AN OVERVIEW OF THE EVOLUTION OF AFFECT IN THE MUSIC
OF WESTERN CIVILIZATION FROM THE ANCIENT
GREEK PERIOD THROUGH THE BAROQUE

by

NANCY LYNNE HARRIS JONES

A THESIS
Presented to the School of Music
and the Graduate School of the University of Oregon
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of
Master of Arts

August 1998
"An Overview of the Evolution of Affect in the Music of Western Civilization from the Ancient Greek Period through the Baroque," a thesis prepared by Nancy Lynne Harris Jones in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Master of Arts degree in the School of Music. This thesis has been approved and accepted by:

Dr. Jack Boss, Chair of the Examining Committee

Date

Committee in charge: Dr. Jack Boss, Chair
Dr. Robert Hurwitz
Dr. Richard Trombley

Accepted by:

Vice Provost and Dean of the Graduate School
Musicians, philosophers, historians, and composers through the ages have attempted to understand the relationship between musical modes and musical affections. The Greeks used the modes as prescriptives for healing diseases, based on the purgative power of the affections. Greek writings transmitted through Boethius were misinterpreted by well-meaning Renaissance music theorists who believed Boethius was relating the ethos of the affections to the church modes rather than to the Greek modes. This thesis begins with Plato’s and Aristotle’s beliefs about musical affect and ends with a discussion of the teachings of Johann Heinichen, Johann Mattheson, and C. P. E. Bach. Stories about using musical modes to bring about healing are also included.
Musicians, philosophers, historians, and composers through the ages have attempted to understand the relationship between musical modes and musical affections. The Greeks used the modes as prescriptives for healing diseases, based on the purgative power of the affections. Greek writings transmitted through Boethius were misinterpreted by well-meaning Renaissance music theorists who believed Boethius was relating the ethos of the affections to the church modes rather than to the Greek modes. This thesis begins with Plato’s and Aristotle’s beliefs about musical affect and ends with a discussion of the teachings of Johann Heinichen, Johann Mattheson, and C. P. E. Bach. Stories about using musical modes to bring about healing are also included.
Heinichen remarks that all of these examples prove that we can express words and affects using different, even contradicting, keys. He said everything that has been written about affects of keys according to the old system (Greek) is rubbish, as if one mode could be cheerful, the other sad, the next heroic or warlike. Even if the old system were right, its application would fail with the slightest change of the common tempering in which the instrumental voices are never accurate.

Heinichen said that if we derive beautiful arias from one key or another, we attribute the good effect of the aria to the key instead of to the composer. It becomes belief that the key could not be expressed just as well using the opposite lyrics and affects, which he found annoying and wrong. He said it does not work well to specifically assign one or another key to any particular affect. The selection of the key depends on the mood of the composer, because we can find the saddest and most tender arias in d, a and b minor as well as brilliant and strong ones in a minor, e minor and c minor.

Heinichen states, “All keys or modes, with no further differentiation, are suitable for expressing all kinds of, even contradicting, affects.” Which one will be selected by the composer depends on four criteria:

1. The intention of the composer, who might have favorite keys.
2. The composer’s choice to express an affect in a different mode or key.
3. Selection of a certain key to suit a particular instrument.

4. Choice of key or mode to suit the range of the singer.

Heinichen said, “A master could easily compose an aria, or even an entire opera, in five or six different manners without repeating himself. This is strong proof that the loci topici give us the most beautiful opportunity for inventions.”

Buelow believes Heinichen succeeded in attaining the true goal of Baroque music, to stir the emotions.

Johann Mattheson (1681 - 1764)

Mattheson’s education was exceptionally broad, according to George Buelow. He was trained in music, dancing, drawing, arithmetic, riding, fencing, English, French and Italian in addition to liberal arts. He also studied keyboard, composition, singing, gamba, violin, flute, oboe, lute and law. He led a rich musical life singing with the Hamburg opera from 1696 to 1705. In 1703, Mattheson met Handel and, as fellow musicians, they became good friends. Mattheson sang in many operas and became an organ virtuoso. He also studied English law, politics, economics and details of trade. By 1735, he had become completely deaf.

Buelow states that Johann Mattheson was the most important writer on the music of the German Baroque. Between 1715 and 1740, Mattheson wrote
immediate judgments. Wisdom lies in learning to be masters of our passions and to control them with such skill that the evils which they cause are quite bearable, and even become a source of joy.\textsuperscript{63}

Descartes said his analysis includes all the principal passions and the Greeks’ analyses does not. Only passions that can be defined as good or evil affect the heart, the blood and the well-being of our body.\textsuperscript{64}

Kivy says Mattheson assumed that the vital spirits were structurally similar to the emotions they caused and then inferred the shape of the emotion by observing the expression-behavior. If he could have turned a microscope of the emotions on the vital spirits to observe their structure directly, he would not have needed to use introspection to examine expression-behavior of self or others.\textsuperscript{65}

We will now look at an outgrowth of the Doctrine of Affections in the eighteenth century.

\textit{Der empfindsamer Stil as Expressed by}  
\textbf{Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach (1714 – 1788)}

Carl Phillip Emanuel Bach was known to close his eyes in deep concentration when he played his clavichord to allow his inner-most emotions to express through the music as he played. In his father, Johann Sebastian Bach, and in Georg Friedrich Handel, Emanuel saw and heard the greatest representatives of
AN OVERVIEW OF THE EVOLUTION OF AFFECT IN THE MUSIC
OF WESTERN CIVILIZATION FROM THE ANCIENT
GREEK PERIOD THROUGH THE BAROQUE

by

NANCY LYNNE HARRIS JONES

A THESIS
Presented to the School of Music
and the Graduate School of the University of Oregon
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of
Master of Arts

August 1998
"An Overview of the Evolution of Affect in the Music of Western Civilization from the Ancient Greek Period through the Baroque," a thesis prepared by Nancy Lynne Harris Jones in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Master of Arts degree in the School of Music. This thesis has been approved and accepted by:

Dr. Jack Boss, Chair of the Examining Committee

Date

Committee in charge: Dr. Jack Boss, Chair
Dr. Robert Hurwitz
Dr. Richard Trombley

Accepted by:

Vice Provost and Dean of the Graduate School
An Abstract of the Thesis of

Nancy Lynne Harris Jones for the degree of Master of Arts
in the School of Music to be taken August 1998

Title: AN OVERVIEW OF THE EVOLUTION OF AFFECT IN THE MUSIC OF WESTERN CIVILIZATION FROM THE ANCIENT GREEK PERIOD THROUGH THE BAROQUE

Approved: ____________________________

Dr. Jack Boss

Musicians, philosophers, historians, and composers through the ages have attempted to understand the relationship between musical modes and musical affections. The Greeks used the modes as prescriptives for healing diseases, based on the purgative power of the affections. Greek writings transmitted through Boethius were misinterpreted by well-meaning Renaissance music theorists who believed Boethius was relating the ethos of the affections to the church modes rather than to the Greek modes. This thesis begins with Plato's and Aristotle's beliefs about musical affect and ends with a discussion of the teachings of Johann Heinichen, Johann Mattheson, and C. P. E. Bach. Stories about using musical modes to bring about healing are also included.
CURRICULUM VITA

NAME OF AUTHOR: Nancy Lynne Harris Jones

PLACE OF BIRTH: Larned, Kansas

DATE OF BIRTH: November 27, 1938

GRADUATE AND UNDERGRADUATE SCHOOLS ATTENDED:

University of Oregon
San Jose State University
University of California, Santa Barbara
Santa Barbara City College

DEGREES AWARDED:

Bachelor of Arts in Music, Piano Performance, 1975, San Jose State University
Associate in Arts, 1970, Santa Barbara City College

AREAS OF SPECIAL INTEREST:

Counseling and Writing Books on Healing
Playing Jazz Piano

PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE:

Professor of Piano, Department of Music, Northwest Christian College,
Eugene, Oregon, 1997 - present

Piano Instructor, Community Music Institute, University of Oregon,
Eugene, 1996 - present
AWARDS AND HONORS:

Who's Who in the Media and Communication, 1997 - present
PEO Scholarship Winner, $3,000, 1996 - 1997
American Business Women's Association Scholarship Winner, $1,200, 1996
Phi Kappa Phi Honor Society, San Jose State University, 1975
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose of This Thesis</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background and Origins</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Origin of the Modes</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Review of Literature</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of Chapters</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. THE ANCIENT GREEK AND ROMAN PERIOD</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pythagoras (582 – 500 B.C.E.)</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Harmoniai</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plato (427 – 347 B.C.E.)</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aristotle (384 – 322 B.C.E.)</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hibeh Papyrus</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aristides Quintilianus (200 C.E.)</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boethius (480 – 524 C.E.)</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. THE MIDDLE AGES</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magic and Musical Chanting</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boethius (480 – 524)</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medieval Modal Theory</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. THE RENAISSANCE</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antiquity Revisited</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Affects and Modal Misappropriation</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modal Metamorphosis</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Word-Painting vs. the Concetti</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Text Setting</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Josquin Des Prez (1450 – 1521)</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adrian Willaert (1490 – 1562)</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Florentine <em>Camerata</em></td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

V. INTO THE BAROQUE | 94 |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Johann David Heinichen (1683 – 1729)</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johann Mattheson (1681 – 1764)</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Der empfindsamer Stil</em> as Expressed by Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach (1714 – 1788)</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

APPENDIX | 150 |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. THEORISTS AND MUSICIANS</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greek and Roman Period (2,000 B.C.E. – 476 C.E.)</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle Ages (600 – 1450 C.E.)</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Renaissance (1450 – 1600)</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baroque (1600 – 1750)</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

B. ILLUSTRATIONS | 152 |

BIBLIOGRAPHY | 154 |
# LIST OF EXAMPLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. <em>Harmoniai</em>, Greek Modes</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Greater Perfect System</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Eight Church Modes with Authentic and Plagal Distinctions during the Eleventh Century</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The Harmonious Union of the Muses, Modes and Planets, From the Thirteenth Century</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Hexachord Syllables Combined with Modes (later Middle Ages)</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Rediscovery of the Eight Modes of Boethius</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Matteo Nardo’s Table</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Greek Modes Compared to Church Modes</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Glarean’s Twelve Modes</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. The Four Elements</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Josquin Des Prez, Psalm 129, Deep anguish, serene confidence</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Josquin</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Josquin, “<em>De profundis</em>.”</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Willaert’s Madrigal. Sad and Subdued Affects Using Intervallic Combinations</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Willaert. Happy, excited, virile, natural feeling</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Rage</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Example

17. Quarrelsomeness ................................................. 100
18. Pompousness .................................................. 101
19. Eternal pursuit of fortune expressed in a bass theme .................. 102
20. Fickle or furious fortune ..................................... 103
21. Ever-changing or calamity-bearing fortune .......................... 104
22. Love ........................................................... 106
23. Burning fire of love .......................................... 107
24. Flirtatiousness .................................................. 108
25. Tenderness ....................................................... 109
26. Sighs of Love .................................................. 110
27. Sighing ........................................................... 111
28. Invention of a Main Theme ................................... 122
29. Invention through imitation of the first five notes ...................... 122
30. Canonic imitation in passages with two or more voices ................ 123
31. Despair .......................................................... 125
32. Clever and playful yet avoiding excessive cheerfulness ................ 126
33. Bitter lament (grief) over parting from the beloved ...................... 127
34. Scornful, bursting forth in unexpected joy .......................... 128
35. Trembling shimmer of the murmuring waves .......................... 129
36. Little turns, clever passages, pleasant runs and jumps .................. 130
37. As a connected phrase, these melodic ideas might look like this ........ 131
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>38. Writing musical inventions using <em>locus notationis</em></td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39. C. P. E. Bach, Sonata No. 23, II. Lovely melting figures with a rising theme</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40. Sonata No. 25, I. Bizarre, grotesque</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Purpose of This Thesis

This thesis traces the evolution of the emotions (affections) in music from the Greek culture through the Baroque period. Affect in music is a topic that volumes could be written about. In many areas I have opened doors, but just looked in because each area was diverse. I have gathered, organized, and expanded on information about musical affect through the ages. My purpose is not to cover all topics concerning music and emotions, but to trace an early lineage that led to some of the multiple developments in the expression of musical affections.

A theme that arose repeatedly throughout this research was the seeming conflict between the ancient Greek Pythagorean approach to music as illustrative of mathematical principles and the Aristotelian approach to music as primarily for our listening pleasure. Of course, the mathematical approach and the listening approach to music were combined in numerous works in later centuries.
While Plato's approach to music was numerical, Aristotle's was for enjoyment and pleasant listening. Warren Anderson states in his article entitled "Ethos" in *The New Grove Dictionary* that Aristotle's flat pronouncement is "that the *harmonia* [Greek modes] consist of notes and nothing else." The mathematical approach even in the Middle Ages was so complex, the theorist Hucbald said, "One trained for no short time ... may, at length, be granted entry to the inner regions of this discipline, the darkness being gradually withdrawn from his dull eyes and their vision made keen. He may understand how everything is brought together and connected through the logic of numbers."3

**Background and Origins**

*Ethos*, denoting the character of the speaker, and *pathos*, the appeal to the emotions, were subjects the Greeks understood well. Gordon Kirkwood tells us that the *logos*, or "word," whether in prose or verse, was believed magical in its effects, and penetrated the soul for good or ill as a drug or medicine penetrates the body.4 According to Bywater, training in music and poetry formed a prominent part of every well-born Athenian's education.5 Any Greek or Roman citizen who lacked this training was considered improperly educated. He could not function at the same level as his colleagues unless he could recite poetry accompanied by music to entertain his fellow noblemen in the Symposium.6
The Greeks believed music which aroused passion could relieve the listener of troubled feelings. Plato related man's body, harmony, and soul to the universal. He used music to affectively restore harmony in a person who was experiencing disharmony in his body. Both Aristotle and Plato stressed that art is an imitation of nature. To Aristotle, imitation was synonymous with "poem." Hutton says poetry and rhetoric were among Aristotle's principal interests, though of his writings on these subjects, only the Poetics and Rhetoric survive.

Aristotle (384-322 B.C.E.) lived at a time when the ancient Greek traditions of Homer and Euclid were long past, though rhetoric was attaining its full stature. When Aristotle wrote about the poetic art, he had before him the finest products of his race. Greek tragedy had already reached its peak, and a decline had set in. The time was ripe for theoretical reflection and critical investigation. Aristotle believed by experiencing the same passion as the actor on stage, the spectator was relieved of his own similar passion. Plato, however, believed purgation occurred for the spectator through experiencing the opposite passion. The ancient Phrygian and Mixolydian modes were the modes most apt to achieve effective purgation through awakening the affections. The Dorian mode was not effective for purgation.

Poetes in Greek meant "maker." Plato, in the tenth book of the Republic, called poetry the false siren, the imitator of shadows, the ally of the low and weak
in the soul. Poetry was "making," but art was always an imitation, e.g. the Fall of Troy or the likeness of Pericles.\textsuperscript{11} Aristotle said, "Epic poetry, tragedy, comedy, the dithyramb,\textsuperscript{12} and most music performed on the flute and lyre were all imitations. Bywater states that plots of tragedy originated from sacred myths or heroic sagas and denoted classical Greek history. They were not completely fiction, rather based on fact. Children were taught the Homeric epics as the basis of education. New Comedy, which was the only living form of drama in Aristotle's day, had plots that were invented.\textsuperscript{13} Homer is credited with being the first to outline the general forms of comedy by producing a dramatic picture of the ridiculous in his comedy, \textit{Margites}.\textsuperscript{14}

Tragedy, according to Greek tradition, originated with the ritual of Dionysus, performed at his festival representing his sufferings and passions. The \textit{katharsis}, purification or purgation, may have originated here. \textit{Katharsis} is an old Greek word. The Dionysus ritual was a \textit{katharsis}, a purification of the poisons of the past year. The mimic representation on the stage of incidents arousing pity and fear did act as a \textit{katharsis} of such passions or sufferings in real life.\textsuperscript{15}

Tragedy must arouse pity and fear in the audience. The tragic event occurs within the sphere of the natural affections, when a man kills his brother, or a son his father or a mother her son, or a son his mother. If enemy harms enemy or if the parties are neither friends nor enemies, there is nothing to pity.\textsuperscript{16}
Boethius (480-524 C.E.) was the last of the Romans who studied Aristotle in the Greek. He quotes from Chapter 20 of the *Poetics* in his commentaries on Aristotle's writings. For centuries thereafter, scholars were content to rely on Boethius for their knowledge of Aristotle.

About 1200 C.E., the "New Aristotle" began to appear from Syria through Africa and Moorish Spain and in the spoils of returning Crusaders from the East. By the beginning of the Renaissance, Greek and Latin had been long neglected in Europe. The classical writings were also hard to obtain. Both the *Rhetoric* and the *Poetics* were poorly translated into Latin, Arabic, or Syrian and then translated from these poor translations into other languages, rather than from the original version, because of the scarcity of competent Greek translators. Some of these translations were worse than useless, according to Herrick.

**Origin of the Modes**

It is important to study the development of the origin of the modes in ancient Greece because the emotions were expressed through the modes. Precisely which mode expressed which affect was based on the origination of the name of each mode. It would be an interesting study to peruse texts written in Greek on the ancient origins of the modal names. Because the Greek civilization began around 2,000 B.C.E., this information may not as yet be translated into English. The
naming of the modes was ancient history even to Plato. The modes were named based on many adjectives which described the characteristics of each of the Greek tribes. It would seem that the answer to the true origin of the naming of the ancient Greek modes probably lies somewhere in the folklore, folk music, or ancient customs of each individual Greek tribe. To find more answers regarding the naming of the Greek modes, one might have to study the ancient history of the Hellenic race.

To further understand the real characteristics of the origin of the modes, one would have to study the basic characteristics, habits, attitudes, and life-styles of each of the ancient Greek tribes (e.g. the Doriens, the Aeolians) in some detail. The Greek modes already bore their names at the point the texts began from which my research on ancient Greek music was conducted. I found no earlier sources written in English.

Review of Literature

It was particularly difficult to find information on musical ethos in the Middle Ages. Secondary sources include the section on ‘mode as ethos’ in Harold Powers’ article entitled “Mode” in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians, and Claude Palisca, who has a few scattered pages on ethos in his book, Humanism in Italian Renaissance Musical Thought. Warren Anderson has a
lengthy article on "Ethos" in *The New Grove*, however, I found no book that traced the lineage of the evolution of the transmission of emotions through music as its main subject.

In Palisca's book, *Humanism in Italian Renaissance Musical Thought*, he includes a section entitled "Expressing the Affections." Palisca discusses "poetic furor," which was the ancient Greeks' way of conjuring up images charged with association and affections through concentrated imagining. He says, "In this state, the poet composes almost from the heart." He talks about Aristotle’s theory for purgation of negative emotions through the representation of a similar affection which contrasts with Plato’s method for purgation through recalling the opposite emotion.

Other important secondary sources relating to affect in modes were Claude Palisca’s *Studies in the History of Italian Music and Music Theory* and M. L. West’s *Ancient Greek Music*. Harold Powers' article on "Modes" in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians* was particularly informative on modes in the Middle Ages; and George Buelow's three articles in *The New Grove* entitled the "Doctrine of the Affections," "Johann David Heinichen," and "Johann Mattheson" were all important sources of information.

I found no book with a clearly defined list of the attributes of the Greek modes. This information was scattered here and there. Also, not every writer
agreed as to what the original characteristics of the Dorian or Phrygian tribes really were. This was an important point because I was researching the origin of the modes as a starting point. It was not until I was studying Der vollkommene Capellmeister by Johann Mattheson that I felt more enlightened because of his discussion of the Greek tribes. Mattheson does not state where he found the information about the Greek tribes, but his writings on the origin of the names of the modes were more comprehensive than the books I had already studied by Palisca and West on ancient Greek music. Most books on Greek music history or theory tend to begin sometime into the development of actually composed Greek music rather than the beginnings of this development.

Summary of Chapters

"The Ancient Greek and Roman Period," Chapter II, traces the Greeks’ beliefs about music, rhetoric, poetry, the harmoniai, ethos, and includes some stories about healing with the modes. A look at the Greeks’ point of view on the affections, the modes, and their purposes for music are presented in the thoughts and writings of Plato, Aristotle, Aristides Quintilianus, and Boethius.

"The Middle Ages," Chapter III, presents new developments in music with the growth of Christianity after the downfall of the Roman Empire in the fifth century. Because of the conscious destruction of Greek and Roman music by the
early Christian Church, only Boethius' *De institutione musica* was available for reference in the ninth century concerning the music theory of the ancient Greeks whose civilization was defunct. This chapter covers the merging sources of music theory which coalesced during this period. It covers some innovations of Guido d'Arezzo, compares the Church Modes to the Greek modes, and includes a section on modal *ethos*. The only secondary source I could locate on *ethos* during this period was in the section entitled "Modes" by Harold Powers in *The New Grove*.

“The Renaissance,” Chapter IV, discusses the re-discovery of the ancient Greek texts of Plato, Aristotle, Boethius, and others, and the resulting revival of the affections in music. This chapter presents the confusion which resulted because of the scribes’ inability to understand music theory, the music theorists’ inability to understand the Greek language, and the mistaken confidence the music theorists placed in each other’s interpretation of Boethius. The beliefs and writings of Glarean, Gaffurio, and Zarlino are presented along with those of Mei and Galilei. Musical examples of Dufay and Josquin are offered showing differences between word-painting and the *concetti*. Examples by Willaert are presented showing text setting to express the affections.

“Into the Baroque,” Chapter V, presents musical examples which express affections through music as presented by Johann David Heinichen in *Der General Bass in Der Komposition*. Many examples showing the use of various *loci topici*
in composing inventions (melodies) as presented by Johann Mattheson are included, as well as his definitions of many affections which he believed were vital for contrapuntists to understand thoroughly. Comments by Ernst Harriss and Hans Lenneberg, translators of Der vollkommene Capellmeister, are included.

In the Baroque period, Mattheson believed the emotions were vitally important to study to gain an understanding of the true nature of composing music. On the other hand, Heinichen negated the Greeks' beliefs in ethos as applied to the modes. Mattheson also recommended that composers study Descartes, who believed that he had done a more thorough job of analyzing the emotions than even the Greeks themselves had done.\textsuperscript{27} This thesis ends with a section on C. P. E. Bach and Johann Quantz as they relate to the changing attitudes toward affect in music in the later eighteenth century.
Notes

1 e.g., the "Crucifixus" from J. S. Bach's *Mass in B Minor*


4 The reader is reminded that present-day theoretical terms and concepts were unknown to the Hellenic civilization. For example, the term "harmony" to the Greeks could mean *melos* (melody) or *harmoniai* (modes), but not at all what we in the present century conceive harmony to be. Placing current definitions onto ancient terms is a fallacy that must be carefully avoided.

5 Much misunderstanding has been caused by modern attempts to strictly limit the meanings of Greek words, according to Bywater. Ancient Greek nouns cannot be translated directly into exact equivalents in modern English. Every proposition has to be reduced to its lowest terms of thought and then re-built.

6 The Greek noblemen's after-dinner get-together.


9 *Aristotle's Poetics*, 1-3.


12 *Dithyramb* – an elaborate choral song with narrative content (myth) originally associated with the worship of Dionysus. Like tragedy and comedy, it was performed in poetical contests. (*Harvard Dictionary of Music*, 213.)
13 *Ars poetica*, 12.

14 *Ars poetica*, 30-31.

15 *Ars poetica*, 14-16.

16 Aristotle's *Poetics*, 58-59.

17 Aristotle's *Poetics*, 24.


22 Anderson, "*Ethos,*" 282-287.


24 In *Studies in the History of Italian Music and Music Theory* by Claude Palisca, brief comments concerning the affections and the modes were scattered with a footnote here and a sentence or two there throughout the chapters, rather than organized into larger sections. M. L. West, in his book, *Ancient Greek Music*, also devotes a few scattered pages to "ethos" and "modes."


26 *Concetti*—Expression of the meaning behind the words.
CHAPTER II

THE ANCIENT GREEK AND ROMAN PERIOD

An ancient and enduring thought is that music is an echo of the original impulse of divine creation. Confucius, the Chinese philosopher who lived a century before Plato, said that music is born of emotion, and that the musical goal is "spiritual power inherent in nature," and that "truly great music shares the principles of harmony with the universe." Confucius recognized the necessity of the human participant in a connection between music and the emotions. Musical discussions tended toward either its mathematical properties or its affect.

Greek culture, including music, developed from influences of Egyptian, Phoenician, and Asian cultures around 2000-1500 B.C.E. The Greeks believed there were three kinds of music: the music of the universe, human music, and instrumental music, according to Boethius. The music of the universe could be studied in the elements and in the seasons as observed in the heavens. They believed an established order of motion is present in the seemingly silent celestial motion. Human music could be comprehended by examining our own nature to understand the parts of the soul itself. Instrumental music was produced by
strumming, blowing, striking, or with water. Physical emission of sound was an audible medium of an inner, transcendent power. Aristotle said, “Art imitates nature.”

Greek music, which was monophonic, was played on stringed instruments such as the lyre and kithara. Our attempts today to simulate the sound of Greek music may be in vain, because only a few notated fragments have survived. The purpose of Greek music was to support poetry; the reasons for music were basic education and healing. Music on the kithara was believed to have the power to allay anger and heal diseases. The aulos, a reed instrument, played over the affected parts in the Phrygian harmony, was believed to heal sciatica. Greek instruments were hand carved or made from things found in nature; their philosophy of life was one of many gods, many lovers, and aggrandizement of the body.

Primitive melody did not extend much, if at all, beyond the range of a single octave, and it was often restricted to less than an octave. Their harmoniai might have used just five or six different notes, and in some cases only two or three. These notes formed a closed system, characterized by a particular structure. As far as a particular harmonia was concerned, other notes, higher or lower, did not exist at all. One of the ceremonial tunes attributed to Olympus, the Libatory, was apparently based on five notes, e f a b c. The note-names given
here serve merely to characterize the intervals of the scale; we do not know the actual pitch.\textsuperscript{9} Terms such as \textit{syntonos} (intense) and \textit{chalaros} (slack) were used to indicate highness, lowness, and range.\textsuperscript{10}

\textbf{Pythagoras (582 - 500 B.C.E.)}

No books by Pythagoras have come down to us. His writings on musical ratios are preserved in the works of his followers—the Pythagoreans.\textsuperscript{11} Mathematical laws were thought to underlie the systems both of musical intervals and of heavenly bodies; and certain modes and certain notes were believed to correspond with particular planets and their movements.\textsuperscript{12} Pythagoras conceived the Doctrine of \textit{Ethos} which states that because of its numerical basis, music is a force of moral value.\textsuperscript{13}

Pythagoras believed that song performed many wonders in the affections of the body and mind. To be a mathematician did not imply that one did not believe in the power of \textit{ethos}; it simply meant \textit{harmonia}\textsuperscript{14} were constructed mathematically. The Pythagoreans are reported to have classified types and used music to produce different affects for rousing or calming emotions. They probably took both harmonic intervals and rhythms into account in their classification and regarded number ratios as the crucial factor in each case.\textsuperscript{15}

According to Strunk, the power of the art of music became so evident to the
Pythagoreans that they would free themselves from the cares of the day with melodies that caused a gentle and quiet slumber to steal upon them. Upon rising, they dispelled the stupor and confusion of sleep by other melodies, thinking that the whole structure of soul and body is united by musical harmony. Which modes Pythagoras used to dispel anger or stupor of sleep was not indicated.\(^\text{16}\)

Pythagoras calmed and restored to self-mastery a youth, who became wrought up by the sound of the Phrygian mode and was about to set fire to the house of his rival. By changing the mode of his music, the youth's fury was reduced to a state of perfect calm.

Warren Anderson says that over the centuries, many differing views, sometimes sharply opposed, have made up the shifting pattern of beliefs concerning musical \textit{ethos}. M. L. West writes that mode, interval, rhythm, and tempo had a considerable role to play in determining the character and emotional affect of an ancient Greek musical composition. A given mode or instrument might be credited at different times and places with distinctly different characteristics.\(^\text{17}\)

The belief in \textit{ethos} originated in a view of music as being magically potent, an idea which was widely held throughout the Near and Middle East. The term \textit{ethos} came to mean the sense of moral character. \textit{Ethos} implied an attribute, not merely of persons but also of musical phenomena, which were vehicles for
conveying ethical attitudes. The liberating force for working the magic through music was Pythagorean theory, which brought musical phenomena under the control of number and relationship (one of the main senses of *harmonia*).  

**The Harmoniai**

According to Plato, *ethos* consisted of mode and rhythm lodging fast in the soul’s deepest recesses. He did not believe that music itself had *ethos* in it. He saw it as a vehicle for *ethos*. In the seventh and sixth centuries B.C.E., a song was not made up of a scale pattern, but rather was a reference to a melodic style. The modes were named after the various Greek tribes, the Dorians, Aeolians, and Ionians. According to Andrew Barker, from the seventh century B.C.E., the Greeks were familiar with a number of distinct melodic styles, associated with different regions or peoples of the Aegean area. Interaction between Greeks from different places, and also contact with non-Hellenic cultures, led to the adoption of other harmonies into the music of the major centers of civilization. By the sixth century B.C.E., this process was well advanced. Ionian, Phrygian, Lydian, and Dorian music expressed distinct characters, with particular emotional, aesthetic, and moral affects based on different religious or cultural patterns. The Dorian harmony came to be thought of as peculiarly Greek.

By the late sixth century, musicians had to be aware of the structural
differences between the regional forms of melody. The use of an instrument tuned to a definite scale made possible the beginnings of a systematic variety of scale forms. If the strings had to be tuned to a definite note-series in advance of a performance, the musician had to know the form of the scale he was using and the alterations needed to produce it. Eventually a system of *tonoi* came to replace the *harmoniai*, at least in the writings of the harmonic theorists.

At the beginning of the fifth century B.C.E., the Aeolian *harmoniai* was thought to express the merry lightheartedness of the Aeolian people, who were neither anguished nor serene. The Ionians had excellent physical condition, were fond of contention, never showed affection, and were never kind or cheerful. The Ionian harmony was hard and serious—well adapted to tragedy. Plato said a lustful mind takes pleasure in the lustful modes. A sterner mind finds joy in the more stirring modes. Plato wrote, “This is why the musical modes were called by the names of the tribes of peoples, for whatever mode each people delighted in, it was named after them.”

Sophisticated fifth century B.C.E. composers might shift from one style to another in the course of a single piece as a way of generating changes of feeling and mood. These differences were sufficiently marked in the fourth century for philosophers, notably Plato, to use them as the foundation for their theories about the distinct moral characters and influences of different kinds of music.
AN OVERVIEW OF THE EVOLUTION OF AFFECT IN THE MUSIC
OF WESTERN CIVILIZATION FROM THE ANCIENT GREEK PERIOD THROUGH THE BAROQUE

by

NANCY LYNNE HARRIS JONES

A THESIS
Presented to the School of Music and the Graduate School of the University of Oregon in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts

August 1998
AN OVERVIEW OF THE EVOLUTION OF AFFECT IN THE MUSIC
OF WESTERN CIVILIZATION FROM THE ANCIENT
GREEK PERIOD THROUGH THE BAROQUE

by

NANCY LYNNE HARRIS JONES

A THESIS
Presented to the School of Music
and the Graduate School of the University of Oregon
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of
Master of Arts
August 1998
By the later fifth century, according to Barker, a fairly clear general conception began to emerge about the ways in which distinctions between regional styles were described. The main differences between regional types were identified as differences in *harmonia* (differences in the particular pattern of tuning of an instrument). By retuning the intervals between the strings of a lyra or kithara, a performer could prepare his instrument for a piece in a different *harmonia*—Dorian, Phrygian, or whatever. The ancients tuned by using different sizes of intervals, different orders of intervals, different numbers of notes for a particular *harmonia*, and various ranges. The *harmoniai* were not modifications or transformations of one another.

M. L. West states that Damon was an important theorist of the later fifth century B.C.E., who was a colleague of Plato. He was the first writer we know of who explained modal *ethos* in detail. He believed that musical modes and rhythms were intimately connected with ethical qualities. He set out a series of modal scales, enumerating their notes and intervals, and commenting on their qualities. He did likewise with rhythms, commending some, condemning others as expressive of undignified aggression, frenzy, or other vices. Numerical ratios played a part in his theory, so that a Pythagorean influence may be inferred. Aristides Quintilianus (200 C.E.) preserved these ethical qualities, saying that they were used by the most ancient musicians. The Damonian scales include:
Intense Lydian   \[ e \uparrow f a c' \]
Ionian          \[ e \uparrow f a c' d \]
Dorian          \[ d e \uparrow f \dddot{a} b \uparrow b \uparrow c' e' \]
Phrygian        \[ d e \uparrow f a b b \uparrow c' d' \]
Mixolydian      \[ e \uparrow f g a a \uparrow b e' \]

These notes do not indicate absolute pitch.\(^{31}\) The up arrow indicates a quarter tone above.

Attempts to reduce *harmoniai* to a system probably originated in the later fifth century B.C.E., partly under the influence of musical theory, which was just beginning to appear as a serious technical discipline. Around the year 400 B.C.E., a school of harmonic theorists represented on a diagram the seven *harmoniai*, which divided the space of an octave into twenty-four quarter-tones. The entire two-octave scale was called the Greater Perfect System.\(^{32}\) The list retains a number of the old names, e.g., Dorian, Phrygian, etc. Others, such as lastian and Aeolian were left out, and instead we find what were obviously specialists' terms, Hypolydian, Hypophrygian, Hypodorian. These *harmoniai* are referred to as the "Greek modes."\(^{33}\)
Plátō (427 ὀ. 347 B.C.E.)

The great Greek philosopher, Plátō, studied music with a pupil of Damon and took up Damon's ideas. He, like Pythagoras, believed rhythm and melody imitated the movements of the heavenly bodies, thus outlining the music of the spheres and reflecting the moral order of the universe. He felt modes and rhythms of dance and song were charged with ethos because they were imitations of the voices and movements of people. He believed music and dance encoded ethical qualities manifested in human conduct and fed them back into the souls of performers and audiences. Therefore, it was important, especially in education, to choose music that conveyed good qualities. In song, it was the words and subject matter that played the primary role, but they had to be combined with the appropriate modes and rhythms, or the ethical affect would be obscured.

Out of the six harmoniai discussed by Damon, Plato approved only the Dorian and Phrygian. He believed the expressive capabilities of earthly music were potential problems. The sensuous qualities of certain modes were dangerous, and he felt that a strong censorship must be imposed.

M. L. West writes that much of the poetry that was written was composed to be sung at the symposium, which was the after-dinner drinking party where the men in the aristocratic circles relaxed with their friends. They took turns singing whatever they cared to: a little hymn to a god, a piece of political comment,
reflections on the joys of wine or the pains of love, moral advice, or humorous abuse. Pieces in couplets were sung with a male or female piper providing the accompaniment, while those in more elaborate meters were accompanied by the singer himself on a lyre or a harp. A creative poet would keep producing new songs; others would repeat old ones. At the end of the evening, the merry guests would carouse through the streets, still singing and dancing, and pay further visits to acquaintances.

Plato mentions the "intense Lydian" together with the Mixolydian as lamentatory and suitable for women, and he distinguishes these from the "slack" modes, Ionian and Lydian, which are soft and suited to the symposium. The meaning of "tense" and "slack" in this context is made plainer by Aristotle's remark that the tense harmoniai are not easy for old men to sing; nature offers them the slack ones instead. A "tense" mode involved more high notes and was taxing for that reason. In the tense mode, the melody moved more in the upper part of that octave, in the slack mode more in the lower. It is significant that Plato used tenseness and slackness as a principle of classification connected with ethos.

In the Republic, Plato wrote, "Musical training is a more potent instrument than any other, because rhythm and harmony find their way into the inward places of the soul, on which they mightily fasten, imparting grace and making the soul of
him who is rightly educated graceful, or of him who is ill-educated, ungraceful.\textsuperscript{40} He also said the true function of all education was the improvement of the soul and the harmonization of its elements. A child's education had two parts: gymnastics and \textit{mousike}, which was primarily an exposure to poetry and to the music that was its vehicle.\textsuperscript{41}

Plato said a true musician was able to recognize the forms of soberness, courage, and high-mindedness, and to recognize their opposites, too. He regarded earthly music as a shadow of the Ideal. He admitted music into the ideal society he envisioned to the extent that it was desirable in an ethical sense. The ideal music he postulated in the realm of the eternal presented no clear and present danger. But, actual music was intimately connected with human emotions—a fact he clearly recognized and feared. The emotions were easily aroused, subject to infection at all times which could cause illness.

Plato believed that negative emotions touching the soul created disease. This is why he "feared" the disharmony that the wrong kind of music could create in young men and insisted on high morals which kept emotions positive. Censorship, he felt, was essential. Many things that are not well understood are referred to as "magical." Plato believed music harmonized the soul.

Plato tells the story of Thales the Milesian who sang so sweetly that he not only influenced the minds of certain persons, but also cured illness and the plague.
Pythagoras cured drunkards with music, and Socrates a man possessed. Those who suffered from sciatic gout or were bitten by serpents were healed with the sound of the tibia.\textsuperscript{42}

In the \textit{Laws}, Plato said that rhythmic and melodic complexities were to be avoided because they promoted depression and disorder. He believed passion in music represented wrong principles. Although Plato believed that musicians were madmen, the music itself represented divine harmony, and listening was permissible. He believed \textit{mousike} was put together out of three things—\textit{harmonia}, rhythm, and diction. Rhetoric was an important subject to study because there was no difference in delivery in words whether spoken or sung. The harmony and rhythm must follow the words.\textsuperscript{43}

Plato said, "Complexity engenders disease; simplicity in music is the parent of temperance in the soul. He who blends gymnastics with music and applies them suitably to the soul is the man whom we most rightly pronounce to be the most perfect and harmonious musician."\textsuperscript{44}

Plato believed there could be no greater detriment to the morals of a community than a gradual perversion of chaste and modest music.\textsuperscript{45} The minds of those hearing this perversion were immediately affected and would gradually go astray, retaining no trace of honesty and right, if either the lustful modes implanted something shameful in their minds, or the harsher modes something savage and
monstrous. Music was pure as long as it was played on simpler instruments, but as it became more complex by being played in a variety of manners, it had become confused, had lost its virtue, and had fallen almost to baseness, preserving only a remnant of its ancient beauty. This is why Plato prescribed that boys should not be trained in all modes, but only in those that were strong and simple. He said, "Music of the highest moral quality is modest, simple, and masculine and is a great guardian of the commonwealth."\textsuperscript{46}

Example 2-1  \textit{Harmoniai}, Greek Modes

Plato believed the Dorian was the primary Greek \textit{harmonia}, the norm to which all others must be related. He said, "The Iastian and Lydian are occupied with feasting, drinking, and good company.\textsuperscript{47} In this way, Plato sought to explain the harmonies, matching the qualities of the sounds to the given material of the moral characters.\textsuperscript{48} Barker states that the capacity to distinguish the \textit{ethos} and to name the \textit{harmoniai} associated with each character was a matter of specialist expertise, not common knowledge.\textsuperscript{49}
Plato believed good education was vitally important, and art derives its main value as a means of attaining this educational ideal. In this connection, he regarded music as highly important. Its purpose was, not for entertainment as Aristotle believed, but to help in building up a harmonious moral character and in calming the human passions through cultivating the opposite of a bad passion.50

Aristotle (384 - 322 B.C.E.)

Only in the closing passages of the Politics did Aristotle devote a brief moment to practical problems of ethos, which Warren Anderson feels could have been one of Aristotle’s greatest contributions if he had expanded on his beliefs.51 To Aristotle, music was for social enjoyment, not for Plato’s concept of noble living. The classification of the modes no longer had an ethical basis. Aristotle, unlike Plato, would allow all the modes for discriminating use.52 Professional musicians were considered vulgar people. It was not manly to perform music, except when drunk or for fun.53 It was permissible for everyone to participate in the pleasure that music brought. Aristotle agreed with some of Plato’s views, such as the recognition of music’s moral influence on education, and disagreed with others. Aristotle wrote: “Music imitates the passions or states of the soul, such as gentleness, anger, courage, temperance, and their opposites. Music that imitates a certain passion arouses that passion in the listener.”54 He said this is obvious from
what occurs when we listen to certain kinds of music—we change in our soul.

Aristotle showed polite contempt for the number theory used by Pythagorean theorists. He believed pieces of music contain in themselves imitations of character (ethos). Upon hearing them, people were affected differently. The Mixolydian mode made men mournful, sad, and grave. The Dorian alone gave the greatest composure of a moderate and settled temper. The Phrygian made men enthusiastic and divinely suffused. Plato said the Phrygian mode expressed prudence and was ideal for men of peace. (Socrates had felt the Phrygian was violently exciting.) Plato believed the Dorian mode was for energy and strength; Aristotle believed it was for moderation and settled temper. Aristotle believed the Lydian had beauty, grace, and decency. He changed Plato’s mousike (an unquestioned fusion of text and harmoniai) to ta mousika (vocal, instrumental or mechanical sounds having melody and rhythm with or without text). He regarded instrumental music as capable of expressing ethos in itself.

Aristotle wrote in his Treatise on Rhetoric that the purpose of art was an attempt either to convince or to persuade. There were three considerations in persuading by speaking: (1) the character (moral and emotional state) of the speaker, (2) the character of the hearer, (3) the nature of the thing that is said. Moral character carries with it the highest power to produce an affect. Aristotle said:
Persuasion is effective when the hearers have been brought to a state of excitement under the influence of the speech. What appears to be the truth persuades. Because persuasion is brought about by these means, it is important for the speaker to educate himself fully on the subject of morals, on the virtues, and on the passions including what each of the passions is, of what nature it is, and from what causes it is produced.\textsuperscript{60}

Aristotle states that moral character is represented by movement from note-to-note, not by notes played simultaneously. Different notes played with the melody obscure the \textit{ethos}.\textsuperscript{61}

Aristotle's extant works were probably written during the last twelve years of his life. They encompass nearly the entire range of the knowledge of his day. His concept that instrumental music was important in itself undoubtedly furthered the development of instrumental music in later centuries.\textsuperscript{62}

In the Middle Ages, Aristotle became the supreme philosophical authority. Today, some of Aristotle's works survive only as fragments.\textsuperscript{63}

\textit{Hibeh Papyrus}

The \textit{Hibeh Papyrus}, from the third century B.C.E., is a short extract from a speech. Its importance to us is that it shows that \textit{ethos} did exist, because this speaker was disputing its authenticity. According to Barker, the \textit{Hibeh} is trivial in tone and argument, and we know nothing of the circumstances of its delivery.\textsuperscript{64}
The author did not seem to be particularly knowledgeable of music theory. He was perhaps just voicing his complaint in what seemed ridiculous to him. Of import to us, the *Hibeh* discourse contains an early reference to ethical qualities associated with music. It contains a sharp attack upon believers in musical *ethos*. The author denies "that the chromatic makes men cowardly or that the enharmonic makes them brave." Attacking a variety of targets seemed to be the author's main intent.

In spite of this denial of the *ethos* theory and another attack at the end of the second century C.E., (the Sceptic Sextus Empiricus devotes the sixth book of his work, *Against the Scientists*, to arguments against musical theorists), belief in the ethical power of music continued to prevail.

Aristides Quintilianus (200 C.E.)

Aristides, who lived in the late third and early fourth century C.E., was a Greek music theorist. His treatise, *De musica* (*On Music*), is one of the basic sources of our knowledge of ancient Greek music, though the authenticity of some of his descriptions of Greek scales is doubtful. He set out a system of *harmoniai* that he alleged to be the *harmoniai* of Plato's *Republic*. During the Middle Ages, he came to be viewed as one of the most important authorities on ancient Greek music theory.
As a neo-Platonist, Aristides saw music as a medium in the purgation process for the order of the soul and the universe. He wrote: "In ethos, the painful passions move through the systaltic (pulsing); we awaken the spirit through the diastaltic (separation); and we bring the soul to quietude through the medial (middle)." He believed these three worked together in the treatment of the passions. He said that as in the case of healing drugs, no one certain substance is naturally disposed to heal the sufferings of the body. He was introducing the notion of ethos, education, and medical analogy, and was making it clear that the melic composition alone is not responsible for proper morality just as one drug does not heal an illness. Perfect healing is the result of getting rid of the painful passions (systaltic), re-awakening the spirit (diastaltic), and thereby quieting the soul (medial).  

Aristides presents an elaborate system of cosmic harmony. Everything is based on number and proportion. Our earthly music is an imperfect imitation of the heavenly attunement manifested in the working of the universe. The soul itself is an attunement, having the same set of ratios as a musical scale and therefore moved by music, which uses these ratios. The soul is moved because it has become enmeshed in a structure founded on sinews and breath which vibrate in sympathy when stringed or wind instruments are sounded. The soul chooses a body with male or female attributes, according to its inclination, and develops
emotions reflecting its male, female, or mixed affinities. Musical scales and keys are more or less male or female in character and will appeal to the individual hearer according to his or her own sexual mix. Lower keys are male, higher ones female. Instruments too are graded on a sexual scale according to register or timbre, and this makes them suited to different harmoniae and rhythms. In the chapters in De musica where the sex theory is expounded, Aristides implied that the number of different possible emotions and mixtures of them, which are potentially expressible in music, is very large.

Elsewhere, Aristides reckons with a simple trinity of musical characters: depressant, stimulant, and calming. The stimulant kind of composition is that which conveys grandeur, manly exaltation, heroic deeds, and related emotions. The depressant is that which reduces the soul to an abject, unmanly state. It is appropriate to unhappy love, death, and disaster. The calming type is that associated with equanimity, freedom, and peace. It is suited to hymns.

Aristides is convinced of the value of music for educational and therapeutic purposes. Orderly, manly melodies are required in education; others may be useful in treating people in different emotional states. Not everyone responds as quickly or in the same way as everyone else to a given type of music. He believed sex, age, and other factors made a difference; some experimentation may be necessary for successful emotional release.
Like Aristotle and Plato, Aristides believed in the power of purgation to release negative *ethos*. He also believed, like Aristotle and Plato, that our internal harmony or disharmony regulates our health. Unlike Aristotle and Plato, he categorized the modes as male or female.

**Boethius (480 - 524 C.E.)**

Boethius was one of the great intermediaries between the Middle Ages and the ancient world. His *De institutione musica* was the only work known to the Middle Ages which presented the complete system of Greek music theory.

Boethius was a Roman mathematician, writer, translator, statesman, and philosopher. The object of his philosophy was “to resolve the ideas of Aristotle and Plato into harmony.” Boethius handed down the doctrine of music from the Aristotelian system. He believed the goal of study was always philosophy; but the only path to it was through mathematics by the Pythagorean system. He believed that music was capable of “improving or degrading the morals of men.”

Boethius wrote a treatise in five books entitled *De institutione musica*, translated by Calvin Bower. It is based on the Quadrivium, (arithmetic, music, geometry and astronomy), the fourfold path to knowledge. According to M. L. West, Boethius’ work was a compilation of higher learning based on the knowledge of others. His main translations were of Nicomachus, Cleonides and
Ptolemy. His arithmetical and musical treatises were of great historical significance as the point of departure for medieval theorists.\textsuperscript{83}

Schrade writes that it may be puzzling to find that an incomplete book on music, written by a man of only twenty, exercised the most extraordinary influence upon centuries to come. Music, as a part of mathematics, was a science within philosophy. After Boethius was executed in 526 A.D., medieval musicians continued his work to reconcile Plato with Aristotle.\textsuperscript{84} His \textit{De institutione musica} was the chief source book for the theorizing monks of the Middle Ages.\textsuperscript{85}

Boethius wrote that music is the guide on the path toward the summit of perfection. He dedicated his books on music to those of his own age, in order to stimulate them to study philosophy. The time in which Boethius wrote his work on music represented the very last phase of ancient literature in every field and form.\textsuperscript{86} He was born in 480, just three years after the fall of the Roman Empire in 476; yet, through it all the Christian Church was established and gaining in strength. In the year 500, when Boethius was 20 years old and wrote \textit{De institutione musica}, he easily could have been writing about the church modes rather than the ancient Greek modes. Yet because the Roman Empire was newly fallen, the theory of and writings about the ancient Greek modes were subjects that were still available for study.

Boethius wrote:
Music is related to us by nature and can ennoble or corrupt the character. The perceptive power of all the senses is so spontaneously and naturally present in certain living creatures that to conceive of an animal without senses is impossible. The ear and senses are delighted when the modes are sweet and well ordered, and pained when disordered and incoherent modes offend them.\textsuperscript{87}

In \textit{De institutione musica}, Boethius repeats an earlier story told by Pythagoras. He had observed youths who were filled with frenzy from alcoholic drink and were acting like madmen when they asked the musician to play his aulos for them in a \textit{melos} appropriate for religious occasions, solemn in character, dominated rhythmically by long time values. When the musician did what was asked, the youths suddenly changed as if they had been sober even at the beginning.\textsuperscript{88}

Mattheson wrote that later writers, who misinterpreted Boethius during the Middle Ages, sought diligently in his writings for things that did not exist in them and created many fallacies in interpretation which still exist and have done more harm than good. I believe diligent care should be taken when reading the writings of Gaffurio, Glarean, and Zarlino during the Renaissance, regarding Boethius' writings in the fifth century C.E. about modal \textit{ethos}. One might wish to study many other theorists of the Middle Ages and Renaissance before reading what these well-meaning men had to say about Boethius. These three Renaissance music theorists may have made valuable contributions in other areas of music.
theory, but their understanding of Boethius' writings should be approached with caution. Both Galilei and Mattheson commented on this, as the reader will discover in later chapters of this thesis. Plato, Aristotle, and Aristides shared the belief that negative ethos must be released to achieve purgation and healing. Their aim was the same; only their individual methods of purgation differed.
Notes


12 Grout and Palisca, *History*, 4-5.

14 *Harmoniai* – Greek modes.

15 Not every source agrees that the science of *ethos* originated with Pythagoras, but its conception almost certainly goes back to the fifth century.

16 Strunk, *Greek Views*, 83.


25 Strunk, 48.


Humorous abuse – making fun of a fellow aristocrat.

The presence of the female as a piper at the Symposium was probably insignificant except for that reason; but, this was a gentlemen’s drinking party!

Strunk, Classical Antiquity, 30.

Strunk, Classical Antiquity, 293.

Strunk, Classical Antiquity, 294.

Strunk, Classical Antiquity, 295.

Strunk, Classical Antiquity, 296.

Barker, Writings, 130-131.

Strunk, Greek Views, 9.


53 Strunk, *Greek Views*, 27.


57 Strunk, *Greek Views*, 34.


61 Barker, *Writings*, 197.


64 Barker, *Writings*, 183.


68 Strunk, *Greek Views*, 47.


70 West, *Ancient Greek*, 252.
71 West, *Ancient Greek*, 252.

72 West, *Ancient Greek*, 252.


77 Strunk, *Greek Views*, 79.


82 Calvin Bower, “Boethius,” 844.


84 Schrade, “Philosophy,” 199.


86 Schrade, “Philosophy,” 199-200.


CHAPTER III

THE MIDDLE AGES

In the second century, the citizens of the Roman Empire may have believed the peace and prosperity they lived in would never pass away. Yet before the third century signs of decay began to appear after many barbarian invasions. Nevertheless, the emperor Aurelian (270-275 C.E.) overcame his rivals and regained control of the empire, according to Hoppin.¹

The stability of the fourth century brought a change in the fortunes of Christianity within the empire from bitter persecution under Diocletian to complete adoption under Constantine (312-337), and Christianity became by decree the compulsory religion of all Roman subjects except the Jews. This reversal of fortune affected the forms and rites of the Christian religion in multiple ways. Men of prominence became members of the clergy. Churches throughout the empire acquired wealth and power through extensive property holdings. An ecclesiastical government was modeled after the territorial organization of the Roman Empire. Hoppin states these new strengths enabled the church to survive the disastrous events of the fifth century, which caused Rome itself to fall.²
Magic and Musical Chanting

The leaders of the early Christian Church looked with horror on the traditional Roman theater, secular festivals and pagan religious exercises. Because of the pagan custom of using music and the voice to summon unseen powers, certain unspecified modes were believed to be dangerous. The Church Fathers wanted such music exterminated to blot out the magical rituals associated with Roman music.³

We know from the early Church Fathers that the pagan peasants, whom the church sought to make into Christians, uttered jubilations which were extended vowel sounds in a musical pattern. These free, expressive vocal sounds were believed to communicate with unseen powers. In the liturgy, they were developed and disciplined while being merged with approved texts. The result was plainchant, according to Stewart.⁴

The magical, esoteric, and subsequent alchemical (or Hermetic) writings and teachings retained a vast inheritance from the pagan cults and ancient philosophies. These were intimately involved with the image and regenerative powers of a goddess or goddesses. The Roman Church transferred this female image to the form of the Virgin, thus attempting to absorb the energies of the pagan goddess images which were still at large in the common imagination.⁵
The early church intentionally suppressed and destroyed the manuscripts it inherited from Greek, Roman, and Hebrew sources. According to St. Augustine, this suppression was aimed at an intentional control of the magical power in connection with acoustics of the human voice. The alchemical writings from the middle ages to the eighteenth century show a strong influence of belief in acoustical power. Medieval sources, such as the Prophecies of Merlin (twelfth century), seem to preserve oral poetical traditions in which the inner powers are demonstrated. They may represent the remnants of ancient Druidic or Celtic teaching.

In the metaphysical and magical traditions which preceded modern psychology, the imagination was of paramount importance. It was the controlled imagination (moulding of consciousness into sets of images by an act of will) that acted as the fertile medium in which the obscure theories sprang to life as real experiences. In the invocations and chants of priests, monks, shamans or medicine men, the upper partials, the haunting higher sounds that arise out of the basic notes, were used as evidence of a spiritual presence inherent in the material world. We may reasonably infer that similar techniques were widespread in both pagan and early Christian inspirational chant.
Boethius (480 - 524)

The general idea of modal ethos was accepted in medieval theory without question borrowed from Classical antiquity, and according to Powers, specific doctrines regarding one mode or another became traditional.

Boethius states in the Prologue of his De musica:

The Phrygian tone, sung to a musical instrument, aroused one young man listening, the suitor of a certain girl, and provoked him to such rashness that he wanted to break into the girl’s room at once, by force. And when the Phrygian tone was changed to Hypophrygian, that is, the third to the fourth tone, the young man calmed down, appeased by the gentleness of the tone.11

According to Bower, Boethius studied Greek philosophy and the liberal arts. In 522, he became magister officium to Theodoric, the ruler of Italy, in Ravenna. Two years later he was executed as a traitor for defending a friend.12

Hoppin states that the writing of Boethius was primarily concerned with philosophical speculations on the nature of music, its effects, and its relation to man and the world in which he lived. Because these speculations took the expression of musical intervals by mathematical ratios as their starting point, music won its place in the Quadrivium. The medieval mind understood music as number related to or expressed in sound. According to Neo-Pythagorean view,
number and proportion regulated the universe. Music, therefore, represented and included the universe.\textsuperscript{13}

Boethius’ most famous work, \textit{De institutione musica}, was first translated in an English version by Calvin Bower and published by Yale University Press in 1989. In this work, Boethius treats the four mathematical disciplines of antiquity: arithmetic, music, geometry and astronomy (the Quadrivium). Of the five books covering these disciplines, only the \textit{De institutione arithmetica} and the greater part of the \textit{De institutione musica} survive.\textsuperscript{14}

Bower says Boethius believed music was an all-pervading force in the universe and a principle unifying the body and soul of man as well as the parts of the body. Music could also be found in certain instruments. These three represented the universal, human, and instrumental music.\textsuperscript{15} He discusses the relationship of mathematical principles to the monochord and presents the theory of musical modes in Book Three.\textsuperscript{16}

Boethius states in the \textit{Fundamentals of Music} that likeness attracts, whereas unlikeness repels. For this reason, a person with a lustful disposition takes pleasure in more lustful modes or is corrupted upon hearing them. Boethius said:

\begin{quote}
This is the reason musical modes were named after certain peoples, such as Lydian and Phrygian, for in whatever a particular people finds pleasure, by that same name the mode itself is designated. A tribe or
\end{quote}
race of people finds pleasure in modes because of likeness to its own character, for it is not possible for gentle things to be joined with or find pleasure in rough things, nor rough things in gentle.\textsuperscript{17}

Bower says \textit{De institutione musica} fell into virtual oblivion between the sixth and the eighth centuries, but began to be read again during the ninth century, when it was eventually established as the foundation of Western music theory. But in the Middle Ages the preoccupation was with polyphony and measured music which soon led to the neglect of Boethius’ writings in the training of musicians.\textsuperscript{18} A manuscript tradition of the work appears to have flourished in the tenth century, and the treatise became the most widespread theoretical treatise on music in the late Middle Ages. Bower writes that more than 120 manuscripts of the work survive from the Renaissance.\textsuperscript{19} This treatise was the only work known to the Middle Ages that presented the complete Greater Perfect System of Greek theory. It was built on the diatonic pitches from A through a’, made up of two pairs of conjunct tetrachords.\textsuperscript{20}

\textbf{Example 3-1} \hspace{1em} The Greater Perfect System

\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{c}
A \hspace{0.5em} B \hspace{0.5em} C \hspace{0.5em} D \hspace{0.5em} E \hspace{0.5em} F \hspace{0.5em} G \hspace{0.5em} A \\
B \hspace{0.5em} C \hspace{0.5em} D \hspace{0.5em} E \hspace{0.5em} F \hspace{0.5em} G \hspace{0.5em} A' \\
\end{tabular}
\end{center}
Medieval Modal Theory

In the Middle Ages, there was great confusion and union of theoretical systems. Two main strands of theory were imported into Western medieval theory during the eighth and ninth centuries, according to Randel. The first and fundamental strand was a system of eight modes borrowed from Syrian or Byzantine echoi. Randel says the earliest mention of the oktoechos is found in a Syrian source from about 515, three hundred years before the earliest account of the eight church modes. Another influence was the musical systems of the Greek era, transmitted to the medieval West especially by Boethius, according to Powers. A merger of these systems resulted in the church modes.

Throughout the Middle Ages, many changes occurred in the theoretical concepts of the modes. By the eleventh century, eight church modes had been organized into categories as shown in the following example. The modes that retained the old Greek names were called authentic; the "hypo" modal varieties were called plagal.
Example 3-2  The Eight Church Modes with Authentic and Plagal Distinctions during the Eleventh Century.  

Rather than concentrating on modal ethos during the Middle Ages, music theorists compared the eight modes to the motions of the seven planets (the moon, Mercury, Venus, the sun, Mars, Jupiter, Saturn) plus the zodiac. The following table was prepared by Aurelian, a French scholar and monk in the ninth century. In the Guidonian tradition, the eight modes were likened to the Beatitudes. In an anonymous thirteenth-century treatise, the eightfold system was correlated with the macrocosmic elements of the universe and the human microcosm of bodily fluids and temperaments.  

Example 3-3  The Harmonious Union of the Muses, Modes and Planets,  
From the Thirteenth Century
Guido d'Arezzo (c. 990-1050) was a Benedictine monk who made important contributions to the development of musical theory in the Middle Ages. *Micrologus* is Guido's most important work. He established the hexachord Ut, Re, Mi, Fa, Sol, La as an aid to sight-singing from syllables in the initial lines of the Hymn of St. John:

\[ Ut \text{ queant laxis Resonare fibris} \]
\[ Mira gestorum Famuli tuorum, \]
\[ Solve polluti Labii reatum \]
\[ Sancte Joannes. \]

Example 3-4  Hexachord Syllables Combined with Modes (later Middle Ages)
The following is a compilation of modal affects from three eleventh-century sources, as an illustration of the kinds of similarities and differences that can exist in ascribing *ethos* to the members of a modal system. Harold Powers states that the sources are Hermannus Contractus (eleventh century), Frutolfus of Michelsberg (before 1100), and Johannes Afflighemensis (c. 1100). Powers says they probably do not represent independent traditions, despite their mutual differences. By this time, theorists were applying their own descriptions to the church modes, depending on how each mode made them individually feel.

Mode 1, Dorian:
Hermannus, “serious or noble”;
Frutolfus, “mobile because it is capable of all affects”;
Johannes, “lingering and courtly meanderings.”

Mode 2, Hypodorian:
Hermannus: “agreeable”;
Frutolfus: “mournful because its melody seems more suitable to sad and unhappy things”;
Johannes: “deep-voiced seriousness.”

Mode 3, Phrygian:
Hermannus, “excited or leaping”;
Frutolfus: “excitable”;
Johannes: “harsh and rather indignant leaping about.”

Mode 4, Hypophrygian:
Hermannus, “moderate or lingering”;
Frutolfus, “moderate and serious”;
Johannes, “adulatory.”
Mode 5, Lydian:
Hermannus, "voluptuous";
Frutolfus, "joyful";
Johannes, "moderate wantonness."

Mode 6, Hypolydian:
Hermannus, "mournful";
Frutolfus, "voluptuous";
Johannes, "lachrymose."

Mode 7, Mixolydian:
Hermannus, "garrulous";
Frutolfus, "joyful and merry";
Johannes, "theatrical leaps."

Mode 8, Hypomixolydian:
Hermannus, "joyful or exultant";
Frutolfus, "agreeable and sweet";
Johannes, "seemly and rather matronly."

By the eleventh century, these modal attributes had become more an individual attitude toward each mode rather than based on anything the Greeks might have originally intended. The value of these opinions about the ethos of the modes by writers during the Middle Ages is nebulous. The mystery of the original Greek ethos as understood by Pythagoras, Plato, and Aristotle remained a mystery.

Powers states that between the thirteenth and fifteenth century, musicians were creating artistic forms of polyphony, and theory was showing greater interest in rhythm, mensural notation, discant, and counterpoint. Powers states that the last phase of medieval modal theory developed in Italy during the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries.
In the early Renaissance, the German composer Hermann Finck listed the ethic affect of each tone in his book, *Practica Musica* (1556). Along with traditional attributes, Finck attributed the modes to the seven planets. He wrote:

1. Dorian refreshes the sad and disturbed. It is like the Sun, deemed first among the planets. The foremost musicians today use this tone the most.

2. Hypodorian produces tears, makes one pitiable, heavy, serious, and is the most subdued of all, like the Moon.

3. Phrygian, not wrongly attributed to Mars, moves to loud words, hideous battles, and bold deeds.

4. Hypophrygian represents the parasite, who caters to the passions of his master and is assigned to Mercury on account of the likeness in nature.

5. Lydian, not unlike the sanguine temperament, corresponds with cheerfulness, friendliness, and the gentler affects, since it pleases most of all. It averts quarrels, calms agitation, fosters peace and is of a jovial nature. It is the joy of the sorrowful, the restoring of the desperate, and the solace of the afflicted.

6. Hypolydian is contrary to the former, not infrequent in prayers by others and is attributed to Venus.

7. Mixolydian has more in common with Saturn, and shows itself with great shouts, so as to be a terror to all.

8. Hypomixolydian is not unlike an honest matron, who tries to soften and calm the wrath and turmoil of her husband with agreeable discourse, studiously avoids offense, and is pacific.
Powers says there was no necessary connection between modes, modal theory, and polyphonic composition in either theory or in practice. From 1450-1600, musicians increasingly believed that polyphonic music must “somehow” be modal. They believed that the modes furnished a number of differently-structured musical relationships, each of which had its own set of expressive characteristics that could naturally reinforce the affective sense of a verbal text, which was especially advantageous for poetic enhancement. The tradition that a mode had inherent expressive properties and extramusical associations related to planets, muses, and the human body was an essential part of most modal systems.

Guido was reported to have said:

“The third tone has broken leaps, and so its song is impetuous. The sixth has gentle leaps, and this is voluptuous. The seventh is garrulous [annoyingly talkative], on account of many short turnabouts. The eighth is more agreeable on account of its lingering and less frequent turnings.”

Powers said that seen in this way, the modes are not merely classified in a closed system of categories nor collected as scales or melody types. Guido’s modes are depicted as real, individual entities, with characters identified as impetuous, voluptuous, garrulous, and agreeable. Such characters as these are ethic, expressive, and even have the moral power as a musical entity to act on the human spirit.
Even in the Middle Ages, the authenticity of a Classic origin had begun to decay. The Neo-Classic rebirth in the Renaissance had not yet happened. The ancient Greek texts had not yet been rediscovered. Through folklore, chants, poetry, and old wives' tales, traditions of modal ethos continued, though losing a little here and a little there of the truthfulness of the ancient origin. This decay continued through the centuries; and even during the Renaissance, much new confusion in interpretation of the long-neglected Greek and Latin languages added to the loss of authenticity of accurate interpretation of modal ethos as the Greeks would have intuitively understood it.

Today, relatively little written information can be found on modal ethos during the Middle Ages. Polyphonic music of the period used the Church Modes rather than the unadulterated Greek modes. The ancient ethos of the modes began to be anybody's guess. Harold Powers' article on "Modes" in the New Grove Dictionary offers the most comprehensive information available on modal ethos during the Middle Ages. Even though the classical tradition of linking ethos to the modes continued to prevail and fascinate musicians and theorists through the following centuries, the true Hellenic tradition as taught by Plato and Aristotle was basically lost.
Notes


9 Stewart, *Music*, 89.


27 Mensural notation was a system of musical notation established around 1250 by Franco of Cologne which remained in use until 1600. Mensural music, which is written using mensural notation, denotes polyphonic music in which every note has a strictly determined value, as distinct from plainsong (Gregorian chant) with its free rhythm. (*Harvard Dictionary of Music*, 439.)

28 In discant, two or more parts proceed note-against-note in strictly measured rhythms often employing rhythmic modes. (Randel 306.)
32. Randel, Harvard, 139.
CHAPTER IV

THE RENAISSANCE

Antiquity Revisited

The Renaissance in Italy won worldwide dominance because of its revival of antiquity, according to Palisca. The best musicians from everywhere were recruited to perform in the Italian courts and churches; a constant demand for instruments stimulated the production of new varieties and designs, and Venice became the music publishing capital of the world.¹

The relation between text and music, and the degree to which the aural sense or mathematics should determine the rules of composition continued to be topics which provoked much thought.² For Pythagoras and Plato, the rules were mathematical, whereas for Aristotle, music was for aural enjoyment. Polyphony in the Renaissance was composed based on mathematical principles until the books on ancient musical learning by Boethius, Aristotle and others began to be rediscovered around 1450. Early collectors valued these books so highly that sometimes hundreds of crates of books were carefully passed from one owner to the next through the will of the deceased owner. However, few musically trained
persons could read Greek, and many problems arose during translation because of the scribes' ignorance of music theory. Because music was considered to be a division of mathematics, the manipulation of ratios was necessary for understanding the relationship of intervals to each other.

By the end of the fifteenth century, a feverish activity of editing, translating, commenting on and synthesizing Greek sources took place in literature, rhetoric, history, medicine, philosophy, and natural science. By the mid-sixteenth century, in Rome or Venice, it was possible for a scholar to locate at least one copy of any of the principal Greek musical treatises because of the wider distribution of printed sources. Over the years, some of the Greek texts that were borrowed from libraries and private owners were not returned because they were so highly valued.

Palisca tells us that *De institutione musica* of Boethius was first printed in Venice in 1492; thereafter, having almost infallible and scriptural authority in the field of music. The picture of the Greek modes as written by Boethius within the framework of the Quadrivium is what the early humanists had to guide them in understanding the writings of Plato and Aristotle. However, Renaissance musicians misunderstood Boethius by assuming that he described a system using the eight church modes.
Gallicus de Namur (c. 1415-73) was the first Western writer to recognize that the theory of Boethius was concerned not with plainchant but with the music of the ancient Greeks, especially the theories pertaining to modes. So, the rereading of Boethius became a vital component for the reexamination of antiquity.

Example 4-1  Rediscovery of the Eight Modes of Boethius

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Hypodorian</th>
<th>Hypophrygian</th>
<th>Hypolydian</th>
<th>Dorian</th>
<th>Phrygian</th>
<th>Lydian</th>
<th>Mixolydian</th>
<th>Hypermixolydian</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A B c d e f g a</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tone</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B c d e f g a b</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tone</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c d e f g a b c d'</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semitone</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d e f g a b c d'</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tone</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e f g a b c d' e'</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tone</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f g a b c d' e' f'</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semitone</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g a b c d' e' f' g'</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tone</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a b c' d' e' f' g' a'</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Palisca says in the fifteenth century, Boethius was cast in the alien role of musical law-giver to a culture dedicated to polyphony, a kind of music he never knew.
The Affects and Modal Misappropriation

Bishop Bernardino Franco wrote in a letter in 1549, the ancients created powerful effects that we nowadays cannot produce either with rhetoric or with oratory in moving the passions and affections of the soul. [Composers] should seek to recover the art of the ancients, who were able with music to make the lax active, the angry calm, the dissolute temperate, to console the afflicted and to make happy the miserable.  

The following is an excerpt from an anonymous letter written around 1540:

“To inflame souls and spirits to anger, choose the Third Mode.” This attribution of ancient Greek affects to the church modes represents well the attitude of Renaissance writers concerning modal affects. The writer speaks of the Phrygian as the Third Mode but gives the ethos of the ancient Greek harmoniai, “inflames to anger.” The Lydian is characterized as pleasing and sweet, fitting to peaceful Lydian people. Of the Dorian he says that it was “severe and majestic and filled the ears of hearers with sweetness.”

Palisca in Humanism in Italian Renaissance Musical Thought introduces a table attributed to Matteo Nardo, whom he describes as an otherwise unknown Renaissance writer. Palisca disputes Nardo’s table. “Who would compose a stirring martial piece in the church Phrygian, or banish gloom with the sorry tritone-ridden church Lydian? Here is humanism gone awry, a sad legacy of early Renaissance musical scholarship’s failure to make
necessary distinctions between two totally different tonal systems--the ancient Greek and the Western medieval."\textsuperscript{12}

Example 4-2  Matteo Nardo’s Table

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Aron (1525) Trattano, ch. 25</th>
<th>Nardo Letter</th>
<th>Gaffurio (1518) De harmonia, IV</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I:</td>
<td>joy, happiness, merriment</td>
<td>Dorian: grave, sonorous, majestic, fills ear with sweetness</td>
<td>modesty, virile, constancy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II:</td>
<td>grave, used by ancients in funerals</td>
<td>Hypodorian:</td>
<td>slowness, slothfulness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III:</td>
<td>inflames to anger, animosity</td>
<td>Phrygian: inflames to anger</td>
<td>incites to anger, war</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV:</td>
<td>suited to rest, tranquility</td>
<td>Hypophrygian:</td>
<td>quiet, grave</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V:</td>
<td>relieves melancholy, troubles</td>
<td>Lydian: pleasing, sweet, jovial.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI:</td>
<td>induces tears, compassion</td>
<td>Hypolydian:</td>
<td>tears, lamenting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII:</td>
<td>mixture of modesty and joviality</td>
<td>Mixolydian:</td>
<td>twofold: exciting and withdrawn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII:</td>
<td>for merry and happy banquets</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Aristides Quintilianus’ diagram of the Greek modes\textsuperscript{13} (Example 4-3) may not be entirely accurate, but it is the best likeness we have today. The + signs symbolize a pitch a quarter-tone higher. In comparing the Greek modes to the church modes, one finds an absence of leaps and an absence of the plus signs in the church modes. There is no way to simulate the exact pitch any of these modes may have begun on. These modes, though called by the same names, would sound entirely different from each other, as well as anything we might imagine them to be today.
The modes were fascinating to Renaissance musicians because they were thought to unlock the powers of music over human feelings and morals. Works by Plato and Aristotle, now printed Latin translations, spoke of the emotional, moral or ethical effects that could be wrought by a musician through the proper choice of mode. Artful communication that could sway people through their feelings became a prime objective for gaining or maintaining power.

Jean Calvin, the Franco-Swiss religious reformer, wrote in *The Genève Psalter* in 1542, “...there is hardly anything in the world with more power [than music] to turn or bend, this way and that, the morals of men, as Plato has prudently considered. And, we find by experience that it has a secret and almost incredible power to move our hearts in one way or another.”
Strunk writes that Franchino Gaffurio, Heinrich Glarean, Gioseffe Zarlino, and Girolamo Mei worked diligently to investigate ancient music and to rescue it in their writings from the darkness in which it had been buried.\textsuperscript{17} The theory of modal affect was commented upon enthusiastically. The old Hellenic beliefs were adapted to new ends and were refashioned with increasing freedom. In practical application, composers began to use modes in an intricate polyphonic texture. Polyphonic collections ordered with the eight modes in succession were published, from Rore’s first book of five-part madrigals (1542) to Palestrina’s offertories (1594).\textsuperscript{18}

Girolamo Mei (1519-1594), who had never studied music and could neither play nor sing, became a musical reformer, urging his musical associates through essays and letters to reshape the music of their time in the image of ancient Greek music. Mei believed the modes (\textit{tonoi}) were the key to the power that ancient music had to communicate with human emotions. To regain this power, the ancient system of \textit{tonoi} needed to be revived. After a time, Mei, collaborating with Vincenzo Galilei (1520-1591), a celebrated Italian writer on music, definitely established that the system of the Greeks was completely different from the church modes.\textsuperscript{19} Because of doubt Mei cast on the relation of ancient Greek modes and
those used in the Renaissance, his research led him to question altogether the
expressive ability of polyphony.²⁰

Galilei criticized the composers of his day. According to Strunk, he knew through study that the direction Renaissance music was going was completely opposed to the Greek rules. Galilei said the composers of his day were esteemed, prized, and salaried by various gentlemen to compose what they called “music.” He said the last thing composers thought of was the expression and sense of the words with the passion they require. He said the music of his day was of value merely for “artificial” (wind and stringed) instruments, from which the ear desires nothing but the enjoyment of their harmonies.

Nevertheless, Renaissance musicians believed that music had reached the highest perfection possible and ridiculed Galilei, who responded with the observation of how bold these men were who laughed at an art of composition they knew nothing about, much less how to produce it. Galilei believed and argued that their polyphonic music was not expressing the affections as taught by the Greeks. But the Renaissance composers argued that music was no longer considered as useful to virtue or human happiness or to express the passions in praising the gods, the genii or the heroes.²¹

Strunk writes that Heinrich Glarean (1488-1563), Swiss musical theorist and writer, was one of the great humanists of the sixteenth century. He was a
lifelong admirer of Boethius. Glarean's *Dodecachordon* (1547) advanced the theory that there are twelve church modes corresponding to the ancient Greek modes. By adding four modes to the existing eight church modes, he claimed to have restored the ancient Greek system. Powers writes that Glarean synthesized medieval and ancient sources to assign names to his new modes. He retained Boethius’s names for the modes in the sense in which they had come to be understood in the Middle Ages as octave species. Glarean’s book had a tremendous influence on the changing concept of the modal system and the ever-present problems of composing with the modes.
Example 4-4  Glarean's Twelve Modes

Powers writes that Glarean was fully committed to the doctrine of modal ethos, and here too, his work reveals his synthesis of the classical revival with the medieval heritage. Glarean wrote, "The Phrygian, the third mode, is a particularly famous and ancient mode... Horace calls it 'barbarus'... Lucian calls it 'divinely inspired.' Some say that it incites to battle and inflames the appetite of a frenzied
rage. Some have thought that it has the character of moving to tears; therefore they set it freely to words that are tearful and full of laments." Glarean applied these Greek affects to the church modes without realizing these modes could not be expected to work the marvelous effects that the ancient authors attributed to the Greek harmoniae.

Palisca writes that of fifteenth-century writers who specialized in music, Franchino Gaffurio (1451-1522), celebrated Italian theorist, was diligent in seeking classical sources. Because he could barely read Greek, he was unable to study the original sources for himself. Unfortunately, he studied Glarean’s misinterpretations of Boethius and accepted them as truth.

In spite of his mistake in believing that Boethius was writing about the church modes when he was actually writing about the ancient Greek modes that had not been in practical existence since the fall of the Roman Empire in the year 476 C.E., Gaffurio’s writings enhanced the prestige and vigor of the modes among composers and theorists.

Gaffurio believed, like Plato, that the human soul is organized according to musical ratios. To Gaffurio, cosmic and human harmony were the very basis of music’s power and purpose. In his treatise Practica musicae, he speaks of its force over inanimate things. He states that all souls are imbued with harmony, and they derive pleasure from music because it answers to the harmony within
themselves. He quotes Aristoxenus as saying that “a certain tuning pitch exists in one’s body like that of the voice and instruments. Just as sounds are made in singing, various vibrations arise out of the nature and form of the whole body.”

In the final chapter of his Theorica, Gaffurio states that the voice joined by instruments creates a “double affection” which can excite, quiet or expel passions of the soul.

Gaffurio said, “Let the composer of a vocal piece make the melody agree in sweetness with its words, so that when these are about love or a plea for death or some lament, let him set mournful sounds as far as he can. Order the piece in the Fourth, Sixth, or Second Tone, since these Tones are more relaxed and are known to produce this kind of effect easily. When the words speak of indignation and rebuke, it is fitting to utter harsh and harder sounds, which are ascribed most often to the Third and Seventh Tones. Words of praise and modesty seek somehow intermediate sounds, which are properly ascribed to the First and Eighth Tones.”

Strunk writes that here Gaffurio was ascribing the Greek affects to the church modes which shows his complete lack of understanding for Boethius’ writings and meanings.

Zarlino (1517-1590), Italian music theorist and composer, was learned in philosophy, poetry and mathematics. He is generally thought of as one of the greatest musical theorists of the sixteenth century. His teacher was the Venetian
master Adrian Willaert. His books, *Istituzioni Harmoniche* and *Dimostrazioni Harmoniche*, are excellent treatises on counterpoint, harmony, and modal theory, which opened the door to modern practice. He bases harmonic law not on the eight mode system, but on Glarean’s twelve church modes.

Zarlino took pride in his century’s re-creation of the music of the ancient world and flatly rejected the music of the Middle Ages. His writings bear witness to the extraordinary range and depth of his reading and to the understanding with which he read. Around 1558, Zarlino adopted Glarean’s system in its entirety.²⁴

Zarlino was very interested in the power that music had on the passions and the means by which it could be activated. Zarlino believed the nature of the mode must be studied by the composer who must take care to accompany each word in such a way that, if it denoted harshness, hardness, cruelty, or bitterness, the harmony must be similar, but so that it does not offend. If any word expresses complaint, grief, affliction, sighs or tears, the harmony will be full of sadness.³⁵

Zarlino defended with some persuasion the idea of celestial harmony. He wrote, “When the body is listless, it is brought back to health with cures wrought by medicine, and the afflicted and weak spirit by instrumental and vocal music.”³⁶ He believed human harmony resides in the four elements of the body and that the nerves are composed of earth and fire, the bones of water and air, and the flesh of
all four. He said that no one would deny that the four humors—black bile, phlegm, blood, and yellow bile—are united in the body through harmony.

Example 4-5  The Four Elements

In his *Istitutioni harmoniche*, Zarlino wrote that the Fifth, Sixth, Eighth, Eleventh and Twelfth Modes are “lively and full of cheer.” The First, Second, Third, Fourth, Ninth and Tenth are “sad and soft.” Here again, Zarlino was applying the Greek *ethos* to the church modes rather than to the Greek modes. Galilei, who attacked Zarlino’s entire teaching, realized this and wrote:

> When Zarlino said that among our modes one has a quiet nature, others are lascivious, cheerful, tranquil, infuriated and others have yet different natures and
characters, and that the modes as used today by musical practitioners have the same capacities that the ancient modes possessed, I would answer, persuaded by experience which teaches us the contrary, that these are all tales contrived to confuse dunderheads.  

Galilei, who was not a musician or a contrapuntist, was Zarlino’s pupil in Venice around 1564. After a period, he became dissatisfied with some of Zarlino’s solutions to important theoretical questions and became Zarlino’s most outspoken and severest critic.

Galilei also attacked the elaborate polyphonic style of the sixteenth century in his Dialogo della musica antica e della moderna (1581). He saw no reason to revere the ancient rules when they were daily violated in practice. He did not believe that Renaissance theorists and musicians, led by Gaffurio, Glarean, and Zarlino, had been able to restore music to its ancient state.

**Word-Painting vs. the Concetti**

In the second half of the sixteenth century, aesthetic doctrines were strongly directed toward the Aristotelian idea that ‘art imitates nature.’ Word-painting became a standard device in vocal polyphony. It was a principal feature of the Italian madrigal. Joachim Thuringus, in 1624, wrote, “There are three categories of words that may be expressed and painted by means of music: words
of affections (weep, laugh, pity), words of motion and places (leap, cast down, heaven, abyss), and words of time and number (quickly, twice)."^44

Sixteenth century composers used word-painting in vocal music to depict a word or an idea associated with a word, e.g., an ascending passage for 'exalted' or a dissonance on 'pain.' The term refers only to the treatment of individual words and not to the dominant affection of an entire piece, according to Warren.\(^45\) Some of the most moving passages in the motets of Josquin are the result of highly expressive forms of word-painting.

*De profundis clamavi ad te, Domine.*
Out of the depths I have cried to thee, O Lord.

Example 4-6 Josquin Des Prez, Psalm 129
Deep anguish, serene confidence

---

---
Vincenzo Galilei was one of the first to ridicule word-painting. In 1581 in his *Dialogo*, Galilei wrote: “I... treat ... the most important and principal part there is in music,... the imitation of the ideas [congetti] that are drawn from the words.” “Congetti are imitations of things outside us; and nature is that which forms them in the mind [anima], which knows how to imitate them with the voice and the various passions of the soul. Names, words and all discourse imitates things and *congetti*.48 He said that they are what Aristotle called thoughts or notions.49

The decline of the polyphonic madrigal also brought a decline in the use of word-painting.50 He criticized those who broke into unseemly fast notes at words meaning ‘to flee’ or ‘to fly,’ or have the singers suddenly halt at words meaning ‘to disappear,’ ‘to faint,’ or ‘to die.’ He said to symbolize ‘alone’ composers reduce the music to one part, and for the word ‘two’ or ‘together,’ they reduced it to two parts, or resort to black notes for ‘dark’ and white notes for ‘light.’ They imitate drums, trumpets and other sounds unsuited to voices. Galilei said the entire genre of madrigalism was in a state of ruin.51

Galilei stated of one of Lasso’s works, on the line, “He descended into hell,” that the composition descends in such a way that the singer sounds like someone groaning to frighten children rather than anyone singing. On the words, “aspires to the stars,” Lasso ascends to a height that no one shrieking from
excessive pain has ever reached. On the words meaning weep, laugh, sing, shout, shriek, harsh chains, hard bonds, cruel woman, the words are spoken rhetorically. Galilei said that if famous Greek orators had uttered these words in such a fashion, they would have moved their listeners to laughter and contempt and would have been despised as foolish and worthless men. Galilei said the music of Willaert and Lasso and others of his day was so remote from the ancient music as to be its mortal enemy with no means of producing effects because its sole aim was to delight the ear.52

Galilei said:

The aim of ancient music was to induce in another the same passion that one feels oneself. The orator who wished to move the passions studied them and imitated not only the actor but any other sort of person who might help him to this end. When the ancient musician sang any poem whatever, he first considered diligently the character of the person speaking, his age, his sex, with whom he was speaking and the effect he sought to produce. Using the words chosen by the poet, the musician then expressed in the tone and with the accents and gestures the quality of sound and rhythm appropriate to produce the proper effect. The ancient musician expressed through words, rhythms, proper modes, his countenance, habits and gestures his burning desire to fight, to overcome, and to conquer the enemy.53

Galilei believed the passions were missing in the music of his day. He wanted composers not only to imitate the essence of the concetti, (the ideas behind the words) rather than simply its words, but to imitate also the sound qualities of
He said the composer should study the qualities of voice—pitch, volume, accents, rapidity and gestures—used by different categories of people to speak to one another—children, servants, princes, girls, matrons—to imitate the essence of the words in a more life-like manner. This is what the ancients did when they sang a poem, choosing a tonos, accents, quantity and quality of sound, and rhythm appropriate to the action and person. In 1591, Galilei wrote: “No one so far as I know has yet taught the way to accompany the words, or rather the thoughts behind them, with notes.”

One of the main points Galilei asserted in his Dialogo in 1586 was that the church modes had none of the virtues claimed for them by Glarean and Zarlino. Galilei wanted to see modality abandoned in favor of a system based on the model of the ancient Greeks, to restore the power that ancient music had to communicate human emotions. He believed this could only be accomplished if the ancient system of tonoi were revived.

Text Setting

During the Renaissance, in the First Practice (primo practica), the composer was guided by the principle that harmony was the mistress of the text. In the Second Practice (secondo practica), the text was the mistress of the harmony, according to Marco Scacchi. The division between music that was “affective”
(Second Practice) and that which emphasized complex polyphony (First Practice) occurred at the end of the Renaissance because of the rediscovery of the ancient Greek texts.

Plato had stated that of the three components of song—words, rhythm and melody—the words were by far the most important. "The harmony and rhythm must follow the words." Renaissance composers felt that it was one thing to say that the music should be "suited" to the text, such as in word-painting, but it was quite another to suggest that the music should be "subservient" to the text, as in expressing the concetti. Strunk wrote that composers and theorists turned to classical principles again for guidance in laying the syllables and words under the notes during this period.
Josquin Des Prez was the greatest of the fifteenth-century contrapuntists, according to De Robeck. His fame was enormous. "Prince of music," his contemporaries declared, saying, "No one knows as he does how to excite the emotions of the soul by his songs."\(^{61}\)

Glarean praised Josquin for being able to express the passions of the soul in music more effectively than any other composer in his century. He believed it was easy for Josquin to combine melodies belonging to different modes. Glarean said, "In the motet, "De profundis," he goes from Dorian to Phrygian, creeping unobserved and without offending the ear. He ends the combined systems of the Dorian and Hypodorian on E, the seat of the Phrygian." Glarean said, "This was
not so much an expression of an affection as a demonstration of unusual agility and cleverness in combining the modes."

"Musica reservata" was a term first used during the 1540s and 1550s to characterize the music of Josquin and his followers, to express its clarity, balance and expressiveness. In the late sixteenth century, the term more narrowly meant "expressive interpretation of the text." Musica reservata was a forerunner of the Affektenlehre (Doctrine of Affections) of the Baroque period (seventeenth century roughly) and the empfindsamer Stil (Sensitive Style) of the later eighteenth century, whose chief practitioner was Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach. 
Example 4-8 Josquin, "De profundis." Glarean said Josquin “goes from the Dorian to the Phrygian, creeping unobserved and without offending the ear. He ends the combined systems of the Dorian and Hypodorian on E, the seat of the Phrygian.” Josquin moves the emotions through combining modes. *Dominus* means Lord in Latin.
Adrian Willaert (1490 - 1562)

According to Palisca, Adrian Willaert was an important Flemish composer who offers a fine example of Renaissance text setting in his madrigal from *Musica nova, "Aspro core e selvaggio."* It was probably composed before 1540 and uses Petrarch's poetry.\(^{65}\) Galilei said, "Contrapuntists are confident that they have adequately imitated the ideas and the words of a poem such as the line "Aspro core e selvaggio, e cruda voglia" if "they have made the parts sing many sevenths, fourths, seconds and major sixths and caused a coarse, bitter and little pleasing sound."\(^{66}\)

In the following example, throughout the first two lines, the lowest voice moves consistently by upward leaps of the fifth and downward leaps of the fourth, which Zarlino says\(^ {67}\) gives a sad and subdued effect. He does not explain why. The beginning of the second part exhibits frequent leaps of the fourth up and the fifth down, which gives a happy, excited, virile, and natural feeling.\(^ {68}\) To express grief and sorrow, Willaert uses the half step and the minor third [in measure 14] to produce sounds that are sweet and soft. To my own tonally trained ear, I found the exact opposite to be true. The first two lines seemed happier than the section with the B\(^ b\), which to me sounds minor, indicating sadness.\(^ {69}\)
Example 4-9  Willaert's Madrigal. Sad and Subdued Affects
Using Intervallic Combinations

Aspro core e selvaggio, e cruda voglia
In dolce, humile, angelica figura
In a sweet, humble and angelic figure
Hard and wild heart, and raw desire
Example 4-10 Willaert. Happy, excited, virile, natural feeling. Galilei, I believe, would disagree with Palisca, that Willaert here offers a "fine example of text setting." Galilei would say the concetti were missing because Willaert used intervals to express the emotions, not words. Concetti are ideas behind the words. While emotions can be expressed using intervals, concetti can only be expressed by laying the syllables under the notes so as to express the conceptions behind the words.
By the end of the sixteenth century, the entire corpus of Greek music theory had been translated and studied, although it had not necessarily been understood.\(^70\) Because of the new polyphonic directions composition was taking in motets, masses and madrigals, theorizing about the modes was causing utter confusion.\(^71\) The eight-mode system, the competing twelve-mode system, and the eight psalm tones were being mixed together and were causing chaos, according to Powers. Multiple problems ultimately led to the abandonment of the modal hexachord system as the model available for musical composition. In the later sixteenth and early seventeenth century, Glarean's twelve-mode system was taken up enthusiastically by composers as well as by theorists.\(^72\)

In the last quarter of the sixteenth century, musicians were considering Boethius as a resource for the study of Greek music theory and practice and no longer as the gospel for music theory of their own generation. Much of Boethius had been an embarrassment to music theorists, because they could not understand large parts of it, and many parts they could understand disagreed with what they believed.\(^73\)

**The Florentine *Camerata***

By the end of the sixteenth century (1570s), a small, informal group (*camerata*) of nobles, scholars, and musicians began to meet at the home of
Giovanni Bardi in Florence to discuss music, poetry, astrology, and other sciences. The *Camerata*'s purpose was to formulate theories of expressive music based on their study of the music practices of the ancient Greeks and Romans. One of their chief aims was to restore music in some degree to the height from which it had fallen after the barbaric Goths overthrew the Roman Empire.

Palisca writes that the *Camerata* wanted to restore the combination of words, music, modes, and affections that altogether made up the ancient Greek theater. They knew the Greeks were great poets and philosophers who were not trying to please the ear like the modern musicians, but who made an impression on the intellect, the most noble part of man, according to the passion (cheer or pain) in the poetry. The composers and poets of the *Camerata* were eager to end the distortion of the words in the polyphonic music of their own time. They said that the text must at all times be understood, that the words must be sung with a meticulous natural sense, and that the music must interpret the spirit of the whole. The focus on ancient Greek music probably became most intense between 1572 and 1578, when Galilei and Bardi were corresponding with Girolamo Mei, who, according to Grout, seems to have been first to suggest the idea of monodic singing based on the style of the Greeks. Each of his letters brought fresh discoveries about Greek music to stimulate new rounds of debate for the *Camerata.*
Vincenzo Galilei said the correct way to set words was to use a solo melody that would enhance the natural speech inflections of a good orator. With the help of Emilio de’ Cavalieri, Jacopo Peri and Giulio Caccini, he began to extract the essence of the Greek and Latin musical theories and, by this means, to become a thorough master of music theory. Galilei set to music a lament from Dante’s *Inferno* and a part of the Lamentations and Responds of Holy Week. These were sung by a tenor and accompanied by a consort of viols for the *Camerata*. This novelty was pleasing and aroused envy among the professional musicians.

The *Camerata*’s revival of the theories of ancient music helped to produce the new concept of monody (from the Greek *monodia*: monos “alone” and aidein, “to sing”) as well as the first operas. Among the first poems to be sung as monodies with consort accompaniment were the *Story of Daphne* (1597), and *Euridice* (1600), by Peri.
Notes


37 The four humors in early physiology.


56 Palisca, *Humanism*, 76.

57 Palisca, *Studies*, 76, 470.

58 Palisca, *Studies*, 85-86.


64 De Robeck, *Italian Renaissance*, 23.

65 Palisca, *Humanism*, 357.


72 Powers, “Modes,” 414.

73 Palisca, Studies, 188.


77 Palisca, Camerata, 5.

78 Grout, History, 278.

79 Strunk, Renaissance, 1965, 16.

80 Strunk, Renaissance, 15-16.

81 Grout, History, 277.


CHAPTER V

INTO THE BAROQUE

The term *baroque* was probably derived from the Portuguese *barrocco*, meaning a pearl of irregular form. Other meanings include “grotesque,” and “overladen with scroll-work.” Both the beginning and the end of the Baroque period in music are rather clearly defined, much more so than those of most other periods, particularly the Renaissance. Baroque music starts about 1600, with the rise of monody, opera, oratorio, cantata, recitative, and closes 150 years later, with the deaths of Bach and Handel.¹

More than any other period, the seventeenth century contributed toward the development and establishment of clearly defined forms and genres, such as the ostinato-forms, the variations, the suite, the sonata, the rondo, the concerto, the opera, the oratorio, the cantata, and the da-capo aria. In texture, Baroque music emphasized melody and bass, with the space in between filled in by improvised harmony using the figured bass or *basso continuo* technique. This was a method of indicating an accompanying part by showing the bass notes only with figures designating the intervals and chords to be played above them. The Baroque was a
period of improvised harmony and elaborate melodic ornamentation. The tonic and dominant were established as the principal chords about 1650.\(^2\)

Many great composers contributed to the music of the Baroque. Also, there were the great theoretical writers of the age--Heinichen and Mattheson. We will now explore some of the contributions of these great theorists to the development of ideas about affects in music.

**Johann David Heinichen (1683 - 1729)**

Johann David Heinichen was a distinguished German composer and a major theorist of the early eighteenth century.\(^3\) As a child, he studied harpsichord and organ. In 1706, he completed a law degree. In 1709, he moved to Leipzig and composed several operas. He moved to Venice in 1710, the center of Italian operatic music, where he was commissioned to write two operas, both successfully produced in 1713. In 1717, he was engaged as Kapellmeister to the court at Dresden, a position he retained all his life. During this employment, he wrote a vast amount of secular and sacred music. He revised and rewrote his earlier thoroughbass manual (first written in 1711), almost doubling the contents which he published at his own expense.\(^4\)

Heinichen composed in almost every form of his day except for keyboard--more than 250 works, many of which were lost in World War II. None of his
music was published during his lifetime. His musical style, which mixed the national idioms of German, French and Italian music, is more *galant* or pre- Classical in character than contrapuntal, according to Buelow. His operas were more Venetian than German. The *Einleitung*, new to the second version of his thoroughbass manual, provides insights into German compositional principles of musical rhetoric and the expression of the affections. Heinichen’s concern for affect and the application of rhetorical devices\(^5\) originated during his student years. According to Buelow, few composers of the Baroque have left us such confident, experience-tested opinions about their musical art.\(^6\)

Heinichen’s famous book, which he called *Der General-Bass in der Komposition*, was published in 1728. He followed the tradition set by the majority of theorists of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries that associates musical composition with the Greco-Roman doctrines of rhetoric and oratory. Concerning affect, he considered the most important question to ask when determining the affects to express in a musical work is, “What feeling results from the previous situation?” By studying the text of the recitative in opera, one can discover the affect to be expressed in the following aria. In the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, persuasive speech rooted in the Aristotelian example became synonymous with the Baroque composer’s purpose in writing vocal music. In Baroque vocal music, emotion (or affect) evolving directly from the application of
the word and the idea became the composer's goal. It was not easy for the composer to find and detect the underlying basic affect he was supposed to address among all the words and thoughts in a particular aria.7

Heinichen believed the true purpose of music was to move the “bottomless ocean” of emotions of an audience by the expression of words and affects in music through refined and text-related musical expression.8 He said we can best stimulate our imagination by using the *loci topici*.9 The *locus topicus* was a standard rhetorical device to assist the orator to discover topics and ideas for formal discourse. It was derived from the Greek *topos* and the Latin *locus communis*, and first appears in this amalgamation of languages in seventeenth-century rhetorical manuals printed in Germany. The *loci* were rationalized categories of topics. The most common *loci* were those of cause, place, time, manner, and means.10

Heinichen wrote that there is no better way to enliven the imagination of the composer than by using the *loci topici*. Even with the most uninspired text, the composer should examine the material by considering the *antecedentia*, *concomitantia* and *consequentia*. Examine the circumstances of the person and events, what is happening, the cause and intent, the time frame and the location. A skilled composer will always find ideas and be able to create clever inventions by weighing carefully the purpose of the words.11
Buelow states the following examples, taken from Heinichen’s treatise, are based on four texts. Using the *locus* called *locus circumstantiarum* to discover the antecedent, concomitant, and consequence of the text, he demonstrates how the composer can discover the appropriate affects.

Regarding the following operatic excerpt, Heinichen said,

In this opera, the composer can discover Matilde’s intentions by studying the words *accusare*, *gridare*, *chiede raggione*, (all indicating rage) in the preceding recitative. The aria can be presented with the most raging emotion, which would inspire a composer rich in imagination to turn his ideas into beautiful inventions.¹²
Example 5-1  Rage. Heinichen writes that we could also look at the words *acusare* (to accuse), *gridare* (to scuffle) and *chiede r raggione* (to be angry and ask why). The composer could write inventions for several vocal parts.¹³ To express rage, the music uses repeated sixteenth notes outlining triads at a fast tempo. *Non e sola, non estraniera la causa ch'è vera, no dubito no* (is not alone, is not foreign the cause which is true, I have no doubt, no)
Example 5-2. Quarrelsomeness. Heinichen states that we could present Matilde's heroic decision to liberate her lover in a pompous manner. To express quarrelsomeness, the music uses repeated sixteenth notes on the same pitch, repeated words, and even the melody repeats like much thought on the same subject, yet not necessarily getting anywhere. *con novo d'amor fatto animoso liberare il mio sposo* *Non e' sola, non e' straniera, la causa ch'e' vera, non dubito no* (with renewed love becoming bold, to liberate my husband, is not alone, is not foreign a cause which is true, I have no doubt, no)
Example 5-3  Pompousness. To express pompousness, the music outlines triads in eighth and sixteenth notes, uses diatonic patterns in sequence, and uses authentic cadences for a feeling of importance. *Non e ' sola, non e ' straniera la causa ch' e ' vera, non dubito, no* (is not alone, is not foreign the cause which is true, I have no doubt, no)
Example 5-4  Eternal pursuit of fortune expressed in a bass theme. Heinichen states, “One could present the changing, fickle, fleeting, stubborn or suffering sense that leads to happiness in various ways.” To express pursuit of fortune, the music uses a bass theme in diatonically descending patterns and sequences in unison with the violins. *Chi ha nimica la fortuna si vedra sempre, sempre penar, si vedra sempre penar* (Who has fortune as enemy will be always, always suffering)
Example 5-5  Fickle or furious fortune. Heinichen states, "The vague or ravenous happiness could be presented by harmonies in various intensities." Fickle fortune is expressed in the music by using an ascending diatonic pattern of four notes repeating and alternating with full scale passages and sequences of the four ascending notes. *Chi ha nemica la fortuna, si vedra' sempre si vedra', sempre penar* (Who has fortune as enemy will be always suffering).
Example 5-6  Ever-changing or calamity-bearing fortune. Heinichen states, “The effect of the happiness that brings suffering could be presented using the word penare (to suffer) as a hint, in very different manners which are especially varying from the already presented examples.” Ever-changing fortune is expressed in the music by constant modulations. The example begins in e minor, but the second measure seems to be in G major. The third measure introduces d#, the leading tone of e minor, but then becomes chromatic and descends back to G major. The d# again appears and leads back to e minor at the cadence. *Chi ha nemica la fortuna sivedra' sempre penar* (Who has fortune as enemy will be always suffering)
Heinichen wrote that in arias expressing a double affect, one would emphasize the lively affect more than the solemn one. A melancholy or depression induced by loving feelings would always be expressed as a pleasant love rather than a black melancholy. In a tender, serious-pleading, sad-sighing vocal part, the expression of the tenderness would always be preferred over the negative expressions. If there is deathly despair, the composer will look at and emphasize the underlying rage as opposed to the dying affect.¹⁸

Buelow writes that Heinichen asks how a composer can find invention for the da capo (A section) of another aria, which begins with the singer’s appearance on the scene without a preceding recitative. The words are no lo diro col labro, che tanto ardir non ham (I will not say it with my lips, that so much courage do not have…) Buelow continues, “One does not know if the affect is sad or gay, amorous or serious.”¹⁹ Heinichen says in these two lines, “We cannot find any hint that would allow us to develop an invention. But, if we look into the following recitative, we find forfe con le faville, per dirche gid tutt’ ardo, lo squardo parlera,”²⁰ (perhaps with sparks, to show that I am already all burning, my look will reveal). Heinichen says from this he knows the da capo is intended to have an in-love intention.
Example 5-7  Love. Love is expressed in the music by a simple soprano melody in G major accompanied at the tenth below in the bass. *Non lo dirò collabro, collabro, chatando ardir non ha* (I will not say it with my lips, that so much courage do not have)
Example 5-8  Burning fire of love. Heinichen says if we wanted to use the words *faüille* (sparks), *pupille* (pupil), *l'ardore* (the passion), *lo sguardo* (the look), we could use the burning fire of love as the underlying affect. Burning fire of love is expressed by an on-going drive of continuous sixteenth notes in F major. *Non lo dirò co' la... Bro che tanto ardir, non ha* (I will not say it with my lips that so much courage, do not have)
Example 5-9  Flirtatiousness. Buelow writes that the next example attempts a "flirtatious" affect, resulting from the expression of "amorous glances and burning eyes." Flirtatiousness is expressed in the music by two soprano parts playing in thirds in triplet rhythms against duple meter in the bass. *Non lo dirò' colla... bro* (I will not say it with my lips)
Example 5-10  Tenderness. Heinichen said, “The work is much easier if the lyrics of the aria itself gives ideas and inspiration. In the following aria, Aminta is searching for his shepherdess in the shadows of the trees.” To express tenderness, the music uses dotted eight and sixteenth rhythms in 12/8 meter, which sounds almost like a gentle, rocking lullaby. *Vo cercando il vero Nume, che sospira la mia fe’, Qual farfalla intorno al lume, fra quest ombre aggirò il pie*’ (I am searching for the true God, who longs for my faith like a butterfly around the light, among the shadows I wander)
Example 5-11  Sighs of Love. Sighs of Love are expressed in the music by using c harmonic minor, though the key signature shows two flats rather than three in repeating motives. *Vo' cercando il vero il vero nume che sospira la mia fe'* (I am searching for the true God who longs for my faith)

Example 5-12  Fear. Aminta is fearfully searching for his love, which could be expressed by syncopation.²⁴ Fear is expressed in the music by alternating eighth and quarter notes in a syncopated rhythm with chromaticism in g minor. *Vo' cercando il vero nume che sospira, la mia fe'* (I am searching for the true God who longs for my faith)
Example 5-13  Sighing. Heinichen says we can imagine that Aminta has found his love with a playful exchange of loving looks. Buelow quotes Heinichen as saying that the "corresponding emotions" of the two lovers "through the use of two well-chosen instruments alternating in pleasant consonances and dissonances portray the mutual love, at once quarrelsome and yet united in spirit." Sighing is expressed in the music by using two flutes sometimes playing together in thirds and sometimes as a leader and a follower in motives. *Vo cercando il vero nume* (I am searching for the true God)
Heinichen remarks that all of these examples prove that we can express words and affects using different, even contradicting, keys. He said everything that has been written about affects of keys according to the old system (Greek) is rubbish, as if one mode could be cheerful, the other sad, the next heroic or warlike. Even if the old system were right, its application would fail with the slightest change of the common tempering in which the instrumental voices are never accurate.

Heinichen said that if we derive beautiful arias from one key or another, we attribute the good effect of the aria to the key instead of to the composer. It becomes belief that the key could not be expressed just as well using the opposite lyrics and affects, which he found annoying and wrong. He said it does not work well to specifically assign one or another key to any particular affect. The selection of the key depends on the mood of the composer, because we can find the saddest and most tender arias in d, a and b minor as well as brilliant and strong ones in a minor, e minor and c minor.

Heinichen states, “All keys or modes, with no further differentiation, are suitable for expressing all kinds of, even contradicting, affects.” Which one will be selected by the composer depends on four criteria:

1. The intention of the composer, who might have favorite keys.
2. The composer’s choice to express an affect in a different mode or key.
3. Selection of a certain key to suit a particular instrument.

4. Choice of key or mode to suit the range of the singer.

Heinichen said, "A master could easily compose an aria, or even an entire opera, in five or six different manners without repeating himself. This is strong proof that the loci topici give us the most beautiful opportunity for inventions."\(^{27}\)

Buelow believes Heinichen succeeded in attaining the true goal of Baroque music, to stir the emotions.\(^{28}\)

**Johann Mattheson (1681 - 1764)**

Mattheson’s education was exceptionally broad, according to George Buelow. He was trained in music, dancing, drawing, arithmetic, riding, fencing, English, French and Italian in addition to liberal arts. He also studied keyboard, composition, singing, gamba, violin, flute, oboe, lute and law. He led a rich musical life singing with the Hamburg opera from 1696 to 1705. In 1703, Mattheson met Handel and, as fellow musicians, they became good friends. Mattheson sang in many operas and became an organ virtuoso. He also studied English law, politics, economics and details of trade. By 1735, he had become completely deaf.\(^{29}\)

Buelow states that Johann Mattheson was the most important writer on the music of the German Baroque. Between 1715 and 1740, Mattheson wrote
numerous scores and treatises and translated English histories, novels and philosophical works. He documented in great detail the radical changes in musical styles from the Baroque to the Classical period. In his books, he discussed almost every aspect of the music of his day.

Mattheson’s most important book is *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, published in 1739. In this book, he systematized the doctrines of rhetoric as they became the basis of composition; he proposed a complete theory of good melody writing, which to Mattheson was the basis of all composition; he discussed emotions in music. Buelow states that Mattheson believed that every aspect of music is viewed in relationship to the Affections. He further states this section of *Der vollkommene Capellmeister* is the only attempt found in Baroque literature to arrive at a true “doctrine” of the Affections. The most important aspects of this book lie in the originality of the presentation and the author’s reflections on the most important aspects of the musical thought of his time. Buelow says Mattheson’s books are of inestimable value for the student of eighteenth-century German Baroque music.30

The Doctrine of the Affections (*Affektenlehre*) was a term first used extensively by German musicologists to describe an aesthetic concept in Baroque music originally derived from Greek and Latin doctrines of rhetoric and oratory. The Doctrine of the Affections was treated in great detail by Mattheson in *Der*
vollkommene Capellmeister. He listed more than twenty affections and described how they should be expressed in music.31

Mattheson outlined a musical rhetoric that was patterned after the formal devices of grammar. The doctrine of musical rhetoric served as the formal structure to which the presentation of musical affects or emotions was appended. Buelow believes that Mattheson’s view on the loci was derived from Heinichen.32

Rhetorical terminology was borrowed from the ancient Greeks by music theorists during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Aristotle wrote that orators used rhetorical means to control and direct the emotions of their audience; so also in Baroque music treatises, the composer must move the affections (emotions) of the listener. The affections, then, were rationalized emotional states or passions. Many theorists and philosophers of the Baroque categorized and described types of affections as well as connotations of scales, dance movements, rhythms, instruments, forms and styles.33

Mattheson believed those affects which by nature are most inherent in us are not the best and must be curtailed and kept in check. He said, “This is a part of morals with which an accomplished composer must be absolutely familiar, if he wishes clearly to distinguish virtue from vice in his music, and if he wishes to kindle love for the former and abhorrence for the latter in the mind of the listener, which is the true purpose of music.”34 The author of amorous compositions must
draw on his own experience. He will find in himself or in his own affect the best model to organize his expressions in sound. If he has no personal experience of this noble passion, he would be more successful with another emotion.

Mattheson’s advice is that “one ought to choose a good poetic work in which nature is vividly portrayed and strive to distinguish the passions contained therein.” The works of a composer of music would turn out better if he himself realized what he actually wished to achieve. People fail because music is written without a moral purpose. To simply please the hearing is like shooting an arrow into an empty sky.

The following is a sampling of the many definitions of affections as classified by Mattheson in *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, Part I, Chapter Three. I have arranged them alphabetically for easier reading:

Desire refers to the future and harbors impatience.

Despair is the most extreme degree or the brink to which cruel fear can drive us. This passion is to be expressed in extremities of all kinds of sounds. It may result in peculiar, absurd and excessive tonal constructions. Despair is the complete collapse of hope. Elevation and collapse can be represented quite naturally by sounds, especially if the tempo contributes.

Hope is an elevation of the mind or the spirits. Hope consists of a youthful desire, which fills the mind with courage. This affect requires the sweetest
mixture of sounds. Those affects that are set against hope are fear, despondency, fright and terror. If their natural characteristics are understood, appropriate progressions of sound corresponding to the emotion will be used.

Humility and patience are treated without inserting anything uplifting into the music.

Jealousy is composed of seven passions, burning love, mistrust, desire, revenge, sadness, fear and shame. Numerous inventions can be derived aiming toward restlessness, vexation and misery.

Joy is perceived as an expansion of our vital spirits. It is expressed best by large and expanded intervals. Joy is far more natural than sadness. It is such a friend of life and health, the mind approves of it more easily in imagination and acceptance.

Love is based on a diffusion of the spirits. It is expressed with expansive and extravagant intervals. Love refers to the present.

Obstinacy can be represented well by bizarre ideas. Obstinate musical figures are used in one voice and must not be changed under any circumstance.

Pity is composed of love and sadness and requires great skill as a composer to produce most movingly.
Pride, arrogance and haughtiness create an opportunity to employ all kinds of splendid-sounding figures demanding a special seriousness and bombastic movement that continuously strive to ascend.

Sadness is a contraction of the parts of our body. The smallest intervals are the most appropriate for this passion. Sadness in sacred work includes everything that represents repentance, sorrow, penitence, lamentation and misery. Next to love, he who wishes to express sadness well in sound must feel and perceive it himself much more than any of the other passions. The reason is that being sad and being in love are closely related to each other.

Wrath, revenge, rage, fury and related violent emotions are more easily suited to all kinds of inventions in music than the pleasant passions that need to be treated more subtly. It will not suffice to rumble about continuously or to make a crude racket. Each of these harsh characteristics demands a particular manner, fashioned with an appropriate melodious character.

Yearning, longing, wishing and striving must take into account desire’s qualities depending on what is desired or wished.

Mattheson said the affects are like the bottomless sea. No matter how much could be written down, an infinite amount would remain unsaid, and everyone would be left to his own natural inclination.37
Mattheson states there are many tales of music helping sick people to health. A rondeau appeared in a weekly publication in musical notation that was supposed to be a cure against the sting of tarantulas. He states that his father was cured of melancholy by music, after all other remedies had failed. He believed health is so musical that all sicknesses consist of nothing other than discords and dissonances. To support his belief, he offered the well-known tale concerning how the Greeks cured sciatica with the flute playing the Phrygian mode. Music worked against madness and against many other illnesses. Mattheson said Americans around 1725 used no other means than their somewhat coarse method of playing to suppress and alleviate difficult infirmities and pains. He states that music has a wholesome effect on all sorts of pains in limbs, and that sound works strongly on the muscles of the human body. ³⁸

Mattheson also wrote about the ancient Greeks. He stated, “The oldest distinction between the three modes, Dorian, Phrygian and Lydian was only by highness and lowness of sound. The Dorians had a coarser, more manly and deeper speaking voice than the Phrygians. The Lydians sang finer and more effeminately than the others. The Dorians were a modest, virtuous and peaceful people. The Phrygians used more noise than foresight. The Lydians were described as sensual people.”³⁹ These three modes were introduced about 600 years before the birth of Christ. The invention of the fourth, the modi mixolydii,
was attributed to Sappho, a famous woman poetess, for which the Lydian was too low. She named it Mixolydian, rather than after herself, because of its close relationship with the Lydian. In time, the Aeolians and Ionians contributed to the Greek modes. The Aeolians preferred a higher mode; the Ionians preferred a lower mode. All of these people lived in Asia minor where music was hidden as in a protected corner of the world. Mattheson said that whatever these modes originally had as their principal characteristic (their names and essence) remained the same even in his day.  

Mattheson said of Gaffurio and Glarean, who studied and misinterpreted the works of Boethius:

So arduously strove this pair to gain fame after death
That they were capable only of ruining music.  

Mattheson said at the time of Gaffurio and Glarean, before the advent of the printing press, people in the world were in such a condition that they knew about almost nothing. He said that what Gaffurio and Glarean wrote and taught was adulterated, incorrect and highly harmful, the traces of which were found even in his day in a thousand places. Mattheson said Glarean’s Dodecachordon is “reduced to rubble.”

Mattheson believed the stirring of the affections and passions of the soul depends on the skillful invention of a clear and expressive melody, (melopoie), which he considered the most important facet of music. He said everyone wrote
about harmony, but they were all deficient in regards to melody. He said even skilled composers write four to ten voice parts before they know how to even write one good one. Harmony he considered to be merely the result of simultaneously sounding melodies. Melody was the body of music and the beat was its soul; harmony was merely the clothing. Melody alone moves hearts.  

During the Baroque, the word "invention" meant nothing more than a composed melody, most likely using various loci topici. Mattheson states that he preferred the first, locus notationis, which concerns musical figures such as imitation, inversion and repetition, and the second, locus descriptionis, which dealt with the depiction of extra-musical ideas through metaphorical (one word means another) and allegorical symbols. Out of fifteen loci, he preferred these two over all the others. Mattheson says that Heinichen appears to have derived his whole theory of invention from the locus circumstantiarum. The loci were intimately related to the musical craft and were of high significance. The systematic method for arousing the passions and affects which Mattheson designed is typical of the elaborate categorizing and complex designs so widely manifest in Baroque Germany.

The locus notationis of invention Mattheson describes as the richest source of invention. It involves the external form and design of notes through 1) note value, 2) inversion or permutation (rearrangement), 3) repetition and 4) canonic
passages without the limits of strict imitation (which Mattheson calls monotonous and unpleasant to the ear). The following are examples of *Loci notationis*:

**Example 5-14  Invention of a Main Theme**

*With Notes of one Value:*

```
\[\text{Musical notation}\]
```

*Of Differing Value:*

```
\[\text{Musical notation}\]
```

*Through Inversion:*

```
\[\text{Musical notation}\]
```

**Example 5-15  Invention through imitation of the first five notes**

```
\[\text{Musical notation}\]
```
Example 5-16  Canonic imitation in passages with two or more voices

1) is a deviation from the canonic sequence; 2) is an exact repetition; 3) a canonic succession at the unison; 4) an approximation of this passage; and 5) an ornament ending with a trill.⁴⁷

Mattheson said the *locus descriptionis* of invention, is, after *locus notationis*, the most reliable and essential guide for invention. The bottomless sea of human affections belongs here. This *locus* depends upon the nature of the words being set to music because the text of vocal music principally serves to portray the affections. However, even without words, in purely instrumental music, with every melody, the purpose must be to present the governing affection
so that the instruments, by means of sound, present the affection almost verbally
and perceptibly.\footnote{48}

Mattheson makes a point that there is a big difference between an adjective
and a passion or affection (such as depicted in "word painting"). If one cannot let
the words deep, high, heaven, earth, joke, suffer, joy, descending, ascending, tears
and thousands of others, pass by in the melody without having special figures and
melismas, then one makes a mockery of music. The words, "I speak not of joys,"
and "I do not feel like laughing" would sound bad if one used runs or leaping notes
on joys and laughing. "Keep me from falling into sin" must not be indicated
through the fall of the voice. He said, "Do not aim at the words; aim at the
meaning in composing.\footnote{49} The following examples provide settings of various
affections as illustrated by Mattheson:
Example 5-17 Despair. (Enormous is my pain, infinite are my miseries. The air bemoans having nurtured me. The world, because it supported me, is worth burning simply for that. The stars become comets, to destroy this monster of nature. Earth denies my body a grave. Heaven denies my soul a dwelling place. What do I do then, desperate and damned murdered that I am? ‘Ere I should suffer such unbearable pain, I will hang myself! Mattheson said, “These exquisite and very beautiful descriptions can be set to music in [the following] way.” A slow haunting minor melody is used to express despair.
Example 5-18  Clever and playful yet avoiding excessive cheerfulness.51 (This new angel I would not know if she is more beautiful or if she sings better. She attracts me if I listen and by looking at her I fall in love.) Using eighth notes and quarter notes in cut time creates a moving major melody to express playfulness.
Example 5-19  Bitter lament (grief) over parting from the beloved.\textsuperscript{52} Ah! 
*Dolente partita* (Ah! painful depart). The music uses a slow minor melody to express grief.

![Musical notation for Ah! dolente partita](image)

Example 5-20  Plaintiveness or humility.\textsuperscript{53} *Ich will mich dem Schicksal beugen* (I shall submit myself to destiny). Using only two notes in this melody causes the music to sound thoughtful and plaintive.

A.

![Musical notation for Ich will mich dem Schicksal beugen](image)

B. Heinichen states, “The famed Madame Keiser once performed this piece so expressively, that this submission almost seemed visible, as if one could hear it with the eyes, simply because of the following small supplement and crossing accent.”

![Musical notation for Ich will mich dem Schicksal beugen](image)
Example 5-21  Scornful, bursting forth in unexpected joy. *Wol dem Volck, dem es also gehet; aber wol dem Volck, des der Herr ein Gott ist!* (Blessed be the people who suffer thusly, and blessed be the people whose Lord is God!). Slow, serious-sounding four-measure sections alternate with short fast major sections to create scorn bursting forth in sudden joy.

Example 5-22  This minuet demonstrates moderate cheerfulness. Mattheson said, "The geometric proportion here [indicated by little crosses] is four, as always with good dance melodies. The rhythms of the first and second measures are used again in the fifth and sixth creating arithmetic uniformity." This minuet has a moving minor melody expressing moderate cheerfulness in the first section. In the second section, the key changes and ends in D major.
Example 5-23  Trembling shimmer of the murmuring waves. Mattheson said, "This example is based on adjectives rather than affections and is better suited for instruments than for voices." Das zitternde Glanzen der sprudelnden Wellen (The glint and sparkle of the foaming waves). The shimmer of the waves is expressed by using stepwise sixteenth notes which creates motion.

Example 5-24  Sorrow, pain, and ray of hope. Lo mesta e sola piango sempre il mio ben, che non m'ascolta, e nella doglia mia nepur mi resta un balen di speranza (I, sad and lonely, cry always. My love, who does not listen to me, and in my pain not even is left for me a glint of hope.) To express sorrow, the music uses chromaticism with the sound of harmonic minor.
Hans Lenneberg, a translator of *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, wrote that Mattheson asked us to suppose he wished to set the following words meant for Pilate in a Passion:

"Trees whose branches reach too high into the air will soon be cut down."

Mattheson reasoned:

Because there is no particular affect apparent in these words, I turn my thoughts to the fortunes of Pilate. He was a great statesman and governor which leads to pride and lust for power. The reaching up of the branch might also give some composers an idea, but following inner feelings are always better than outward literal images.\(^56\)

Even where there are no words, the purpose must be of picturing the governing sentiment. In writing instrumental music, the composer may write according to some special emotion of his own invention; in vocal pieces, it is the poet who usually determines the affect. To picture horrible and gruesome things, use dissonance. An interchange between consonance and dissonance can lead to many more inventions.\(^57\)

Lenneberg gives examples of Mattheson’s ideas on melodic invention:\(^58\)

Example 5-25  Little turns, clever passages, pleasant runs and jumps

\[\text{Example music notation here}\]
Example 5-26  As a connected phrase, these melodic ideas might look like this:

Mattheson wrote that although these passages may have been used by masters before, putting them together gives the phrase a new appearance which may be considered an original invention. One must work out the borrowed material so that it will gain a better appearance than it had before.

Example 5-27  Writing musical inventions using *locus notationis*  

*with notes of the same time value*

*with notes of different time values*

*By Inversion*
Ernest Harriss, another translator of Der vollkommene Capellmeister, wrote of Mattheson: “Occasionally he seems to be laughing from the grave as one struggles to untangle his difficult and, at times, perhaps purposefully ambiguous statements.”

Harriss believes Mattheson’s groundbreaking efforts in music were so significant that he could be called the most important forerunner of modern musicology. He saw the senses as active participants in the artistic process. Harriss says Mattheson made incensed enemies through his strong intercession for the imitation of the affects in music and for his participation in the revolution to topple the old medieval basis for music (Boethius’ mathematical concepts and Guidonian solmisation). Mattheson said the ear is the final arbitrator in musical matters.

Peter Kivy, a philosopher on music of the Baroque and particularly of Mattheson, believes Mattheson was a more subtle and forward-looking philosopher of music than he has ever been given credit for being. Kivy says in philosophical circles it is believed that music neither expresses nor arouses emotions in the listeners, but rather that music possesses emotions as innate properties, much in the way that a weeping willow or a bloodhound seem to be sad. He believes from his research that Mattheson would choose what Kivy calls the possession theory.
Kivy says Mattheson made it clear that he subscribed to the Cartesian theory of *esprits animaux*. The relationship between the vital spirits and the emotions they were supposed to cause was thought to be so close as to make it all one to Mattheson. Mattheson said Rene Descartes, the philosopher, was especially worth reading since he contributed a great deal to music. Descartes’ influential work, *The Passions of the Soul*, was published in 1649.

Descartes believed there was God, soul, animal spirits and body. He believed the movement of our muscles depends on the nerves, (little threads or tubes coming from the brain) which contain extremely small fast-moving bodies called “animal spirits,” *esprit animas*, which flow in the blood. From the brain, the animal spirits flow into the nerves and then to the muscles where they move the body in all the ways it can be moved. He did not know how these animal spirits and nerves produce movements or sensations, or what corporeal principle makes them act. He believed we experience the passions in music because they are a part of our soul. All the passions appear to be caused by some movement of the spirits.62

Descartes believed the passions were basically all good by nature and all we have to avoid is their misuse. When we feel our blood agitated by passion, we should take heed and recollect that everything presented to the imagination tends to mislead the soul. We should distract ourselves by other thoughts and not make
immediate judgments. Wisdom lies in learning to be masters of our passions and to control them with such skill that the evils which they cause are quite bearable, and even become a source of joy.  

Descartes said his analysis includes all the principal passions and the Greeks' analyses does not. Only passions that can be defined as good or evil affect the heart, the blood and the well-being of our body.  

Kivy says Mattheson assumed that the vital spirits were structurally similar to the emotions they caused and then inferred the shape of the emotion by observing the expression-behavior. If he could have turned a microscope of the emotions on the vital spirits to observe their structure directly, he would not have needed to use introspection to examine expression-behavior of self or others.  

We will now look at an outgrowth of the Doctrine of Affections in the eighteenth century.

*Der empfindsamer Stil* as Expressed by Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach (1714 – 1788)

Carl Phillip Emanuel Bach was known to close his eyes in deep concentration when he played his clavichord to allow his inner-most emotions to express through the music as he played. In his father, Johann Sebastian Bach, and in Georg Friedrich Handel, Emanuel saw and heard the greatest representatives of
the Baroque era. Haydn, Mozart and Beethoven were born during his lifetime and studied his works.

C. P. E. Bach was employed by Frederick the Great in Berlin for thirty years. The names of Emanuel Bach, Johann Quantz and the king’s other musicians are sufficient to immortalize the name of their great patron.⁶⁶

Carl Friedrich Zelter said of Emanuel Bach:

His spirited performing style at the keyboard, from which he was able to draw a strong and powerful tone combining brilliance with a singing and speaking manner of execution, was something hitherto quite unknown. His improvisations delighted every heart and spoke to every intellect. Stirring, lively, natural, cheerful, rich in thoughts and ideas, all is new and fresh, and with every repetition offers renewed pleasure.⁶⁷

Emanuel Bach’s Essay on the True Art of Playing Keyboard Instruments is one of the most important treatises on music written in the eighteenth century. It is more widely owned and studied today than any of his compositions and is a standard guide to eighteenth-century keyboard fingering, ornamentation, improvisation and continuo playing.⁶⁸

In the chapter on performance in The True Art of Playing Keyboard Instruments, Emanuel Bach asks, “What comprises a good performance?” The answer he gives is “the ability through singing or playing to make the ear conscious of the true affect of a composition.”⁶⁹ He also wrote, “A musician
cannot move others unless he too is moved. He must of necessity feel all of the affects that he hopes to arouse in his audience, for the revealing of his own humor will stimulate a like humor in the listener. In sad passages, the performer must grow sad. A sluggish, dragging performance must be avoided, caused by an excess of affect and melancholy. It is principally in improvisations or fantasias that the keyboardist can best master the feelings of his audience. The accomplished musician must carefully appraise his audience and their attitude toward the expressive content of his program.)*"70

The performances of Emanuel Bach are characterized by impressive, rhetorical and moving qualities and tend to avoid lavish decorations. One rhetorical device he used was instrumental recitative. Another element in Bach’s style, related to recitative by its freedom of rhythm, was the rhapsodic manner of the keyboard fantasy.71

Bach disagreed with the following theory on performance as stated by Johann Joachim Quantz (1697 – 1773) in Quantz’s famous book, Versuch einer Anweisung die Flote traversiere zu spielen:

Dissonances are played loudly and consonances softly, since the former rouse our emotions and the latter quiet them. An exceptional turn of melody which is designed to create a violent affect and deceptive progressions must be played loudly. All tones of a melody which lie outside the key may be emphasized whether consonance or dissonance and those within the key may be performed piano.72
Emanuel said, “A mere technician can lay no claim to the rewards of those who sway in gentle undulation the ear rather than the eye, the heart rather than the ear, and lead it where they will.”

Quantz, a German flautist, composer, writer on music and flute maker, instructed the king in the fine art of playing the flute. When Frederick the Great was not engaged in battles to protect his kingdom, he and his musicians enjoyed musical episodes together. Reilly says Quantz, unlike C. P. E. Bach, supported polyphonic music; however, he did much to promote greater virtuosity on the flute during the eighteenth century. Quantz found that playing in certain keys on the Baroque flute did promote affect. Keys containing sharps and their relative minors were found to be bright and louder. Keys containing flats and their relative minors were dull and softer. Reilly states that Quantz deserves an honorable place among the lesser composers of the eighteenth century and a major position in the development of flute literature.

The *empfindsamer Stil* was an outgrowth of the *Affektenlehre* of the Baroque, which had its origins in the rediscovery of the ancient Greek concept of expressing the affections through music. Emanuel Bach was the chief composer of *Empfindsamer* music in the eighteenth century. During the second half of the century, the composers in the *Empfindsamer* school of thought wanted to replace the Baroque idea of maintaining only one affection throughout a composition by
many changes of affection or expression within a composition (or movement) along with many dynamic changes.\textsuperscript{75}

Advocates of the \textit{empfindsamer Stil} believed that music is closely related to poetry and rhetoric and that its true essence consists of a judicious imitation of nature. \textit{Affektenlehre} in the Baroque expressed the intangible, the unseen, the deeper meaning underlying the text or musical \textit{inventio} in the case of instrumental music. The \textit{empfindsamer Stil} was characterized by accompanied melody, playfulness, love songs, and a change of setting from the church to the salon as the cultural center.\textsuperscript{76}

The term \textit{Empfindsamkeit} refers more to certain types of emotional expression than to any specific musical means of attaining them.\textsuperscript{77} Emanuel's part in the \textit{empfindsamer Stil} was to speak emotively without using words. His keyboard works show his gradual (though never total) abandonment of contrapuntal techniques.\textsuperscript{78} He pursued the \textit{empfindsam} mode on the one hand and a kind of motivic variation that must be considered a cornerstone of his style. This technique appears in many different guises. In his sonata-form recapitulations, the opening theme is usually given a new twist as soon as it reappears. In rondo themes, the theme is subjected to every imaginable reshaping. Any literal restatement seems abhorrent. He reshaped motifs or melodies with variations of sonatas without altering the form.\textsuperscript{79} He was a master of improvisation. Emanuel's
favorite form of keyboard expression was the free fantasia. He wrote, "A fantasia is said to be free when it is unmeasured and moves through more keys than is customary in other pieces." Some expressive devices became his trademarks—sudden interruptions of forward movement, changes in tempo or dynamics, connecting movements without pausing, and the statement of themes on so many tonal levels that the key areas were blurred.

A central key to eighteenth-century thinking was the notion of intuitive musical expression through dynamic devices. Emanuel became adamant about proper indications being written into the music to express affect, dynamics, tempo, and any other markings that would assist the performer in knowing how the composer intended the music to be performed. Before Emanuel's time, such precision had never been required on so well-ordered a basis. The affects were newly set by the indications of tempo and expression at the beginning of the piece, according to Stephen Clark.

Emanuel had stated in his Essay, "Composers act wisely who in notating their works include terms, tempo indications which help to clarify the meaning of a piece." Expression for Emanuel Bach was conceived as the conception of a particular affect through the character of the melody or harmony. Where Bach wanted a contrast of affect, he achieved it through discontinuity, a break in the harmonic rhythm, or a sudden change of tempo or texture.
Music for clavichord was Emanuel's most personal mode of expression, although he composed for the piano in the last two decades of his life. His *Wurttemberg Sonatas*, a set of six sonatas for keyboard published in 1744, were composed in the *empfindsamer Stil*. All six sonatas are in three movements. They are fantasy-like, with erratic rhythmic groups (triplets and sevenths), rather than a steady rhythm of sixteenth or eighth notes. Notable developments in style are that the themes contain rolled chords, arpeggios and scale-like runs in complicated rhythms. Deceptive cadences are used liberally. The first movements are monothematic sonata-allegro form. The following examples demonstrate the use of affects in works for keyboard.

Example 5-28  C. P. E. Bach, Sonata No. 23, II. Lovely melting figures with a rising theme.

In Sonata No. 25, one senses something grotesque must have been at work in the mental processes of the composer. The opening gesture abounds in crushed notes:\textsuperscript{86}
Any reference to the "great" Bach in the second half of the eighteenth century almost always meant C. P. E. Bach. He was hailed as the foremost exponent of a musical language based on individual self-expression, which touched the heart and awakened the passions. It is pioneering music, marking the beginning of a new phase in musical history, reaching out with a zest for the unconventional, but sometimes marred by traces of immaturity and underdevelopment, according to Ottenberg.\textsuperscript{87} Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach set a worthy standard of single-hearted earnestness and devotion for the Viennese masters who followed him.

This thesis has traced the evolution of musical affect from the ancient Greek through the Baroque period. Many writers through the ages have written on music's power to move the listener, but few writers if any have ever followed the historical evolution of musical affect through the ages. This subject has been basically neglected until now. Because the subject of emotions in music is many-faceted, I feel that much investigation remains to be done in further exploration of origins, customs, practices, and techniques that coalesced through the centuries.
and gradually led to the complexities of musical sounds and affects which we enjoy today and even take for granted. It is easy to forget how gradually our present elaborate musical structure unfolded.

The role the power of musical affect plays in healing is another topic for further research. Reinvestigation of the techniques that worked quite successfully for Plato and Aristotle is a subject that is also neglected. Mattheson, Descartes, and others spent a vast amount of time contemplating, organizing, and systematizing the emotions and their definitions. They felt this work was extremely important. Traditional methods of music therapy do not necessarily establish the ancient Greeks' traditions as their origin. Many methods of healing (too numerous to mention) other than the traditional modern methods of medicine, or music therapy, are gaining in importance in the world today. People forever search for methods that help them get in deeper touch with their inner nature—what Plato called the soul. Many people today believe that maintaining internal harmony is still the key to good health. Plato and Aristotle wisely used music to release the harmful emotions. Whether it is the Greeks' method of purgation, the modern psychological counselor, the music therapist, or just being with yourself and relaxing to your favorite music, whatever restores the harmonic balance within the soul and restores health is always appreciated and not to be overlooked. I hope that other writers will continue to explore both the subject of affect in music and
healing through purgation of negative emotions. Much information remains to be
discovered, investigated, written, and shared in each of these areas.
Notes


9 *Loci topici* are supposed to help the composer find the affects and to help invent new affects. Heinichen called them an “incomprehensible pleonasm,” (a superfluous supplementation as in ‘a tall giant’).

10 Buelow, “Heinichen,” 162.


10 Heinichen, Der GeneralBass, 39-41.

15 Heinichen, Der GeneralBass, 42-43.

16 Heinichen, Der GeneralBass, 43-45.

17 Heinichen, Der GeneralBass, 46-47.

18 Heinichen, Der GeneralBass, 49-51.


20 Heinichen, Der GeneralBass, 49-51.

21 Heinichen, Der GeneralBass, 52-53.


24 Heinichen, Der GeneralBass, 68-69.


27 Heinichen, Der GeneralBass, 84-88.


29 Mattheson, Der GeneralBass, 95.


34 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 104.

35 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 110.

36 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 111.

37 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 104-110.

38 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 94-104.

39 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 178-179.

40 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 179-181.

41 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 182.

42 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 193-184.

43 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 256, 300-306, 318-319, 146.

44 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 297.

45 Ernst Harriss, “Introduction to the Translation,” *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 15.

46 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 289.

47 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 290.

48 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 291.

50 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 394.

51 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 206-207.

52 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 206-208.

53 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 270.

54 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 452.

55 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 414.


59 Ernest Harriss, “Preface to the Translation,” *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, i.

60 Harriss, “Introduction to the Translation,” *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 7-8.


63 Descartes, “Passions,” 403-404.

64 Descartes, “Passions,” 353.


73 C. P. E. Bach, *Essay on the True Art*, 147


78 Helm, “C. P. E. Bach,” 851.


83 Clark, C. P. E. Bach Studies, 47-48.

84 Clark, C. P. E. Bach Studies, 53.

85 Schulenberg, Instrumental Music, 162-163.

86 Acciaccatura [It. acciaccare, to crush. Italian name for an ornament of harpsichord music (c. 1675-1725) which calls for the lower second of the normal note to be simultaneously struck and immediately released. (Willi Apel, Harvard Dictionary of Music (Cambridge: Harvard UP) 7.

APPENDIX A

THEORISTS AND MUSICIANS

Greek and Roman Period (2,000 B.C.E. – 476 C.E.)

Pythagoras 582 - 500 B.C.E.
Damon Later Fifth Century
Plato 427 - 347 B.C.E. Laws, Republic, Timaeus
Aristotle 384 - 322 B.C.E. Rhetoric, Poetics

Middle Ages (600 - 1450 C.E.)

Guido d'Arezzo c. 990-1050 Micrologus
### Renaissance (1450 – 1600)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Composer</th>
<th>Years</th>
<th>Work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Guillaume Dufay</td>
<td>1400 - 1474</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Josquin Des Prez</td>
<td>1450 - 1521</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Franchino Gaffurio</td>
<td>1451 - 1522</td>
<td>The Theory of Music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heinrich Glarean</td>
<td>1488 - 1563</td>
<td>Dodecachordon.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adrian Willaert</td>
<td>1490 - 1562</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIOseffe Zarlino</td>
<td>1517 - 1590</td>
<td>Le istitutioni harmoniche</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girolamo Mei</td>
<td>1519 - 1594</td>
<td>Letters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vincenzo Galilei</td>
<td>1520 - 1591</td>
<td>Dialogo della musica antica et della moderna</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Baroque (1600 – 1750)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Composer</th>
<th>Years</th>
<th>Work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Johann Mattheson</td>
<td>1681 - 1764</td>
<td>Der vollkommene Capellmeister</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johann Heinichen</td>
<td>1683 - 1729</td>
<td>Der General-Bass in der Komposition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johann Joachim Quantz</td>
<td>1697 – 1773</td>
<td>Essay on a Method for Playing the Transverse Flute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. P. E. Bach</td>
<td>1714 – 1788</td>
<td>Essay on the True Art of Playing Keyboard Instruments</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX B

ILLUSTRATIONS


3-4 Powers, “Mode,” 396.

4-1 Palisca, *Humanism*, 41.
4-2 Palisca 345.
4-3 Powers, “Mode,” 408.
4-4 Powers, “Mode,” 408.
4-6 Josquin Des Prez, *De profundis* (motet).
4-7 Josquin Des Prez (picture).
4-8 Josquin Des Prez, *De profundis*.
4-9, 4-10 Adrian Willaert, *Aspro core e selvaggio e cruda voglia* (madrigal).

5-2 Bülow 166.
5-3 Bülow 166.
5-4 Bülow 167.
5-5 Bülow 168.
5-6 Bülow 169.
5-7 Bülow 170.
5-8 Bülow 171.
5-9 Bülow 171.
5-10    Buelow 172.
5-11    Buelow 173.
5-12    Buelow 173.
5-13    Buelow 173.
5-14    Johann Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 288.
5-15    Mattheson 289.
5-16    Mattheson 290.
5-17    Mattheson 394-395.
5-18    Mattheson 206.
5-19    Mattheson 207.
5-20    Mattheson 270.
5-21    Mattheson 299.
5-22    Mattheson 452.
5-23    Mattheson 414.
5-24    Mattheson 655.
5-25    Mattheson 69.
5-26    Mattheson 70.
5-27    Mattheson 74.
5-29    Barford, 88.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


