

THE INFLUENCE OF BASSO CONTINUO PRACTICE ON THE COMPOSITION
AND PERFORMANCE OF LATE EIGHTEENTH- AND EARLY
NINETEENTH-CENTURY LIED ACCOMPANIMENTS

by

LYNN MARIE KANE

A DISSERTATION

Presented to the School of Music
and the Graduate School of the University of Oregon
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

June 2006

“The Influence of Basso Continuo Practice on the Composition and Performance of Late Eighteenth- and Early Nineteenth-Century Lied Accompaniments,” a dissertation prepared by Lynn Marie Kane in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Doctor of Philosophy degree in the School of Music. This dissertation has been approved and accepted by:

Dr. Anne Dhu McLucas, Chair of the Examining Committee

Date

May 25, 2006

Committee in Charge:

Dr. Anne Dhu McLucas, Chair
Dr. Marc Vanscheeuwijck
Dr. Marian Smith
Dr. Kenneth Calhoon

Accepted by:

Dean of the Graduate School

© 2006 Lynn Marie Kane

An Abstract of the Dissertation of

Lynn Marie Kane

for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

in the School of Music

to be taken

June 2006

Title: THE INFLUENCE OF BASSO CONTINUO PRACTICE ON THE
COMPOSITION AND PERFORMANCE OF LATE EIGHTEENTH- AND
EARLY NINETEENTH-CENTURY LIED ACCOMPANIMENTS

Approved:

Dr. Anne Dhu McLucas

The use of basso continuo in the performance of many late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century genres is well documented, yet the influence of this practice on the Lieder from that time has never been fully explored. This dissertation analyzes Lied accompaniments of the period in relation to the recommendations found in contemporary thorough-bass treatises in order to demonstrate that continuo practice did have an effect both on what composers were writing and how the songs were being performed.

The majority of written-out Lied accompaniments from the late eighteenth century conform to the recommendations given by treatise authors on matters of texture, distribution of the notes between the hands, octave doublings, parallel intervals, embellishments, and the relationship of the keyboard part to the solo line. Furthermore, figured basses were still printed in some songs into the early part of the nineteenth

century. Well-known nineteenth-century Lied composers, such as Schubert, Mendelssohn, and Brahms also frequently use these simple, continuo-like keyboard parts, and incorporate common continuo techniques for filling out chords into their more complex accompaniments.

The fact that continuo practice, a tradition in which improvisation played a large role, continued to have such a pervasive influence on the printed Lied suggests that additions and embellishments can be made to what is written on the page. Furthermore, evidence from secondary sources, statements by musicians of the period, and clues in the music itself confirm that composers did not always intend for performers to play exactly what is notated. In this dissertation, I argue that in many of these songs the musical score should be viewed as only a basic outline, which can then be adapted depending on the skill level of the performers, the available keyboard instruments, and the context of the performance. Principles from the continuo treatises serve as a guide for knowing what additions to make, and I offer suggestions of possible applications. Appendices detail the contents of approximately fifty continuo treatises published between 1750 and 1810.

CURRICULUM VITAE

NAME OF AUTHOR: Lynn Marie Kane

PLACE OF BIRTH: Eugene, Oregon

DATE OF BIRTH: October 21, 1977

GRADUATE AND UNDERGRADUATE SCHOOLS ATTENDED:

University of Oregon, Eugene, OR
Wheaton College, Wheaton, IL

DEGREES AWARDED:

Doctor of Philosophy in Music History, 2006, University of Oregon
Master of Music in Piano Accompanying, 2001, University of Oregon
Bachelor of Music in Piano Performance, 1999, Wheaton College

AREAS OF SPECIAL INTEREST:

German Lieder
Keyboard Performance Practice

PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE:

Graduate Teaching Fellow, University of Oregon, Eugene, 1999-2006
Teaching Assistant, Wheaton College, Wheaton, Illinois, 1996-1999

GRANTS, AWARDS AND HONORS:

Outstanding Graduate Scholar in Music, University of Oregon, 2006
Graduate Student Research Award, University of Oregon, 2005
Finalist, University Club Foundation Fellowship, 2004
Scholastic Honor Society Scholarship, Wheaton College, 1999
Presser Scholar, Wheaton College, 1998-1999

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to express sincere appreciation to my entire committee for their insight and involvement from the very beginning of this process. Their commitment to excellence in both scholarship and musical performance is an inspiration to me. Special thanks also to Dr. Gregory Mason for providing many of the eighteenth-century scores used for this project, for teaching me so much about the art of accompanying, and for giving me confidence in my instincts as a performer. In addition, thanks are due to Erick Arenas for his assistance in obtaining facsimiles, and to Tim Clarke for providing the computer-notated versions of some of the examples. Most of all I am grateful to Bryan, my husband, best friend, and personal computer technician. I could not have done this without your patience, love, and encouragement every step of the way.

DEDICATION

To my parents, who taught me the importance of education, hard work,
integrity, and honoring my commitments.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	1
Statement of Purpose	1
Significance of the Study	4
Methods and Procedures	7
Overview of Relevant Scholarship	10
Overview of the Dissertation	21
II. A BRIEF HISTORY OF THE GERMAN LIED	23
The Seventeenth-Century Continuo Lied	25
The Hamburg Lied	33
The Late Eighteenth-Century Lied in Northern Germany	39
The Late Eighteenth-Century Lied in Southern Germany	62
The Late Eighteenth-Century Lied in Austria	65
The Late Eighteenth-Century Lied in Switzerland	74
The Lied at the Turn of the Century	82
Summary	86
III. GENERAL RULES OF ACCOMPANYING IN THE LATE EIGHTEENTH CENTURY	90
Audience and Purpose	91
Number of Notes and Their Distribution	99
Intervals and Chords	105
Unfigured Bass	108
Ornamentation and Filled-In Accompaniments	112
Relationship to the Solo Line	116
Summary	123

Chapter	Page
IV. CONTINUO PRACTICE AND THE COMPOSITION OF LIED ACCOMPANIMENTS IN THE LATE EIGHTEENTH CENTURY	
	126
Figured Bass Accompaniments	127
Northern Germany	144
Southern Germany	165
Switzerland	172
Austria	174
Summary	185
V. CONTINUO PRACTICE AND THE COMPOSITION OF LIED ACCOMPANIMENTS IN THE EARLY NINETEENTH CENTURY	
	187
Carl Friedrich Zelter (1758-1832)	188
Ludwig van Beethoven (1770-1827)	198
Louise Reichardt (1779-1827)	203
Johann Carl Gottfried Loewe (1796-1869)	209
Franz Peter Schubert	213
Fanny Hensel (1805-1847)	227
Felix Mendelssohn (1809-1847)	232
Johannes Brahms (1833-1897)	238
Summary	246
VI. THE PERFORMANCE OF LIED ACCOMPANIMENTS IN THE LATE EIGHTEENTH AND EARLY NINETEENTH CENTURIES	
	249
Flexibility of the Musical Score	250
Improvisation in the German Lied	257
Conclusion	293

APPENDIX	Page
A. GENERAL INFORMATION REGARDING CONTINUO TREATISES, 1750-1808	301
B. NUMBER OF NOTES AND THEIR DISTRIBUTION ACCORDING TO CONTINUO TREATISES, 1750-1808	324
C. INTERVALS AND CHORDS ACCORDING TO CONTINUO TREATISES, 1750-1808	336
D. BASS LINE SPECIFICS ACCORDING TO CONTINUO TREATISES, 1750-1808	342
E. PERFORMANCE INSTRUCTIONS GIVEN IN CONTINUO TREATISES, 1750-1808	348
 BIBLIOGRAPHY	 362

LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES

Musical Example	Page
1. Heinrich Albert, "Herbstlied," from <i>Arien</i> , Denkmäler deutscher Tonkunst, no. 12 (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1958)	28
2. Heinrich Albert, "Auf! Ihr meine güldne Saiten," m. 5-7, from <i>Arien</i> , Denkmäler deutscher Tonkunst, no. 13 (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1958)..	30
3. Štěpán, "Im Frühlings Schatten," m. 1-10 from <i>Das Wiener Lied von 1778 bis Mozarts Tod</i> , Denkmäler der Tonkunst in Österreich, no. 54 (Graz: Akademische Druck und Verlagsanstalt, 1960)	67
4. Walder, "An ein Bischen Blüthe," m. 1-7 from <i>Singcompositionen mit Begleitung des Claviers</i> , vol. 2 (Zürich: Orell, Gessner, Fueslin und Compagnie, 1786)	81
5. Pasquali, <i>Thorough-bass Made Easy</i> , Plate 1	101
6. Kollmann, <i>Practical Guide to Thoroughbass</i> , p. 29	115
7. Fricke, <i>A Treatise on Thorough Bass</i> , p. 93	118
8. Agricola, "Das Erdbeben," from <i>Musikalisches Allerley</i> , (Berlin, Feb. 1761) ..	129
9. Georg Benda, "Philint Stand," m. 1-7 from <i>Sammlung Vermischter Clavier und Gesangstücke</i> (Leipzig: Schwickert, 1780)	130
10. Schubart, "Der Riese und der Zwerg," m. 1-24 from <i>Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart Sämtliche Lieder</i> , Denkmäler der Musik Baden-Württemberg, no. 8 (Munich: Strube, 2000)	131
11. Schubart, "Die Henne," m. 16-23 from <i>Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart Sämtliche Lieder</i> , Denkmäler der Musik Baden-Württemberg, no. 8 (Munich: Strube, 2000)	133
12. Neefe, "Hermann und Thusnelda," m. 1-7 from <i>Oden von Klopstock mit Melodien</i> (Flensburg and Leipzig: Kortenschen Buchhandlung, 1776)	134
13. Neefe, "Hermann und Thusnelda," m. 10-12 from <i>Oden von Klopstock mit Melodien</i> (Flensburg and Leipzig: Kortenschen Buchhandlung, 1776)	134

Musical Example	Page
14. "Hanne," m. 5-8 from <i>Fünzig weltliche Lieder</i> (Zürich, 1778)	136
15. Käsermann, "Bitten," from <i>Geistliche Oden und Lieder von C. F. Gellert</i> (Bern: Ludwig Rudolf Walther, 1804)	138
16. Kirnberger, "Ich trachte nicht," m. 1-10 from <i>Oden mit Melodien</i> (Danzig: Jobst Hermann Flörcke, 1773)	140
17. C. P. E. Bach, "Lied der Schnitterinnen," m. 1-9 from <i>Neue Lieder-Melodien nebst einer Kantate zum Singen beym Klavier</i> (Lübeck: Christian Gottfried Donarius, 1789)	148
18. C. P. E. Bach, "Geduld," m. 11-20 from <i>Herrn Professor Gellerts Geistliche Oden und Lieder mit Melodien</i> (Berlin: George Ludewig Winter, 1759)	149
19. J. A. P. Schulz, "Beschattet von der Pappelweide," from <i>Lieder im Volkston</i> (Berlin, 1782)	151
20. F. W. Rust, "Lied," from <i>Oden und Lieder</i> , vol. 2 (Leipzig: Georg August Grieshammer, 1796)	152
21. Corona Schröter, "Der Brautschmuck," m. 1-4 from <i>25 Lieder in Musik gesetzt</i> (Weimar, 1786)	153
22. J. F. Reichardt, "Erlkönig," m. 1-7 from <i>Goethes Lieder, Oden, Balladen und Romanzen mit Musik</i> , Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 58 (Munich: G. Henle, 1964-70)	154
23. C. H. Graun, "Auferstehn, ja auferstehn," m. 1-8 from Max Friedlaender, <i>Das deutsche Lied im 18. Jahrhundert</i> (Hildesheim, NY: G. Olms, 1970) ..	155
24. J. F. Reichardt, "Vergnütet mich," m. 8-22 from <i>Gesänge fürs schöne Geschlecht</i> (Berlin: Friedrich Wilhelm Birnstiel, 1775)	157
25. W. F. Schulz, "Monat Aprill," m. 1-8 from <i>Lieder am Clavier</i> (Berlin: Rellstabschen Musikhandlung und Musikdruckerey, 1794)	158
26. Reichardt, "Der Edelknabe und die Müllerin," m.1-6 from <i>Goethes Lieder, Oden, Balladen und Romanzen mit Musik</i> , Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 58 (Munich: G. Henle, 1964-70)	164

Musical Example	Page
27. Corona Schröter, "Das unbefangne Mädchen," m. 1-4 from <i>Gesänge mit Begleitung</i> (Weimar, 1794)	165
28. Zumsteeg, "An Mignon," from <i>Kleine Balladen und Lieder</i> , vol. 2 (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1800-1805)	166
29. Zumsteeg, "Liebe," m. 1-4 from <i>Kleine Balladen und Lieder</i> , vol. 1 (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1800-1805)	167
30. Zumsteeg, "Hochgesang," m. 1-6 from <i>Kleine Balladen und Lieder</i> , vol. 5 (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1800-1805)	168
31. Zumsteeg, "Die beiden Bonzen," m. 20-25 from <i>Kleine Balladen und Lieder</i> , vol. 7 (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1800-1805)	169
32. Zumsteeg, "Die Erwartung," m. 61-72 from <i>Kleine Balladen und Lieder</i> , vol. 2 (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1800-1805)	169
33. Schubart, "An meine Liebe," m. 1-10 from <i>Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart Sämtliche Lieder</i> , Denkmäler der Musik Baden-Württemberg, no. 8 (Munich: Strube, 2000)	170
34. Schubart, "Frühlingsabend," m. 1-4 from <i>Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart Sämtliche Lieder</i> , Denkmäler der Musik Baden-Württemberg, no. 8 (Munich: Strube, 2000)	171
35. Walder, "Das Veilchen," m. 1-6 from <i>Singcompositionen mit Begleitung des Claviers</i> , vol. 2 (Zürich: Orell, Gessner, Fueslin und Compagnie, 1786)	172
36. Walder, "Hans an Veit," m. 1-11 from <i>Singcompositionen mit Begleitung des Claviers</i> , vol. 2 (Zürich: Orell, Gessner, Fueslin und Compagnie, 1786) ...	173
37. Haydn, "I do confess thou art sae fair," m. 1-33 from <i>Schottische Lieder für William Napier</i> , Werke, series 32, vol. 2 (Munich: G. Henle, 1958-)	176
38. Haydn, "Lob der Faulheit," m. 1-16 from <i>Werke</i> , series 24 (Munich: G. Henle, 1958-)	178
39. Mozart, "Wie unglück bin ich nit," m. 1-5 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtlicher Werke</i> , series 3, vol. 8 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1955-)	180
40. Mozart, Original version of "O Gotteslamm," m. 1-8 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtlicher Werke</i> , series 3, vol. 8 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1955-)	182

Musical Example	Page
41. Mozart, Figures for "O Gotteslamm," m. 1-7 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtlicher Werke</i> , series 3, vol. 8 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1955-)	182
42. Paradis, "Sophia an Siegwart," m. 1-6 from <i>Zwölf Lieder auf ihrer Reise in Musik gesetzt : (1784-86)</i> , ed. Hidemi Matsushita (Fayetteville, Arkansas: ClarNan Editions, c1987)	185
43. Zelter, "Wir gingen beide," m. 5-9 from <i>Schillers Musen-Almanach für das Jahr 1797</i> (Tübingen: J. G. Cottaischen Buchhandlung, 1797)	189
44. Zelter "Wir gingen beide," m. 12-13 from <i>Schillers Musen-Almanach für das Jahr 1797</i> (Tübingen: J. G. Cottaischen Buchhandlung, 1797)	189
45. Zelter, "Wer nie sein Brodt mit Thränen aß," m. 8-13 from <i>Lieder, Das Erbe deutscher Musik</i> , no. 5 (Munich: G. Henle, 1995)	190
46. Zelter, "Sehnsucht," m. 1-20 (Mus. Ms. Autog. Zelter 22, Berlin Staatsbibliothek)	192
47. Zelter, "Sehnsucht," Postlude (Mus. Ms. Autog. Zelter 22, Berlin Staatsbibliothek)	193
48. Zelter, "Der König von Tule," m. 1-6, from <i>Lieder, Das Erbe deutscher Musik</i> , no. 5 (Munich: G. Henle, 1995)	194
49. Zelter, "Der getreue Eckart," m. 1-4 from <i>Lieder, Das Erbe deutscher Musik</i> , no. 5 (Munich: G. Henle, 1995)	195
50. Zelter, "Der getreue Eckart," m.16-23 from <i>Lieder, Das Erbe deutscher Musik</i> , no. 5 (Munich: G. Henle, 1995)	195
51. Zelter, "Rastlose Liebe," m. 48-52 from <i>Lieder, Das Erbe deutscher Musik</i> , no. 5 (Munich: G. Henle, 1995)	197
52. Zelter, "Rastlose Liebe," m. 57-64 from <i>Lieder, Das Erbe deutscher Musik</i> , no. 5 (Munich: G. Henle, 1995)	197
53. Zelter, "Rastlose Liebe," m. 1-4 from <i>Lieder, Das Erbe deutscher Musik</i> , no. 5 (Munich: G. Henle, 1995)	198
54. Beethoven, "Maigesang," m.10-18 from <i>Beethoven Werke</i> , series 12, no. 1, ed. Helga Lühning (Munich: G. Henle, 1990)	200

Musical Example	Page
55. Beethoven, "Der Bardengeist," m. 5-8 from <i>Beethoven Werke</i> , series 12, no. 1, ed. Helga Lühning (Munich: G. Henle, 1990)	201
56. Beethoven, "Vom Tode," m. 26-33 from <i>Beethoven Werke</i> , series 12, no. 1, ed. Helga Lühning (Munich: G. Henle, 1990)	202
57. L. Reichardt, "Aus Genoveva," m.1-4 from <i>Songs</i> , ed. Nancy B. Reich (New York: Da Capo Press, 1981)	204
58. L. Reichardt, "Ruhe Süßliebchen," m. 1-3 from <i>Songs</i> , ed. Nancy B. Reich (New York: Da Capo Press, 1981)	206
59. L. Reichardt, "Ruhe Süßliebchen," m. 8-16 from <i>Songs</i> , ed. Nancy B. Reich (New York: Da Capo Press, 1981)	207
60. L. Reichardt, "Stille der Andacht," m.1-5 from <i>Songs</i> , ed. Nancy B. Reich (New York: Da Capo Press, 1981)	208
61. L. Reichardt, "Wenn ich ihn nur habe," m.1-4 from <i>Songs</i> , ed. Nancy B. Reich (New York: Da Capo Press, 1981)	208
62. Loewe, "Christi Huld gegen Petrus" m. 1-5 from <i>Gesamtausgabe der Balladen, Legenden, Lieder und Gesänge, für eine Singstimme</i> , ed. Max Runze (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel; reprint ed. Westmead, England: Gregg International Publishers, 1970)	211
63. Loewe, "Die Gruft der Liebenden" m.47-65 from <i>Gesamtausgabe der Balladen, Legenden, Lieder und Gesänge, für eine Singstimme</i> , ed. Max Runze (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel; reprint ed. Westmead, England: Gregg International Publishers, 1970)	213
64. Schubert, "Kaiser Maximilian" m.1-6 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke</i> , series 4, vol.14 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)	215
65. Schubert, "Der Goldschmiedsgesell" m.1-5 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke</i> , series 4, vol. 11 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)	216
66. Schubert, "Der Tod und das Mädchen" m. 22-26 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke</i> , series 4, vol. 1 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)	217
67. Schubert, "Gretchen am Spinnrade," m. 48-59 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke</i> , series 4, vol. 1 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)	219

Musical Example	Page
68. Schubert, "Erlkönig," m. 19-23 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke</i> , series 4, vol. 1 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)	220
69. Schubert, "Erlkönig," m. 93-96 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke</i> , series 4, vol. 1 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)	220
70. Schubert, "Erlkönig," m.145-end from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke</i> , series 4, vol 1 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)	221
71. Schubert, "Mignon I" (1821) m.1-10 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke</i> , series 4, vol. 3 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)	222
72. Schubert, "Verklärung" m.10-12 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke</i> , series 4, vol. 6 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)	224
73. Schubert, "Verklärung" m.13-15 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke</i> , series 4, vol. 6 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)	224
74. Schubert, "Verklärung" m. 38-41 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke</i> , series 4, vol.6 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)	225
75. Schubert, "Antigone und Oedip," m. 27-33 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke</i> , series 4, vol. 1 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)	226
76. Schubert, "Am Feierabend" m.46-59 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke</i> , series 4, vol. 2 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)	227
77. Hensel, "Was Will die einsame Träne" m. 5-8 from <i>Lieder ohne Namen (1820-1844)</i> , vol. 1, ed. Cornelia Bartsch (Kassel: Furore Verlag, 2003)	229
78. Hensel, "Was Will die einsame Träne" m. 9-12 from <i>Lieder ohne Namen (1820-1844)</i> , vol, 1, ed. Cornelia Bartsch (Kassel: Furore Verlag, 2003)	229
79. Hensel, "Harfner's Lied" m.1-5 from <i>Ausgewählte Lieder</i> , vol. 2, ed Annette Maurer (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1993)	230
80. Hensel, "Harfner's Lied" m.25-26 from <i>Ausgewählte Lieder</i> , vol. 2, ed. Annette Maurer (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1993)	231
81. Hensel, "Über allen Gipfeln ist Ruh," m. 1-5 from <i>Ausgewählte Lieder</i> , vol. 2, ed. Annette Maurer (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1993)	231

Musical Example	Page
82. Hensel, "Frühling," m. 1-7 from <i>Ausgewählte Lieder</i> , vol. 1, ed. Annette Maurer (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1993)	232
83. Mendelssohn, "Minnelied" from <i>Werke</i> , vol. 19, ed. Julius Rietz (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1874-77; reprint ed. Farnborough, England: Gregg International Publishers, 1968)	235
84. Mendelssohn, "Wenn sich zwei Herzen scheiden" m.1-4 from <i>Werke</i> , vol. 19, ed. Julius Rietz (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1874-77; reprint ed. Farnborough, England: Gregg International Publishers, 1968)	237
85. Brahms, <i>Volksweisen für Clara Schumann</i> , p.10 from the facsimile, ed. Gerd Nauhaus (Hildesheim: Georg Olms Verlag, 1997)	240
86. Brahms, "Heidenröslein" m.1-4 from <i>Complete Songs for Solo Voice and Piano</i> , vol. 4, ed. Eusebius Mandyczewski (New York: Dover, 1980)	241
87. Brahms, "Schnitter Tod" m.1-8 from <i>Complete Songs for Solo Voice and Piano</i> , vol. 4, ed. Eusebius Mandyczewski (New York: Dover, 1980)	242
88. Brahms, "Vergangen ist mir Glück und Heil" m.1-10 from <i>Complete Songs for Solo Voice and Piano</i> , vol. 2, ed. Eusebius Mandyczewski (New York: Dover, 1980)	243
89. Brahms, "Meine Liebe ist grün," m. 1-6 from <i>Complete Songs for Solo Voice and Piano</i> , vol. 2, ed. Eusebius Mandyczewski (New York: Dover, 1980) .	244
90. Brahms, "Meine Liebe ist grün," m. 35-38 from <i>Complete Songs for Solo Voice and Piano</i> , vol. 2, ed. Eusebius Mandyczewski (New York: Dover, 1980)	245
91. Schubert, "Genügsamkeit" m.1-2 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke</i> , series 4, vol. 7 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)	262
92. Possible Introduction to Schubert, "Genügsamkeit"	263
93. Possible Introduction to Schubert, "Der Goldschmiedsgesell" m. 9-10	263
94. Another Possible Introduction to Schubert, "Der Goldschmiedsgesell"	264
95. Zelter, "Musen und Grazien in der Mark" m. 1-4 from <i>Schillers Musen Almanach für das Jahr 1797</i> (Tübingen: J. G. Cottaischen Buchhandlung, 1797)	268

Musical Example	Page
96. Author's Realization of Zelter, "Musen und Grazien," m. 1-4	268
97. Author's Alternate Realization of Zelter, "Musen und Grazien," m. 1-4	269
98. C. P. E. Bach, "Ich ging unter Erlen" from Max Friedlaender, <i>Das deutsche Lied im 18. Jahrhundert</i> , vol. 2 (Hildesheim, NY: G. Olms, 1970)	270
99. Author's Realization of C. P. E. Bach, "Ich ging unter Erlen"	271
100. Zelter, "An Mignon" (1801), m. 6-11 from <i>Lieder, Das Erbe deutscher Musik</i> , no. 5 (Munich: G. Henle, 1995)	278
101. Zelter, "An Mignon" (1806) m. 8-11 from <i>Carl Friedrich Zelter: Fünfzig Lieder</i> , ed. Ludwig Landshoff (Mainz: B. Schott's Söhne, 1932)	279
102. Reichardt, "Elegie auf ein Landmädchen", m. 19-22 from <i>Goethes Lieder, Oden, Balladen und Romanzen mit Musik</i> , Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 58 (Munich: G. Henle, 1964-70)	281
103. Zelter, "Feenreigen," m. 11-12 from <i>Schillers Musen-Almanach für das Jahr 1798</i> (Tübingen: J. G. Cottaischen Buchhandlung, 1798)	282
104. Schubert, "Jägers Liebeslied" m.1-10 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke</i> , series 4, vol. 5 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)	285
105. Author's Modifications to Schubert, "Jägers Liebeslied," m. 6-9	286
106. Schubert, "Jägers Liebeslied" m. 23-27 from <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke</i> , series 4, vol. 5 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)	287
107. Author's modification of "Jägers Liebeslied" m.9-10	288
108. Reichardt, Opening of "Bergschloß" (Stanza 1-6) from <i>Goethes Lieder, Oden, Balladen und Romanzen mit Musik</i> , Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 58 (Munich: G. Henle, 1964-70)	289
109. Reichardt, "Bergschloß" (Stanza 7-13) from <i>Goethes Lieder, Oden, Balladen und Romanzen mit Musik</i> , Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 58 (Munich: G. Henle, 1964-70)	289
110. Reichardt, "O weh, o weh" m. 1-2 from Max Friedlaender, <i>Das deutsche Lied im 18. Jahrhundert</i> , vol. 2 (Hildesheim, NY: G. Olms, 1970)	291
111. Author's modified accompaniment for Reichardt, "O weh, o weh," m.1-2 ...	291

Musical Example	Page
112. Second modified accompaniment for Reichardt, "O weh, o weh," m.1-2	292
113. Ruprecht, "Das verliebte Mädchen" m. 1-8 from Max Friedlaender, <i>Das deutsche Lied im 18. Jahrhundert</i> , vol. 2 (Hildesheim, NY: G. Olms, 1970)	292
114. Author's modified accompaniment for Ruprecht, "Das verliebte Mädchen," m.1-4	293

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Statement of Purpose

The term *basso continuo* literally means “continuous bass,” and refers to a common musical practice from the Baroque period of the seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries. In a basso continuo accompaniment, the keyboard player was expected to improvise, or “realize,” a harmonic accompaniment over a single instrumental bass line that ran throughout the work. This type of accompaniment is also commonly referred to as a “figured bass” accompaniment because of the numbers or “figures” the composer wrote underneath the bass line, indicating which chords he intended the performer to play. Accompanying from a figured bass was a skill every keyboardist was expected to possess. Therefore, treatises were written on the subject to provide instruction manuals for both the theoretical aspects of harmony and practical techniques, such as how to realize each figure, properly distribute the notes between the hands, and improvise tasteful embellishments.

Musicologists have long accepted the use of basso continuo accompaniments as an indispensable aspect of performance practice during the Baroque era, but many have assumed the practice was essentially discontinued after the first half of the eighteenth century since more and more composers were writing out complete keyboard

accompaniments utilizing full chords. Recent scholarship, however, has demonstrated that the theory and practice of continuo playing persisted throughout the remainder of the eighteenth century and even into the nineteenth. Continuo treatises intended for practical use continued to be written in Europe as late as the 1820s.¹ Furthermore, the use of basso continuo in the performance of several genres, including opera, concertos, symphonies and church music, is documented throughout this period as well.²

Another popular genre during the second half of the eighteenth century was the Lied, a German poem set to music for solo voice with keyboard accompaniment. Since basso continuo practice was still a part of the performance tradition in so many other genres at this time, it seems likely that it would have had an influential effect on Lied accompaniments as well. The purpose of this dissertation is to test that hypothesis in order to determine if, and to what extent, basso continuo practice influenced the composition and performance of late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century Lied accompaniments.

While most late eighteenth-century Lied composers no longer expected their performers to improvise an entire accompaniment, some composers persisted in writing actual figured bass numerals beneath the bass line of their keyboard parts as late as 1804. Even without the figures, however, there are other elements of these written-out

¹A complete list and description of all of the treatises can be found in the appendices.

²See especially Hellmut Federhofer, "Zur Generalbasspraxis im 19. Jahrhundert," *Musik und Kirche* 60 (1990): 1-10; Linda Faye Ferguson, "Col Basso and Generalbass in Mozart's Keyboard Concertos: Notation, Performance Theory, and Practice" (Ph.D. diss., Princeton University, 1983); and Daniel J. Koury, "The Orchestra in the Nineteenth Century: Physical Aspects of its Performance Practice" (Ph.D. diss., Boston University, 1963).

accompaniments that reflect ideas put forth by the authors of continuo treatises about proper hand position, the ideal number of parts and their distribution, and how a continuo accompaniment should relate to the solo line. For example, the accompaniment to Johann Friedrich Reichardt's setting of Goethe's poem *Erlkönig* from 1794 consists almost entirely of single bass notes in the left hand and three-note chords in the right hand, which is the basic hand position and chord spacing recommended by most authors of continuo treatises in Germany. Therefore, the actual notes on the page look very much like a written-out version of a continuo accompaniment that would have been improvised only a few decades earlier.

If basso continuo practice did have an influence on the composition of these Lied accompaniments, it is likely that it also had an influence on aspects of performance. Some of the late eighteenth-century Lieder appear very simple, with only a melody line and a bass line. It is possible that what appears on the written page is only a skeleton of what was actually expected to be played by the keyboardist. Simple strophic songs, which feature the same music from verse to verse, could have been varied stanza by stanza in order to bring out different elements of the text. Since improvisation was still a key element of performance in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, it is not difficult to imagine that the accompaniments could have been varied from performance to performance depending on the singer, keyboardist, and context. In addition, ornamentation could have been used to help boost the sustaining power and dynamic capabilities of early keyboards, which varied greatly from instrument to instrument.

Significance of the Study

In recent years historical performance practice studies have become an increasingly visible part of music scholarship. The majority of these studies, however, are focused on music before 1750. There is still a great need for further inquiries into the performance of late eighteenth-century and nineteenth-century music. Within this context, the research relating to historical performance issues surrounding the German Lied is particularly scarce. Several authors have hinted at the possibility of a *continuo* tradition existing well into the nineteenth century, but none have developed this idea fully. Furthermore, none have dealt with the *continuo* tradition specifically in the context of the German Lieder of this period.

Most existing studies on Lieder, including the performance practice studies, tend to focus on either the vocal line or the text, but rarely on the keyboard part. Clearly, all three parts are intended to function together as a whole, and all are very important. However, there are numerous detailed analyses of vocal lines, and significantly fewer of accompaniments. When the accompaniments are described it is usually in the context of something "new" or "innovative" a particular composer is doing. Unfortunately, this means that there are many composers who were prolific in the genre that are considered too "traditional" and are therefore either lumped together in a short paragraph or completely ignored. Part of the reason for this neglect is because of frequent

misrepresentation by well-known scholars who label eighteenth-century Lieder as “tuneful trifles”³ or “a despised form, unfit for consideration.”⁴

Sergius Kagen expresses the view of many when he describes the supposedly inadequate pre-nineteenth-century German Lied writing that

The German composers of this period who wrote in German, with the exception of Mozart and the towering genius of J. S. Bach, whose music transcends all limitations of time and style, have contributed relatively little to vocal literature.⁵

Despite the fact that the Lied was one of the most important aspects of eighteenth-century cultural life for the German middle class and more than 800 song collections were published between 1736 and 1800, a reading of most Lied histories gives one the impression that Franz Schubert had virtually no predecessors in the genre. Barbara Meister writes that “In truth it is not until Schubert that we find a major composer for whom art song was a vital, indispensable form of musical expression.”⁶ Henry Finck states that Schubert “practically created” the Lied.⁷ In his article on Franz Schubert for the 1980 *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians* Eric Sams writes that Schubert’s song facility

³Edward T. Cone, “Words and Music: The Composer’s Approach to the Text,” in *Music: A View from Delft, Selected Essays*, ed. Robert P. Morgan (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1989), 115.

⁴Charles Rosen, *The Romantic Generation* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1995), 124.

⁵Sergius Kagen, *Music for the Voice*, rev. ed. (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1968), 5.

⁶Barbara Meister, *An Introduction to the Art Song* (New York: Taplinger Press, 1980), 48.

⁷Henry T. Finck, *Songs and Song Writers* (New York: Charles Scribner’s Sons, 1928), v.

was “practically without ancestry.” Charles Rosen makes the strongest statement saying that

[After Schubert’s] first tentative experiments, the principles on which most of his songs are written are almost entirely new; they are related to the Lieder of the past only by negation: they annihilate all that precedes.⁸

Furthermore, modern scholars often criticize the unaffected simplicity and direct appeal of these earlier Lieder, yet these are the very qualities that were praised and valued during the height of the genre’s popularity. The present study, therefore, is needed in order to show what these early Lied composers were trying to accomplish, and to demonstrate how their accompaniments fit into a wider historical context. Furthermore, it provides an ideal opportunity to introduce some of the lesser-known composers of the period, as well as show how the better-known ones relate to the musical climate around them.

In addition to challenging the traditional definitions of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century Lieder, this study also has significant implications for performance practice. Continuo treatises, secondary sources, statements by musicians of the period, and clues in the music itself confirm that composers did not always intend for performers to play exactly what is notated. Rather, the simple musical outlines on the page provided a basic structure, which keyboardists could then adapt to their own skill level, the ability of the singer, the available instruments, and the performance context. Principles given in the continuo treatises can serve a guide for knowing what additions to make to the accompaniment, and I offer suggestions of possible applications. This dissertation is also

⁸Charles Rosen, *The Classical Style* (New York: Viking Press, 1972), 454.

relevant to music theory, where basso continuo is studied as an aid to understanding harmony and composition. It also has the potential to contribute to the study of German literature, since poetry plays a key role in the Lied, and many Lied composers were using texts by some of the most important German poets of the period.

Methods and Procedures

In order to understand how figured bass practice influenced the composition and performance of Lied accompaniments in the second half of the eighteenth century and the first few decades of the nineteenth century, the research was guided by the following questions:

- 1) How is the information in continuo treatises reflected in what is written in the Lied accompaniments themselves?
- 2) Because continuo accompaniments were originally improvised, are there other performance possibilities discussed in the continuo treatises or in eyewitness accounts that reflect things that are not actually written on the page?
- 3) Did the different kinds of keyboards (harpsichord, clavichord, fortepiano) and the evolution of these instruments affect the accompaniments that were written and the style of performance?
- 4) Are there any connections between specific genres of continuo playing (opera, church music, etc.) and similar types of Lieder?

- 5) Are there any traces of the influence of continuo practice in the Lieder of later composers, especially Felix Mendelssohn (1809-1847) and Johannes Brahms (1833-1897), since they were influenced by earlier styles?

In order to provide a context for these more specific questions, information on general background issues is acquired from secondary sources regarding performance practices and the history of the Lied. This includes historical information on the development of the various keyboard instruments and modern writings on the history of basso continuo practice. Also, biographical and analytic studies on the various Lied composers were taken into account.

The main focus of the research, however, is on the analysis of primary sources. The most important sources are the accompaniment treatises of the period and the Lied compositions themselves. I have chosen to look at Lieder and treatises beginning in the 1750s because it was during that decade that the principles of simple, natural song composition, which remained important throughout the period of this study, were first codified. It was also during that decade that several influential song collections began to appear in Berlin. The analyses continue well into the nineteenth century with a focus on individual composers for whom continuo practice had the most enduring impact.

In order to determine the influence of continuo practice on the Lied accompaniments, my general procedure was to study what the treatises say on how to realize and perform continuo accompaniments, and compare those recommendations with what is actually written by the Lied composer. In addition, facsimiles of composition exercises used by these Lied composers will assist in illuminating what kind of training

particular composers had. Other primary sources, such as periodicals, writings on aesthetics, diaries, letters, and reviews, will also be studied to illuminate aspects of performance that may not have been written down in the music itself.

French, Italian, and English figured-bass treatises are included in the analysis in addition to the German ones. First of all, this gives a more complete picture of the figured-bass tradition in general. Furthermore, most of the authors, regardless of nationality, agree on the general principles for continuo accompanying in the second half of the eighteenth century. Most authors also show a general awareness of what the others are writing, frequently quoting from other treatises. Finally, many of the authors traveled, worked, and published outside of their countries of origin. For example, Augustus Friedrich Christoph Kollmann was a German whose treatises were published in London. However, one of his goals was to bring German theory to England and his writings show a strong reliance on the theoretical writings of Kirnberger.

Many Lied composers also traveled and worked outside of their original areas at some point in their careers and might have incorporated aspects of these other traditions. Not only did composers from German-speaking areas go abroad, such as Johann Friedrich von Dalberg (1760-1812) who spent much of his life traveling in Germany, England, and Italy, but also composers came from other regions to these German-speaking areas. For example, Gaspare Spontini (1774-1851) was an Italian composer who spent over twenty years in Berlin and wrote several Lieder. Furthermore, although Berlin, the city where many of the early song composers resided, produced several German figured-bass

treatises, it was also strongly influenced by France, and Lied composers were encouraged to imitate a French style of song composition.

Overview of Relevant Scholarship

The majority of the research for this dissertation was done using primary sources, but secondary sources were also used for background information on performance practice, early keyboards, and the history of the Lied. While there has been no extensive research on the specific topic of this dissertation, there are several books and dissertations that verify the existence of continuo practice into the nineteenth century. Robert Zapulla's *Figured Bass Accompaniment in France* is an extensive examination of all known theoretical and practical basso continuo treatises written in France.⁹ Although Zapulla's emphasis is on French continuo playing, he also compares and contrasts French traits with other national and regional styles. Particularly useful for this study is an appendix with an annotated checklist of French, Italian, English, and German accompaniment treatises that reveals that continuo treatises were still being written in several countries through 1825.

Linda Faye Ferguson's dissertation on the use of continuo in Mozart's keyboard concertos also documents continuo practice in several genres well into the nineteenth century.¹⁰ For example, Ferguson gives numerous accounts of opera orchestras using continuo as late as 1831. In addition, she shows that the use of a keyboard as part of a

⁹Robert Zapulla, *Figured Bass Accompaniment in France* (Turnhout, Belgium: Brepols, 2000).

¹⁰Ferguson, "Col Basso and Generalbass."

symphony orchestra was still considered standard by Heinrich Christoph Koch in 1802, and even as late as 1809 by Carl Maria von Weber. Regarding concertos, Ferguson concludes that although the keyboardist no longer acted as director of the ensemble after 1800, many continued to play in some or all of the full ensemble sections, even into the 1830s.

Ralph Larry Todd's analysis of Felix Mendelssohn's composition studies with Carl Friedrich Zelter during the years 1819-1821 is another source that suggests the presence of a continuo practice in the nineteenth century.¹¹ Through an analysis of the order and types of exercises Zelter assigned, Todd traces Mendelssohn's musical lineage back through Zelter, who studied under Kirnberger and Fasch, all the way to Johann Sebastian Bach. From this Todd concludes that, despite the fact that continuo practice was waning in other areas by the end of the eighteenth century, figured-bass instruction persisted and even flourished for some time in Berlin.

In addition to being one of Mendelssohn's primary composition teachers, Carl Friedrich Zelter also wrote over 200 Lieder, roughly between 1785 and 1820. In a recent dissertation, Stephanie Lynn Campbell demonstrates several specific connections between continuo practice and Zelter's Lied accompaniments, many of which imply elements of improvisation.¹² For example, as late as 1797 some of his Lieder contain figures beneath

¹¹Ralph Larry Todd, *Mendelssohn's Musical Education: A Study and Edition of His Exercises in Composition* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983).

¹²Stephanie Lynn Campbell, "Carl Friedrich Zelter and Text Setting: A Comparison of Goethe Settings by Zelter, Beethoven and Schubert" (Ph.D. diss., Washington University, St. Louis, 1997).

the bass line, suggesting that Zelter expected the pianist to add notes to those on the page. Other songs contain bass lines with additional notes in smaller print, presumably meant as a possible realization of the keyboard part. Furthermore, some songs present a very large range of notes that would be difficult or impossible to cover with two hands. Campbell suggests that this implies that the keyboard player was not always meant to double the vocal line, but instead was to realize an accompaniment from the bass line and other lines provided. Further evidence that the pianist had freedom to play more than what was actually on the page comes from the fact that after 1800 when Zelter transferred many of his earlier songs from a two-stave to a three-stave format he usually filled out the chords in the piano part, reinforcing the vocal line without doubling it exactly.

Much of the secondary literature on performance practice deals with music before 1750, but there are several recent books that include the second half of the eighteenth century and the early nineteenth century. Clive Brown's *Classical and Romantic Performing Practice: 1750-1900*¹³ is a thorough examination of many specific performance conventions including accentuation, dynamics, articulation, tempo, alla breve, and ornamentation, but Brown also suggests that in order to interpret the music correctly modern performers need to look beyond the notes of the page. Therefore he frames his discussion with questions such as: What did the composers mean by what they wrote? What were their expectations regarding improvisation? How much interpretive freedom did the performer have? *Performance Practice: Music After 1600*, edited by Howard

¹³Clive Brown, *Classical and Romantic Performing Practice: 1750-1900* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999).

Mayer Brown and Stanley Sadie,¹⁴ also contains sections on the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries and covers many of the same topics as Clive Brown's book, but includes additional chapters specifically dealing with sources, instruments, and vocal techniques, each written by acknowledged authorities in the individual fields.

For more detailed information on keyboard practices, Sandra Rosenblum's book *Performance Practices in Classical Piano Music* is one of the most important secondary sources.¹⁵ Although the book is a helpful scholarly resource on topics such as dynamics, articulation, pedaling, ornamentation, and rhythm, Rosenblum also wants the book be useful for the serious piano student, so she includes many practical applications to actual piano compositions of the period. In addition to the information on the construction of early fortepianos and historical technique, she also gives suggestions on how to apply these performance conventions to the modern piano. Other articles by Rosenblum in *Performance Practice Review* explore issues of keyboard performance in other musical eras in addition to the Classic period.¹⁶

¹⁴Howard Mayer Brown and Stanley Sadie, eds., *Performance Practice: Music After 1600* (New York & London: W. W. Norton, 1989).

¹⁵Sandra Rosenblum, *Performance Practices in Classic Piano Music: Their Principles and Applications* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1988).

¹⁶Idem, "Concerning Articulation on Keyboard Instruments: Aspects from the Renaissance to the Present," *Performance Practice Review* 10, no. 1 (1997): 31-40 and "Pedaling the Piano: A Brief Survey from the Eighteenth Century to the Present," *Performance Practice Review* 6, no. 2 (1993): 158-178.

F. T. Arnold's *The Art of Accompaniment from a Thorough-Bass*¹⁷ and Peter Williams's *Figured Bass Accompaniment*¹⁸ both discuss keyboard practices in relation to basso continuo playing. Arnold's book recounts the history of figured bass in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries with a summary of some of the most important treatises and information on the best continuo players. He then goes on to describe how to perform each chord and its inversions, resolutions, and figures according to various authors. Peter Williams's book also summarizes historical styles of continuo playing and chord types, but he states that theory, history, and practice should not be separated. Therefore, he expects his readers to apply what they are learning and includes a second volume which is an extensive anthology of graded examples taken from theory books and music of the period for students to practice.

More recent scholarship on continuo theory includes Jesper Bøje Christensen's *18th-Century Continuo Playing: a Historical Guide to the Basics*,¹⁹ a detailed guide to figured bass practices in France and Germany between 1690 and 1735. The book relies extensively on historical sources and is laid out in short sections in order to allow the reader to easily find the specific information they need. Many of the chapters in *The*

¹⁷F. T. Arnold, *The Art of Accompaniment from a Thorough-Bass as Practised in the XVIIth and XVIIIth Centuries* (London: The Holland Press, 1961).

¹⁸Peter Williams, *Figured Bass Accompaniment* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1977).

¹⁹Jesper Bøje Christensen, *18th-Century Continuo Playing: a Historical Guide to the Basics*, trans. J. Bradford Robinson (Kassel; New York: Bärenreiter, 2002).

Cambridge History of Western Music Theory also reference figured bass practice in the eighteenth century.²⁰

While Arnold, Williams, and Christensen focus mainly on the rules of continuo playing, a recent dissertation by Kah-Ming Ng examines the broader social and artistic context of figured bass accompaniment between 1650 and 1800.²¹ One of Ng's overarching questions, which is particularly relevant to this study, is why such a large number of treatises were written for amateurs in the eighteenth century. He concludes that thoroughbass accompanying was considered a fashionable accessory for educated amateur musicians, and explores the various marketing ploys used by the treatise authors to attract buyers. He also provides an analysis of aspects of artistic accompaniment, such as treatment of dissonance, melodies in various voices, and playing from an unfigured bass, as a result of his own survey of the treatises themselves.

The classic and most thorough secondary source for the history of the eighteenth-century Lied is Max Friedlaender's two volume *Das deutsche Lied im 18. Jahrhundert*.²² In addition to providing some brief historical background, most of the first volume is an extensive annotated catalog which lists published Lied collections by year, including

²⁰Thomas Christensen, ed, *The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002). See also Thomas Christensen's article "The *règle de l'octave* in Thorough-Bass Theory and Practice," *Acta musicologica* 64 (1992): 91-117.

²¹Kah-Ming Ng, "Figured Bass Accompaniment at the Harpsichord in its Social and Artistic Context" (Ph.D. diss., Oxford University, 2002).

²²Max Friedlaender, *Das deutsche Lied im 18. Jahrhundert* (Hildesheim, NY: G. Olms, 1970.)

information about the composers and the contents. The second half of volume one is 360 pages of actual musical examples. Volume two is entitled *Dichtung* and covers numerous poets, poems and their subsequent musical settings.

Most of the literature on the nineteenth-century Lied deals with composers in the second two-thirds of the century, and generally only with the well-known composers Franz Schubert (1797-1828), Robert Schumann (1810-1856), Felix Mendelssohn (1809-1847), Johannes Brahms (1833-1897), and Hugo Wolf (1860-1903).²³ Lorraine Gorrell's 1993 book on the topic is a little more inclusive, with brief chapters on women composers, and one called "The Supporting Cast," which discusses lesser-known composers of the nineteenth century.²⁴ Of the eighteenth-century composers the so-called "First Berlin School" composers receive the most attention with two dissertations providing general overviews of the Berlin Lied of the mid-eighteenth century. The authors of both works are particularly interested in Christian Gottfried Krause's influence on the group's musical style.²⁵ More attention is given to the Lieder of C. P. E. Bach, arguably the most

²³See for example Carol Kimball, *Song: A Guide to Style and Literature* (Seattle: Psst...Inc, 1996); James Hall, *The Art Song* (Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press, 1953); Anneliese Landau, *The Lied: The Unfolding of its Style* (Washington, D.C.: University Press of America, 1980); Barbara Meister, *An Introduction to the Art Song* (New York: Taplinger Press, 1980); and Denis Stevens, ed., *A History of Song* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1970).

²⁴Lorraine Gorrell, *The Nineteenth-Century German Lied* (Portland, OR: Amadeus Press, 1993)

²⁵Leroy Evans Bynum, Jr., "The First Berlin Lieder School: The Early Development of the German Art Song" (D.M.A. diss., University of Georgia, 1992) and John Richard Edwards, "Christian Gottfried Krause: Mentor of the First Berlin Song School" (Ph.D. diss., University of Iowa, 1973).

important composer associated with the Berlin school, in *C. P. E. Bach and the Rebirth of the Strophic Song* by William H. Youngren.²⁶ The lengthy monograph contains multiple chapters on the historical and aesthetic background of Bach's era, thorough analyses of all of Bach's song collections, and copious musical examples of Bach's work as well as facsimiles of songs from original editions by Krause, Marpurg, and others of the period. In general, however, research on the Lieder of individual lesser-known composers is found mostly in dissertations, journal articles, and introductory essays of printed music editions.²⁷

Two Lied histories that make a special effort to introduce lesser-known composers are J. W. Smeed's *German Song and its Poetry, 1740-1900*²⁸ and the recent *Cambridge Companion to the Lied*, edited by James Parsons.²⁹ Of course, Smeed does include Schubert, Schumann, and other nineteenth-century Lied composers in his discussion, but he devotes roughly half the book to eighteenth-century composers as well. In addition, he includes sections on the Lied in Austria and in Switzerland, which is elsewhere rarely

²⁶William H. Youngren, *C. P. E. Bach and the Rebirth of the Strophic Song* (Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press, 2003).

²⁷For example see Ray Fernando Luper, "The German Lieder of Nikolaus Freiherr von Krufft, 1779-1818" (Ph.D. diss., Tulane University, 1976); Michael Lynn Ballam, "The Life of Johann Michael Haydn and an Examination of His Lieder Collections *Auserlesene Sammlung von Lieder mit Melodien and Aoiden*" (D.M.A. diss., Indiana University, 1976); and Hidemi Matsushita, "The Musical Career and Compositions of Maria Theresia von Paradis (1759-1824)" (Ph.D. diss., Brigham Young University, 1989). See the bibliography for other composers.

²⁸J. W. Smeed, *German Song and its Poetry, 1740-1900* (London: Croom Helm, 1987).

²⁹James Parsons, ed. *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004).

discussed.³⁰ Furthermore, he includes chapters on relevant concepts such as “Hausmusik” and the influence of folk song. Smeed laments in his introduction that so many authors sum up the history of the German Lied in only four names: Schubert, Schumann, Brahms and Wolf, writing that

This is not only an historical oversimplification, but unfair to many forgotten composers who wrote extremely beautiful songs. It is the thought of these neglected masterpieces, as well as a desire to set the historical record straight, that prompts me to attempt this account.³¹

The breadth of the field that Smeed covers is extremely useful, but its usefulness is sometimes hampered by his strong personal opinions and some imprecise translations.

The chapters in *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied* is one of the most important sources, since it contains the most recent research on the eighteenth-century Lied, including issues of historical context, circulation, and performance. In particular, the chapter by James Parsons entitled “The Eighteenth-Century Lied” refutes many of the common misrepresentations of eighteenth-century Lieder as expressionless and anemic, and places them in their proper historical and social context. Amanda Glauert’s chapter on “The Lieder of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach, Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven” provides much needed information about these well-known composers. Although much of the music by these composers is frequently written about, their contributions to this particular genre are not. Significant portions of both Jane Brown’s chapter on the influence of poetic

³⁰The only lengthy discussion of the Swiss Lied is found in Albert Nef, *Das Lied in der deutschen Schweiz: Ende des 18. Und Anfang des 19. Jahrhunderts* (Zürich: Gebrüder Hug and Co, 1909).

³¹Smeed, xiii.

styles on the music of the Lied and David Gramit's chapter on the Lied as both artwork and commodity are spent on the eighteenth-century Lied and issues surrounding its composition and publication.

Although there were a few performance practice insights in Stephanie Campbell's Zelter dissertation mentioned above, most of the research on Lied performance has centered around the songs of Franz Schubert, and interpretations of them by Schubert's friend and collaborator Johann Michael Vogl, who often added ornamentation to the vocal line. Articles by Walther Dürr and Eric Van Tassel, as well as a more extensive treatment of the subject in a dissertation by Timothy Mussard, argue that these improvised embellishments were a practice in which Schubert willingly took part.³² A recent dissertation by Charles Madsen on the Schubert-Liszt transcriptions agrees with the three mentioned above, and suggests that ornamentation of Lieder was not only an accepted practice, but was actually expected during Schubert's time as well as Liszt's.³³

Dürr, Van Tassel, Mussard, and Madsen all come from the perspective that our modern ideas about the inviolability of the Lied did not exist in the early parts of the nineteenth century. David Montgomery, however, advocates for a different view. In his

³²Walther Dürr, "Schubert and Johann Michael Vogl: a Reappraisal," *19th-Century Music* 3, no. 2 (1979): 126-40; Eric Van Tassel, "'Something Utterly New': Listening to Schubert Lieder. I: Vogl and the Declamatory Style," *Early Music* 25, no. 4 (1997): 702-714; and Timothy Mussard, "Embellishing Schubert's Songs: A Performance Practice" (D.M.A. diss., University of Washington, 1987).

³³Charles Madsen, "The Schubert-Liszt Transcriptions: Text, Interpretation, and Lieder Transformation" (Ph.D. Diss., University of Oregon, 2003). While Dürr and Mussard were dealing only with the performance of the vocal line, Madsen points out that Liszt also embellished the accompaniment parts of Schubert's Lieder.

book *Franz Schubert's Music in Performance*, he argues that adding spontaneous ornamentation to Schubert's music is not only a misrepresentation of already "wonderfully worked-out musical ideas," but also "runs counter to the new direction taken by serious music—and Schubert's music specifically—during the early nineteenth century" when composer and performer were becoming separate entities.³⁴ For Montgomery, performance practice is about accurately representing what has already been carefully notated in the music.

Pianist-scholars Malcolm Bilson and Robert Levin, on the other hand, take issue with Montgomery's ideas. Bilson writes that it is not the notes on the page that are sacrosanct, but rather the meaning of the notes in their proper context. He insists that personal interpretation is intrinsic to the "First Rule" of every treatise, including the ones written in Schubert's day, and is absolutely necessary because musical notation can never be precise.³⁵ Levin agrees with Bilson, and adds that the composer/performer dichotomy that Montgomery insists on simply did not exist in Schubert's Vienna.³⁶

³⁴David Montgomery, *Franz Schubert's Music in Performance; Compositional Ideals, Notational Intent, Historical Realities, Pedagogical Foundations* (Hillsdale, NY: Pendragon Press, 2003), 189.

³⁵Malcolm Bilson, "The Future of Schubert Interpretation: What is Really Needed?" *Early Music* 25, no. 4 (1997): 715-722. Bilson and Levin are responding to an earlier article: David Montgomery, "Modern Schubert Interpretation in the Light of Pedagogical Sources of His Day," *Early Music* 25, no. 1 (1997): 100-118.

³⁶Robert Levin, "Performance Prerogatives in Schubert," *Early Music* 25, no. 4 (1997): 723-727.

It is the purpose of this dissertation to do exactly what Bilson recommends: to understand the meaning of the notes in their proper context. In this case, the notes I will be looking at are those of Lied accompaniments from the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. The secondary literature discussed above makes a case that improvisatory practices, including basso continuo, still had a role in the general musical composition and performance of this time period. My research will show specifically that these practices continued to influence the composition and performance of German Lieder as well.

Overview of the Dissertation

Following this introduction, the next two chapters will give background information in order to provide a historical, social, and artistic context for the analyses that follow. Chapter Two is an overview of the history of the solo Lied with keyboard accompaniment from the seventeenth-century continuo Lied through the first few decades of the nineteenth. The history proceeds by region and gives special attention to the composers whose Lieder are analyzed in later chapters. Chapter Three surveys the contents of all of the basso continuo treatises published in the second half of the eighteenth century in order to establish the general rules of figured bass accompanying during the period, especially those relating to hand position and the number of parts, favored and prohibited intervals and chords, the use of unfigured bass, ideas about embellishment and filled-in accompaniments, and the relationship of the accompaniment to the solo line. The chapter will also explore the social context of figured bass

accompanying in the eighteenth century, especially as it relates to the amateur, middle-class musicians, for whom most of the treatises are written.

The remaining chapters of the dissertation will focus on the analysis of the Lieder themselves. Chapter Four analyzes the late eighteenth-century Lied accompaniments using the information gleaned from the treatises in order to see how much of what the composers actually wrote on the page is reflective of continuo practice. Chapter Five examines the way continuo practice remained an influence in early nineteenth-century Lieder, especially on the songs of Zelter, Beethoven, Louise Reichardt, Loewe, Schubert, Fanny Hensel, Felix Mendelssohn, and Brahms. Finally, after presenting the evidence for the influence of continuo practice on many of the Lied accompaniments of the period, Chapter Six explores the possibility of improvising and adding notes to what is already on the page, using principles from the continuo treatises as a guide.

CHAPTER II

A BRIEF HISTORY OF THE GERMAN LIED

It is necessary to begin the chapter with a survey of the history of the Baroque Lied. Although this is not the main period under discussion, it will provide a context for later developments in Lied history. Furthermore, since the goal of this dissertation is to determine the influence of basso continuo practice on Lied accompaniments, it is important first to know about the seventeenth-century Baroque Lied, whose keyboard parts are unquestionably figured bass accompaniments, in order to understand what to look for in the later Lieder. Following the introduction to the Baroque continuo Lied, the focus will shift to the period in question and progress chronologically through the various German-speaking regions that produced Lieder in the second half of the eighteenth century, including Northern Germany, Southern Germany, Austria, and Switzerland.¹ Special emphasis will be given to the composers whose songs will be analyzed in other chapters.

This chapter will also show that the late eighteenth-century Lied did have numerous ties to continuo practice. First of all, there were composers in Germany who

¹Of course in the eighteenth century there was not yet a country of "Germany," but rather German-speaking territories. However, for the sake of clarity, this dissertation will refer to these regions in the way they are understood today as "North Germany" and "South Germany."

continued to print figured bass numerals under the accompaniment parts through the remainder of the eighteenth century, and even into the nineteenth in Switzerland.

Secondly, many North German schools of Lied composers specifically say they are drawing on aspects of Lied from the first half of the eighteenth century, which almost always use figured basses. Composers in other areas may not explicitly claim the influence of the early eighteenth-century Lied, but they draw from examples by North Germans who do claim that influence.

Even where the influence is not directly claimed, there are two general features that characterize almost all late eighteenth-century Lied, which are also common to the Baroque continuo Lied. First, almost all Lied from the seventeenth century until the end of the nineteenth century were composed with the same audience in mind: social gatherings in the home. The idea of the Lied being a “simple” and “natural” genre that could be used by every level of musician, even the middle class amateurs, can be connected to the Baroque Lied. In addition to aiming at the same audience, almost all of the Lied under discussion had the same goal: to bring out the poetry. The text is always the focus, therefore a simple harmonic accompaniment that supports, but does not get in the way, is all that is needed. The idea of a basso continuo-influenced accompaniment fits perfectly with this concept, since one of the reasons the continuo accompaniment practice began originally was to allow for flexible text declamation. This chapter will take all of these things into consideration and provide a historical foundation for the analyses in the chapters that follow.

The Seventeenth-Century Continuo Lied

Histories of eighteenth- and nineteenth- century Lieder usually ignore the Baroque continuo Lied, associating it with extravagance, splendor, and courtly patrons, which have nothing to do with the simple, naive, amateur Lied popular in the second half of the eighteenth century. While there is one type of Baroque Lied that represents these qualities, with relatively ornate, melismatic, contrapuntal settings, there is another that is more in line with the values of the eighteenth century Lied. Most seventeenth-century Lieder, like the Lieder of North Germany a century later, were generally simple songs in strophic form with lighthearted texts and melodies that could be easily sung by amateur musicians. R. H. Thomas, in his book on the German Baroque continuo Lied, identifies two types of Baroque poetry that represent these two sets of values, and consequently their musical settings: the poetry that represents the public voice and that for the private voice. While the public voice of poetry, represented generally by music for the courts, “proclaimed exalted truths about existence, about the majesty of God and the death of kings,” the private voice “sang of homelier themes, of everyday joys and sorrows, of love true and false.”² Some poets wrote in both styles, but it was the “homelier” types that formed the basis of the texts for the seventeenth-century continuo Lied.

The most important poet set by the early seventeenth-century Lied composers was Martin Opitz (1597-1639), whose *Buch von der deutschen Poeterey* (1624) presented new rules for German poetry in an attempt to raise the quality and dignity of the genre to a

²R. Hinton Thomas, *Poetry and Song in the German Baroque* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1963), xi. Thomas’s book appears to be the only full-length work devoted solely to the German Baroque continuo Lied.

new level.³ Before Opitz many of the traditional German texts were long, asymmetrical, and lacking a consistent rhyme scheme, which made for awkward musical rhythm that did not lend itself to Lied settings. Opitz' reforms, on the other hand, preached clarity and consistency, particularly in diction, meter, and rhyme. He also wanted consistency in subject matter, preferring pastoral or moral poetic themes.⁴

Two of the most important composers of the early continuo Lied were Heinrich Albert (1604-1651) in Königsberg and Johann Rist (1607-1667) in Hamburg. Albert set to music the texts of many poets other than Opitz, including a few of his own, but all of these lesser-known poets were highly influenced by Opitz' poetic reforms.⁵ While Albert wrote many kinds of vocal music, he is best known for his eight volumes of *Arien*, most of which are typical of the early continuo Lied, which flourished from approximately 1640-1670, and consisted of simple, strophic songs for solo voice with accompaniments built on a figured bass.⁶ By his own admission, Albert kept the *Arien* simple, so that they could be played by his educated middle-class friends who had only a minimal amount of musical

³Thomas, 34. Thomas goes so far as to say that Opitz' poetry was "set to music more often and in more different ways than probably any other poet of his time." Not only was he set frequently during his own lifetime, but he is featured in several prominent collections of the eighteenth century, including Johann Friedrich Gräfe's *Sammlung verschiedener auserlesener Oden* from 1737 and the *Lieder der Teutschen* produced by the Berlin school in the second half of the eighteenth century. J. H. Baron, "Dutch Influences on the German Secular Solo-Continuo Lied," *Acta Musicologica* 43 (1971), 51 acknowledges the influence of Opitz on "all succeeding German poets of the 17th century."

⁴John H. Baron, "The Generalbass Lied, c1620-c1750" in *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd ed.

⁵Baron, *Grove*.

⁶Thomas, xii.

training. The simplicity of the songs also reflects their function, which was to provide entertainment for social gatherings among friends. The majority of the songs in Albert's collections were written especially for these kinds of events, or as gifts for friends on significant days such as birthdays or weddings.⁷ The foreword to his first book of *Arien* from 1636 reflects on the audience, purpose, and nature of the works when he asks people

not to imagine that these melodies are intended to show any great skill, for this would do me an injustice....I composed these songs for the sake of the texts, which came into my hands, which I liked, and which for the most part I was asked to put to music by good friends of mine...If you are surprised that I have included religious and secular songs in one book, remember how it is in your own life. Often you spend time in the morning in worship, but at noon you amuse yourself in the garden or some other pleasant place, and pass the evening in good company, perhaps with your lady love.⁸

When a second part came out in 1640 he continues to defend the unpretentious nature of the songs, describing them as having been composed when "the authors of the texts and myself sometimes met to make music merely for pleasure."⁹

The simple tune and harmonies of Albert's duet "Herbstlied" from his 1640 collection are reflective of the style of many of these early continuo Lieder.

⁷Ibid., 44.

⁸Quoted in Ibid., 46.

⁹Ibid.

Example 1. Heinrich Albert, "Herbstlied," from *Arien*, Denkmäler deutscher Tonkunst, no. 12 (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1958)

1st Soprano
2nd Soprano
B. c.

Joh - und he - bes Wald und Feld wie - der an zu kin - gen, Be - re - so pflöß, maet und rauf
dann es will dir grim - me Käl - al - la Luft ver - ja - gen.

hin und wie - der in der Luft, fäl - let al - la Blät - ter durch sein stren - gen Wet - ter.

Forest and field now rise again to lament,
For the fierce cold will banish all pleasure.
The north wind howls, whistles, and calls
Here and there, in the air;
All the leaves fall because of the harsh weather he brings.¹⁰

Furthermore, the ideals of amateur, intimate, strophic, and “homely” poetry and music that deal with the subjects of everyday life are not really that different from the values of the late eighteenth-century Berlin composers who are usually credited with the beginning of the modern Lied. Music historian J. W. Smeed agrees that these strophic songs, which are “very simple, direct and fresh in style,” can be seen as “the natural forerunners of the [modern] Lied.” Regarding the “Herbstlied” he writes that

That tune points back to the simple folk-melodies woven by sixteenth-century composers into their polyphonic works, and is at the same time an oddly exact anticipation of the tone to be adopted by J. A. P. Schulz and his imitators when,

¹⁰Translation by Carl Parrish in Hermann Keller, *Thoroughbass Method* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1965), 34.

over a century after Albert, they attempted to reintroduce the style of such folk melodies into their songs.¹¹

Johann Rist, who also wrote early Lieder, was both a popular composer and an extremely popular poet. Like that of Albert, his poetry followed the Opitz reforms and is usually strophic with consistently clear rhyme and meter.¹² He himself was an amateur musician and had many friends who were minor musical figures in Hamburg.¹³ When it came to Lieder, however, he considered music to be merely functional. He wanted ordinary people to be able to sing his texts, so he demanded simplicity and clarity from the composers who set them. Thomas points out that Johann Schop, a court composer at Wolfenbüttel, had to modify his natural style when setting Rist's texts in order to respect Rist's preferences. The modifications pleased Rist, who praised the results, because even children, and those "inexperienced in the noble art of song" could sing them.¹⁴ Again, these simple strophic songs, which were meant to be available to everyone, including amateur musicians and "ordinary people," reflect values that were also present at the end of the eighteenth century.

These simple, strophic songs aimed at the amateur musician were not the only kind of continuo Lied present during the Baroque era in Germany, however. Some composers,

¹¹Smeed, *German Song and its Poetry*, 1.

¹²Baron, *Grove*.

¹³Thomas, 67 mentions three organists (Jacob Schultze, Heinrich Scheidemann, and Jacob Kortkamp), a cantor (Thomas Selle), and other Hamburg composers (Peter Meier and Johann Schop).

¹⁴*Ibid.*, 69.

including Heinrich Albert, wrote in different styles depending on the type of text and reason for composition. For example, as Albert's fame and popularity grew, he was regularly commissioned by the aristocracy and nobility to write pieces for more formal occasions. The simple poetry and strophic continuo Lieder that he wrote in abundance for informal social gatherings with his friends were not appropriate for these courtly musical affairs, and Albert adjusted the vocal style to include more impressive, florid singing, as seen at the end of the following example.¹⁵

Example 2. Heinrich Albert, "Auf! Ihr meine güldne Saiten," m. 5-7, from *Arien*, Denkmäler deutscher Tonkunst, no. 13 (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1958)

The image shows a musical score for a vocal line and a basso continuo line. The vocal line is written on a treble clef staff with a key signature of one sharp (F#) and a common time signature (C). The lyrics are: "mei.ner Sin. nen Macht Auf ein e. wigs Lob bedacht!". The vocal line features a highly ornate and florid melodic style, particularly in the latter half of the excerpt, with many sixteenth and thirty-second notes. The basso continuo line is written on a bass clef staff and provides a simple harmonic accompaniment.

Just as Thomas claimed poetry, and therefore song, had both a private and a public voice, Smeed agrees that the differences in the song styles are ultimately connected with the type of poem the composer was setting. He writes that

the simpler melodic style is most often to be found in combination with a type of verse recognisably close to the German folk tradition, while florid Italianate vocal

¹⁵Ibid., 52.

writing is more likely in settings of mannered Baroque texts which clearly show the invasion of German poetry by classical, Italian and French influences.¹⁶

Another significant influence on the nature of the musical settings was the compiler of the collection. If the poet was responsible for the collection, he usually envisioned simple settings that would not obscure his texts. Often poets wrote the texts with the idea of a melody in mind, knowing that they would eventually be set to music.¹⁷ The composers for these poet-determined collections were usually minor figures who agreed to the poets' desire for simplicity. If a composer was the compiler, Baron says the musical style was often more ornate, although he concedes that most of the Lieder from 1640-1670 conformed to "established patterns of simplicity."¹⁸

Just as Opitz' reforms influenced Lied composition in the 1640s and 50s, a new treatise on poetry influenced the Lied of the 1660s and later. Caspar Ziegler's (1621-1690) treatise *Von den Madrigalen*, originally published in 1653, applied the concept of the Italian madrigal verse, with its lines of varying lengths, to German poetry. The main influence that Ziegler's treatise had on the continuo Lied was that preference was no

¹⁶Smeed, 2. The premise of Baron's "Dutch Influences on the German Secular Solo-Continuo Lied," however is that even the Albert-Rist style of German Lied showed foreign influences, specifically Dutch. He also claims that even Martin Opitz's *Buch von der deutschen Poetery* copied the ideas of Dutch writers.

¹⁷Anthony Harper, "Zur Verbreitung und Rezeption des weltlichen Liedes um 1640 in Mittel- und Norddeutschland," in *Studien zum deutschen weltlichen Kunstlied des 17. Und 18. Jahrhunderts*, ed. Gudrun Busch and Anthony J. Harper (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1992), 37.

¹⁸Baron, *Grove*.

longer given only to strophic poetry, and consequently to strophic musical settings.¹⁹

Furthermore, the popularity of Italian cantatas and operas also began to influence the Lied style. As a result, many Lied collections appeared that contained works in an operatic style with florid, melismatic settings quite far removed from the simple, syllabic Lieder of someone like Johann Rist.

In describing the new operatic style of the continuo Lied, John Baron writes:

Such songs were in general too difficult for the amateur, who had relished the Generalbass lied before 1670, and as a result they did not have the popularity of the earlier lieder. Amateurs continued to sing the older songs, or turned to the new collections of sacred music in similar style. The professional singer concerned himself with opera and the cantata and, though capable of singing the more complicated arias in the new collections, would probably have had little use for them.²⁰

As a result, the publication of secular continuo Lied collections declined in the last decades of the seventeenth century, and new ones appeared only sporadically until the 1730s.²¹ The lack of song publication led Hermann Kretzschmar to call this period "Die liederlose Zeit."²²

¹⁹Ibid.

²⁰Ibid.

²¹Max Friedlaender's thorough catalog in *Das deutsche Lied im 18. Jahrhundert* contains only nine entries for the years 1689-1734. There were a number of sacred songbooks that appeared in the early eighteenth century featuring spiritual songs for solo voice with continuo accompaniment, such as J.A. Freylinghausen's *Geistreiches Gesangbuch* from 1704, but Baron suggests that these belong more appropriately to the history of the chorale and church music, rather than the history of the Lied.

²²Hermann Kretzschmar, *Neuen deutschen Liedes*, vol. 1 (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1911), 142-161.

The Hamburg Lied

Most histories of the eighteenth-century Lied begin their discussion with the Berlin composers, and the so-called “Berlin Lieder Schools.” Christian Gottfried Krause’s *Von der musikalischen Poesie* (1752) is praised for its “innovative” descriptions of naturalness that can be achieved in poetry and song. Certainly Krause and the Berlin composers were significant in the history and development of the German Lied, but, in reality, ideas about naturalness and simplicity in the Lied began not in Berlin, but flourished first in other northern cities, especially Hamburg.

In the 1730s there was a renewed interest in composing simple tunes that the amateur musician could participate in. While simplicity was again an important element, the relationship between text and music had become much more casual. Rather than starting with a text and then composing music to fit the style and meter, composers of the 1730s typically added words to previously existing tunes. As a result the vocal lines were often more instrumental in conception, and many of these collections were actually written primarily for keyboard with incidental texts.²³ One of the most popular collections was the *Singende Muse an der Pleisse*, published by Johann Sigismund Scholze, under the pseudonym of Sperontes, in 1736. The work contains 250 songs for solo voice and keyboard accompaniment. The original edition in 1736 consisted only of a solo vocal line and bass line with basso continuo figures. However, due to its popularity, the work went through several editions, and the later editions from the middle of the eighteenth century

²³Baron, *Grove*.

feature fully realized accompaniments.²⁴ This makes it a particularly useful source for this dissertation since a comparison of the different versions provides insights into the possibilities for realization and improvisation in other Lied accompaniments of the mid eighteenth century, which will be explored in later chapters.

Most of the texts in *Singende Muse* were written by Scholze himself, but they clearly take second place to the music, which was usually taken from popular dance or march tunes. While preexisting tunes had been used previously for some of the seventeenth-century texts, the earlier composers generally took great care to modify the music as necessary in order to keep the poetic meter and mood comfortable and correct. Scholze, on the other hand, expects the texts to accommodate themselves to the musical logic of the melodies. As a result, the text declamation is awkward at many points. For example, sometimes sad texts are set to lively dance tunes that are completely different in character. In other examples Scholze gives undue stress to unimportant words, such as indefinite articles, by accentuating them with large leaps, placing them on a downbeat, or prolonging the word over an entire measure.²⁵ Nevertheless the *Singende Muse* was extremely popular since it was one of only a few song book options suited to domestic music-making in an era when most composers were focusing on more complex and virtuosic compositions.

Along with Scholze, there were many other poets and composers who were also frustrated with the dominance of the florid, Italianate style of singing that had become so

²⁴Ibid.

²⁵Smeed, 2-3.

prevalent in the late Baroque period. One of the most outspoken critics was Joseph Christoph Gottsched (1700-1766) of Leipzig, a philosopher of aesthetics and professor of poetry, who called the reigning operatic style “unnatural” and “artificial” in his *Versuch einer Critischen Dichtkunst* of 1730.²⁶ The composer Georg Philipp Telemann (1681-1767) also ridiculed the typical Baroque opera aria, which he said demanded “the highs of a songbird,” “the lows of a great reed warbler,” and “the Ha-ha-hee-heeists of babbling trills.”²⁷ Smeed also points out that their

opposition was not merely on aesthetic grounds; it was undoubtedly coloured by patriotic resentment, dislike of the many foreign virtuosi hired by the courts, part of a general distrust of foreign affectations and fashions. To mock a fashionable castrato who buried the vocal line under trills and conceits (and sang in a language incomprehensible to most Germans anyhow) was part and parcel of a more general attack, closely linked to all the polemical contrasts made in the moral weeklies between a solid and unpretentious *German* way of life and the posturings of courtiers and dandies who preferred French to German and prided themselves on following the latest French and Italian fashions.²⁸

While those in Gottsched’s circle agreed with Scholze’s notion of a simple song that could be easily sung by everyone, they were not content with his “parody” method in the *Singende Muse*, which utilized such a casual approach to the text. Johann Friedrich Gräfe (1711-1757), in the preface to his *Sammlung verschiedener auserlesener Oden* from 1737, stresses the superiority of his own work to Scholze’s since the “melodies have been provided by the most famous masters,” “the music for the songs is quite new and

²⁶Quoted in Smeed, 4.

²⁷James Parsons, “The Eighteenth-Century Lied,” in the *Cambridge Companion to the Lied*, ed. James Parsons (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), 40.

²⁸Smeed, 4-5.

composed specially for the texts,” and the collection is compiled by someone who “loves both music and poetry” equally.²⁹ Johann Valentin Görner (1702-1762), in the preface to his *Sammlung neuer Oden und Lieder* (1744), looks back beyond Scholze and instead claims a direct link with the seventeenth-century Lied and Martin Opitz.³⁰

The care composers such as Gräfe, Görner, and also Telemann, took with the poetry reflects poetic reforms set forth by Gottsched in his *Versuch*, which stressed that song poetry should above all be “natural,” which meant short, modest, and simple. He emphasized pleasant themes, such as love, which would be well-suited for entertainment.³¹ One of his pupils in Leipzig, Johann Adolph Scheibe (1708-1776), moved to Hamburg in 1736 where he further promoted Gottsched’s ideas. Scheibe reiterated the importance of “order and nature” and described the care the composer should take when setting a text. Simple, strophic poetry was recommended; therefore the composer must take care to provide “an expressive, skillful, and affecting melody” that would be appropriate for each and every poetic stanza. Furthermore, he emphasizes the importance of a “natural” melody, which stays close to the tonic, adheres to a “moderate range,” and remains “free, flowing, and pure.” He says the judge of “naturalness” is whether or not a tune can “be sung at once and without particular effort by anyone inexperienced in music.”³²

²⁹Thomas, 100.

³⁰Baron, *Grove*.

³¹Jane Brown, “In the Beginning Was Poetry,” in the *Cambridge Companion to the Lied*, ed. James Parsons (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), 16.

³²Parsons, 39.

Two poets whose works reflected these ideas, and who are well represented in the *Lieder* of Gräfe, Görner, and Telemann, are Friedrich von Hagedorn (1708-1754) and Johann Peter Uz (1720-1796). In addition to their reliance on Gottsched, Hagedorn and Uz were interested in ancient Greek poetic models, such as Horatio, Sappho, and especially Anacreon. Both poets translated many Anacreontic poems into German, and eventually began writing their own poetry in this style. This poetic style was extremely popular with the Hamburg composers, and also praised by the Berlin philosophers and composers, such as Ramler and Krause.³³ Furthermore, Hagedorn's poetry continued to be set by Lied composers for the remainder of the century.³⁴

The Hamburg composers themselves, particularly Telemann, also had a substantial influence on the Berlin composers. Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach (1714-1788), an important Lied composer, spent 20 years in Hamburg after his time in Berlin. Furthermore, numerous Berlin composers claim the specific influence of Telemann and his associates.³⁵ It is also significant that in several of the earliest Berlin Lied collections, the only non-Berlin composer whose works are included is Telemann.

Many Lied histories explain the simplicity of the late eighteenth-century Lied only as a reaction to the virtuosic, operatic style of the late Baroque. This is indeed one element of the late eighteenth-century Lied, but to reduce its genesis to a mere reaction is to

³³Bynum, "The First Berlin Lieder School," 38.

³⁴Including such varied composers as Telemann, Mozart, Štěpán, and Zumsteeg.

³⁵Bynum, 36 suggests, however, that although songs by Gräfe and Görner are equally elegant, Telemann was especially favored because Berlin composers may have been more impressed with the composer himself than with the compositions.

neglect its place within the context of other poets and composers who were already trying to find a way to combine text and music in a way that would be natural and singable for everyone. The experiments of poets such as Gottsched and Hagedorn, as well as composers like Gräfe and Telemann, who were searching for a simpler style unencumbered by foreign influence, helped pave the way for later composers in Berlin.

It is difficult to ascertain how aware mid eighteenth-century composers like C. P. E. Bach and Marpurg were of seventeenth-century continuo Lieder. However, it is certain that they knew of early eighteenth-century composers such as Telemann and Görner, practically all of whose songs also used figured basses in the accompaniment parts and are often referred to as continuo Lieder as well. One reason for an awareness of the Hamburg Lieder is that Marpurg went through a systematic critique of every song collection published after 1737 in his *Kritische Briefe über die Tonkunst*, of which 142 issues were published between 1759 and 1763. The Berlin composers' appreciation of the poetic and musical style of the Hamburg Lieder has already been mentioned above. The fact that mid-century Berlin composers were aware of and influenced by these composers who were using literal figured bass accompaniments is significant because it provides a link between two accompaniment styles and hints at the possibility that they passed on these ideas and preferences to Lied composers later in the century as well.

The Late Eighteenth-Century Lied in Northern Germany

The First Berlin School

Despite the fact that Hamburg played a role early on in the development of a simple, natural, strophic song, the center of song composition in the second half of the eighteenth century quickly moved to Berlin, in part due to the lavish patronage of Frederick II (1712-1786), who was himself a musician and composer. Frederick's commitment to building and maintaining the finest opera houses and orchestras in Europe meant that he sought to bring the best musicians and artists to his court, and Berlin became an important cultural center. In his study on music at Frederick's court, Eugene Helm puts it this way:

Frederick the musician was a versatile composer and a skillful flutist, but his musical importance lies almost solely in his patronage, because he was no ordinary patron. The main structure of Berlin's musical life during the middle of the eighteenth century was organized and regulated to the workings of one brain: Frederick's.³⁶

Eighteenth-century historian Charles Burney also confirms the centrality of the Berlin court, writing:

From the year 1742, when the late King of Prussia [Frederick II] fixed the musical establishment of his opera and court, so many eminent musicians were engaged in his service that Berlin seems to have given the law to the rest of Germany.³⁷

³⁶Eugene Helm, *Music at the Court of Frederick the Great* (Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press, 1960), xviii.

³⁷Charles Burney, *A General History of Music from the Earliest Ages to the Present Period* (1789), reprint ed. (New York: Dover, 1957), 948.

Although Frederick did not set out to cultivate the Lied specifically, he was indirectly responsible for its development, since most composers came to Berlin at his request, and came together under his service. Karl Heinrich Graun (1704-1759) came to the court in 1735, after receiving a favorable response to the Italian opera he had written for Frederick's marriage. Johann Joachim Quantz (1697-1773) was Frederick's primary flute and composition teacher. Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach (1714-1788) was hired as the primary harpsichordist and accompanist in 1740. Franz Benda (1709-1786) was a composer and court violinist for fifty-three years. Johann Gottlieb Graun (1703-1771), brother of Karl Heinrich, was another violinist in the court and composed numerous symphonies. Johann Friedrich Agricola (1720-1774), a former student of Quantz, performed many duties in Berlin including composing, conducting, and opera directing. Christoph Nichelmann (1717-1762) entered Frederick's service in 1744 as second harpsichordist, alternating with Bach.³⁸ The influence and renown of the court also drew other musicians, poets, composers, and theorists to Berlin. For example, the theorist-composers Friedrich Wilhelm Marpurg (1718-1795) and Johann Philipp Kirnberger (1721-1783) were not associated with Frederick's court, but they did interact with the musicians there and played an important role in the city.³⁹ Significantly, four of these composers,

³⁸Helm, 142, 158, 174, 189, 199, 206, 230. Although it does not deal with the specific topic of Lieder, Helm's book contains useful information on other musical activities of the court and many of the composers who were also involved in Lied composition.

³⁹Bynum, 10.

Quantz, Bach, Marpurg, and Kirnberger, also wrote works dealing with accompanying, all of which are considered some of the most important of the period.

While their musical tasks in Frederick's court were varied, all of the above composers wrote Lieder, and the group is generally acknowledged as the First Berlin School. Although there is some debate in recent literature about whether or not to call them a "school," contemporary eighteenth-century sources, such as Charles Burney, did acknowledge them as a collective group. Furthermore, they often referred to themselves by names such as *die Berlinische Musici*. They published numerous Lied collections as a group between 1753 and 1770, and often referred to these collections as *Berlinische Oden* or *Berlinische Lieder*. Most importantly, their Lieder represent a unified approach to composing "simple, natural, lighthearted and charming" Lieder, with texts that were clearly understandable, and music that "provided the most transparent of coverings."⁴⁰

The First Berlin School found models for simplicity and naturalness not only in their earlier eighteenth-century predecessors discussed above, but also in the new Berlin literary circles, and in the French Air. In addition to musical activities at Frederick's courts, Berlin had also become a center for the literary community. At the court's invitation, the poet and philosopher Johann Wilhelm Ludwig Gleim (1719-1805) came to Berlin in 1740 and began a literary circle that became closely associated with the Lied school. In the next few years the circle grew to include other poets including Johann Peter Uz (1720-1796), Johann N. Götz (1721-76), Karl Wilhelm Ramler (1725-98), and Ewald von Kleist (1715-59), all of whom worked in close collaboration with the Berlin

⁴⁰Ibid., 46.

composers, and whose texts were featured in the first collections of Berlin Lieder. In addition to simplicity and naturalness, other key values were lightheartedness and humor, extolled in a treatise written by Gleim in 1744 called *Versuch in Scherzhaften Gedichten*.⁴¹

The treatise that prescribed how to apply these poetic qualities to music was *Von der musikalischen Poesie*, published in 1752 by Christian Gottfried Krause (1719-70).⁴² Krause came to Berlin in 1746 as a lawyer employed by Frederick II. Although his official profession was law, music was of significant interest to Krause throughout his life. As a young man he received training in violin, keyboard, and timpani from his father.⁴³ During his years in Berlin he also tried his hand at composition and was associated with several of the court musicians, including Quantz, Agricola, and C. P. E. Bach.⁴⁴ Krause was also interested in aesthetics and poetry, and soon after his arrival, he joined Gleim's circle of poets. He quickly became an important member of the group, and even took over the leadership when Gleim left Berlin in 1747.⁴⁵

The major portion of *Von der musikalischen Poesie* is not actually about the Lied, but rather about opera seria. Furthermore, most of what Krause wrote was not new, but

⁴¹Ibid., 18.

⁴²Although it was first published in 1752, letters between Krause and his poet friends show that the project was already well underway by 1747.

⁴³James Harry Mallard, "A Translation of Christian Gottfried Krause's *Von der musikalischen Poesie*, with a Critical Essay on His Sources and the Aesthetic Views of His Time" (Ph.D. diss., University of Texas at Austin, 1978), 5.

⁴⁴Ibid, 8. In addition to numerous Lieder, Krause also wrote several larger vocal works, including several cantatas with librettos by Ramler.

⁴⁵Bynum, 19.

drew heavily on the works of earlier aestheticians such as Mattheson, Gottsched, and Scheibe.⁴⁶ Yet it was Krause's treatise that provided the blueprint for the Lieder of the First Berlin School. The first point that Krause makes is that composers should only choose poems that are specifically written for musical settings. Text should always be of primary importance, and composers should bow to the poet's desire rather than the other way around. Repetition of words and extensive melismas should be avoided since they would only interfere with the poet's original intention. Accompaniments should only be viewed as a vehicle for delivering the texts, and they should be simple enough that their removal would not destroy the continuity of the vocal line. Krause suggests that the only way to guarantee this is to compose the melodies from the beginning without any harmonic accompaniment in mind. Melodies should be natural, simple, and singable since Krause intends for this type of singing to be an informal, social activity that all classes of people can participate in. Finally, Krause advocates always using strophic form in song composition. First of all, since the poems were generally written in this form it makes sense for the composer to follow the poet's example. Secondly, Krause maintains that each poem and song should represent a single affect. Strophic form forces the composer to choose a melody and accompaniment that will fit with that affect throughout the piece.⁴⁷

⁴⁶Mallard, 124.

⁴⁷An English translation of Krause's work is available in Mallard, "A Translation of Christian Gottfried Krause's *Von der musikalischen Poesie*. Edwards, "Christian Gottfried Krause" provides more information on how the First Berlin school applied Krause's ideas.

Krause's treatise not only delineated the character of the First Berlin School Lieder, it also had an influence on song composers for the remainder of the eighteenth century, even outside of Berlin. Johann Adam Hiller (1728-1804) in Leipzig wrote:

The treatise *On Musical Poetry* is of considerable use. Poets learn from it how a poem intended for music must properly be constituted; here the musician will be made attentive to the things that are most important if he wants to judge of the value of a piece written for song. Fundamental and deep insights into the essentials of poetry and music, acquaintance with the examples of our famous masters are the special features of this book which, by the way, is very well written...It is to be wished that poet and composer might read this German treatise assiduously; it is equally useful to both...⁴⁸

Johann Friedrich Reichardt (1752-1814), one of the central figures of the Second Berlin School, criticized Krause's "disorder and verbosity," but approved of the content. When Reichardt was asked to write a new guide for improving the "unmusical poetry" written by many of his contemporaries, he responded, "I could decline your invitation in two words by telling you: read Krause's *On Musical Poetry*."⁴⁹ Stuttgart composer Christian Daniel Schubart (1739-1791) also praised the work, writing in 1784:

In his treatise on musical poetry Krause has given much excellent information about music, as well as poetry. No poet who is working for a composer can dispense with this useful book. He demonstrates with Italian and German examples how arias, cavatinas, recitatives, duets, terzettos, and choruses must be appropriately treated by poets and composers...The public demands a new edition

⁴⁸Johann Adam Hiller, *Wöchentliche Nachrichten und Anmerkungen die Musik betreffend*, vol. 3 (1768), 35. Quoted and Translated by Mallard, 23.

⁴⁹Johann Friedrich Reichardt, *Über die deutsche comische Oper nebst einem Anhang eines freundschaftlichen Briefes über die musikalische Poesie* (Hamburg: Carl Ernst Bohn, 1774), 106. Quoted in Mallard, 24.

of this fine book in which principles and examples are more adapted to modern times.⁵⁰

One of the models Krause takes for the Lied in *Von der musikalischen Poesie* is the French Air. The Berlin school praised the French for their careful attention to text declamation, elegant melodies devoid of superfluous virtuosity and ornamentation, use of dance rhythms, and unobtrusive accompaniments. Bynum points out that “In the preface of the first Berlin Lieder collection, *Oden mit Melodien* (1753), and in practically every collection since associated with the school, the French were praised for their accomplishments in song....”⁵¹ Max Friedlaender also asserts that the French chanson had a much greater influence on the development of Berlin Lieder than other types of earlier German art song.⁵² In his article on Krause for *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, however, Raymond Barr is more skeptical and says that this could have been a political move by Krause, since he knew how interested Frederick II was in French culture.

In an effort to encourage the song style he desired, Krause began to compile and publish Lied collections. The first volume of *Oden mit Melodien* was published in 1753 and met with overwhelming success. As a result, a second volume was published in 1755.

⁵⁰Carl Friedrich Daniel Schubart, *Ideen zu einer Aesthetik der Tonkunst*, in *C. F. D. Schubart's des Patrioten, gesammelte Schriften und Schicksale*, vol. 5, ed. Ludwig Schubart (Stuttgart: J. Scheible's Buchhandlung, 1839), 93. Quoted and Translated by Mallard, 26.

⁵¹Bynum, 23.

⁵²Friedlaender, *Das deutsche Lied*, vol. 1, 116.

Neither of these volumes lists names of the poets or composers.⁵³ It is unclear exactly why, but perhaps it is because Krause wanted the Lieder to be judged exclusively on their artistic merit,⁵⁴ or perhaps it emphasized the idea of a collective, natural process of music-making which could be shared by everyone.⁵⁵

Krause's aim for the collection was primarily to create a repertoire that would be suitable for amateur musicians at private and social occasions. Therefore, most of the poetry was lighthearted and written in the Anacreontic style.⁵⁶ The introduction to the work by Ramler reiterates the light-hearted nature of the poems, but assures readers the poems were written by the best poets of the day and urges them to take them seriously as quality works:

[They are] not so poetic that they cannot be understood by the beautiful female singer. Also, not so light and superficial that no truly clever person cares to read

⁵³Letters between Krause and Ramler show that the names of the poets and composers were deliberately excluded.

⁵⁴This is Barr's idea.

⁵⁵The names for the first volume were later revealed by Marpurg in his *Historisch-Kritische Beyträge zur Aufnahme der Musik*. The poems are by Gleim, Hagedorn, Nikolaus Giseke, Ewald von Kleist, Johann Uz, Johann Schlegel, and Johann Dreyer. Composers were Franz Benda, Quantz, Agricola, K. H. Graun, C. P. E. Bach, C. Nichelmann, J. G. Graun, and Telemann.

⁵⁶Bynum, 49. Anacreontic poetry was written in the style of the Greek poet Anacreon and focuses on topics such as wine, feasting, friendship, or praise of heroes. Brown, "In the Beginning Was Poetry," 17 emphasizes that this theory of poetry was well suited to the emerging middle class. She says "Wine, love, and praise do not mean, in Gottsched or in any of the Anacreontic poets, drunkenness or sex; it is the love of middle-class urbanites playing at being shepherds and shepherdesses, and the drinking of solid citizens who appreciate the good cheer of no more than one glass too many."

them. They must please the drinker more than the drunkard, and also the chaste more than the ruffian.⁵⁷

Ramler's introduction also delineates the musical elements that make the songs easy for the amateur singer. First of all, text is primary. Therefore, music and text must be combined to convey the mood of the text, while still allowing for melodies that are easy to sing and pleasing to the ear. In this same vein, Ramler advocates a return to simplicity, which includes the avoidance of operatic ornamentation.

Songs in the *Oden mit Melodien* are short and use simple forms, such as strophic or a basic two-part form. The accompaniment provides harmonic support, but never gets in the way of the vocal line or text. Bass lines are predictable with straightforward harmonies, in accordance with Krause's idea that the bass should be so "simple and natural" that it could even be left out. Most of the songs are written on two staves with only a soprano and bass line, but none of the basses are figured.⁵⁸ After the volumes of *Oden mit Melodien*, the First Berlin school composers also published several other volumes, most compiled by Marpurg, such as the *Neue Lieder zum Singen beym Clavier von Friedrich Wilhelm Marpurg* in 1756 and three volumes of *Berlinische Oden und Lieder* (1756, 1759, 1763). The collections featured numerous songs by Marpurg, as well as many by the same composers and poets. The main differences are that the poets and composers are no longer anonymous, and there are some uses of figured bass.

⁵⁷Ibid., 50. Bynum also quotes Marpurg who described the poems as "...well chosen poems at which one may neither blush nor yawn."

⁵⁸Although several of the composers such as Agricola and Marpurg were still using figures.

C. P. E. Bach deserves special mention, since he was highly regarded by his contemporaries and is probably still the best known of the first Berlin Lied composers. He was also an accompanist himself and wrote one of the most influential accompaniment treatises, so it is no surprise that many of his accompaniments are more sophisticated than those of his contemporaries in Berlin. When the text suggested it he did write in a simpler style, which can be seen in the pastoral "Schäferlied" from Gräfe's *Sammlung verschiedener und auserlesener Oden* (1741) or "Himmelfahrt der Erlösers" from *Gellert Geistliche Oden und Lieder* (1758). However, he was also not opposed to dissonances, chromaticism, modulation, or ornamentation if it would enhance to the text:

No one disputes the need for embellishments. This is evident from the great numbers of them everywhere to be found. They are, in fact, indispensable. Consider their many uses: They connect and enliven tones and impart stress and accent; they make music pleasing and awaken our close attention. Expression is heightened by them; let a piece be sad, joyful, or otherwise, and they will lend a fitting assistance.⁵⁹

Yet, Bach was also well aware that not everyone who would be performing his songs had the capability of providing tasteful realizations or embellishments. Therefore in the preface to his Gellert-settings he writes:

I have added to my melodies the necessary harmonies and embellishments. In this way, I have not abandoned them to the arbitrariness of a stiff general bass player; one can also use them as keyboard pieces. Since the voice part always lies in the upper part, untrained throats will thereby sense great relief.⁶⁰

⁵⁹Carl Philip Emmanuel Bach, *Essay on the True Art of Playing Keyboard Instruments*, trans. William J. Mitchell (New York: W. W. Norton, 1949), 79.

⁶⁰Quoted and translated by Bynum, 81-82. Bach was not the only one who did not have complete confidence in the amateur performers of these songs, and many composers provide prefaces with explicit details about how to perform the piece. Smeed, 63 gives the example of J. A. Hiller who "laboriously explains that in strophic song the singer will

Bach knew many amateur performers would be singing and playing his songs, so he provides full accompaniments with the vocal line clearly indicated. Bach's statement has important implications for looking at the influence of basso continuo practice on the composition and performance of Lied accompaniments. First of all, it reinforces that this period was a transitional time when continuo practice still had an influence, but composers were moving away from including figures in the printed score and requiring keyboardists to improvise chords conforming to them. It shows that figured bass was indeed part of the Bach's thought process as he composed his Lied. It also shows that many amateur musicians had some knowledge of continuo accompanying, although they did not improvise up to the standard of a professional like Bach. Therefore, these Gellert settings of Bach are particularly useful to analyze and compare with other Lied in order to determine what kind of accompaniment a Lied composer was anticipating from the performers.

In addition, Bach's statement that the songs can also be used as keyboard pieces shows that the keyboard part in his works are more substantial. In raising the keyboard parts to a more independent level, Bach also shows a different attitude than that of Krause. Krause felt songs were best conceived without a bass line, whereas Bach wanted a balance of both melody and harmony:

sometimes need to make slight adjustments to the note-values from stanza to stanza in order to accommodate the words. It is *not* superfluous to explain these things, he adds, as long as the Germans are so weak in song."

He who wishes to think correctly about composition must simultaneously consider melody and harmony.⁶¹

Bach is also credited with being one of the first Lied composers to use more serious poetry, including that of Klopstock and Gellert. Light-hearted pastoral poetry had dominated most of the Berlin school compositions, particularly because they were meant to be pleasant and enjoyed by the public. After the Seven-Years War, however, the more serious times called for more serious poetry, including poems on the topics of war and religion.⁶² Poetry in Northern Germany continued to move away from the Anacreontic ideals of the mid-century, and by 1770 several other forces were influencing poetry and song in Berlin, including the publication of the *Musenalmanach* and the study of folk song.

Göttingen and the *Musenalmanach*

Although Berlin is often credited for the innovations in the Lied after 1770, which include the use of higher-quality poetry and the influence of folk song, the inspiration came first from the university town of Göttingen, where a group of poets joined together in 1772 to form the Göttinger *Hainbund*, which included Johann Heinrich Voss (1751-1826), Ludwig Heinrich Christian Hölty (1748-1776), Christian Theodor Boie (1744-1806), and Johann Martin Miller (1750-1814). The *Hainbund* poets were particularly influenced by Klopstock's poetry, and wanted to move away from the Anacreontic style.

⁶¹Bach, *Versuch*, vol. 2, 212. Quoted and translated by Bynum, 88.

⁶²Bynum, 69.

While the group itself was short lived, with the disbanding of its members in 1776, the poetic styles they introduced remained, and were set by many of the composers of the Second Berlin School, especially J. A. P. Schulz.⁶³ The ideas and poetry of the *Hainbund* also spread through the publication of the first German *Musenalmanache*, small pocket-book calendars that also contained short, lyric poems, interspersed with several new Lieder for voice and keyboard. The volumes were bought mostly by middle-class readers to use as "light reading material for private enjoyment of social occasions," and this method of publication turned out to be a quick way to disseminate Lieder to a wider audience than would have been the case with conventional printing of song collections.⁶⁴ Many German cities published these musical almanacs,⁶⁵ but the first two, the *Göttinger Musenalmanach* (1770-1804) and the *Vossischer Musenalmanach* (1776-1800), came out of the *Hainbund*. The subscription list for the first issue of the *Vossischer Musenalmanach* in 1776 lists the numbers of subscribers from each city and shows the widespread appeal of the volume:

Algier 1, Altona 60, Berlin 80, Bonn, 10, Bremen 30, Breslau 60, Büzow 50, Camenz 8, Carlsruhe 20, Darmstadt 30, Drakenburg 9, Dresden 15, Erfurt 3, Erlangen 21, Flensburg 40, Frankfurt am M. 24, Gießen 8, Glücksburg 18, Göttingen 100, Halle 20, Hamburg 209, Hannover 50, Jena 12, Jifeld 16, Kopenhagen 50, Leipzig 10, Lemgo 6, Lissabon 30, Lübeck 50, Marburg 20, Mietau 60, München 12, Münster 52, Neubrandenburg 72, Schwerin 36, Stade 9,

⁶³Kyunghee Lee, "Songs in the *Musenalmanache* and *Taschenbücher* in German-Speaking Areas (1770-1814)" (Ph.D. diss., Universität Innsbruck, 1996), 68-9.

⁶⁴*Ibid.*, 35. See also Ewan West, "The *Musenalmanach* and Viennese Song 1770-1830," *Music and Letters* 67 (1986): 42.

⁶⁵Cities that published their own musical almanacs included Leipzig, Tübingen, Berlin, Mannheim, Vienna, and many others.

Stockholm 10, Ulm 49, Wismar 11, Wolfenbüttel 10, Würzburg 82, Zürich 30, Zweybrücken 1.⁶⁶

While the primary purpose of the *Musenalmanach* was to offer a survey of the kinds of poetry being produced in a given year, these small books also provided a rich resource for Lied composers who were constantly looking for better-quality poetry.⁶⁷

Herder, Goethe and the *Volkslied*

In addition to the Göttingen poets, the other main influence on poetry and the North German Lied in the last decades of the eighteenth century was folk song. The central figure of the folk song revival in Germany was Johann Gottfried Herder (1744-1803), a prolific author on literary, philosophical and historical topics. Herder became interested in folk poetry because he felt it was the freest and truest expression of a nation.⁶⁸ These ideas are expressed in several influential essays, including *Abhandlung über den Ursprung der Sprache* (1772) and *Auszug aus einem Briefwechsel über Ossian und die Lieder alter Völker* (1773), which deal with the origins of language and its deeply rooted affinity with music. Herder felt that in every culture folk poetry was indelibly linked with music, and it was Herder who actually coined the term *Volkslied*.⁶⁹ Brown writes that

⁶⁶Heinrich Voss, ed., *Musenalmanach für das Jahr 1776* (Lauenburg, 1776).

⁶⁷West, 42. See also Lee, 118.

⁶⁸Paul Leinbach Althouse, Jr., "Carl Loewe (1796-1869): His Lieder, Ballads, and Their Performance" (Ph.D. Diss., Yale University, 1971), 94.

⁶⁹August Closs, "Johann Gottfried Herder," in *German Men of Letters*, ed. Alex Natan (London: Oswald Wolff, 1961), 29.

for Herder “Music and song do not simply express emotion, as they do for Gottsched and his generation; instead, they are the voice of the spontaneous self underlying all linguistic expression.”⁷⁰ While Krause had looked to France for a cultural model, Herder looked to Britain. His essay on the English playwright Shakespeare in his *Von deutscher Art und Kunst* from 1773 expresses the idea that every culture had the ability to create great art in the right environment. It happened in England with Shakespeare, and Herder insisted it could happen even in a country as politically disunified as Germany through the works of the young poet Johann Wolfgang von Goethe (1749-1832).

Herder’s ideas had an enormous impact on poetry and song composition in late eighteenth-century Germany. First of all, he provided many new song texts through his own collections of folk poetry, as well as indirectly through his encouragement of contemporary poets to draw on the style of folk poetry for inspiration. Goethe in particular was influenced by Herder’s ideas, and he became the most popular poet set by Lied composers for generations.⁷¹ Herder’s ideas about the appeal of folk music also resonated with Lied composers. The fact that folk music was spontaneous, had immediate rhythmic and melodic appeal, and was linked to the reality of everyday shared experiences fit in well with the conception of the Lied as a song that could be easily sung and enjoyed

⁷⁰Brown, “In the Beginning Was Poetry,” 20.

⁷¹It is difficult to think of a song composer who has not set Goethe’s poetry. A representative sampling of well-known composers might include Johann Friedrich Reichardt, W. A. Mozart, Carl Zelter, Carl Loewe, Franz Schubert, Robert Schumann, Johannes Brahms, and Hugo Wolf.

by amateur musicians in common social settings, and many Lied composers began using folk songs as models for their own compositions.⁷²

The Second Berlin School

The changes in poetic ideals, which were championed by Voss and Herder, led to the production of an overall higher quality of poetry than was being written in earlier parts of the century. The new poetry in turn led to changes in Lied style, and once again Berlin was central, producing a new generation of composers. This group of composers is sometimes referred to as the Second Berlin School and generally includes Johann Abraham Peter Schulz (1747-1800), Johann Friedrich Reichardt (1752-1814), Johann André (1741-1799), and sometimes Carl Friedrich Zelter (1758-1832). Higher-quality poetry and the growing popularity of the fortepiano led to new possibilities, but the venue for the Lied was still the home, and composers were concerned with maintaining a certain level of simplicity, although to varying degrees.

The composer admired and published most by Voss and the Göttingen poets, was Johann Abraham Peter Schulz (1747-1800). Voss and Schulz both agreed that two qualities should be emphasized, and these became the standard for the Lied: “singableness” (*Sangbarkeit*) and “popularity” (*Popularität*).⁷³ Since these songs were usually sung in intimate social gatherings, easily understandable poetry and melodies would appeal to a wider audience and ensure the growing popularity of the Lied. Schulz

⁷²Smeed, 21.

⁷³Lee, 77.

had a consistent dream “to make all kinds of Lieder which could be sung by various classes, from farmer to burgher,”⁷⁴ and another central term in Schulz’s philosophy was the *Schein des Bekannten*, usually translated as the “appearance of familiarity.” In other words, he wanted to write art songs that had a close resemblance to familiar popular examples, but which were not actually folk songs themselves.⁷⁵ This is demonstrated in his collections of *Lieder im Volkston* (1782-1790), which Leon Plantinga describes as “self-consciously artless.”⁷⁶ Schulz makes this clear in the preface to the second edition, writing:

In all these songs it has been and remains my endeavor to sing more in the folk style than in the art style; that is to say that even untrained lovers of song, if they do not altogether lack a voice, can easily sing them and learn them by heart. For this purpose I have chosen only such texts from our best song-poets, which seem to be made for this kind of folk singing; and I have tried to make the melodies as simple and understandable as possible. In this way I have tried to bring to them the appearance of familiarity (*Schein des Bekannten*) because I know from experience how much this appearance is helpful, even necessary, for the folk song to become quickly accepted. In this appearance of familiarity lies the whole secret of the *Volkston*.⁷⁷

⁷⁴Ibid., 112.

⁷⁵Wilhelm Schulte, “J. A. P. Schulz, a Protagonist of the Musical Enlightenment: *Lieder im Volkston*,” *Music Research Forum* 3, no. 1 (1988): 29 points out that Schulz was successful in that a number of his songs are sung today as folk songs with most people thinking they are of an unknown origin.

⁷⁶Leon Plantinga, *Romantic Music: A History of Musical Style in Nineteenth-Century Europe* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1984), 109. Despite his seemingly simple, folk-song style, Schulz was actually well versed in the figured bass tradition. He traveled to Berlin to study intensively with Kirnberger in 1765. He knew Kirnberger’s harmonic theories very well, as he actually collaborated with him on the second part of his *Kunst des reinen Satzes* and wrote his *Die wahren Grundsätze zum Gebrauch der Harmonie*. See David Beach, “The Harmonic Theories of Johann Philipp Kirnberger; their Origins and Influences” (Ph.D. diss., Yale University, 1974), 4-12.

⁷⁷J. A. P. Schulz, *Lieder im Volkston*, 2nd ed. (Berlin: 1785), preface. Quoted and Translated by Schulte, 24.

Another composer from the Second Berlin School, Johann André, exemplifies the enthusiasm and potential available to the middle class literary and musical amateur of the day, since he himself had only modest musical training and did not become a professional composer until late in his life.⁷⁸ Whereas many of the Berlin composers viewed music as an opportunity to educate the public in addition to providing entertainment, André was most concerned about the entertainment aspect. As such, his music did not always garner respect from the other poets and composers of the day. Goethe was a good friend of the composer, but the poet did not appear to respect his music, and although André's songs were published in the *Vossischer Musenalmanach* Voss often showed some frustration with him.⁷⁹ His Lied collections are significant not because of any originality or musical mastery but because of their popularity with the public. His strophic songs with simple keyboard parts, and simple low-pitched melodies were ideal for moments "of quiet family satisfaction with the singer accompanying himself in an unassuming way, with few or more often no listeners," which is why they were written and published, and why they were so popular with André's middle-class contemporaries.⁸⁰

Unlike André, Johann Friedrich Reichardt was exposed very early on to music, was a gifted violinist and keyboardist, and had many opportunities to travel and study

⁷⁸Margaret Majony Stoljahr, *Poetry and Song in Late Eighteenth Century Germany: A Study in the Musical Sturm und Drang* (London: Croom Helm, 1985), 112.

⁷⁹Ibid., 114.

⁸⁰Ibid., 119.

music at the most important German musical centers of the day.⁸¹ His musical career included performing, conducting, writing on music, and composing. He wrote numerous operas and *Singspiele*, but is especially well known for his *Lieder*, of which he composed over one thousand.⁸² With such a large number of *Lieder*, Reichardt was able to set texts by a broad spectrum of poets including Gleim, Hagedorn, Matthisson, Schiller, and Goethe. He was close friends with Goethe and Herder, and Reichardt himself was an avid folk song collector and proponent of Herder's ideas. As a music critic and journalist, he frequently wrote about his ideals for song composition in such a rational and concrete way that Schulz criticized him for a lack of spontaneity and naturalness. David Ossenkop describes Reichardt's attitude as an attempt to combine the spontaneity of folk song with the rationalism of the Enlightenment era:

It is clearly evident that Reichardt's views concerning the nature of folk song and the setting of folk-like texts reveal the confluence of two different attitudes that are common in eighteenth-century philosophical thought. Reichardt manifests an enthusiasm for the natural and direct expression of folk song, but he establishes a set of definite principles concerning folk style and directs that they are to be strictly followed by composers when they choose to write folk-like *Lieder*. Such an interest in the establishment of definite rules reflects a Rationalistic attitude that is characteristic of the Berlin School. Thus we notice an inclination toward

⁸¹Ibid, 189. Reichardt kept a record of these travels and published several volumes of these accounts containing a variety of opinions and observations on musical practice of the day, including two volumes on travels in Germany (1792-1793), three on travels in Paris (1802-3), and two on Austria (1810). An English translation of portions of the latter work is available in Nancy B. Reich, "A Commentary on and a Translation of Selected Portions of *Vertraute Briefe geschrieben auf einer Reise nach Wien und den Austereich. Staaten zu Ende des Jahres 1808 un zu Anfang 1809* by Johann Friedrich Reichardt, 1752-1814" (Ph.D. Diss., New York University, 1972.)

⁸²David Ossenkop, "The Earliest Settings of German Ballads for Voice and Clavier" (Ph.D. Diss, Columbia University, 1968), 272.

wholehearted expression of feeling on the one hand and an adherence to Rationalistic precepts on the other.⁸³

Other North German Lied Traditions

While Berlin was the center of much of the Lied activity in Northern Germany during the second half of the eighteenth century, two other important city centers were Leipzig and Weimar. In Leipzig, the theatrical composer Johann Adam Hiller (1728-1804) contributed to the development of the Lied in the 1770s through his *Singspiel* Lieder. He makes full use of theatrical expression and the music often receives more attention than the text. While Hiller wrote numerous arias in a more Italianate style, many of the performers who sang his *Singspiel* were theatrical actors with much less musical training than professional musicians, and therefore the Lieder are in a simpler style than a full-fledged aria. The advantage of introducing Lieder to audiences through a *Singspiel* was that the stage provided a faster way to circulate the songs to a large number of people at once.⁸⁴ Hiller was aware of his amateur audiences and wanted to make sure that his *Singspiele* were accessible to them, so he published vocal scores that could be played at home. Hiller also published several song collections, which like his *Singspiele*, feature both simple tunes and more complicated aria-like numbers. Throughout, however, he expresses a specifically pedagogical aim "to teach the German people to sing."⁸⁵ Hiller's

⁸³Ibid., 279.

⁸⁴Lee, 73-74.

⁸⁵Anna Amalie Abert and Thomas Bauman, "Johann Adam Hiller," in *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd ed.

Singspiellieder were popular with the public, but the compositions themselves were not imitated by his contemporaries, who put more emphasis on the text than Hiller did.⁸⁶

However, his approach of introducing Lieder through *Singspiele* was also taken up by Christian Gottlob Neefe, Georg Benda, Johann André, and Johann Friedrich Reichardt.⁸⁷

In Weimar the center for political, economic, social, and cultural life in the 1770s and 80s was unquestionably the court of Duchess Anna Amalia (1739-1807) and her son Duke Karl August.⁸⁸ Anna Amalia's attitude in Weimar was more liberal than that at other courts, and artists were free to explore without fear of censorship. Artists and writers such as Christoph Martin Wieland, Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, Johann Gottfried Herder, Ernst Wolf, and Karl von Seckendorff were all hosted in Weimar during Anna Amalia's reign. Goethe wrote about Anna Amalia's rule saying:

Justice, the economy, and law and order were strengthened, developed and upheld. An entirely new spirit took over the Weimar court and in the city. Well-known foreigners of rank, scholars, and artists visited or resided here, free access to a large library was established, and a good theater was maintained, and the artistic, intellectual and spiritual education for a new generation was arranged.⁸⁹

⁸⁶Stoljahr, 122 feels that Hiller's *Singspiel* songs still retained an aura of artificiality associated with the theater, which was still a wholly exotic world for most middle-class people. Even these simplified *Singspiel* songs were often too technically demanding for the amateur public.

⁸⁷Lee, 73.

⁸⁸Annie Janeiro Randall, "Music and Drama in Weimar 1776-1782: A Social-Historical Perspective" (Ph.D. diss., University of Cincinnati, 1994), 13.

⁸⁹Ibid., 17. Quoted from Paul von Bojanowski, *Dem Andenken der Herzogin Anna Amalia die Großherzogliche Bibliothek* (Weimar: H. Böhlau, 1907), 7.

Every Wednesday evening a small group consisting of Anna Amalia and her friends would gather in her music room to perform instrumental duos, trios, quartets, keyboard solos, or Lieder accompanied by harpsichord, harp, or guitar. In the summer, they moved to one of the county palaces in Ettersburg or Tiefurt and often sat along the banks of the river for their Lieder gatherings. Many of these Lieder were published in a journal funded by Anna Amalia called the *Tiefurt Journal*, of which only limited copies were available, since they were intended purely for local consumption. Anna Amalia and her musical friends were very capable of composing complex songs in the “learned style,” but these songs are deliberately simple. In keeping with simplicity, the accompaniments are very sparse,⁹⁰ using simple harmonic progressions of I-V-I, uncomplicated rhythms, square phrasings, and harmonizations in thirds and sixths. Common themes in the text include nature, motherhood, innocent love, and the triumph of love and nature over love’s usual obstacles.⁹¹

Another Lied collection representative of the Weimar court’s tastes was Goethe’s song book from the late 1770s, which contains eighty-five songs for voice with keyboard accompaniment by Philipp Christoph Kayser (1755-1823) and Karl Siegmund Freiherr von Seckendorff (1744-1785). In contrast to the *Tiefurt Journal* songs, the songs in Goethe’s songbook contain more complicated rhythms, a greater variety of keys, meters, and form,

⁹⁰According to Randall, 26 when they were performed out of doors they probably would have been done with guitar accompaniment.

⁹¹*Ibid.*, 23-27.

a wider emotional range, and higher quality texts by some of the most highly regarded poets of the era.⁹²

A third publication that was significant for the Weimar circle was Christoph Martin Wieland's (1733-1813) journal the *Teutsche Merkur*, with which Goethe remarked that "Weimar entered German literature."⁹³ First published in 1773, it continued to be published until 1810, a remarkably long time for a journal of that era. Almost all of the songs in the journal were simple, strophic pieces intended for use in the readers' homes rather than public performance. Part of the appeal of these songs was that, except for Weimar's Kapellmeister Ernst Wilhelm Wolf, none of the contributors was a composer by profession, and thus the readership of the journal could relate to them. For example, Seckendorff was a nobleman with a military background, and Johann Michaëlis (1746-1772) was a professor of Oriental languages. Corona Schröter (1751-1802) was a musician by trade and the court theater's leading singer and actress. Although today she is now most frequently cited as a composer, in the eighteenth century she was better known as a performer.⁹⁴ The journal helped to propagate the idea that any refined person could, and consequently should, participate in song composition and performance.

⁹²Ibid., 36.

⁹³Ibid., 42. Quoted from Goethe, *Dichtung und Wahrheit*, book 15.

⁹⁴Ibid., 51.

The Late Eighteenth-Century Lied in Southern Germany

The Lied in southern Germany had more variety than its northern counterpart, and drew on several traditions in addition to the Berlin Lied. There was also a long standing Italian opera tradition in the southern cities, such as Stuttgart. According to Albert Nef, Lied composers had a later start in the south than in the north, because they were not able to focus on house music and the Lied until after 1770, when opposition from the people led the Duke of Württemberg to dissolve his Hofkapelle and Italian opera house.⁹⁵ In addition to the operatic tradition, basso continuo practice and German folk songs were also important influences on Lied composition in southern Germany.

The first important *Musenalmanach* published in southern Germany was the *Schwäbische Musenalmanach*, which appeared between 1782-1787 and again from 1792-1793. As it had in other areas, the *Musenalmanach* helped unite and focus the local literary culture. Poets from Stuttgart and Tübingen were the main contributors, many of whom were younger than poets in other cities, but they still echoed the older styles. In total, there were 19 Lieder published in this almanac, 13 by Johann Rudolf Zumsteeg, 5 by Christian Daniel Friedrich Schubart,⁹⁶ and one by an anonymous composer.⁹⁷

⁹⁵Nef, *Das Lied in der deutschen Schweiz*, 3.

⁹⁶All five songs by Schubart are published under a pseudonym, either Buxtehude or T.d. ä.. According to Lee, 218 the reason for this may have been because at the time Schubart was imprisoned at the fortress Hohenasperg for insulting the mistress of Duke Carl Eugen of Württemberg, and publishing the name of one of his prisoners might have irritated the Duke.

⁹⁷Lee, 160.

One of the important composers of the Lied in South Germany was Christian Daniel Friedrich Schubart (1739-1791). Influenced by Herder, Schubart developed his own type of *volkstümliche* Lied, although his influence on song was more limited than that of Schulz since his were virtually confined to southern Germany.⁹⁸ While Herder constantly insisted that the poems in his collection were sung by the people, he never provided any melodies for the folk poetry he collected.⁹⁹ Schubart picks up where Herder left off and urges composers to take the same inspiration from the “naive,” “simple,” and “unaffected” melodies of folk music, as Herder had recommended poets take from their texts.¹⁰⁰ Schubart was uniquely qualified for this, since he was the only one among other eighteenth-century musicians who was both a well-known poet and a song composer. In addition to the use of folk-like melodies, Schubart also commonly used the theme of the rustic life of the *Volk* in his poetry.¹⁰¹

Schubart was known in his day as a distinguished performer on the organ, harpsichord, and clavichord,¹⁰² and the accompaniments to his Lieder are frequently more independent than those of the North Germans, often playing an important role in conveying the meaning and mood of the text. He also expects a higher level of skill from

⁹⁸Ibid., 216.

⁹⁹Neither did Achim von Arnim and Clemens Brentano forty years later in their *Des Knaben Wunderhorn* (1805-8).

¹⁰⁰Smeed, 22.

¹⁰¹Lee, 219.

¹⁰²David Ossenkop, “Schubart, Christian Daniel Friedrich” in *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd ed.

the accompanist, employing not only interludes and postludes, but also more advanced keyboard techniques such as quick runs and tremolos in the left hand. At other times his Lied accompaniments are sparser, and several of his songs even show figures under the bass line, suggesting that notes need to be added.¹⁰³ He emphasizes the importance of the *Volk*, and hopes to capture the overall simple quality of these folk songs, rather than the “labored” and “pedantic” style of the North Germans, particularly that of Marburg and Kirnberger.

How is it, I often thought, that the German songs set by the Berlin composers are so splendid in music but are hardly anywhere played, sung, or appreciated? They are too ponderous to sing, and written down with too timid a conscientiousness... Song flows voluntarily out of a stirred heart. It already has its patch dug by nature, and needs no channel dug laboriously by the hoes and shovels of Marburg and Kirnberger. We still have folk songs which are over one hundred years old; but how artless, how light they are! Their discoverer appears to have stolen the notes from the heart.¹⁰⁴

Johann Rudolph Zumsteeg (1760-1802), is especially remembered for his dramatic ballads, but he also wrote many simple Lieder. The large-scale ballads use dramatic accompaniments with descriptive and virtuosic figurations in the keyboard parts that draw

¹⁰³See the discussion of Schubart's “Die Henne” and “Der Riese und der Zwerg” in Chapter Four for examples of this.

¹⁰⁴“Wie kommts, dacht ich oft, daß die von berlinischen Tonkünstlern so vortrefflich in Musik gestzten Lieder der Deutschen fast nirgends gespielt, gesungen, goutirt werden? Sie sind zu schwerfällig, und mit einer zu ängstlichen Gewissenhaftigkeit niedergeschrieben...Der Gesang strömt freywillig aus einem gerührten Herzen, hat schon sein Beet, das ihm die Natur grub, und braucht keinen von den Marburgs und Kirnbergern mit Hacken und Schaufeln mühsam gegrabenen Kanal. Wir haben noch Volkslieder, die über hundert Jahr alt sind; aber wie ungekünstelt, wie leicht sind sie auch! Ihr Erfinder scheint die Noten aus dem Herzen gestohlen zu haben.” Schubart, *Deutsche Chronik* (Jan. 9, 1775): 22-23. This was probably in part a review of Johann André's *Scherzhafte und zärtliche Lieder*. [Author's translation]

on the technique of melodrama with their quick mood changes. He was also one of the first composers to utilize recitative-like sections in a lyrical setting, and many of his ballads employ this dramatic technique. Many of his *Lieder*, however, use accompaniments that are much simpler and were quite possibly derived from continuo practice.¹⁰⁵ Zumsteeg was admired both by his contemporaries, and by future Lied composers for the expressive way he set his texts and how well he was able to reflect the mood of the poetry in the vocal line and accompaniment. In particular, he uses adventurous harmonies, even in his simple accompaniments, that anticipate *Lieder* of the nineteenth century. Franz Schubert admired Zumsteeg's *Lieder* and noticeable similarities can be found in the songs and ballads of the two composers.¹⁰⁶ Therefore, Zumsteeg is an important composer to this study since his Lied accompaniments both look back to earlier traditions and also had an influence on later composers.

The Late Eighteenth-Century Lied in Austria

The Lied for solo voice and keyboard accompaniment was established much later in Austria than in Northern Germany, with the first Viennese song publication in 1778. One reason for this was the dominance of Italian opera and oratorios, as well as the *Singspiel* and other stage pieces in Vienna.¹⁰⁷ Another reason is that Austrian poets were

¹⁰⁵Gunter Maier, "Zumsteeg, Johann Rudolph," in *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd ed.

¹⁰⁶Smeed, 78.

¹⁰⁷Ibid., 42.

restricted due to the stringent state censorship that was in place until 1780. As a result, Anacreontic-style love poetry was still fashionable in Vienna well into the 1780s, long after it had gone out of style in Berlin.¹⁰⁸ The center of Lied composition in Austria was Vienna, and the majority of texts Viennese song composers utilized were from this style of poetry collection. The Berlin composers were frequently critical of the Austrians' lack of attention to the poetry, and Reichardt, in particular, criticized Haydn and Mozart for their choice of trivial texts.¹⁰⁹

In addition to textual differences, another distinguishing feature of the Austrian Lied is the independence of the accompaniment. Although the customary set-up was still only two staves shared by both the keyboard and the voice, the accompaniment plays a much more prominent role, with frequent preludes, interludes, and postludes, as well as frequently changing textures. Perhaps due to its later development, the keyboard style uses figurations that are much more idiomatic to the fortepiano, and several composers actually specify "fortepiano" on their title pages.¹¹⁰ Whereas the North German composers' primary concern was that nothing get in the way of the text, on the whole, the Viennese Lieder are more instrumental in nature, using similar figurations and ornamentations as

¹⁰⁸Amanda Glauert, "The Lieder of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach, Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven," in *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), 68.

¹⁰⁹Smeed, 44.

¹¹⁰*Ibid.*, 43.

those in solo keyboard works.¹¹¹ As a result, Viennese song composers approached texts much more casually and the music had a more dominant role. For example, the snap rhythms and flourishes in the keyboard part as well as the florid vocal line of Joseph Antonin Štěpán's (a.k.a. Steffan) setting "Im Frühlingsschatten fand ich sie" are appropriate for the musical style of the day, but hardly fit the serene images Klopstock paints in his poem.

Example 3. Štěpán, "Im Frühlingsschatten," m. 1-10 from *Das Wiener Lied von 1778 bis Mozarts Tod*, Denkmäler der Tonkunst in Österreich, no. 54 (Graz: Akademische Druck und Verlagsanstalt, 1960)

Andante.

1. Im Früh - lings - schat - ten fand ich sie, Da band ich sie mit Ro - sen -
 2. lis - pel' ich ihr sprachlos zu Und rausch - te mit den Ro - sen -

bän - dern, Sie fühlt' es nicht und schlum - mer - te, sie fühlt' es nicht und
 bän - dern, Da wach - te sie vom Schlum - mer auf, da wach - te sie vom

Also, it is not uncommon for Viennese song publications to leave out the name of the poet entirely or attribute a song to the wrong person.¹¹²

¹¹¹Howard J. Picton, *The Life and Works of Joseph Anton Štěpán (1726-1797): with Special Reference to His Keyboard Concertos* (New York: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1989), 200.

¹¹²Glauert, 341 (footnote) gives two examples: "Štěpán's setting of *Das Veilchen* as published in the first *Sammlung deutscher Lieder* (Vienna, 1778) erroneously attributed the poem to Gleim. Friberth's setting in the third *Sammlung* of 1780, which was in

The first collection of Austrian art-songs with keyboard accompaniment was published in Vienna in 1778. The collection was *Sammlung deutscher Lieder* by Josef Antonin Štěpán (1726-1797), a Bohemian composer who came to Vienna in 1741 after the Prussians invaded Bohemia. It was this collection that set the tone for the Lied in Vienna for the remainder of the century.¹¹³ The introduction by the publisher to this first collection of songs reiterates several significant points about the Viennese Lied in general. First, the Viennese Lied developed rather late since there was a lack of German-language songs in Vienna until Štěpán's collection. Second, Štěpán was particularly well-known for his involvement with keyboard composition and performance, and this influences his Lied composition. Finally, the introduction also makes it clear that the original context for these Lieder was social gatherings among a limited circle of friends:

To the Lovers of German Songs

Those who have sought in vain for a German song in the flood of Italian and French songs which are to be found in every house, or at least on every Klavier, will get here a collection of German songs in two volumes selected from the works of the best German poets.

The songs of the first volume now being published were set to music by the Imperial Royal Court Klaviermeister Mr. Štěpán, who is generally known for his excellent and unique manner of keyboard performance and for his fine keyboard compositions...

Mozart's possession, did not give the name of the poet though it seems from the "vom Göthe" written onto Mozart's manuscript that he knew who the true author was."

¹¹³One of his piano students confirms Štěpán's innovations in her memoirs writing, "His three collections of German songs were epoch-making in those times (50-52 years ago), and they opened up, so to speak, a new way to simple German singing." Modern scholars also agree on the historical importance of Štěpán in the development of the Austrian Lied. Picton, 184; Smeed, 42; Glauert, 68.

Mr. Štěpán, who had composed these songs just for the enjoyment of some of his friends, was very embarrassed when he saw the first of these songs published in print. He begged the music-loving public to treat them with indulgence, for these small songs were never intended for the general public...¹¹⁴

The performance context for the Lied was very similar in Vienna to that of North Germany. Composers in both regions desired to produce simple songs that could be sung in social gatherings with friends. How that simplicity translated into music, however, is quite different in the two places. The introduction to the *Sammlung* mentions the preponderance of Italian and French vocal music in Vienna. Some of the stylistic differences between North Germany and Austria come from the fact that Berlin had taken its cues from the French, but Vienna was influenced more by the Italian opera tradition. In addition to Italianate vocal style, Štěpán and his Viennese contemporaries give greater precedence to the keyboard parts. Howard Picton describes Štěpán's compositional process this way:

By taking over the Italian vocal style for the setting of German poems, and by writing independent accompaniments specifically for the fortepiano, Štěpán inadvertently, and apparently without previous experiment, created a point of departure for the development of the Viennese lied. The special character of the keyboard part, which was extraordinarily richer than in North German lieder, was as remarkable as it was unprecedented. In his art-songs, Štěpán set German pre-Romantic poets, and devised genuine, *obligato* accompaniments for the fortepiano in an idiomatic style.¹¹⁵

¹¹⁴Quoted in Picton, 183. The friends who originally enjoyed Štěpán's songs were those who gathered at the home of Franz Sales von Greiner, who played an important role in the development of the Lied in Vienna. Not only was Greiner a supportive friend to Štěpán, he was also the leader of the main poetic circle in Vienna, and often advised other composers, including Mozart and Haydn on appropriate Lied texts.

¹¹⁵Ibid.

The Viennese were eager for their own songs and Štěpán's Lieder were quickly imitated by minor composers such as M. Ruprecht, W. Pohl, L. Koželuch, J. J. Grünwald, Stadler, J. C. Baumberg, F. X. Rigler, and J. Schrattenbach.¹¹⁶ Several well-known eighteenth-century Viennese composers also wrote German Lieder, including Haydn and Mozart.

In terms of solo vocal music with keyboard accompaniment Joseph Haydn (1732-1809) is best known for his English Canzonettas, which were published in London in 1794 and 1795, but he also published German translations of these English songs, as well as some songs originally in German. Haydn was not known as a connoisseur of poetry, and he often asked friends to give him poetry, which was not usually of very high quality.¹¹⁷ Every Lied historian agrees that Haydn approached his vocal music from an instrumental point of view. For example, Hall points out how he often put words to existing instrumental melodies.¹¹⁸ Meister describes the expressive role of Haydn's accompaniments, which set the mood with introductions while interludes show shifting emotions, all effects that can be found in instrumental compositions.¹¹⁹ Landau gives the example of the two sets of songs dedicated to Francisca Liebe von Kreutzern, which place

¹¹⁶*Ibid.*

¹¹⁷Glauert, 70 gives him the benefit of the doubt saying that the fact that Haydn did not choose his own poetry was not necessarily evidence of Haydn's lack of confidence in literary matters, but also shows a willingness to reach beyond the personal to find a more universal approach to text setting.

¹¹⁸Hall, *The Art Song*, 28. "Bind' auf dein Haar" or "My Mother Bids Me Bind My Hair" is put to an andante from a Pleyel sonata.

¹¹⁹Meister, *Introduction to the Art Song*, 36-37.

the German text inconspicuously between the two staves and are called “Songs for Pianoforte,” implying that they could actually be performed as instrumental compositions.¹²⁰ Glauert illustrates the instrumental nature of Haydn’s songs by pointing out how mini-sonata forms can be found.¹²¹ However, Haydn definitely knew the beauties of the voice, having served in his early years as an accompanist to the great singing teacher Porpora.¹²² He also liked to perform his own songs, and the following quote from a letter to his publisher Artaria in July 1781 shows how much he cared about his songs.

I particularly request you not to allow anyone to copy or to sing these songs at present, or spoil them in any way whatever, for when they are finished I intend to sing them myself to critical audiences. A composer must maintain his rights by his presence, to ensure the proper execution of his works. They are indeed merely songs but not...devoid of ideas, or expression, and above all of melody.¹²³

Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart (1756-1791) is well-known for his brilliant operatic and sacred vocal works, but he also wrote numerous songs for voice and keyboard, including some with Italian and French texts, and about thirty with German texts. Most of his early songs are strophic in form with very simple accompaniments that do little but provide harmonic support and double the vocal line almost constantly.¹²⁴ Arguably Mozart’s best song, “Das Veilchen,” to a text by Goethe, functions in a completely

¹²⁰Landau, *The Lied*, 8.

¹²¹Glauert, 69. See also Stevens, ed., *History of Song*, 235.

¹²²Hall, 28.

¹²³Quoted in Karl Geiringer, *Haydn a Creative Life in Music* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982), 264.

¹²⁴Stevens, 233; Hall, 32; Meister, 40.

different way. In this song the vocal line and the accompaniment have an operatic feel, and they both respond to many nuances and changes of mood in the poem, setting up a simple, but dramatic scene. Unlike Haydn, Mozart chose most of his own poetry, and Constanze even described a little notebook in which Mozart would collect poems for later opportunities.¹²⁵ However, Mozart did not seem to be interested in raising the level of song writing in Vienna, and probably did not intend to see his songs published.¹²⁶ They were usually written for his friends and he usually gave them to the person he wrote them for.¹²⁷ Only seven of his songs were printed during his lifetime.¹²⁸ Even then they were usually published in random fashion, waiting for the stimulation of the appropriate text or circumstance.¹²⁹

One of the main sources for publication was the ubiquitous *Musenalmanach*. The *Göttinger* and *Leipziger Musenalmanachs* had faithful readership in Vienna since their inception, but the first Viennese *Musenalmanach* appeared in 1777,¹³⁰ a year before the

¹²⁵Landau, 9.

¹²⁶Glauert, 74.

¹²⁷Landau, 9.

¹²⁸Hall, 32.

¹²⁹Glauert, 76.

¹³⁰West, 39. West also points out in a footnote that the year 1777-1778 were significant for Vienna in general. In addition to the first publication of the city's *Musenalmanach*, the years also saw the beginning of music printing in Vienna by Anton Huberty, the establishment of the National Singspiel by Joseph II and the publication of Štěpán's *Sammlung deutscher Lieder*, the first collection of songs published in Vienna. The only female composer to be included in the *Wiener Musenalmanach* was Maria Theresia von Paradis (1759-1824).

publication of the first Viennese Lied collection, and continued to be published through 1796. The contributing poets formed a literary circle just as the poets in Göttingen had, and the group met at the home of Franz Sales von Greiner.¹³¹ The earliest issues are closely related to the *Vossischer Musenalmanach* in organization and Anacreontic poetic style. However, due to political tensions and fear of censorship, later issues highlight patriotic sentiments and adapt a decidedly pro-State tone.¹³² In the 1780s and 1790s Freemasonry was at its peak in Austria and the *Wiener Musenalmanach*, provided many of the texts for Masonic songs. Furthermore, many of the contributing poets and composers were active members of Masonic lodges in Vienna, including poets Alois Blumauer, Gottlieb Leon, Martin Prandstetter, and Franz Ratschky, as well as composers Johann Holzer, Joseph Bauernjöppel, and W. A. Mozart. Music, and especially singing, was an important part of the Masonic meetings, and some lodges even had their own “Hauskomponist” who would write music for special ceremonies or performances. It is quite likely then that many of the songs in the *Wiener Musenalmanach* were also utilized on these occasions.¹³³

Just as the song collections of Štěpán, Haydn and Mozart reflect more instrumental characteristics, so do the songs in the *Wiener Musenalmanach*. As in northern Germany all of the songs are strophic, and most use the customary two-stave format, but the simplicity the North Germans valued did not seem to have as much influence on the

¹³¹Lee, 156.

¹³²West, 41.

¹³³Lee, 132-33.

Austrian composers.¹³⁴ As stated above, preludes, interludes, and postludes appear more frequently than in the songs of other regions. Therefore, more than in any other area these Viennese accompaniments are independent from the vocal line and play a more important role in the structure of the song.¹³⁵ The *Wiener Musenalmanach* also reiterates the domestic nature of song and song performance at this time, but it also is significant since it provided a wealth of texts for both minor and major song composers. Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven, and Schubert all drew on them at some point in their song-writing careers.¹³⁶

The Late Eighteenth-Century Lied in Switzerland

While Germany and Austria generally receive all of the attention from scholars of German Lieder, Switzerland also has a rich song tradition. Like Germany and Austria, the Swiss wanted a song that all people could sing, even if they were not professional musicians. For this reason, the Swiss composers admired the Lieder of the Berlin School, and resonated with their ideas about singability and simplicity. However, they also maintained their own traditions. The main thing that distinguishes the Swiss Lied from that of other countries is the popularity of part singing, which originated in the psalm singing of the Reformation in the sixteenth century and lasted well into the nineteenth. Ardent patriotism is a major theme of Swiss Lied texts, which also sets them apart. A further distinctive feature, which is particularly relevant to this study, is the Swiss composers'

¹³⁴Ibid., 158.

¹³⁵Ibid., 172-3.

¹³⁶West, 46.

consistent use of figured bass signatures in song accompaniments throughout the eighteenth century and into the nineteenth.

The secular solo Lied in Switzerland developed relatively late, especially in comparison with Germany.¹³⁷ One reason for this is that Switzerland lacked the large cities and courts with professional opera houses and orchestras that Germany had. Another reason, however, is the heavy influence that the church had over music making. In particular, sixteenth-century Swiss Protestant reformers, Ulrich Zwingli (1484-1531) and Jean Calvin (1509-1565), expressed strong views which limited the song texts and styles that were being written and sung for several centuries. Although he himself was a trained musician, Zwingli excluded music from religious services out of a fear that the worshippers would be distracted by it. Calvin shared Zwingli's concerns about the possibility of music being a distraction in worship, and he limited congregational singing to psalms sung monophonically. Sacred polyphonic settings of psalms were permitted in the home, however, where there would not be as much distraction from the texts. In addition, Calvin also discouraged instrumental accompaniment, which had the potential to provide yet another distraction.¹³⁸ This emphasis on unaccompanied, sacred songs naturally delayed the development of a tradition of a secular Lied with keyboard accompaniment.

¹³⁷Johannes Schmidlin's *Schweizerlieder* of 1769 is considered the starting point for secular song collections. See David Cox, "Switzerland," in *A History of Song*, ed. Denis Stevens (New York: W. W. Norton, 1960), 398.; Nef, vi.; and Smeed, 38. Even Schmidlin's work, however, contains both spiritual songs and part songs.

¹³⁸Allan Atlas, *Renaissance Music: Music in Western Europe, 1400-1600*, (New York: W. W. Norton, 1998), 520.

Spiritual songs were not limited to church services, but also provided the main material for singing in the home. While Germany had already published secular songs by Heinrich Albert and Johann Rist early in the seventeenth century, the first publication of secular Lieder in Switzerland was not until the last third of the eighteenth century. Even at the end of the eighteenth century, when secular Lied compositions abounded, many composers continued to include sacred works in their collections, since they remained popular with the public.¹³⁹ Furthermore, even the secular songs sought to promote moral consciousness, as the abundance of collections with such titles as *Auserlesene moralische Lieder* confirms. While there are certainly many light-hearted texts to be found, as well as numerous love-songs, the poets and composers are careful to avoid any topics that might be deemed offensive or improper.¹⁴⁰

Along with the general preference for sacred texts, the Swiss partiality for the psalms lasted well into the nineteenth century, which is confirmed by accounts of contemporary musicians, including Reichardt, who wrote in his *Musikalisches Kunstmagazin* in 1791 that during his research of popular song in Switzerland, four-part psalms were heard most often. The third book of Goethe's *Wilhelm Meisters Wanderjahre* is probably referring to Switzerland when he writes that the maidens sing mostly psalms, while other Lieder were sung only seldom. As late as 1818 Prof. J. R. Wyss wrote in the

¹³⁹Nef, 6.

¹⁴⁰Smeed, 39.

foreword to the third edition of his collection of *Schweizer-Kühreihen und Volksliedern* that the common man takes refuge in the psalms.¹⁴¹

In addition to the popularity of the psalm texts, the four-part style associated with the singing of psalms also enjoyed long-lasting favor in both sacred and secular songs. In fact, until the 1720s most Swiss song composers wrote exclusively for four parts.¹⁴² Even when composers began to introduce solo songs, they were generally interspersed in collections of mainly part songs.¹⁴³ Furthermore, in many of these collections, songs were printed in such a way that they could be used as either an accompanied solo song or as a part song. The top voice was printed with the figured bass on the left hand side of the page, while the remaining three parts were each laid out separately on the right hand side of the page.¹⁴⁴

Psalm settings and part songs had such a powerful influence on the composition of Swiss Lieder that foreign ideas about accompanied solo songs did not reach Switzerland until late in the eighteenth century. For this reason, Swiss Lieder are generally seen as conservative and slow in development. Smeed even calls Swiss musical style “downright old fashioned.” In addition to part singing, sacred texts, and archaic layouts, the other thing that contributes to the perception of the conservative nature of the Swiss Lied is the pervasive use of figured bass in the accompaniment parts. Swiss Lied composers

¹⁴¹All of these examples, as well as others, are cited in Nef, 7.

¹⁴²Ibid., 6.

¹⁴³Ibid., 29.

¹⁴⁴Ibid., 14.

continued to notate figured bass signatures in the printed score into the nineteenth century, even when they also wrote out a full accompaniment part. The extensive use of figured bass in these Lieder is obviously of great relevance to this study and will be dealt with more fully in the following chapters.

The first Swiss composer to experiment extensively with sacred solo song was Johann Ludwig Steiner (1688-1761), and for this reason Albert Nef refers to him as the “Caccini or H. Albert” of Switzerland. Steiner was best known for his *Neues Gesangbuch* (1723, 1735), a large collection of three- and four-part sacred songs with figured bass accompaniment. Other collections, however, such as *Monatlich-Musicalische Miscellanea* (1724) and *Gott-Geheilgte Fest- und Zeit-Gedanken* (1739), paid homage to Italian cantatas and showed a new commitment to accompanied solo song, a full century after it had taken root in Italy and Germany. Steiner also strongly urged other Swiss composers to employ figured bass accompaniments, and even wrote a treatise on thoroughbass.¹⁴⁵ While Steiner was one of the first important Swiss Lied composers, Johann Caspar Bachofen (1695-1755)¹⁴⁶ was more popular with the public. His best-known collection, the *Musikalisches Hallelujah* appeared in eleven different editions between 1727 and 1803. The majority of Bachofen’s songs were written for three voices with accompaniment, but several solo songs were interspersed in the gaps between three-

¹⁴⁵Ibid., 11-12.

¹⁴⁶Nef gives Bachofen’s birth date as 1692, but Peter Ross in his article on Bachofen for the *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd ed. says that is incorrect.

part songs.¹⁴⁷ It was not until Johannes Schmidlin (1722-1772), however, that solo songs gained equal standing with part songs.

Schmidlin was a protestant minister, as well as the most prolific and well-known composer of sacred house music in the mid-eighteenth century. Among his collections are settings of poems by C. F. Gellert, which C. P. E. Bach also set.¹⁴⁸ While all of the Gellert settings are written for multiple voice parts, Schmidlin placed the figured bass signatures just below the top voice part in order to give a singer the option of singing alone, and to make it easy to accompany himself.¹⁴⁹ In addition to his numerous sacred collections, Schmidlin is also credited with the first publication of secular songs for solo voice with figured bass accompaniment, the *Schweizerlieder* of 1769.

Regarding the title *Schweizerlieder*, Smeed writes that

Schweizerlieder on the title-page of a song-book means much more than the equally common *Deutsche Lieder*; the Swiss composer is proclaiming his patriotism, while the German, as often as not, is merely signaling that the *texts* of his songs are in German rather than French or Italian.¹⁵⁰

Intense patriotism is the most common theme in the secular Swiss Lied, and this is another thing that sets the Swiss Lied apart from Lieder of other countries. Some of these

¹⁴⁷Nef, 13. Bachofen's music is generally outside the chronological realm of this study, but extensive bibliographic information can be found in Byron D. Arnold, "The Life and Works of Johann Caspar Bachofen" (Ph.D. Diss., University of Southern California, 1956).

¹⁴⁸*Hrn. Prof. Gellerts geistlichen Oden und Liedern* (Zürich, 1761)

¹⁴⁹Nef, 14.

¹⁵⁰Smeed, 38. While not entirely lacking in the German Lied, such a strong national tone was not as frequent in Germany, since the region's division into so many small states made a well-developed sense of nationhood much more difficult.

Vaterland Lieder exalt Swiss history by recounting historical battles or portraying legendary figures, such as William Tell. Other songs praise the beauty of the country, especially the Alps. Still others are hymns to unity or liberty. Schmidlin's *Schweizerlieder*, in particular, were extremely popular, partly because of their variety, and partly because the patriotic tone appealed to *Volk* sensibilities in all levels of society, even the peasants. It is likely that some of Schmidlin's tunes came from actual Swiss folk songs and marches, which added even further to their appeal.¹⁵¹

The emergence of secular Lieder in Switzerland came about in no small part because of the Enlightenment. The Enlightenment led to the weakening of religious dominance in Switzerland, which made room for secular composition. Nef puts it this way:

It is not difficult to place the genesis of secular Lieder in Switzerland in relation to the Enlightenment. The main goal of the Enlightenment was independence in thought and action, the freeing from the yoke of strangers, a struggle against rusted tradition. In Switzerland it also has to do with, above all, the re-awakening of the old, lost national feeling. Thus it prepared a need for patriotic Lieder. The psalms and the spiritual-pietistic songs, almost the only musical material widely circulated since the Reformation, were no longer enough. One wanted to have patriotic songs of genuinely Swiss origin.¹⁵²

¹⁵¹Nef, 31.

¹⁵²*Ibid.*, 2. "Es ist nicht schwer, die Entstehung des weltlichen Liedes in der Schweiz in Beziehung zur Aufklärung zu setzen. Das Hauptziel der Aufklärung war Selbständigkeit im Denken und Handeln, Befreiung von fremden Joch, Kampf gegen das verrostete Hergebrachte. In der Schweiz ging sie vor allem auch darauf aus, das alte abhanden gekommene Nationalgefühl neu zu erwecken. Dadurch stellte sich ein Bedürfnis nach patriotischen Liedern ein. Die Psalmen und die geistlich-pietistischen Gesänge, seit der Reformation fast der einzige musikalische Stoff breiterer Kreise, genügten nicht mehr. Vaterlandslieder echt schweizerischen Ursprungs wollte man haben." [Author's Translation]

After Schmidlin, the most important Swiss composers of the late eighteenth century were Johann Heinrich Egli (1742-1810) and Johann Jakob Walder (1750-1817). Both Egli and Walder received musical instruction from Schmidlin, and the influence of his compositional style is readily found in their Lieder. In addition to Schmidlin's influence, Egli and Walder also drew directly on examples of Lieder from the first and second Berlin schools. Schmidlin himself, in the foreword to his *Schweizerlieder* of 1769 claimed himself to be a direct descendent of the Berlin school.¹⁵³ Egli thoroughly studied the works of Kirnberger, Marpurg, and C. P. E. Bach, all members of the first Berlin school.¹⁵⁴ In addition to claiming direct influences, these Swiss composers strove for simplicity and naturalness, just as the Berlin composers had. The songs were meant for use in the home and the diatonic melodies and simple harmonic accompaniments echo the concern that the songs could be easily learned and sung by everyone, regardless of their education or social class.¹⁵⁵

Example 4. Walder, "An ein Bischen Blüthe," m. 1-7 from *Singcompositionen mit Begleitung des Claviers*, vol. 2 (Zürich: Orell, Gessner, Fueslin und Compagnie, 1786)

Momiglich.

Wie lieblich, Süßthe, küßtest du hat dich ein Engel mir ge-

¹⁵³Ibid., 4.

¹⁵⁴Ibid., 101.

¹⁵⁵Ibid., 36.

The Lied at the Turn of the Century

At the turn of the nineteenth century, one of the most important developments in Lied composition was experimentation with more complex and independent accompaniment parts. New ideas about harmony and greater sound possibilities on the steadily expanding keyboard made this experimentation possible. Amidst the experimentation and wider variety of styles, however, there are still ties to earlier Lied traditions. Two of the most important composers at this point in Lied history were Ludwig van Beethoven (1770-1827) and Carl Friedrich Zelter. Beethoven wrote 70 Lieder, including *An die ferne Geliebte* (1816), one of the first song cycles. His Lieder encompass a wide variety of styles, which suggests the fact that he could never completely define the genre for himself.¹⁵⁶ Some of these Lied styles include experiments with instrumental conceptions such as sonata form and theme and variation,¹⁵⁷ linking him with the Viennese Lied tradition of Haydn, but far removed from the simple vocal nature of the Berlin Lied. Many other songs, however are simple and strophic with modest chordal accompaniments doubling the vocal line throughout.¹⁵⁸

Carl Friedrich Zelter is often lumped together with the Second Berlin school since he composed in Berlin and his Lieder had some of the same folk-like influences. However,

¹⁵⁶Gorrell, *The Nineteenth-Century German Lied*, 95. Gorrell also suggests that the lack of consistency in his terminology—everything from Lied, Gesänge, Ariette, to the simple Gedicht von---in Musik gesetzt von L. Van Beethoven—also suggests his confusion.

¹⁵⁷For example, “Neue Liebe, neues Leben” to a poem by Goethe.

¹⁵⁸For example, “Molly’s Abschied.”

André, Schulz, and Reichardt were all active as song composers much earlier than Zelter, the majority of whose Lied compositions were actually published in the nineteenth century.¹⁵⁹ Hermann Kretzschmar called Zelter the “Father of a new, freer and larger art of song”¹⁶⁰ rather than merely an eighteenth-century phenomenon, and many of Zelter’s Lieder do indeed show a general shift away from simple, strophic songs. He was friends with Goethe and influenced by the poet’s ideas, but he also had other interests in Italian opera and in the learned contrapuntal style of Johann Sebastian Bach. As such, his Lieder show much more diversity of style than those of the earlier Berlin composers.¹⁶¹ However, many of his 210 Lieder are still representative of an earlier aesthetic. In her dissertation on Zelter, Stephanie Campbell writes that some of his earliest Lieder are closely related to the continuo song and sometimes imply an improvised accompaniment.¹⁶² In a few instances, even as late as 1797, Zelter provided a few figures underneath the bass line. Despite his experimentation with forms, Zelter seemed to prefer the strophic song with a subtle harmonic accompaniment. In a letter to Carl Loewe on 10 January 1824, Zelter described his aesthetic principles for songwriting insisting that since the text should always take priority, the strophic song is to be preferred to “absolute through-composing.”

¹⁵⁹Campbell, “Carl Friedrich Zelter,” 40.

¹⁶⁰ Kretzschmar, 132. “*Vater einer neuen, freien und grossen Liedkunst.*”

¹⁶¹Campbell, 44.

¹⁶²*Ibid.*, 265.

Furthermore, it was necessary for the accompaniment to stay always in the background so that “if necessary the melody could exist without it.”¹⁶³

Several other Berlin composers continued to perpetuate the North German tradition of simplicity well into the nineteenth century. Ludwig Berger (1777-1839) published about 160 Lieder, including one of the first settings of Wilhem Müllers *Die schöne Müllerin* poems in 1818. His songs are almost all strophic, and despite his reputation as a brilliant pianist, the song accompaniments are mostly very simple.¹⁶⁴ Bernhard Klein (1793-1832) was another early nineteenth-century composer who was content to keep his over 100 Lieder in that same tradition of simplicity, using square-cut melodies and sparse accompaniment. The syllabic song style he used consistently drew criticism from Robert Schumann.¹⁶⁵

In general, the Lied was still viewed as a simple genre for amateurs even at the turn of the century. Heinrich Christoph Koch expresses this idea in his definition of the Lied in his *Musikalisches Lexicon* from 1802:

A lyrical poem of several stanzas, intended to be sung, and united with a melody that is repeated for each stanza and that also is of such a nature that it can be sung by anyone who has a normal and reasonably flexible voice, whether he has any training in the art or not.¹⁶⁶

¹⁶³Hans-Günter Ottenberg, “Zelter, Carl Friedrich,” in *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd ed.

¹⁶⁴Plantinga, *Romantic Music*, 112-113.

¹⁶⁵Richard D. Green, “Klein, Bernhard (Joseph),” in *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd ed.

¹⁶⁶Heinrich Christoph Koch, *Musikalisches Lexicon* (Frankfurt am Main, 1802), 901. Quoted and translated by Leon Plantinga, 109.

Even the more complex music of Franz Schubert (1797-1828) and Robert Schumann (1810-1856) continued to be written for intimate occasions and performed, often by the composer himself, for social gatherings in the home. The many editions of Gottfried Fink's collection *Musikalischer Hausschatz der Deutschen*, which included many songs by eighteenth-century composers, attests to the market for domestic Lied singing throughout the entirety of the nineteenth century.¹⁶⁷

Even though they were experimenting with more sophisticated harmonies and keyboard accompaniments, Schubert, Felix Mendelssohn, and Johannes Brahms (1833-1897) all drew on earlier traditions. Although Schubert is best known for the groundbreaking *Erlkönig* and *Gretchen am Spinnrade*, both of which use more active accompaniments, there are also many simple, strophic songs among the 600 songs that he wrote. He also studied, admired, and imitated the songs of several eighteenth-century composers, with a specific interest in Johann Zumsteeg.¹⁶⁸ Mendelssohn studied composition with Zelter and Berger, both of whom had strong ties to earlier generations of Lied composers.¹⁶⁹ Brahms considered folk song to be the superior type of song and nearly half of his over 200 songs are based somehow on the folk tradition. He often used

¹⁶⁷Twelve different editions of the collection were published between 1844 and 1904.

¹⁶⁸Gorrell, 109.

¹⁶⁹See Todd, *Mendelssohn's Musical Education*.

folk poetry, or modern poetry that was written in a folk style. Furthermore, he published several collections of harmonized folk melodies with very simple accompaniments.¹⁷⁰

Summary

The Baroque continuo Lied provides a foundation for most of the Lieder that followed. While many people wrongly assume that all continuo Lieder were ornate and virtuosic vocal showpieces, the reality is that many of them were actually simple, strophic songs that were intended to be sung easily by amateurs, such as the songs by Heinrich Albert and Johann Rist. The introduction of Italian madrigals and cantatas in Germany toward the end of the seventeenth century brought about new Lied collections that used a more operatic, melismatic style, which were impossible for amateurs to sing.

In the 1730s many composers in Northern Germany reacted against these Italianate styles and showed a renewed interest in composing simpler tunes, including Scholze, Gräfe, and Telemann. As the century went on, Berlin became the center of Lied composition in Northern Germany, especially because of the lavish patronage of Frederick the Great. Significantly it was also a center of figured bass pedagogy, with several important treatises published there. The First Berlin School was also committed to the ideals of simplicity and naturalness and found models not only in their earlier eighteenth-century predecessors, but also in the new Berlin literary circles led by Krause, and in the French air. Enlightenment ideals are also particularly apparent in the North German schools with their desire to appeal to and improve all of society, not just the elite.

¹⁷⁰Gorrell, 260.

Furthermore, three composers from the First Berlin School, C. P. E. Bach, Marpurg and Kirnberger, wrote some of the most important accompanying treatises of the period. The Second Berlin School was based on many of the same principles as the First, but was also strongly influenced by Herder's ideas, and especially by his collections of folk-song poetry. Leipzig, with its popular *Singspiel* Lieder, and Weimar, where Duchess Anna Amalia reigned, were also important North German centers for Lied composition.

While the history of the North German Lied can be traced back to the Baroque continuo Lied, the South German Lied was more strongly influenced by the Italian operatic tradition. Nevertheless, Schubart in Stuttgart wrote many songs in a folk-like style and also incorporated figured bass into several of his songs. Italian operas were also dominant in Austria, and thus the Lied had a later start there than in Germany. A distinctive feature of Viennese Lieder is that the accompaniment parts tend to be more independent, and the songs are more instrumental in nature.

The Lied also got a late start in Switzerland, especially because of the strong influences of the Protestant reformed church which limited the kind of music that could be sung. Four-part psalm settings made up the bulk of house music, and it was not until 1730 that the accompanied solo Lied had much of a role in Switzerland. The first secular Lied collection, Schmidlin's *Schweizerlieder*, was published in 1769, and emphasized patriotic themes, which remained very popular in Switzerland. Despite its geographical proximity to Italy, the Italians had little influence on the music of Switzerland. Instead, the Swiss Lied composers modeled their solo songs after the Berlin composers. Of all of the conservative

aspects of the Swiss Lied, the most significant to this study is that composers continued to use figured bass signatures in their Lieder into the nineteenth century.

One of the things that is common to all of the regions where Lieder were being composed is that the style of music is usually closely related to poetic styles and reforms. Song collections were often compiled by poets, and composers would have to follow their instructions about what kind of melody and accompaniment to write. For example, the reforms of Opitz were one of the main reasons that seventeenth century Lieder were strophic in form. When Ziegler introduced his treatise on the Italian madrigal, strophic forms gave way to more complex settings. Gottsched and his philosophies on aesthetics helped bring the Lied back to its original simplicity in the mid-eighteenth century. Krause encouraged the creation of the First Berlin Lieder School, and Herder's ideas about folk songs inspired the Second Berlin School. The *Göttinger Hainbund* produced the first *Musen Almanachs*, which became an important resource for song composers. The importance placed on the text led for the most part to simple, harmonic accompaniments that provided harmonic support, but kept out of the way of the words. Basso continuo is the ideal method of accompaniment for not interfering with text declamation, and it is difficult to believe that the composers did not have this style in mind.¹⁷¹

All of the Lied composers valued simplicity. This was not out of naivete or incompetence, but because it was the style that best fit the text. Also, Lieder in all of the regions were written for an audience of amateurs and most were intended to be sung in

¹⁷¹Except for the Viennese composers who wrote more keyboard-dominant accompaniments since they were not as concerned with bringing out the text.

social gatherings in the home or for specific occasions, such as weddings or birthdays. Almost all of the Lieder in the late eighteenth century were written on two staves. Strophic was the most common form, since this was also the most common form of poetry. All of these traits were first represented in Germany by the Baroque continuo Lied. While not every aspect of the Lieder can be traced back to the seventeenth century, the general venue, purpose and ethos of the Lieder can be.

From this brief survey of the history of the German Lied, the North German Lied stands out as having had the most direct impact from the Baroque continuo Lied. The Lied developed much earlier in Northern Germany than in the South or in Austria or Switzerland, and therefore has the closest ties with its Baroque counterpart. Also, it is closest in geographical proximity. Furthermore, because the Lied developed first in Northern Germany, it had an impact on Lieder in all of the other areas. Southern Germany and Austria may not have as many direct connections with German continuo practice, but the Italian operatic basso continuo tradition may have had more of an impact. In Switzerland the connection to the figured bass tradition is the most explicit since the composers continued to write in figured bass signatures throughout the time period of this study.

CHAPTER III

GENERAL RULES OF ACCOMPANYING IN THE LATE EIGHTEENTH CENTURY

In order to understand how basso continuo practice relates to Lied accompaniments composed and performed in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, it is first necessary to examine what was being written and taught about the practice at that time. Although scholars have contended that continuo practice was in decline during the second half of the eighteenth century, there were, in fact, over sixty figured bass treatises published between 1750 and the first few decades of the nineteenth century, many of which were directed at amateur audiences and were intended for practical application.¹

Although the focus of this dissertation is on German Lieder, continuo treatises published in other regions are included in the study as well. First of all, there is a great deal of agreement on practical issues in all of the German, Austrian, French, Italian, and English treatises, and surveying them all gives a more complete picture of the

¹In addition to the many treatises dealing with practical accompaniment, there are also a number of treatises from the period that use thoroughbass for other purposes including purely theoretical discussions of harmonic principles, such as Kirnberger's *Kunst des reinen Satzes* (1771), and the composition of solo music, such as the studies in Italian partimento by Martini (1775), Paisiello (1782), and Tritto (1821). A more detailed look at the contents of the continuo treatises used for this study can be found in the appendices at the end of this document.

thoroughbass tradition in Europe during this period. Furthermore, many Lied composers and theorists traveled, worked, and published outside of their countries of origin.² In addition, most authors show a general awareness of the major treatises, mentioning them by name and often quoting or using examples from them, even if those authors are from a different geographic region.

While there are obviously many issues discussed in the treatises, this chapter will focus on those which will be most pertinent to the analysis of the Lied accompaniments in the following chapters. The six issues at hand are 1) the intended audience and purpose, 2) the recommended number of accompanying parts and how they are to be distributed, 3) preferred intervals and chords, 4) how to perform an unfigured bass, 5) the use of embellishment and filled-in accompaniments, and 6) the relationship of the accompaniment to the solo line.

Audience and Purpose

One of the things the majority of these accompaniment treatises have in common, regardless of the nation of publication, is that the intended audience for many of them is beginners. Whereas earlier in the century books were being written for the well-educated nobility or the professional musician, these treatises reflect a general shift to an expanded audience of musical amateurs that was taking place in the mid to late eighteenth century.

²A good example of this is Augustus Friedrich Christoph Kollmann, whose *Practical Guides to Thoroughbass* are steeped in German theory, but were published in London where he was living and working at the time. There was a particularly strong connection between Germany and England during this period because of the close ties between the reigning line of Electors in Hanover and the English royal family.

This is significant, since Lied composers of the time were also generally writing their songs for musical amateurs.

As previously noted, the expansion of commerce and the increased affluence of the middle class in the eighteenth century allowed for increased leisure time. This, combined with larger diffusion of printing produced a proliferation of cheap self-improvement manuals of all kinds, including music tutorials. Music played a large role in this “commercialization of leisure,” with keyboard playing and singing considered some of the most important social accomplishments. Thoroughbass accompanying was considered an adjunct to keyboard playing, a further “fashion accessory” that provided a way for the rising middle class to “feel gentrified by imitating the aristocracy.”³

Daube acknowledges his amateur audience from the beginning of his treatise, recognizing that those already familiar with the basics of thoroughbass will be frustrated by his work’s simplicity, stating that “It is not necessary for one who already knows and practices thoroughbass to read this treatise anyway...It was not written for him.”⁴ Also, most of the treatises begin with elementary musical material, such as note names and scales so that even a true beginner can eventually reach a level that is compatible with more experienced players. Löhlein takes the basics even further by including extremely rudimentary information such as how to sit properly at the keyboard. Garnier’s preface

³Ng, “Figured Bass Accompaniment,” 8-11. See also J. H. Plumb, “The Commercialization of Leisure,” in *The Birth of a Consumer Society: The Commercialization of Eighteenth-Century England*, ed. by Neil McKendrick, John Brewer, and J. H. Plumb (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1982), 265-285.

⁴Barbara K. Wallace, “J. F. Daube’s *General-Bass in drey Accorden* (1756): A Translation with Commentary” (Ph.D. Diss., University of Michigan, 1983), 263-4.

states that he intends to render the principles of accompaniment simple, intelligent, and within the grasp of those who have only a basic understanding of music. Georg Michael Telemann specifically avoids using foreign words and complex terminology to keep the context more relevant for readers who are not as educated in the subject.⁵ Many of the authors take special care to explain things in multiple ways so that the beginning musician is ensured of understanding.⁶

Because amateur musicians were generally more interested in playing and singing than in speculating on theory, the focus of many of these accompanying treatises is on practical application. In fact, the word “practical” often appears right on the title page.⁷ While some authors do bring in theoretical aspects of harmony,⁸ others avoid scientific explanations.⁹ Another concern is to keep readers from becoming bored or discouraged.

⁵Georg Michael Telemann, *Unterricht im Generalbass-Spielen, auf der Orgel oder sonst einem Clavier-Instrumente* (Hamburg: Michael Christian Bock, 1773), 10.

⁶Heck is particularly good at this, often giving at least one example for young beginners. For example, on page 5 of his *Short and Fundamental Instructions for Learning Thoroughbass* (London, 1760) he explains a musical scale using intervals and then to make it “plainer to young beginners” he also explains it by whole and half steps.

⁷Cf. Johann Samuel Petri, *Anleitung zur Praktischen Musik* (Lauban: Johann Christoph Wirthgen, 1767); Claude de La Porte, *Traité Théorique et Pratique* (Paris: Boivin, Le Clerc, 1753); Rameau, *Code de Musique Pratique* (Paris: L’Imprimerie royale, 1760); Jackson, *A Treatise on Practical Thoroughbass* (London, 1795); and Kollmann, *A Practical Guide to Thoroughbass* (London: the author, 1801)

⁸Such as Daube who says that one cannot learn thoroughbass completely without sufficient theory. Wallace, 32.

⁹Corrette in his *Prototype* (Paris: the author, 1775) strongly states that “harmonic proportions” are only proper for a treatise on composition and are absolutely useless in a treatise on accompaniment. Others, such as Kollmann, see a basic understanding of harmonic theory as something useful, but refers pupils to his other books for further

Dubugrarre's solution to this is to keep things brief so his readers can get through the rules quickly without giving up. Miller has another solution, which is to present the elements of thoroughbass in a "pleasant" and "amusing" way by using examples of popular songs.

Since accompanying was a leisure activity for most amateurs, they desired methods that required only a minimum amount of effort. Therefore, claims of simplicity, clarity, and brevity were the most common marketing ploys. Every author claims his method is "new" and "necessary" to remedy the confusing and convoluted treatises previously published. For example, Daube proudly advertises that his method is easiest to learn because he requires only three simple rules.¹⁰ Geminiani boldly states that no prior books can compare to his own:

Some perhaps will be surprized to find so little Resemblance between this Book, and those which have been published by others, upon the same Subject. Had any, or all of those Books together, contained compleat Directions for the just Performance of Thoroughbass, I should not have offered mine to the Publick. But I will take upon me to say, that it is impossible to arrive at the just Performance of Thoroughbass, by the Help of any, or all of the Books hitherto published.¹¹

Bemetzrieder makes the most outrageous claim of all, stating that one can become proficient using his method even without any practice at all, and even if one started learning as late as thirty years of age.¹² The virtue of simplicity is so important that many

discussion rather than take the time to deal with it in a practical work. Kollmann, v.

¹⁰This is clear even from the title *General-Bass in drey Accorden*.

¹¹Francesco Geminiani, *The Art of Accompaniment* (London: John Johnson for the author, 1755), 1.

¹²Anton Bemetzrieder, *Music Made Easy to Every Capacity* (London, 1778), ii-iii.

authors advertise by placing the concept prominently in the title, such as Dubugrarre's 20-page *Méthode plus courte et plus facile* and John Heck's 22-page *Short and Fundamental Instructions for Learning Thoroughbass*.

The authors' overall goals of clarity and practicality not only reflect an amateur audience, but also reflect the Enlightenment ideals of the late eighteenth century. Gordon Rowley points out three ways that the character of Michel Corrette's *Le Maître de clavecin pour l'accompagnement* reflects the principles of his time, all three of which can also be applied to many other works.

First, he orders the facts in a logical sequence, with the belief that this presentation will clarify confusing or difficult concepts. Second, he extends this mode of organization to the practical realm, and provides exercises and lessons through which a theoretical body of knowledge can be converted into a practical skill. Finally, Corrette appears to base his writing on the underlying assumption that one can improve one's knowledge and ability through study.¹³

Some authors state that their methods are so straightforward that 'even women' can learn them quickly and easily.¹⁴ In fact, figured bass accompanying was considered particularly fashionable among eighteenth-century young ladies, since the keyboard skills of females were almost invariably linked to singing during this period. The numerous

¹³Gordon Samuel Rowley, "*Le Maître de clavecin pour l'accompagnement*, Michele Corrette's Method for Learning to Accompany from a Thoroughbass: A Translation" (Ph.D. Diss., University of Iowa, 1979), 7-8.

¹⁴Cf. the prefaces of Kollmann, Edward Miller, *Elements of Thoroughbass and Composition* (London: Longman & Broderip, 1787), and Dubugrarre, *Méthode plus courte et plus facile que l'ancienne pour l'accompagnement du clavecin* (Paris: Le Clere, Mangean, Bayard, Castagnery, 1754). Dubugrarre actually dedicates his work to women.

accounts from the period of fashionable women playing along with their own singing attest to the importance of knowing how to accompany.¹⁵

Furthermore, accompanying was particularly important to some ladies because it was a musical skill they could use even as married women. Women often had to give up playing solo keyboard pieces after marriage, since wifely and motherly duties did not allow time for learning and practicing new solo pieces. Accompanying, on the other hand, was a skill that only had to be learned once, and could then be continually applied. Hubert le Blanc reflects on the subject, writing that

one tires of being a pupil all one's life. When ladies are married, they give up the harpsichord if they know nothing but pieces; however, if they learned accompaniment as girls, marriage in no way prevents them from continuing to practice music.¹⁶

Corrette recognizes this particular audience in *Le Maître de clavecin* when he writes that

Seeing that the harpsichord at present forms a part of the fine education of young ladies of rank, and since I have observed that they no longer abandon it as soon as they are married, once they possess [the ability] to accompany, this circumstance has led me to work a long time toward composing for them a short and easy method to explain the supposed difficulties which the enemies of good harmony care to spread about.¹⁷

¹⁵For quotes of several of these accounts see Ng, 20.

¹⁶Hubert Le Blanc, *Défense de la Basse de Viole contre les Entréprises du Violon et les Prétensions du Violoncel* (Amsterdam, 1740), 5. Quoted in Ng, 25. "...on se lasse d'être Ecolier toute sa vie. Lorsque les Dames sont mariées, elles quittent le Clavecin, si elles ne savent que des Pièces; au contraire, si elles ont appris, étant Demoiselles, l'accompagnement, le Mariage ne les empêche nullement de continuer l'exercice de la Musique..." [author's translation]

¹⁷Corrette, *Le Maître de clavecin pour l'accompagnement* (Paris: Byard, Le Cler, Castagnere, 1753), c. "Comme le Clavecin est présentement une des parties de la belle éducation des Demoiselles de Condition, et que j'ai remarqués [*sic*] qu'elles ne le quittoient plus dès qu'elles étoient mariées quand elles possédoient une fois

While many of these works were genuinely intended for female use, Matthew Head states that often a dedication to "the fair sex" was also used as a marketing device that would target more precisely without significantly reducing the pool of potential purchasers. He writes that

"For the fair sex," with its connotation of gallantry, also prettified the act of buying and selling, and made a music book all the more suitable as a courtship gift, a sign of romantic love.¹⁸

Within the general audience of "beginner," different authors show various approaches in determining how much is necessary for the beginning musician to learn. Some treatises are aimed at true amateurs who want to learn things as quickly as possible without too much trouble. These treatises, such as those by Dubugrarre, Garnier, Nauss, Boutmy, and the chapter on thoroughbass by Petri, are the shortest, generally ranging between 25 and 50 pages. Since these authors realized that most amateurs did not have the time or money to spend on longer, more detailed works, these treatises present only the most basic information on how to figure and realize chords. They often refer their audience to more advanced works, particularly that of C. P. E. Bach, for further information on interpretation or tasteful performance. However, they choose not to

l'accompagnement, c'est ce qui m'a engagé à travailler depuis long tems à leur Composer une Methode courte et facile pour leur applanir les prétendues difficultés que les enemis de la bonne harmonie ont soin de répandre." Translated by Rowley, 61-2.

¹⁸Matthew Head, "If the Pretty Little Hand Won't Stretch: Music for the Fair Sex in Eighteenth-Century Germany," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 52 (1999): 208.

discuss it in their own works, in order to keep their readers from being distracted by unnecessary rules.

Other authors, such as Telemann, Türk, and Kirnberger, write for “serious” amateurs who are willing to take the time and want to make a thorough study of basso continuo. Unlike Miller who tried to make his work “amusing,” Kirnberger makes no apologies that his work will appear dry to the amateur who only wants a quick tutor, claiming that his *Grundsätze des Generalbasses* should be used only by those who want to make a thorough study of music.

Even when the stated audience is beginners, however, some authors actually expect their readers to be serious and advanced musicians who already possess good technique and have played a considerable amount of music, as is the case for C. P. E. Bach’s work. Quantz also assumes his readers already know the general rules of playing figured bass and focuses instead on matters of good taste and the subtleties of a good performance.

In summary, the large number of continuo treatises were written during the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries because there was a market for them. Kah-Ming Ng concludes that

Many music treatises were composed in response to the demands of fashion, to enable their owners to become *à la mode* in the shortest possible time and with the minimum of effort or expenditure. They functioned in the same manner as Hogarth’s works for the masses. His prints created an opportunity for the bourgeoisie to ‘own’ paintings which they otherwise would not have been able to commission. Such works formed the material by which a façade of apparent wealth and patronage could be propped up. Similarly, music instruction manuals

were a surrogate for the custom-made tutor book, with the option of dispensing with the costly tutor.¹⁹

Within this competitive market, authors promoted their own works by advertising the inadequacy of all previous treatises, playing into the culture's desire for self-improvement, offering good value, and promising a quick return on expended efforts. Most significantly, the amateur accompanists to whom treatise authors were marketing were the same amateur singers and keyboardists for whom Lied composers were writing. In particular, the female audience, who performed so many Lieder of the time, also provided a significant public for the continuo treatises. Since so many of these amateur musicians still had an awareness of the basics of accompanying from a figured bass, it seems likely that they would have been perfectly capable of applying principles of continuo accompaniment in their own performances.

Number of Notes and their Distribution

The first principles that need to be identified from the treatises are how many notes should be played in each chord and how these notes are to be distributed between the hands. These principles are particularly important since they will be some of the most distinctive evidences of the influence of continuo practice on the written-out Lied accompaniments. While some aspects of continuo practice, such as the use of parallel intervals or the proper resolution of dissonant chords, require a more thorough analysis of the music, the number of notes in a chord and how they are laid out on the staves are

¹⁹Ng, 86.

immediately obvious from only a brief glance at the page, and will provide a good starting point for the Lied analyses in the next chapter.

The treatise authors describe two types of note distribution. The most common is to play the bass note alone in the left hand, while the right hand plays the entire realization. C. P. E. Bach calls this an “undivided” accompaniment and says it is the kind keyboardists most frequently use.²⁰ Marpurg calls this same hand position the “common” (*gemein*) accompaniment, which also implies that it is a standard division to use.²¹ It is clear from the rest of the treatises that most authors and performers considered this standard as well. Along with C. P. E. Bach and Marpurg, Corrette, La Porte, Rameau, Pasquali, Boutmy, Manfredini, Löhlein, Kirnberger, Türk, Choron, Kollmann, and Jousse²² all explicitly state that the most typical realization includes the bass note played by the left hand with the

²⁰Bach, *Essay*, 209.

²¹Friedrich Wilhelm Marpurg, *Handbuch bey dem Generalbasse und der Composition* (Berlin: J. J. Schützens Witwe, 1755-1760), 167.

²²Corrette, *Le Maître*, 1; La Porte, 6; Rameau, 25; Nicolo Pasquali, *Thoroughbass Made Easy* (London: R. Bremner, 1763), 3; Jean-Joseph-Baptiste Boutmy, *Traité abrégé sur la basse continue* (Den Haag: B. Hummel; Amsterdam: J. J. Hummel, 1760), 5; Vincenzo Manfredini, *Regole armoniche* (Venice: Guglielmo Zerletti, 1775), 30; Georg Simon Löhlein, *Clavier-Schule; oder, kurze und gründliche Anweisung zur Melodie und Harmonie* (Leipzig: Auf Kosten der Waisenhaus- und Frommannischen Buchhandlung, 1779-1781), 216; Johann Phillip Kirnberger, *Grundsätze des Generalbasses als erste Linien zur Composition* (Berlin: J. J. Hummel, c. 1781), 83-6; Daniel Gottlob Türk, *Anweisung zum Generalbassspielen* (Halle, Leipzig: Auf Kosten des Verfassers, in Kommission bey Schwickert in Leipzig, 1800) 331; Alexandre-Etienne Choron, *Principes d'accompagnement des écoles d'Italie: extrait des meilleurs auteurs* (Paris: Chez Imabult, 1804), 18; Kollmann, 40; and Jousse, *Lectures on Thoroughbass* (London: Goulding, D'Alamaine, Potter, 1808), 48.

realization played entirely by the right hand. Others who make no specific verbal recommendation use this distribution of parts in nearly all of their printed examples.²³

Example 5. Pasquali, *Thorough-bass Made Easy*, Plate 1



The less frequent, but other possible option for the division of the notes between the hands is what C. P. E. Bach and Marpurg call the “divided” (*geteilt*) accompaniment where the notes are divided equally between the two hands. Bach recommends occasionally alternating between the two types in order to provide “variety and refinement.”²⁴ In addition to the importance of variety, Türk also points out in both of his treatises that two notes in each hand should always be used for accompanying chorales and chorale-like pieces. He also recommends occasionally using this kind of

²³For example Johann Friedrich Daube, *General-Bass in drey Accorden* (Leipzig: Frankfurt am Main: Johann Benjamin Andrä (J. G. I. Breitkopf), 1756); Jackson; Miller; Heck; Bemetzrieder; the Anonymous *Armonici Erudimenti* (Florence: A. G. Pagani, 1790); Matthew Peter King, *A General Treatise on Music* (London, 1809); and Joseph Corfe, *Thoroughbass Simplified* (London: Preston, 1805). Geminiani’s examples, on the other hand, vary widely from page to page without explanation.

²⁴Bach, *Essay*, 398.

accompaniment as a way of keeping the hands from getting too far apart from each other.²⁵

In general, it is the German authors who seem most open to variety in texture and hand position. They seem hesitant to standardize too many rules, recognizing the importance of personal taste and variety, most likely stemming from their affinity for the galant style. Löhlein acknowledges the common trends, but is quick to point out that there are no rules without exceptions.²⁶ As already noted, Bach preaches alternating between several options for the sake of variety. Marpurg specifically states that one of the major features of “galant style accompaniment” is that it contains frequent changes in texture and number of voices.²⁷ In his discussion on taste and tasteful accompaniment Quantz insists that one should not be too bound to the rules, leaving the division of the notes between the hands to the good judgment of the accompanist.²⁸

One Frenchman, Dubugrarre, also recommends sharing the parts between both hands, but for him it is especially because of the large number of parts he recommends overall. He objects strongly to the three part texture in the right hand that most authors recommend because he considers it an outdated rule. In fact, he prefers no fewer than four

²⁵Daniel Gottlob Türk, *Von den wichtigsten Pflichten eines Organisten*, trans. Margot Ann Greenlimb Wollard (Boston: Scarecrow Press, 2000), 20; idem, *Anweisung*, 331.

²⁶Dora Wilson, “Georg Simon Löhlein’s *Klavierschule*: Translation and Commentary” (Ph.D. diss., University of Southern California, 1979), 493.

²⁷Marpurg, 201.

²⁸Johann Joachim Quantz, *Versuch einer Anweisung die flüte traversière zu spielen* (Berlin, 1752), 229.

parts in the right hand as often as possible, even recommending an unprecedented five parts at times. He is careful to follow his own recommendations in his printed examples, although he never actually exceeds four parts in the right hand.²⁹ Kirnberger, although he shows a preference for so-called undivided accompaniment, acknowledges that in cases where there are more than four parts it will be necessary to share the harmony with the left hand.³⁰ Geminiani is the other author who deviates from the general principle. He has no standard rule and his realizations vary greatly from example to example, using anywhere from two to eight notes between the parts and dividing the notes between the hands differently every time. There are examples in which he only includes one note in the bass, but others with two notes or a full triad. Part of the reason for such variety is that many of his examples feature one bass line with several possible realizations using different kinds of figures.

However, most authors, while allowing for the possibility of a total of two to nine parts shared between the hands, are much more consistent from work to work and example to example. For the majority of the authors, four parts is the ideal for consonant chords, with one note played by the left hand and three played by the right. This arrangement is considered easiest and most complete, especially for beginners, since all

²⁹Dubugrarre, 2. Zapulla, 81 confirms that Dugubrarre's preference for such a large number of parts is unique among the French treatise authors.

³⁰Kirnberger, 83-86.

the notes of the triad are represented.³¹ Dissonant chords require a total of five parts, generally with four in the right hand.³²

In a few cases this four-part texture should not be varied. For C. P. E. Bach these cases are heavily scored music in the learned style.³³ For Türk, chorale accompanying requires constancy throughout. However, more often there are opportunities for variety. First of all, as discussed above, the contemporary preference for the galant style valued variety in texture, which included both the number of voice parts and their distribution. Secondly, the type or number of instruments could also call for differing numbers of voices in the keyboard. Generally, the fewer the instrumentalists or vocalists, the sparser the accompaniment should be. For example, Löhlein writes that a simple melody or solo instrument requires fewer accompanying parts so the melody is not obscured, whereas in a larger ensemble one may play as many voices as he pleases.³⁴ Quantz and C. P. E. Bach also emphasize that the pieces with the fewest instruments require the most discretion and it is the accompanist's job to adapt accordingly.³⁵

³¹Cf. Quantz, 223; Daube, 201; Löhlein (Wilson's translation), 216; Türk, 108; Corrette, *Le Maître*, 1; La Porte, 6; Rameau, 25; Heck, 2; Kirnberger, 83-86; Pasquali, 3; Jackson, Joseph Fricke, *A Treatise on Thorough Bass* (London: the author, 1786), 1; Miller, Türk, 108; King, 64; Kollmann, 40; and Jousse, 33.

³²Cf. Boutmy, 28; Corrette, *Prototype*, 47; Honoré Garnier, *Nouvelle méthode pour l'accompagnement* (Paris, 1767); Jousse, 33 and Rameau, 25.

³³Bach, *Essay*, 175.

³⁴Löhlein (Wilson's translation), 216.

³⁵Quantz, 225 and Bach, *Essay*, 386. Cf. Heck, *The Art of Playing Thoroughbass*, (London: J. Welcker, 1777), 92.

A further reason for more or fewer notes would be for the purpose of dynamics. Fewer voices create a softer dynamic, while more voices create a louder one. One example is the addition of the octave in the bass, which authors agree should be used only for additional force in loud, slow sections.³⁶ Türk demonstrates how to give the impression of a crescendo by gradually adding notes to the chords, or a decrescendo by taking away parts. He also discusses how the character of the music influences the number of parts, using fewer for works with a sad or serious character, and more for lively and joyful pieces.³⁷ The final reason it might also be necessary to vary from the typical four-part texture is to leave out a note in order to avoid undesirable progressions, such as parallel fifths and octaves.

Intervals and Chords

All of the authors consider parallel fifths and octaves between the soprano and bass voices unpleasant to the ear, and agree that they should be generally avoided. However, how strict they are on this rule varies from author to author. J. Jousse, in particular, comes out very strongly saying that parallel fifths and octaves are “expressly forbidden,” as this is the “strictest rule in music.” He also notes that the Germans never break this rule, although several Italian, French, and English authors have.³⁸ While Schröter calls these parallel intervals “most disgusting” and wants them hidden at all times, other German

³⁶Cf. Pasquali, 43-44; Telemann, 18; Manfredini, 63; and Türk, 334.

³⁷Türk, *Anweisung*, 328.

³⁸Jousse, 49.

authors are more lenient. Generally, the greater the number of parts, the less strict the rule is. Although the rule is especially strict in composition, Marpurg says that it is not quite as strict in thoroughbass accompanying.³⁹ He admits that they “offend the ear” but is hesitant to say that there could not be any exceptions to the rule.⁴⁰ Löhlein is not as strict, recognizing that parallel fifths and octaves are actually quite prevalent in fashionable compositions of the day, although he recommends that beginners avoid them.⁴¹ Furthermore, the Germans are not the only ones to take the rule seriously. English author George Jackson is so concerned that all parallel fifths and octaves be avoided that he provides two full pages of examples in order to clearly illustrate both good and bad realizations involving these intervals.⁴² Miller and Kollmann also make blanket statements that contrary motion between the hands is always preferred and parallel motion should be avoided.⁴³

In addition to the common thread of avoiding parallel octaves, the treatise writers also agree on another aspect of moving from one chord to another. That is, the accompanist should always try to keep common tones the same from chord to chord. Leaps should also be kept to a minimum. Daube insists that most incorrect passages occur

³⁹Arnold, *The Art of Accompaniment*, 484.

⁴⁰David A. Sheldon, *Marpurg's thoroughbass and composition handbook: a narrative translation and critical study* (Stuyvesant, NY: Pendragon Press, 1989), 20.

⁴¹Löhlein (Wilson's translation), 241.

⁴²Jackson, 21-22.

⁴³Miller, 6 and Kollmann, 11.

because the right hand is moving about too much.⁴⁴ The French authors call for “*la main posée*,” urging their readers to keep the right hand as still and steady as possible as they move from chord to chord. Pasquali offers very specific suggestions to help the reader know clearly what is appropriate:

In order then to prevent skipping too much with the chords, care must be had, in the progression of a performance, to have always three bass-notes in view, viz. The one that was last played, the one that we are going to play, and the one that is to follow; and to manage the one we are going to play in such a manner, that the highest note of the chord that went before it, nor of the one that is to come after; but every chord be, as it were, a kind of step to the following one. N. B. Two chords are said to be distant, when the highest note of the one is four notes higher or lower than the highest note of the other.⁴⁵

The one time that C. P. E. Bach does recommend a skip in the right hand is if the two hands come too close to one another. In this case it is appropriate to shift the right hand chord to a higher register by repeating it in inversion over a single bass note.⁴⁶ In general, however, it is best to make sure that the hands stay close together. Marpurg says that there should never be too great a “vacuum” between voice parts.⁴⁷ Löhlein is even more specific:

The limits of the right hand are determined by the bass. If there are low bass notes, than the right hand is supposed to accompany in a lower range than when the bass notes are high. Thus the position of the right hand must be set so that there is neither too much, nor is there too little room between both hands. One determines

⁴⁴Daube, 23.

⁴⁵Pasquali, 14.

⁴⁶Bach, *Essay*, 378.

⁴⁷Marpurg, 255-6. Although he says if one had to choose it would be better to take the gap between the tenor and the bass and keep the upper voices in close position since this goes along with acoustical principles found in nature

the intervals with both hands, approximately two and one-half octaves in the outermost voices: however if the bass is close to the one-line octave, then limit yourself to one and one-half octaves."⁴⁸

Unfigured Bass

Many treatise authors lament the fact that composers are becoming inconsistent in figuring their basses, which are often incomplete or riddled with mistakes. C. P. E. Bach, in particular says that it is unjust to expect accompanists to learn both figured and unfigured basses as it takes too much needless effort and leaves too much possibility for errors.⁴⁹ Boutmy also strongly opposes the use of unfigured basses since it precipitates confusion among students and amateurs.⁵⁰ Some are so concerned about the lack of skill in properly figuring basses that they spend large portions of their treatises on that topic alone.⁵¹ However, despite their dismay at the lack of proper figuring, the authors acknowledge the fact that the use of unfigured basses was increasing and accompanists needed to know how to play them.

Löhlein's treatise, which is particularly relevant since it was published late in the eighteenth century (1781) and focuses especially on teaching the amateur musician who

⁴⁸Löhlein (Wilson's translation), 218.

⁴⁹Bach, *Essay*, 410.

⁵⁰Boutmy, 28.

⁵¹This is the focus of J. X. Nauss' *Gründlicher Unterricht den General-Bass recht zu erlernen* (Augsburg: Lotter, 1769). Joseph Fricke, *A Treatise on Thoroughbass* (London, 1786) writes in his preface that he wrote the treatise "in order to shew [*sic*] a plain and accurate method for accompanying; and to propose a clear System for figuring."

wanted to play contemporary music in the galant style, spends a large portion of the second volume of his *Klavierschule* on the realization of unfigured basses. Dora Wilson's analysis of Löhlein's comments says the popularity of unfigured bass arose because it represents a more flexible approach, which is so important in the free galant style. She writes

Certainly the lack of precision inherent in the practice caused many theorists to disregard unfigured bass. The whole concept of unfigured bass challenged the domination of the strict rules adhered to by the thoroughbass theorists. In fact, Löhlein's book appeared at the very end of the great thoroughbass period... This revival of interest in unfigured bass may be a further sign of delineation of style. Straightforwardness and simplicity had to yield to considerably more elaboration. This could be accomplished within the realm of unfigured bass.⁵²

With regards to this study, the fact that these kinds of accompaniments were so prevalent lends credence to the possibility that late eighteenth-century Lied composers who wrote out only a soprano and bass line intended for the keyboardist to improvise, even though there were no figures included in the music. Many of the seventeenth-century Baroque continuo Lieder contain no figures, and yet it is certain that the accompanist was expected to add chords.⁵³

The amateur galant style Lied in the late eighteenth century was generally much simpler than its Baroque counterpart, and it would have been very easy for a performer even slightly familiar with continuo accompaniment to add a few chords. Rameau agrees

⁵²Wilson, 693.

⁵³See John Baron's discussion on how to realize the accompaniments of the Baroque continuo Lied in his dissertation "Foreign Influences on the German Secular Solo Continuo Lied of the Mid-Seventeenth Century" (Ph.D. diss., Brandeis University, 1967), 128-143.

with this idea, stating in his *Code de Musique Pratique* that even without much training one can surely accompany simple movements such as musettes and vocal airs since they mainly alternate between tonic and dominant.⁵⁴

The treatises propose several methods for learning to play these unfigured basses. First, however, many authors emphasize that before attempting the accompaniment of bass lines without figures, it is important to be able to play figured basses accurately and comfortably, with the rationale that if one knows the rules one will be more able to intuitively figure out which chord should follow. In fact, in his *Anweisung*, Türk's chapter entitled "On the accompaniment of unfigured basses," is mostly just an expansion on earlier rules about how to play figured basses correctly. Rameau also warns in his chapter on accompanying without figures that it should not even be attempted until one can already accompany perfectly with figures, knows the rules of composition, and has an ear trained well in harmony.⁵⁵

The most popular specific method for learning to play unfigured basses is according to the rule of the octave. In his article for the *New Grove*, Peter Williams describes the rule of the octave as

a term used by certain 18th-century figured bass theorists to refer to a simplified system of harmony in which each note of a diatonic scale (ascending and descending an octave) considered as a bass part can be assumed to have its own chord above.⁵⁶

⁵⁴Rameau, 171-8.

⁵⁵Ibid., 171.

⁵⁶Peter Williams, "Regola dell'ottava" in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd ed.

Other names for this include “the accompaniment of the scale” or “natural accompaniment.” Jousse advises the accompanist to first determine the key and mode of the piece, and then use the rule of the octave to determine the chords for each note in that given key.⁵⁷ Others, such as Boutmy and Jackson, use this same principle of showing which chords correspond with which bass notes but do not actually refer to the rule of the octave explicitly.⁵⁸ A second prescribed method is the system of fundamental bass, which Rameau saw as the generator of harmony. Corrette describes and recommends both methods.⁵⁹ Daube says that his method of learning only three chords, which is similar to the idea of fundamental bass, is infinitely easier than having to learn chords for each note.⁶⁰

One final recommendation is that it is best if the solo line or other parts are in view, since they also can be used as a guide of what chord is expected and appropriate. This is certainly the most straightforward approach and could have easily been applied to the Lied of the period, which always feature the vocal line prominently. Bemetzrieder considered this approach well worth acquiring and wrote in 1771 that

One can accompany very well, without figures, a bass for which one sees the melody. I have even noticed that my pupils are more securely guided by the melody than by ambiguous figures. The melody and bass suffice in order to indicate the chain of modulations, the harmonies and chords, and nothing more is necessary. Taste does the rest, and taste comes with time.⁶¹

⁵⁷Jousse, 53. Cf. La Porte, 6-7; Fricke, 74; Kollmann.

⁵⁸Boutmy, 26-27 and Jackson, 27-39.

⁵⁹Corrette, *Le Maître*, 81.

⁶⁰Manfredini, 63; Daube, 212-13.

⁶¹Bemetzrieder, 312.

Ornamentation and Filled-In Accompaniments

Daube describes three basic kinds of accompaniments that one needs to know to practice thoroughbass completely. First, the “simple” or “common” accompaniment with only clear chords and no ornamentation or arpeggiation. The second type is the “natural,” which is only slightly different than the first, and follows the character of the piece more closely and might involve arpeggiation or full-voiced accompaniment. The final method of playing is the “artificial” or “complex” style of accompaniment which should be used in pieces with a small number of performers. This more complex style of accompaniment might use imitations of the vocal part, counter-melodies, embellishments, suspensions, or changes to the bass line.⁶²

Other treatise authors describe the process of adding embellishments and arpeggiations to simple, chordal accompaniments as a way to add taste and refinement to a performance. However, most authors also agree that more complex accompaniments should be avoided by beginners since “more Skill and Judgement is required than what falls to the share of the generality of Thoroughbass Players.”⁶³ Manfredini says that harmony should be kept simple and unadorned, and Daube also insists that accompaniment is especially beautiful when played simply without ornamentation or arpeggiation.⁶⁴ Türk

⁶²Daube, 195.

⁶³Heck, *The Art of Playing Thoroughbass*, 93. Therefore, many authors of the period avoid the topic of “refinements” and “niceties” altogether because their audience was mostly beginners who only had the patience to learn simple chordal accompaniments.

⁶⁴Daube, 197.

agrees that the simplest, most unadorned accompaniments are best for beginners and that ornaments should be added only by masters.⁶⁵ Löhlein, adds that once a beginner is proficient in simple accompaniments, he may add ornaments to produce more artistic and tasteful accompaniments.⁶⁶ Both Türk and Löhlein refer their readers to C. P. E. Bach and Quantz for more information on the refinements of accompaniment.

If the accompanist does add embellishment, it should generally only be done when the soloist is resting or holding a long note since it is at these times that the accompanist has more freedom and will not get in the way of the solo line. When the singer has an ornament, however, the accompanist should generally modify his part so as not to clash with the soloist's line. For example, Quantz writes that when the soloist is playing an appoggiatura, the accompanist should leave out the conflicting note in the chord until the dissonance is resolved.⁶⁷ Bach is even more specific, writing that appoggiaturas are some of the most outstanding refinements and require "a delicate accompaniment which aims to bring the appoggiatura into relief rather than to obscure or destroy it."⁶⁸ He goes on to use over twenty pages to demonstrate how that can be done. Heck's solution is that these sections be accompanied sparingly by only two notes in the right hand rather than the usual three, and Löhlein goes even further saying that if in doubt it is better to *tasto solo*,

⁶⁵Türk, *Anweisung*, 337.

⁶⁶Löhlein (Wilson's translation), 217.

⁶⁷Quantz, 232.

⁶⁸Bach, *Essay*, 322.

or only play the bass line without chords, until one can accompany again without disturbing the melody.⁶⁹

In addition to ornamentation, the treatise authors describe other ways to fill in the accompaniment by adding independent melodic interest, including imitations of the vocal line, improvising counter-melodies, and filling in intervals with passing tones. Many of the same rules given for adding embellishments also apply here. In order for the accompanying part to remain generally subordinate to the solo line the majority of melodic additions must be used in moderation, must not obscure the melody or the harmony, and must be used mainly when the soloist is resting or on a long note.⁷⁰

One final way to add variety and refinement to an accompaniment is by breaking or arpeggiating the notes of the chords rather than playing them simultaneously. C. P. E. Bach advocates using these broken chords in either one or both hands in order to provide variety of texture or to change the dynamic level.⁷¹ Heck also demonstrates two-handed arpeggiation and says that the lowest note of Alberti bass patterns can be held.⁷² Kollmann (1807) suggests using arpeggiated chords to prolong the harmony against a long note and describes several ways to do it, as shown in the following example.⁷³

⁶⁹Heck, *The Art of Playing Thoroughbass*, 92 and Löhlein (Wilson's translation), 54.

⁷⁰See for example Bach and Quantz, 234-5.

⁷¹Bach, *Essay*, 396; Bemetzrieder also attests to using broken chords in either or both hands, 93, 112.

⁷²Heck, *The Art of Playing Thoroughbass*, 89.

⁷³Kollmann, 29.

Example 6. Kollmann, *Practical Guide to Thoroughbass*, p. 29



Like Kollmann, Türk enumerates a number of ways to arpeggiate chords and stresses the importance of variety for the sake of expression. He writes that

Sometimes one begins with the lower notes, at other times with the higher ones; now the intervals will be sounded extremely rapidly one after another, now only moderately fast; sometimes one arpeggiates the chord so that each note is played only once, at other times the notes are played more often, etc.⁷⁴

Geminiani views the broken chords as a kind of diminution that is “useful to add motion” and keep the sound lasting.⁷⁵ He reiterates the importance of being able to play accompaniments in multiple styles for the sake of variety, but also emphasizes once again that the accompanist ought to remain humble when he writes that

A good Accompanyer [*sic*] ought to possess the Faculty of playing all sorts of Basses, in different Manners; so as to be able, on proper Occasions, to enliven the Composition, and delight the Singer or Player. But he is to exercise this Faculty with Judgment, Taste and Discretion, agreeable to the Style of the Composition, and the Manner and Intention of the Performer. If an Accompanyer thinks of nothing else but the satisfying his own Whim and Caprice, he may perhaps be said to play well, but will certainly be said to accompany ill.⁷⁶

⁷⁴Türk, *Von dem wichtigsten*, 165. Türk also stresses that arpeggiation should not be used too frequently on the organ as it can have a bad effect.

⁷⁵Geminiani, see part II.

⁷⁶Geminiani, part II, 1.

Relationship to the Solo Line

Further detail is needed on how the accompaniment is to relate to the solo part since it is one of the most important issues for this study. As seen above, many authors speak in general about the attitude of the accompanist toward the soloist. C. P. E. Bach makes it clear that the accompanist has a huge responsibility for the success of the performance. He must always be prepared, able to harmonize all the figures quickly and correctly, serve as the “guardian of the beat” and “catch in his accompaniment all the nuances of the principal part,” and yet he never receives as much applause as the soloist.⁷⁷ As mentioned above, the accompanist should generally stay out of the way of the solo part, adding fragments of independent melodic interest only when the soloist is holding a long note. It is important, then, that the accompanist possess a certain humility and make decisions based on what will make the soloist look best. Everything he plays should serve to enhance the solo part, never detract from it. Löhlein writes

I have noticed that many accompanists are conceited and want to be more prominent when playing with someone...[this attitude] is quite inappropriate...The accompanist must be a captain as well as a musician, and if he is awkward and incompetent, he causes more harm than if he were not there at all.⁷⁸

As has already been mentioned the treatises also contain numerous general comments about changing the texture or number of voices in the accompaniment depending on the number and type of instruments. C. P. E. Bach also mentions that it may be necessary to change the range of the accompaniment depending on the range of the

⁷⁷Bach, *Essay*, 367. Despite the fact that many of the treatises are aimed at women, the authors generally refer to the pupil as “he”, as Bach does here.

⁷⁸Löhlein (Wilson’s translation), 464.

instrument. For example, if a soloist is playing in a low register, he cautions the accompanist not to play in a higher register than the solo part.⁷⁹ On the whole Türk agrees with Bach, but insists that exceptions will have to be made for the lowest instruments, such as bassoon, cello, and the bass voice. In these cases he allows for the accompaniment part to be a whole octave higher than the soloist.⁸⁰

Few authors write much else about how the accompaniment part should relate to the solo line. Even fewer write specifically about accompanying the voice, which is what is most relevant here. One of the relevant issues is whether or not the accompanist should double the solo line. In one of the classic modern studies on continuo accompaniment, F. T. Arnold writes about the subject, saying that

In a general way, two main rules may be said to have found acceptance in the eighteenth century: 1) The upper part of the accompaniment should avoid playing *continuously* in unison with the principal vocal or instrumental part. 2) It should keep *below* rather than above it.⁸¹

C. P. E. Bach confirms this, stating that it is poor to constantly duplicate the melody of the principal part, except at the beginning of pieces in a quick tempo in order to ensure both players adjust to the same tempo.⁸² Löhlein also says that going beyond the upper voice should only be done reluctantly, especially in simple phrases.⁸³ Corfe is even more direct,

⁷⁹Bach, *Essay*, 377.

⁸⁰Türk, *Anweisung*, 331.

⁸¹Arnold, 364.

⁸²Bach, *Essay*, 377.

⁸³Löhlein (Wilson's translation), 493; Quantz, 234; Heck, *The Art of Playing Thoroughbass*, 91; and Petri, 59 also reiterate these ideas.

Furthermore, his example shows the upper note of the right hand part doubling the melody line throughout with a second voice generally playing a third below. Fricke describes this arrangement as the “proper situation” since “If the upper part of the Accompaniment...were inverted or played an Octave lower (as it is marked by small points) it would produce nothing but octaves with that melody, when performed by a Soprano Voice.” This is especially significant since Fricke’s example looks remarkably similar to many of the German Lied accompaniments being written during this same period.

Daube does not generally recommend doubling the vocal line, but he does suggest proceeding in thirds or sixths with the vocal line to improve the accompaniment, which could be seen as a kind of doubling or imitation. He also says that when the vocal line has very difficult passages or intervals, one can double the line softly, according to the singer’s abilities.⁸⁶ Pasquali agrees that chords should never be taken too much above or too much below the notes of the voice, but when accompanying a solo song he actually recommends that “the highest note of the chord should be that which the voice sings.” Not only that, but because doubling the melody is a high priority other liberties are allowed:

For this reason the chords may be taken in any of their different ways, and in any part of the instrument. And, provided the voice may be closely pursued, a skip now and then is permitted.⁸⁷

Edward Miller, who deals only with vocal music in his *Elements of Thoroughbass and Composition*, repeatedly recommends that the highest, or “little finger note” of the

⁸⁶Daube, 202-3.

⁸⁷Pasquali, 46.

right-hand chord double the melody of the air being sung. He contends that this is especially important for beginning accompanists, as well as beginning singers, who might need some help finding their pitch. As one advances it is also possible to omit the doubling, but play in thirds or sixths below the vocal line. In one question and answer segment, the pupil asks

“Am I always to take the Voice Part as the highest Note of the Chord, with the little finger of the right hand? Yes: As such songs are here chosen where it will answer to do so; but this is not the case with all Songs; frequently it has a better effect for the Accompaniment to be Thirds &c. lower than the Voice; and often an Octave lower has a good effect. No certain rules can be given; but when you are Master of what Chords are proper, Observation and Taste will supply the rest.”⁸⁸

Augustus Kollmann, agreed that in instrumental music chords should not come above the obbligato part, but for vocal music he recommends something different:

The thoroughbass accompaniment of an air, or of any solo treble...can be rendered most correct in those places, where the highest part of the chords goes in unison with the principal notes of that part or melody.⁸⁹

At the end of his treatise J. Jousse includes separate sections with pointers on accompanying vocal music, instrumental music, and recitative. His first three points regarding vocal accompanying also confirm that it was often appropriate and necessary to double the voice part in the accompaniment:

- 1) The Accompanist must be in every respect subservient to the voice, support it when it gets weak, and bring it to the true intonation when it deviates from it; to effect this he should have continually under his hand the principal note of the Melody, to strike it when necessary.
- 2) The chords must not be taken much above or below the notes of the voice, and when it can be easily effected, the highest note of the chord should be the note

⁸⁸Miller, 29.

⁸⁹Kollmann, 41.

which the voice sings.

3) When a difficult interval occurs, the Accompanist must prepare the Singer to it, by placing that interval at the top of the chord, and striking the chord a little before its time.⁹⁰

Regarding instrumental music, however, he writes

In accompanying [an Instrumental] Solo, the Accompanist must nearly follow the Rules given for the accompaniment of Songs; however the highest notes of the Chords need not be the same as those played by the Instrument, except at the beginning of the piece, when it is done for the sake of more regularity in point of time between the performers; he should not also exceed the compass of the Solo parts, except where it cannot be avoided.⁹¹

The other author who briefly deals with doubling the vocal line is Corrette in his *Prototype*, who remarks that the right hand playing along with the melody part is specifically a feature of Italian ariettas.⁹² He describes this style of accompanying writing that

Most Italian women singers accompany themselves on the harpsichord when singing in concert. Their manner of accompanying ariettas is very pleasing, not smothering the voice with an abundance of chords, playing them only in moving passages or in situations where the expression of text demands majesty and strength, and striking chords in strict time in instrumental sections. With regard to pretty passages of figured melody, they most often play the same vocal line on the harpsichord with the right hand.⁹³

⁹⁰Jousse, 50.

⁹¹Ibid. This sounds like an echo of C. P. E. Bach's comments about not doubling the solo part. Perhaps C. P. E. Bach was also referring mainly to instrumental music.

⁹²Corrette, *Prototype*, 15.

⁹³“La plus part des Cantatrices Italiennes s’accompag[en]t avec le Clavecin en chantant dans un Concert, leur façon d’accompagner les Ariettes est très agréable n’étouffant pas la voix par une multitude d’accords...n’en faisant gueres que dans les endroits pathétiques ou dans les occasions ou l’expression des paroles demandent de la majesté et de la force, et frappent les accords bien de mesure pendant la Simphonie...à l’égard des jolis passages de chant figurés [*sic*], elles jouent le plus souvent la même partie

In his *Lettre sur la musique française*, Jean-Jacques Rousseau also praises this particular style of accompaniment, and identifies it as a pleasing feature of Italian music. He considers “unity of melody” to be an “indispensable rule” and writes that

It is in this great rule that one must seek the cause of the frequent accompaniments in unison which are observed in Italian music and which, reinforcing the idea of the melody, at the same time render its notes more soft and mellow and less tiring for the voice. These unisons are not practicable in our [French] music, unless it be in some types of airs chosen for the purpose and adapted to it.⁹⁴

While Corrette and Rousseau specifically associate the doubling of the vocal line in the keyboard part with Italian music, the other treatises above offering similar suggestions are all published in England, although one is written by an Italian, and two by Germans who were living there. Moreover, Mattei, an Italian author, writes that the right hand should take care to have an interesting melody of its own, but should not contain the solo part.⁹⁵ All these treatises, however, do seem to point to the doubling of the solo line for singers, rather than instrumentalists, and especially for beginning musicians. This helps the beginning thoroughbass accompanist because there is one less part for him to think about and come up with on his own. It also helps the beginning singer, who may not be as confident of his or her pitches.

Special instructions exist for accompanying chorales and recitatives. In his discussion of the chorale, Türk says that it is perfectly appropriate, and in fact necessary,

du chant sur le Clavecin de la main droite.” Translated by Rowley, 466.

⁹⁴From Leo Treitler, ed., *Strunk's Source Readings in Music History*, revised ed. (New York: W. W. Norton, 1998), 901.

⁹⁵Stanislao Mattei, *Pratica d'accompagnamento sopra bassi numerati* (Bologna: Editore, 1788), 7.

for the accompanist to play along with the melody in order to keep the congregational singers in tune.⁹⁶ Every author who discusses how to accompany recitative, agrees that it is useful and wise to give the singer his or her pitch by discreetly including it in the top of an arpeggiated chord.⁹⁷ If it is an especially difficult passage the note can even be anticipated by playing the chord a slight bit ahead of the beat.⁹⁸

Summary

This chapter shows that the continuo tradition had not died away in the second half of the eighteenth century, since there were still a large number of treatises on the subject written into the nineteenth century.⁹⁹ Of particular interest to this study is the fact that so many of these treatises were aimed at beginners and amateurs, and were intended for practical application, rather than merely providing lessons on harmony or composition.

With only a few exceptions, there is a surprising amount of agreement on the basic principles of continuo accompaniment, regardless of the authors' nationality or time frame, and the concepts can be easily summarized. Most continuo treatises in the second half of the eighteenth century and the early part of the nineteenth century were written for beginning musicians, often amateurs, and were intended for practical application.

⁹⁶Türk, *Von den wichtigsten*, 1-7.

⁹⁷Cf. Bach, *Essay*, 424 and Löhlein (Wilson's translation), 562-3.

⁹⁸See especially Quantz, 238 and Türk, *Anweisung*, 338-9.

⁹⁹Zapulla lists 39 treatises from the first half of the eighteenth century and 69 from after 1750.

Typically, it is recommended that the accompaniment part contain four notes, one note in the left hand bass part, with a three-note chord in the right. Occasionally the notes can be shared between the hands in playing chorales, to produce a louder sound, or to provide variety. When moving from chord to chord, it is best to keep common notes the same in order to avoid awkward leaps. Furthermore, both hands should stay close together, and should preferably move in contrary motion in order to avoid the forbidden parallel fifths and octaves.

The use of unfigured basses was a common trend in the second half of the eighteenth century, and while most treatise authors did not approve of the practice, they demonstrate how to accompany these bass lines using the rule of the octave and principles of fundamental bass. Another issue is how much embellishment should be allowed in the accompaniment part. The authors agree that simple accompaniments are best for beginners, since they have not yet developed the necessary discernment to add tasteful additions. However, masters such as C. P. E. Bach may use ornamentation to provide variety and refinement to their accompaniments. The general principle is that the accompaniment should always remain subordinate to the solo line, which in application means that the accompanist should always adapt to the soloists range, texture, and ornamentations.

One specific issue, whether or not to double the solo line, is of particular importance. In general, authors are opposed to the idea, preferring instead that the top voice of the accompanist part remain below that of the soloist. However, several treatises that deal specifically with accompanying songs discuss the possibility and even necessity of

doubling the melody in order to help beginning singers. Accompaniment of chorales and recitatives also require the occasional doubling of the vocal line.

In addition to the basic principles, also significant is the discussion in several of the treatises of matters of good taste in the galant style. Particularly relevant are Quantz, C. P. E. Bach, Löhlein, and Türk, all German authors who admit that contemporary styles are not always bound to rules and require more flexible treatment. For one thing, this shows that these treatises were dealing with more contemporary music, rather than merely reiterating how to play in older styles.¹⁰⁰ Furthermore, it allows for some flexibility in analyzing the Lieder of the period that do not completely fit the prescribed conventions.

Finally, it is significant that several of the authors of continuo treatises during this period, were also some of the most important Lied composers, particularly Quantz, Marpurg, C. P. E. Bach, and Kirnberger. Furthermore, there is evidence that their works were studied by other Lied composers such as J. A. P. Schulz, Haydn, and Beethoven. Now that a foundation has been laid based on the basic principles set forth in the continuo treatises, the next chapters will explore how this information can be found and applied in the Lied accompaniments themselves.

¹⁰⁰Heck and Corfe also use examples from contemporary composers, such as Haydn and Mozart, to illustrate their principles.

CHAPTER IV

**CONTINUO PRACTICE AND THE COMPOSITION
OF LIED ACCOMPANIMENTS IN THE LATE EIGHTEENTH CENTURY**

There is no question that figured bass was still an important aspect of composition in the late eighteenth-century.¹ Figured bass was an important part of every composer's musical training and composition study, as it still is today. By the second half of the eighteenth century, Lied composers were moving away from requiring keyboard players to improvise an entire song accompaniment from only a bass line. However, as composers began writing out more complete accompaniment parts during this transitional period, ties to the earlier tradition of improvised accompaniments still remained. As late as 1804,² some composers even continued to use actual figured bass numerals beneath the bass line of their fully realized keyboard parts. Even without the figures, however, there are other elements that make the accompaniments look like written-out versions of something that would have been improvised only a few decades earlier. In particular, many of these written-out Lied accompaniments reflect ideas put forth by the authors of

¹See Joel Lester, *Compositional Theory in the Eighteenth Century* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1992) for a thorough discussion on how figured bass and composition were intimately connected throughout the eighteenth century.

²The latest collection found for this study that uses figured bass signatures is Swiss composer Niklaus Käsermann's *Geistliche Oden und Lieder* from 1804.

continuo treatises about proper hand position, the ideal number of parts and their distribution, and how the continuo accompaniment should relate to the solo line.

This chapter will explore these influences by region, using the information gleaned from the continuo treatises to point out evidence of each of these topics in the written-out music. It will be shown that Lied composers in each of these German-speaking regions did indeed draw on principles of continuo accompaniment throughout the second half of the eighteenth century as they conceived their keyboard parts.

Figured Bass Accompaniments

Despite the overall decline in using figured bass accompaniments, a surprising number of composers continued to employ figured bass symbols under the bass lines of their published Lieder throughout the entire second half of the eighteenth century. While the Lieder that contain these figures are definitely in the minority, at least twenty different composers used them in published collections.³ Some, like Carl Friedrich Zelter, used them in only a few songs, while Kirnberger used them in nearly all of his Lied compositions through the 1780s. Also, examples of published Lieder with figured basses can be found in every decade of the eighteenth century into the first decade of the nineteenth century. Therefore, even though bass lines still using figures are in the minority,

³These composers, listed in alphabetical order, include Johann Friedrich Agricola, Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach, Georg Benda, Johann Heinrich Egli, Johann Valentin Görner, Carl Heinrich Graun, Johann Philipp Kirnberger, J. A. Hiller, Niklaus Käsermann, Adolph Carl Kunzen, Christian Gottfried Krause, Christian Gottlob Neefe, Johann Joachim Quantz, Johann Friedrich Reichardt, Johannes Schmidlin, Christian Daniel Friedrich Schubart, Johann Anton Sulzer, Johann Jakob Walder, Carl Friedrich Zelter, and Johann Rudolph Zumsteeg.

there are enough of them that they merit further study. Furthermore, the fact that figured bass accompaniments were still part of some composers' consciousness suggests that they wrote with a similar process in mind for Lieder that are unfigured but otherwise look the same on the page with similar texture and spacing.

Continuo-Lied Style Songs

There are four different types of songs that use written-in figured basses in their accompaniments: 1) songs in a continuo-Lied style with a single melody and bass line; 2) dramatic songs in the style of a ballad; 3) songs that include both a fully-realized accompaniment and figures; and 4) Swiss part songs. In Germany, the most common are of the first type: songs with a very simple, two-part texture. Examples of this type are found frequently in collections of Berlin-school composers of the 1750s and 1760s, such as the first collection of the *Musikalisches Allerley von verschiedenen Tonkünstlern*, published in Berlin in 1761 by Friedrich Wilhelm Birstiel, and the numerous collections of *Lieder der Deutschen mit Musik* compiled by Ramler starting in 1767. For example, the following song by Agricola employs this type of texture throughout.⁴

⁴Other examples from the *Musikalisches Allerley* that use a similar texture with figured bass are "Wie Wunderlich" by Kirnberger and the duet "Wenn ich zu dir" by C. P. E. Bach.

Example 8. Agricola, "Das Erdbeben," from *Musikalisches Allerley*, (Berlin, Feb. 1761)

Verdrossen.

Bru - der, Bru - der, hal - te mich! War - um kann ich denn nicht
sehen? War - um kannst du denn nicht sehen? Bru - der, geh, ich
füh - re dich.

The song is strophic with short strophes of only sixteen measures. Figures are used under the bass line throughout the entire song. This type of texture is not limited to the First Berlin school, however. Composers later in the century also used this same texture along with figures, including several songs in Georg Benda's *Sammlung Vermischter Clavier und Gesangstücke* (1787), illustrated below, and Zelter's "Wir gingen beide Hand in Hand," which was printed in Schiller's *Musenalmanach* from 1797.

Example 9. Georg Benda, "Philint Stand," m. 1-7 from *Sammlung Vermischter Clavier und Gesangstücke* (Leipzig: Schwickert, 1780)

Munter.

Philint stand jünger vor Da wird Thör, und Kopf und rief: Oh Sie, man sieht ich bin Philint! Sagt mich blaue ein - se ton, und

On the page, these two-part songs look very much like the Baroque continuo Lied, in which only the melody and the bass line were given and the keyboard player had to improvise the accompaniment from the notated figures. It seems likely that this is also the meaning of the figures in this type of song, and that the composer intended for the performer to fill in the harmonies accordingly. Simple strophic songs with this same two-part texture appear again and again in the *Lieder* of the second half of the eighteenth century, particularly those of the Berlin schools, but usually without figures. The possibility that these unfigured accompaniments might also have been filled in will be explored more in Chapter Six.

Dramatic Songs

The second type of songs using figured basses are those written in a more dramatic style as a form of recitative accompaniment. C. D. F. Schubart uses figured basses in two of his songs, "Der Riese und der Zwerg" and "Die Henne," which are both telling stories. Unlike the songs discussed above, Schubart does not use figures continuously throughout his songs. Some sections have fully written-out accompaniments with quite a bit of activity in the bass. As the following example shows, "Der Riese und der Zwerg" begins with a

short keyboard introduction, and then a written-out accompaniment in octaves doubling the vocal line as the narrator begins the tale about a giant who encounters a dwarf.

Example 10. Schubert, "Der Riese und der Zwerg," m. 1-24 from *Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubert Sämtliche Lieder*, Denkmäler der Musik Baden-Wrttemberg, no. 8 (Munich: Strube, 2000)

Maestoso

Einstraf auf sei-nem

Gan-ge ein Ries ein Zwerg-lein an und sprach: ich such-te lan-ge so

was so was für mei-nen Zahn.

Er fieng den Zwerg so leich-te, als wär's ein klei-nes

Thier, der Zwerg schrie, daß er keuch-te: Was wilst du denn von mir?

Adagio

As soon as the giant begins to speak in measure nine the figures appear under the bass line. When the giant finishes speaking the more active accompaniment resumes until measure twenty-two. Now it is the dwarf's turn to speak, and the figures resume. It appears that Schubart views these "speaking" sections as a kind of recitative. Therefore, by providing a change of style with a more flexible accompaniment, the singer also has more freedom to deliver the text in a dramatic, speech-like way.

Schubart's intention is even clearer in "Die Henne" where he actually labels one section "Recitativ" Although there may be opportunities earlier in the song for the accompanist to fill in chords,⁵ specific figures do not actually begin until the sections in recitative style. The Lied opens with a more melodic, narrative setting of the text, as the singer describes the industrious hen, but when the dialogue between the hen and an old turkey begins in measure twenty-two, the style changes to recitative, as can be seen in the following example.

⁵In fact, the edited version of "Die Henne" in Hans Joachim Moser's anthology *The German Solo Song and the Ballad* (Köln: Arno Volk Verlag, 1958) does contain harmonies added to many other passages as well.

Example 11. Schubart, "Die Henne," m. 16-23 from *Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart Sämtliche Lieder, Denkmäler der Musik Baden-Württemberg, no. 8* (Munich: Strube, 2000)

Stal der Fait vom Den - - ken mach-te, ward bös da-rob, und Knal und Fal trat

Recitat:

er zur Henn' und sag - te: Das Schrei'n Frau Nachbarin war eben nicht von nöthen, und

8 3 5

The voice part changes to include many repeated notes in a speech-like style, while the accompaniment changes to long notes in the bass with figures written underneath. When the dialogue between the hen and her neighbor is complete, the original tempo and style return at measure thirty-three. Surely Schubart intended for the keyboard player to improvise a continuo-style accompaniment for this *recitativo* section. It would be unnecessary and inappropriate to play what is written on the page and double every note of the singer. It would be much more logical to fill out the chords to provide harmonic support, while still giving the singer flexibility to declaim the text.

Another song in this dramatic style that incorporates a recitative section is "Hermann und Thusnelda" from Christian Gottlob Neefe's collection of Klopstock's odes published in 1776. Instead of a through-composed dramatic Lied like Schubart's, Neefe's Lied is strophic, except for one stanza written in recitative style. The first five stanzas feature the character of Thusnelda enthusiastically welcoming her lover Hermann back

from battle and enticing him with words of love. The tempo is marked *heldenmässig*, and Thusnelda's melody is triumphant and rhythmic, but features a clear melody, and a full accompaniment.

Example 12. Neefe, "Hermann und Thusnelda," m. 1-7 from *Oden von Klopstock mit Melodien* (Flensburg and Leipzig: Kortenschen Buchhandlung, 1776)

Heldenmässig.

Krieger! he! dort kommt er mit Schwert, mit Mord, mit Mord, mit dem Schwerte beschlechte dich! So schenke mir Dein Mann

Neefe changes the musical style at the sixth strophe, however, where Hermann speaks. This stanza is marked "Recit." and instead of a full chordal accompaniment, there is only a vocal line with a figured bass.

Example 13. Neefe, "Hermann und Thusnelda," m. 10-12 from *Oden von Klopstock mit Melodien* (Flensburg and Leipzig: Kortenschen Buchhandlung, 1776)

(Zur sechsten Strophe.)

Hermann. War: um loestst du mein Gant? liegt nicht der stumme to: de Ba: ter vor

Recit.

While Schubart used recitative-style to distinguish dialogue from narrative, Neefe uses the change in style to distinguish between characters and emotions. The Klopstock poem that Neefe is setting consists entirely of dialogue, so the two musical styles are particularly helpful to differentiate the characters, especially if one person is performing the piece. Secondly, the change in musical style reflects the different emotions of the characters. While Thusnelda feels triumphant and full of passionate desire, appropriately portrayed in the fanfare-like opening, Hermann is full of grief and responds to her triumph with uncertain questions, distinguished by the change in musical style and accompaniment.⁶

Fully-Realized Songs

The final two song types that use figured basses are found in Switzerland. As discussed in Chapter Two, a large proportion of Swiss Lied compositions have figures written under the bass lines of the accompaniments, whether they be solo or part songs. Some of the Lieder are similar to the continuo-Lied style with a single melody line and a figured bass. However, unlike the German songs that rely on the performer to fill out the chords, a number of these Swiss songs actually supply a full chordal realization of the accompaniment part in addition to the figures. The accompaniment part sometimes

⁶For other good examples of this type of dramatic song see Kirnberger's *Abschied von den Helden*, one of the musical examples in his treatise *Anleitung zur Singekomposition* (1782), "Der Greis" in Johann Friedrich Wilhelm Wenkel's second collection of *Fortsetzung der Clavierstücke für Frauenzimmer* (1771), Georg Benda's "Mein Thyrsis" and "Schon ist geliebter," from his *Sammlung vermischter Klavier und Gesangstücke* (1780-87) and F. W. Rust "Wie Regenschauer" from his *Oden und Lieder* (1796).

doubles the voice part, but often does not. Instead, the accompaniment provides harmonic support in the style of a traditional four-part continuo accompaniment while the voice part carries the melody above. The following example from *Fünfzig weltliche Lieder* (1778) demonstrates all of these things: the independent vocal line, the supporting accompaniment, which uses the most common hand position for continuo playing, and the figures underneath the bass line.

Example 14. "Hanne," m. 5-8 from *Fünfzig weltliche Lieder* (Zürich, 1778)

O ich lieb ihn gar zu sehr; Dann was fehlt dem Man - ne?

It is not clear exactly why it would be necessary for a composer to include the figures when the part is fully realized and written out. Perhaps because the solo Lied in Switzerland developed so late and so slowly the figures were retained longer. Furthermore, when it came to music, the Swiss were eager to maintain traditions.⁷ Albert Nef, in the only full-length work devoted to the Swiss Lied, points out that the figuring is

⁷See the section on "The Late Eighteenth-Century Lied in Switzerland" in Chapter Two.

frequently approximate and even inaccurate.⁸ This can also be seen in the musical example above. The figure on the downbeat of the seventh measure is written as a seven, however the harmonized chord is a six. This suggests that the figures could have been included as a matter of tradition, rather than for practical use. Another possibility is that the figures were used by more experienced players while amateurs with less experience used the written-out realization. Whatever the reason behind their inclusion, the Swiss continued to use written-out figured bass signatures in a large number of their songs into the early part of the nineteenth century.⁹

Part Songs

Finally, the last type of song to use figured bass accompaniments also involves the Swiss composers. Chapter Two discussed the long-lasting popularity of the part song in Switzerland well into the nineteenth century. As the solo Lied grew in popularity, however, Swiss composers found a way to provide singers with multiple options in one volume. The following example, from Niklaus Käsermann's *Geistliche Oden und Lieder von C. F. Gellert* (1804), shows two different options.

Each voice part, along with a basso continuo part, is given separately in the kind of choir book format that had been popular in Switzerland since the Reformation with the top voice and figured bass on the left side of the page and remaining voices on the right.

⁸Nef, *Das Lied in der deutschen Schweiz*, 116.

⁹Nef gives examples through 1791. In *German Song and its Poetry*, 40 Smeed also confirms that figured basses persisted in Swiss song into the early part of the nineteenth century.

Example 15. Käsermann, "Bitten," from *Geistliche Oden und Lieder*
 von C. F. Gellert (Bem: Ludwig Rudolf Walther, 1804)

Larghetto.

Gott, deine Güte reicht so weit, So weit die Wolken gehen!
 Du tröbst uns mit Barmherzigkeit, Und eißt, und besorget uns.

Herr meine Burg, mein Fels, mein Hort, Verstum mein Flehn, merk auf mein Wort,

Denn ich will vor dir beten! Denn ich will vor dir beten.

General-Bass.

Ich bitte nicht um Lebenslust,
 Und Schätze dieser Eiden.
 Laß mir, so viel ich haben muß,
 Nach deiner Gnade werden.
 Gib mir nur Reue und Verstand,
 Dich, Gott, und den, den du gesandt,
 Und mich selbst zu erkennen.

Ich bitte nicht um Ehr und Ruhm,
 So sehr sie Menschen rühmen;
 Des guten Namens Eigentum
 Laß mich nur nicht verlieren.
 Mein wahrer Ruhm sey meine Pflicht,
 Der Ruhm vor deinem Angesicht,
 Und frommer Freunde Liebe.

Larghetto. Erste Stimme. 3

Gott, deine Güte reicht so weit, So weit die Wolken gehen!
 Du tröbst uns mit Barmherzigkeit, Und eißt, und besorget uns.

Herr meine Burg, mein Fels, mein Hort, Verstum mein Flehn, merk auf mein Wort,

Denn ich will vor dir beten! Denn ich will vor dir beten.

Larghetto. Zweite Stimme.

Gott, deine Güte reicht so weit, So weit die Wolken gehen!
 Du tröbst uns mit Barmherzigkeit, Und eißt, und besorget uns.

Herr meine Burg, mein Fels, mein Hort, Verstum mein Flehn, merk auf mein Wort,

Denn ich will vor dir beten! Denn ich will vor dir beten.

Larghetto. Bass.

Gott, deine Güte reicht so weit, So weit die Wolken gehen!
 Du tröbst uns mit Barmherzigkeit, Und eißt, und besorget uns.

Herr meine Burg, mein Fels, mein Hort, Verstum mein Flehn, merk auf mein Wort!

Denn ich will vor dir beten, Denn ich will vor dir beten.

So bit ich dich, Herr Jesu Christ,
 Mich nicht um langes Leben.
 Im Stille Demuth, Muth in Noth,
 Das wollest du mir geben.

In deiner Hand steht meine Zeit;
 Laß du mich nur Barmherzigkeit
 Vor dir im Lobe finden.
 # 2

However, Käsermann writes in his foreword to the work that he is well aware that many amateur musicians no longer study figured bass thoroughly. Therefore, he also provides a version of each song for solo voice with a simple, written-out keyboard accompaniment.¹⁰ This leaves the performers with several different performance options depending on the combination they have available or their skill level. While this late example uses sacred texts, there were many Lied collections in this format that used secular or patriotic texts as well.¹¹

Johann Philipp Kirnberger

One composer can be singled out for his extensive use of the figured bass, especially of the first type, in a continuo-lied style. Songs with figured basses can be found in all of Kirnberger's Lied collections but are especially prevalent in his *Oden mit Melodien* from 1773.¹² This is not surprising, since his theoretical treatises, including the

¹⁰Niklaus Käsermann, *Geistliche Oden und Lieder von C. F. Gellert* (Bern: Ludwig Rudolf Walthard, 1804), v. Käsermann expresses concern that amateur musicians are also deficient in their ability to sing from the traditional song clefs. This is another reason that he gives for the necessity of his version for solo voice and keyboard, since it is printed using treble and bass clef only.

¹¹See for example *Schweizerlieder mit Melodien* (1786) and Egli's *Lieder der Weisheit und Tugend* (1790).

¹²His other main collections include, *Lieder mit Melodien* (1762), *Lied nach dem Frieden vom Herrn Claudius* (c1779), and *Gesänge am Clavier* (1780). He also wrote several songs for other compilations, such as the *Musikalisches Allerley*, and included 53 songs as demonstrations in his *Anleitung zur Singekomposition mit Oden*. Some of the songs without figured basses are more filled in and provide good examples of what Kirnberger might have expected a keyboardist to improvise in the continuo-like accompaniments.

Grundsätze des Generalbasses which was discussed in the previous chapter, show his strong ties to earlier traditions through his study with J. S. Bach and his reliance on the figured bass school.

Example 16. Kirnberger, "Ich trachte nicht," m. 1-10 from *Oden mit Melodien* (Danzig: Jobst Hermann Flörcke, 1773)

The image shows a musical score for a song. It consists of two staves. The top staff is the vocal line, and the bottom staff is the figured bass line. The lyrics are written below the vocal line. The music is in 3/4 time and G major. The lyrics are: "Ich trachte nicht nach großer Würde, des Melchamps Glück hege ich nicht. Ein hoher Stand ist meine Bürde, gewährt das Gold, was es verspricht? Solt ich denn..."

Just as his *Grundsätze* treatise was an attempt to combine both theory and practice, the same can be said of his songs, which he considered the practical working out of his theories. As a composition teacher Kirnberger was known for being very thorough and rigid in his devotion to the rules, and this strictness carries over into his own compositions as well.¹³ As a result, Howard Serwer describes Kirnberger's compositions

¹³J. A. P. Schulz writes about his composition lessons with Kirnberger saying "I worked for three years following countless rules...and indeed through his instruction became acquainted with all the skills of strict and polyphonic compositions, and of simple and double counterpoint...This strictness soon became superfluous, for the longer I worked, the more I found all newer music dull and insufferable, and I clung with body and soul only to the older composed music." [*Mit eiserem Fleisse und mit einer gleichen Lust arbeitete ich beinahe 3 ganzer Jahre lang nach unzähligen Vorschriften...und ward durch seinen Unterricht allerdings mit allen Künsten des reinen und vielstimmigen Satzes, und des einfachen und doppelten Contrapunkts bekannt...Diese Strenge ward bald unnütz, denn je länger ich arbeitete, je mehr fand ich alle neuere Musiken schall und unausstehlich und ich hing nur mit Leib und Seele an alter gearbeiteter Musik.*] Schulz *Autobiography*. Quoted and Translated by David Beach, "The Harmonic Theories of Johann Philipp Kirnberger; their Origins and Influences" (Ph.D. diss., Yale University,

as correct, but uninspired.¹⁴ Early twentieth-century Lied historian Max Friedlaender's assessment is even less generous, claiming that there is evidence of a theorist and school master Kirnberger's in Lieder, but not an artist. Even some closer to Kirnberger's own time had harsh words. For example, Schubart wrote in 1806 that

What he has written for song is intolerable, composed with a cold, dead heart, and is therefore without effect.¹⁵

Another result of Kirnberger's concern with correct harmonization and counterpoint is that he shows less care for the text. He includes only the first strophe of each song, which he claims in his preface to the *Oden mit Melodien* is mainly to save space, and requests that his compositions be judged according to this first stanza. The attention he pays to the first stanza, however, is usually a detriment to the other stanzas. Finding one appropriate musical mood that can adequately serve all of the stanzas is always a difficulty with strophic compositions, but Friedlaender complains that Kirnberger is particularly inartistic, principally since his focus on only the first stanza causes Kirnberger to miss the main point of the majority of the poems.¹⁶ Kirnberger's supposed ignorance about the text, as well as his prevailing concern with counterpoint causes Friedlaender to comment that the pieces may be better suited for organ solo than for vocal

1974), 5.

¹⁴Howard Serwer, "Kirnberger [Kernberg], Johann Philipp," in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd ed.

¹⁵"Was er für Gesang geschrieben hat, ist unerträglich, mit todtkaltem Herzen gesetzt, und daher ohne alle Wirkung." Schubart, *Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst*, 84. [Author's Translation]

¹⁶Friedlaender, 171-2.

music.¹⁷ The adherence to rules and the instrumental nature of *Lieder* are frequent criticisms made by Friedlaender. For example, he wrote of Johann Gottfried Mützel's *Auserlesene Oden und Lieder von verschiedenen Dichtern* (1759) that

it appears obvious that a musician who holds forth so pedantically and places such great value on the *rules* of art possesses no originality. The compositions show evidence of an artistically skilled hand, yet they are instrumentally formed and move in the most galant tracks.¹⁸

Friedlaender's criticisms hardly seem fair, however, considering the time period in which Kirnberger's and Mützel's songs were written. For example, C. P. E. Bach, a composer whom Friedlaender frequently praises, was meticulous about rules of composition and accompaniment, and expressly stated that his Gellert songs were written to be used as keyboard pieces in addition to vocal works. In addition, it was not unusual for songs of the period to be published with title pages giving instructions such as *zum Singen oder Spielen*. Furthermore, Kirnberger is not alone in his focus on the first stanza. Goethe, who can hardly be accused of textual ignorance, also said the same thing, leaving the responsibility for providing differentiation between stanzas up to the vocal performer.¹⁹ Nevertheless, it is true that Kirnberger was especially infatuated with rules, and in

¹⁷Ibid., 171.

¹⁸Friedlaender, vol. I, Pt. 1, 158. "Dass aber ein Werth auf Kunstregeln legt, keine Eigenart besitzt, wird begreiflich erscheinen. Die Compositionen lassen eine kunst geübte Hand spüren, doch sind sie ganz instrumental geformt und bewegen sich im galantesten Fahrwasser." Translated by Robert Gordon Campbell in "Johann Gottfried Mützel, 1728-1788" (Ph.D. diss., Indiana University, 1966), 129.

¹⁹Moser, *The German Solo Song and the Ballade*, 6. Campbell, "Zelter," 55-117 offers an extended discussion about Goethe's views on poetry and how it should be expressed in song. See also Kenneth Whitton, *Goethe and Schubert: The Unseen Bond* (Portland, Amadeus Press, 1999).

particular was devoted to the use of figured bass. It is also true that a large number of Kirnberger's Lied compositions do feature a continuo Lied-like texture with a single soprano line and a figured bass line, with the intention that the keyboard player fill in the rest of the chordal accompaniment, providing numerous examples of the basso continuo tradition at least into the 1780s.

In conclusion, nearly all of the songs that utilize figured bass accompaniments are tied to one of two places: either North Germany or Switzerland. The first type, in particular, is centered in Germany, and is especially associated with the Berlin composers. This is not surprising since this is the region where the solo Lied first developed, as well as the area that has the most direct ties to earlier continuo Lieder. In addition, many of the Berlin composers who were writing the songs described above were also the ones who wrote some of the most important treatises on continuo practice in the late eighteenth century, including C. P. E. Bach and Kirnberger. Furthermore, R. Larry Todd insists that *even while continuo practice was waning in other places by the end of the eighteenth century, Berlin remained a bastion of conservatism, retaining a strong thoroughbass tradition until at least 1830.*²⁰

In addition to Berlin, Switzerland is the other main center for Lied compositions using figures under the bass line. As has already been mentioned, Swiss Lied composers were known for being quite conservative in their tastes, and perhaps this is why they retained the figures in their songs for so long. Furthermore, the Swiss composers greatly admired the Berlin Lied composers and imitated their style of composition.

²⁰Todd, *Mendelssohn's Musical Education*, 20.

Schubart was not based in Berlin or Switzerland, but he was vocal about his keen interest in and study of the works of C. P. E. Bach and his father Johann Sebastian Bach.²¹ In particular, he especially admired C. P. E. Bach's song compositions, writing in his *Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst* (1784-5, published in 1806), that Bach

...demonstrated brilliance as a song composer. His cantatas, his chorales, for which he chose Gellert's, Cramer's, and Klopstock's texts, are full of pathos, full of novelty in the course of their melodies, unique in their modulations—in short, true music of the spheres. His diligence is as great as his creative spirit. No genius has ever written as much as he has, and everything—even the most trifling little song or minuet—bears his original stamp.²²

However, the fact that Schubart uses figured bass in recitative-like sections of dramatic Lieder also points to the influence of basso continuo practice in Italian opera that was so prevalent in Southern Germany.

Northern Germany

In addition to the many Lieder that use actual figures in the music, there are other aspects of the late eighteenth-century Lied accompaniments that reflect principles of continuo practice, and it is these traits that will now be examined. It is appropriate to begin this analysis of specific Lieder with the songs of C. P. E. Bach since he was not only a prolific Lied composer and central figure in the First Berlin Lied school, but also the

²¹David Ossenkop, "Schubart, Christian Friedrich Daniel" in *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd ed.

²²Schubart, *Ideen zu einer Ästhetik der Tonkunst*, 180. Quoted and translated by Youngren, *C. P. E. Bach*, 3.

author of one of the most significant eighteenth-century continuo treatises.²³ Aside from individual songs published in joint Berlin school collections, Bach published several volumes of his own Lieder, including *Geistliche Oden und Lieder*, featuring poems by C. F. Gellert in 1757, *Psalmen mit Melodien* with texts by J. A. Cramer in 1774, two volumes of *Geistliche Gesänge mit Melodien* with texts by C. C. Sturm in 1780 and 1781, and the *Neue Lieder-Melodien nebst einer Cantate* of 1789. With the exception of some of the chorales in the *Psalmen mit Melodien*, none of the songs in these collections actually use figured basses written in the score. Instead, as Bach admitted in the preface to his Gellert Lieder, he chose to write out the “necessary harmonies and embellishments” rather than leave them up to the whim of an inexperienced figured bass player. We know from statements like this that Bach had figured bass in mind when he composed the works, and since he wrote them out in full, we have a good example of the kind of continuo accompaniments Bach himself would have wanted to hear.

Texture and Distribution of the Notes Between the Hands

Bach wrote in the second volume of his *Versuch*, published in 1762, that the best opportunity to judge the skill of an accompanist is by his accompaniment of a solo or aria, since “The fewer the parts in a piece, the finer must be its accompaniment.”²⁴ How then do

²³Arnold in *The Art of Accompaniment*, 290 even goes so far as to say that “There is no single treatise on the art of accompaniment from a figured Bass to which those who wish to recapture the tradition owe a deeper debt than to the *Second Part of Ph. Em. Bach’s* celebrated work on the Clavier...”

²⁴Bach, *Essay*, 367.

Bach's written-out accompaniments compare with the recommendations he lays out in this volume on the "true art" of accompaniment? Bach goes on to state what an appropriate, refined accompaniment would look like, writing that

Gratuitous passage work and bustling noise do not constitute the beauties of accompaniment. In fact, they can easily do harm to the principal part by robbing it of its freedom to introduce variations into repetitions and elsewhere. The accompanist will achieve eminence and attract the attention of intelligent listeners by letting them hear an unadorned steadiness and noble simplicity in flowing accompaniment which does not interfere with the brilliance of the principal part.²⁵

Nearly all of Bach's approximately 300 songs are strophic and utilize two staves with the vocal line and the keyboard sharing the top staff. Partly as a result of the two-staff format and the strophic form, all of the accompaniments, despite their varying styles and skill levels, maintain this kind of "noble simplicity." In addition, the texture resulting from the number of parts and how they are distributed also contributes to the simple nature of most of Bach's *Lieder*.

It must be pointed out at the beginning that Bach used a wide variety of accompaniment figures and styles. As a proponent of the *Empfindsamer Stil* many of his songs feature constant, subtle changes that give his *Lied* accompaniments a greater sense of sophistication than those of his Berlin contemporaries. In addition, many of the texts he set were sacred and serious in tone, and the nuances of the accompaniment reflect the nature of these individual texts. In fact, Bach states in his *Versuch* that it is variety and nuance, not just the correct realization of figures, that make a truly great accompanist.

²⁵*Ibid.*, 367-8.

Still, there are features that appear frequently enough in his Lieder that a few generalizations can be made about the application of his ideas on continuo playing.

First of all, in his *Versuch* Bach specifies that the ideal number of parts is anywhere from one to four. According to Bach, strict four-part accompaniments are best for heavily scored music in the “learned style,” while

Three- and fewer- voiced accompaniments are used in delicate works where the taste, performance, or affect of a piece requires a husbanding of harmonic resources.²⁶

Bach’s Lieder definitely fit into the second category as “delicate works” since they are written for solo voice, and therefore the accompaniment is very exposed and uses a sparser texture in order not to cover up the vocal part. Bach does indeed follow his own directive in this case since most of his Lied accompaniments restrict themselves to two or three voices, with an occasional fourth voice for added color and dynamic change. As to how these parts should be divided, Bach recommends that the most frequent division should be a single note in the bass with the harmony taken by the right hand.

The secular Lieder from Bach’s 1789 collection fit these descriptions particularly well, and the following example is representative of nearly all the Lieder in this publication.

²⁶Ibid., 175.

Example 17. C. P. E. Bach, "Lied der Schnitterinnen," m. 1-9 from *Neue Lieder-Melodien nebst einer Kantate zum Singen bey dem Klavier* (Lübeck: Christian Gottfried Donarius, 1789)

The song is very simple, and as Bach would consider it a delicate work, three parts are the norm. Except for a few bars toward the end of the piece, the inner parts of the harmony are played solely by the right hand with thirds and sixths as the predominant intervals.

Bach's *Versuch* also describes a second means of dividing the accompaniment in which the parts are shared equally between the two hands. He further suggests that this kind of "divided accompaniment" is one of the best refinements and can be mastered by playing good keyboard music.²⁷ It is not surprising then that the songs that utilize this kind of hand division most frequently are those which he also specifically intended as *Handstücke*, such as the Gellert Lieder. The Gellert Lieder, in particular, use a wide variety of textures from song to song, and within individual works. The following example, "Geduld," is a much more complex song rhythmically and harmonically, and Bach constantly varies the number of parts. He generally stays between two and four parts, but in the fifteenth measure two of the chords actually contain five. Since the

²⁷Ibid, 398.

melody above these chords are the two highest notes in the piece, Bach might have felt that the full texture would be necessary to provide enough support for the voice.²⁸

Example 18. C. P. E. Bach, "Geduld," m. 11-20 from *Herrn Professor Gellerts Geistliche Oden und Lieder mit Melodien* (Berlin: George Ludewig Winter, 1759)

The musical score consists of two systems. The first system shows the vocal line on a single staff and the piano accompaniment on two staves. The second system continues the vocal line and piano accompaniment. The lyrics are: "mich die Pflicht, die wir so oft ver = ges = sen, Täglich er = mef = sen. Täglich er = mef = sen."

Bach was not the only one to favor lighter textures for the accompaniment of song, as other continuo treatises and songs of the period attest. In addition to the descriptions by eighteenth-century writers, the criticisms of many twentieth-century scholars, who describe these early Lied accompaniments as "naive" and "anemic," confirm the prominence of these sparse textures.²⁹ Like Bach, other treatise authors describe a total of three notes as an ideal texture for solo accompaniment.³⁰ Fricke even provides a musical example, which was highlighted in the last chapter, of what the ideal accompaniment

²⁸In fact, every five-note chord that Bach uses in his Gellert Lieder are with pitches in this same high range. The increased number of notes may have been especially necessary on a harpsichord.

²⁹Lawrence Kramer, "The Schubert Lied: Romantic Form and Romantic Consciousness" in *Schubert: Critical and Analytical Studies*, ed. Walther Frisch (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1986), 200.

³⁰Cf. Fricke, 93; Heck, *The Art of Playing Thoroughbass*, 92; Löhlein (Wilson's translation), 216-17.

should look like with one note in the bass and two notes in the right hand, one of which doubles the singer's line with the other a third or a sixth below. The kind of accompaniment Fricke illustrates is used in a large majority of the printed *Lieder* from Northern Germany in the second half of the eighteenth century. In addition to Bach's "Lied der Schnitterinnen" above, the texture is also represented in many other Berlin, Göttingen, Leipzig, and Weimar publications by both well-known and lesser-known composers.

One Berlin composer who uses this three-part texture extensively is J. A. P. Schulz in his *Lieder im Volkston* collections. As mentioned previously, Schulz was steeped in the figured bass tradition from his formal studies with Kirnberger. However, he also wanted to compose music that would be an accurate portrayal of the poetry as well as "touch the heart." One way to do this was to provide the "appearance of familiarity." Thus his *Lieder* use a folk-style melody, but are not actually folk songs. While the melody was modeled after the folk song, the accompaniment uses the simple, single bass line reminiscent of continuo practice. Once again, as in the first C. P. E. Bach example, the intervals of the right hand are almost always thirds and sixths.

Example 19. J. A. P. Schulz, "Beschattet von der Pappelweide," from *Lieder im Volkston* (Berlin, 1782)

Part of the appeal of many of these folk-influenced Lieder is that they combine this simple, popular folk tradition with elements of the more serious "art song," whose accompaniments are reminiscent of continuo practice.

More evidence of North German composers using this division of the notes is found in Friedrich Wilhelm Rust (1739-1786), of Leipzig, whom James Parsons describes as one of best composers to look at for a true indication of the style of songs most people were singing, playing and composing.³¹ A typical Lied for Rust features a single bass line in the left hand with two or three notes in the right hand, such as the following example, which is entitled simply "Lied."

³¹James Parsons, "Lied," in *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd ed.

Example 20. F. W. Rust, "Lied," from *Oden und Lieder*, vol. 2 (Leipzig: Georg August Grieshammer, 1796)

The image shows a musical score for a song titled "Lied" by F. W. Rust. It consists of three systems of music, each with a vocal line and a piano accompaniment. The lyrics are in German and are written below the vocal line. The first system of lyrics is: "Ist das Le - ben nicht ein Traum süß - er Ge - fühl - le? Aus - ge - lau - fen bin ich". The second system is: "faun und bin schon am Ziele, wo ich der Wä - gung - leit keine Scher - ne sol". The third system is: "le! Einmalig wie in fur - zu - Zeit en - bet - fer - we. Wohl - le." The score is in 3/4 time and features a three-note texture in the right hand. The publisher's name "G. S." and the word "vollständig" are visible at the bottom right of the score.

Rust occasionally incorporates other intervals besides the third and the sixth in the right hand part, but he maintains a three-note texture nearly constantly throughout. Other publications in Leipzig also use this same kind of texture, even as late as 1798 in Christian Gottlob Neefe's *Bilder und Träume* on texts by Herder.

Corona Schröter, centered in Weimar, published two major Lied collections. The second, *Gesänge mit Begleitung* (1794) is the more elaborate of the two collections featuring works in German, French and Italian with three staves and more independent, complex accompaniments. The first collection, entitled *25 Lieder in Musik gesetzt* (1786), consists exclusively of strophic songs, each written using only two stanzas. This first

collection was apparently the more popular of the two³² and contained the first setting of Goethe's *Erlkönig*.³³ A representative example from the publications, "Der Brautschmuck" betrays the definite influence of basso continuo practice on the written-out accompaniment of the songs. As seen in the example below, Schröter chooses a single bass in the left hand of the accompaniment with all of the harmony in the right hand. The right-hand realization of the harmony alternates between two- and three- note chords, which are most commonly recommended by the authors of continuo treatises. Schröter is also careful to keep common tones the same when moving from one chord to another, moving to the next closest position every time, as seen in the frequently repeated "D" in the bottom of the right hand chord.

Example 21. Schröter, "Der Brautschmuck," m. 1-4 from *25 Lieder in Musik gesetzt* (Weimar, 1786)

The musical score shows the first four measures of the piece. The right hand plays chords, alternating between two-note and three-note structures. The left hand provides a single bass line. The lyrics are written below the notes: "Wollt mich, ne Lie: be lie: ben mich, und wen und Gold mir fern; ein". Dynamic markings include *p* and *ffz.* (fortissimo).

³²Ronald R. Kidd, "Schröter, Corona Elisabeth Wilhelmine" in *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd ed.

³³Examples of this texture can literally be found in songs by practically every Lied composer during the second half of the eighteenth century. A few other collections that feature the three-part texture prominently are the Weimar *Tiefurt Journal*, *Musikalisches Allereley* (Vol I-IV, 1761); the *Musikalisches Real-Zeitung* (1788-1790), and the Göttingen *Musenalmanach* (1774).

As seen in all of the above examples, an overwhelming majority of the late eighteenth-century Lieder published on two staves use what Bach referred to as an “undivided accompaniment,” with single notes in the bass line and the harmony in the right. Like Schröter’s “Der Brautschmuck” above, even Lieder that include more than two notes in the right hand generally follow these guidelines for note distribution. For example, J. F. Reichardt’s setting of “Erkönig” from 1794 features one left-hand note, with occasional octaves to emphasize the beginning of a new stanza, and three-note chords in the right hand, as seen in the following example.

Example 22. J. F. Reichardt, “Erkönig,” m. 1-7 from *Goethes Lieder, Oden, Balladen und Romanzen mit Musik*, Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 58 (Munich: G. Henle, 1964-70)

Sehr lebhaft und schauerlich

Wer rei-tet so spät durch Nacht und Wind? Es ist der Va-ter mit sei-nem

p *coll' 8va.* *mf*

While Reichardt’s accompaniment with a chord on every beat is not particularly graceful, and unlike Schröter, he does not follow the rules about keeping common tones the same when moving from chord to chord, the division of the notes between the hands is clearly reminiscent of continuo practice.

Lied accompaniments with the written notes divided between the hands are less frequent, but still easily found. Generally, this divided texture is used to provide some

variety, a reason highly recommended by the treatise authors as well. Another time that the left hand shares part of the harmony is if the melody is written low in the range and there is not enough space between the hands for the right hand to take all of it. Finally, sacred Lieder in particular utilize this equal four-part division, drawing a clear connection with sacred chorales, as demonstrated in the following example by C. H. Graun from Marburg's collection of *Geistliche Oden in Melodien gesetzt von einigen Tonkünstlern in Berlin* (1758).³⁴

Example 23. C. H. Graun, "Auferstehn, ja auferstehn," m. 1-8 from Max Friedlaender, *Das deutsche Lied im 18. Jahrhundert* (Hildesheim, NY: G. Olms, 1970)

The image shows two systems of musical notation for a piano accompaniment. Each system consists of a grand staff with a treble clef on the upper staff and a bass clef on the lower staff. The music is in a minor key and 4/4 time. The lyrics are written below the notes.

System 1 (Measures 1-4):
 Auf - er - stehn, ja auf - erstehn wirst du, mein
 Staub, nach kur - zer Ruh! Un - sterb - liche

System 2 (Measures 5-8):
 Staub, nach kur - zer Ruh! Un - sterb - liche

³⁴Many of C. P. E. Bach's *Gellert Lieder* also use this divided texture. However, many of his sacred songs do not, at least as they are written on the page. Many of the Lieder in the Cramer Psalms and the Sturms *Geistliche Gesänge* use an undivided accompaniment just as frequently, if not more often.

Bass Lines and Octave Doublings

It has already been noted above that the texture of many of these songs use a single bass in the left hand, a texture intimately associated with continuo practice. This type of bass line, in particular, points strongly to the possibility that the accompanist could have improvised his or her own harmonies from the chords outlined there. This is particularly likely when the right-hand part features only a single melody line without any added harmonies. Providing for several different options was an excellent money-making strategy in the competitive Lied publishing market of the time. Lied scholar James Parsons elaborates on this, writing that

...a single bass line represents a practical strategy, one making it possible for the composer and his or her publisher to have the best of all possible worlds, thereby guaranteeing maximum sales: amateurs would have stayed close to the bare bass lines while advanced performers would have realized the bass's harmonic implications.³⁵

Furthermore, it is not just the presence of these bass lines, but also the kind of bass lines used that imply some kind of harmonic addition. For example, frequent repetitions of a bass note, the outlining of triads, and octave skips are reminiscent of typical bass lines in the earlier Baroque continuo Lieder. Songs from Reichardt's *Gesänge fürs schöne Geschlecht* from 1775 provide particularly good examples of this. The very first song in the collection, "Vergnütiget mich," pictured below illustrates these features.

³⁵Parsons, "Eighteenth-Century Lied," 48.

Example 24. J. F. Reichardt, "Vergnüget mich," m. 8-22 from *Gesänge fürs schöne Geschlecht* (Berlin: Friedrich Wilhelm Birnstiel, 1775)

weil ich dir. Komm, Dore! Komm, Dore! Ho - her die - her Mit - gen soll dir der Früh - linge Lob erhöhen, soll dir der Frühlinge Lob er - höhen: und
ferst du gleich nicht kästlich für gen, ein schön - er Mund singt all' get schön, ein schöner Mund singt all' get schön.

For example, beginning in measure 11, the bass line outlines a clear cadence and then slows the harmonic rhythm with a repeated eighth-note bass pulse. The voice part also reinforces the Baroque-like features with its long-breathed, melismatic figures moving upward in a sequence. It is easy to imagine someone with a little accompanying experience adding chords to bring out the implied harmonies and provide more support to the relatively high range of the singer, and Reichardt indeed provides a few optional notes in small print in measures 8-10. Furthermore, Reichardt provides other clues to his conception of the work by subtitled the collection "kleine Cantaten" and advertising optional continuo and accompanimental string parts in a note before the preface.³⁶

Most treatise authors agree that doubling the bass line at the octave is not necessary when accompanying a solo, since it is generally only used when extra support is

³⁶For more background on Reichardt's *Gesänge fürs schöne Geschlecht* see Head's "If the Pretty Little Hand Won't Stretch," 203-54 and idem, "Fürs schöne Geschlecht—Johann Friedrich Reichardt und der weibliche Amateur," in *Professionalismus in der Musik: Arbeitstagung in Verbindung mit dem Heinrich-Schütz-Haus Bad Köstritz vom 22 bis 25 August 1996*, ed. By Christian Kaden and Volker Kalisch, 285-92 (Essen: Blaue Eule, 1999).

needed in larger ensembles.³⁷ Indeed, for the most part, octave doublings in the bass are avoided in the Lieder of the late eighteenth century. Reasons that treatise authors do give for the doubling the bass include to add support and produce louder sounds, to distinguish between sections, and to reinforce long notes in a slow tempo. These are also the general ways that Lied composers use the left hand octaves as well, particularly in dramatic songs. The following example “Monat Aprill” from Wilhelm Friedrich Schulz’ *Lieder am Clavier* (1794) illustrates the three points above using octaves in both hands, but especially in the bass, to bring out the drama in loud, slow sections.

Example 25. W. F. Schulz, “Monat Aprill,” m. 1-8 from *Lieder am Clavier* (Berlin: Rellstabschen Musikhandlung und Musikdruckerey, 1794)

The image shows a musical score for the first eight measures of the song "Monat Aprill" by Wilhelm Friedrich Schulz. The score is written for voice and piano. The top staff is the vocal line, and the bottom staff is the piano accompaniment. The tempo markings are "Langsam und unbillig." and "Etwas geschwinder." The lyrics are: "Wer - rd - thet A - prill! Wer - rd - thet A - prill! Du - lo - dest uns freundlichen..."

In the Lied the singer berates the month of April, which betrays the flowers by luring the buds out only to soon destroy them with hail and snow storms. Each stanza opens emphatically with the strong condemnation “Traitor April!” (*Verräther Aprill*) and Schulz emphasizes the harsh statement with a full chord in the right hand and octaves in the bass. For the sections using octaves he also indicates a slower tempo. By the fifth

³⁷See for example Jousse, 48; Manfredini, 63; Telemann, 18; Quantz, 259

measure, when the poetry begins talking about the beauties of Spring, Schulz indicates a faster tempo and the octaves disappear. The bass octaves are also used in the quicker tempo when the poetry describes the fast approaching storm in order to illustrate the dramatic text.³⁸

If a performer were improvising, she could have added or removed octaves on her own as well depending on the situation. The accompanying keyboard instrument was not specified for any of these works, but a composer with a harpsichord in mind might have included more octaves than a composer writing for the fortepiano, which had more possibilities for dynamics without adding or subtracting notes.

Parallel Fifth and Octaves

Parallel fifths and octaves are widely condemned in the continuo treatises, particularly between the outer voices. By writing out all of the bass lines and melodies, late eighteenth-century composers were able to predetermine the appropriate counterpoint. Also, the extensive use of thirds and sixths that were featured in many of the Lieder helped prevent the offending intervals. Furthermore, the sparse three-part texture was another way to avoid the intervals, since more notes generally provided more problems. Lied composers such as Marpurg and Kirnberger, who are particularly strict in their treatises about avoiding these intervals, are also careful to avoid them in their songs. However, many of the other authors acknowledge that the current styles and fashionable

³⁸Another example of a dramatic song that uses octaves to distinguish between sections is Reichardt's "Erkönig," illustrated earlier in the chapter, in which each new strophe begins with a few octaves in the bass.

trends in the late eighteenth century put more emphasis on flexibility than on rules. As a result many other composers are more conscious of providing pleasant melodies and accompaniments for their intended audiences to play and enjoy than in consistently abiding by the rules.

Relationship to the Solo Line

C. P. E. Bach's *Versuch* states that it is "poor constantly to duplicate the melody of the principal part in the accompaniment,"³⁹ yet practically every one of Bach's Lieder use only two staves with the right hand sharing a staff with the vocal line and appearing to double every note. In the case of Bach's Gellert Lieder one reason for this is the fact that the pieces were set up to be used as solo keyboard pieces in addition to songs, and therefore the keyboard would have to play the melody. In his treatise Bach frequently recommends the playing of good keyboard pieces for attuning the ear to what a well-constructed melody sounds like. In the introduction to the second part of the *Versuch* he writes

12. In order to become a skilled performer of thoroughbass, due time must first be given to the playing of good solos.

13. Good solos are those that have well-constructed melodies and correct harmony, and provide sufficient exercise for both hands.

14. In playing these the ear grows accustomed to good melody, an important factor in accompaniment, as we shall see presently.⁴⁰

³⁹Bach, *Essay*, 377.

⁴⁰*Ibid.*, 173-174.

Perhaps Bach viewed these songs to be doubly instructive as solo keyboard pieces as well as accompaniments.

Bach does mention two specific instances where doubling the principal part is useful and necessary. The first is recommended as a way to enable “weak musicians” to begin rapid passages together in an orderly and expedient manner.⁴¹ The second time he recommends playing the soloist’s note in recitative passages to help the singers get their pitches.⁴² Although he is not talking about the solo Lied, the principles could be applied to the amateur singers of his Lieder, who could very well have been “weak musicians” who needed help with their pitches. If the same person was singing and accompanying him or herself, the ability to play easily along with the melody would be especially useful.

Furthermore, while Bach’s treatise does not deal specifically with how the accompaniment should relate to the principal part in the solo Lied, several other authors do, as discussed in the previous chapter. All of these authors, including Bach, agree that when accompanying an instrumentalist doubling the principal part would be unwieldy and unnecessary. However, the accompaniment of a simple solo song requires different guidelines, and authors such as Pasquali, Miller, and Kollmann do highly recommend doubling the voice part in simple songs and airs.⁴³ The varying recommendations seem to leave the choice of whether or not to double the solo line up to the individual performers and performance situations.

⁴¹Ibid., 377.

⁴²Ibid., 424.

⁴³See for example Pasquali, 46; Miller, 7; and Kollmann, 41.

In practice, the popular two-stave printing method used for nearly all Lied publications until the last decade of the eighteenth century makes it difficult to determine hard and fast rules about whether or not to double the vocal line. Because both the staff containing the vocal line and the right-hand keyboard part are one and the same, understanding the composers' original intent is difficult unless they give performance hints in their prefaces.

In fact, a few authors do offer suggestions for the performance of their own works, but again the recommendations are mixed. For example, Friedrich Gottlob Fleischer in the foreword to his *Oden und Lieder mit Melodien* (1756) encourages the doubling of the vocal line by the keyboard, especially if the keyboardist lacks the necessary basso continuo skills. In 1782, however, the preface to *Johann Wilhelm Hässlers Clavier- und Singstücke verschiedener Art* strongly advises against doubling the voice part. As in the continuo treatises, the Lied composers themselves seem to leave the choice of whether or not the keyboardist should play along with the singer up to the performers.

Certainly less-experienced performers had the option of playing the Lied exactly as notated. The most important bass and melody notes were already there, and playing what was written would ensure an easy and secure performance, particularly if the performers were musically insecure amateurs. However, the possibility is also open that a keyboardist who had more knowledge of accompanying could have left out the vocal line entirely and improvised his or her own harmonies from the bass line provided. The division of the notes between the hands, as discussed above, which generally features a left hand part that frequently looks like a basso continuo line with only single bass notes outlining triads

would have been easy to improvise from, and certainly gives credence to this second option as well.

A more specific issue related to the vocal melody is whether or not the keyboard part should double the vocal ornamentation. The treatises are clear that a simple accompaniment is ideal and that it is best for the accompanist to leave out the ornaments in order not to conflict with the solo part.⁴⁴ Again, however, it is difficult to determine precisely how this applies to the Lieder because of the two staves, and the already simple accompaniments. It seems likely that the choice is once again up to the performer. If an amateur singer were accompanying herself at the keyboard, and needed help with her pitches, she could include the ornaments. Or if the Lied was being used as a keyboard piece, the ornaments would most likely be included. If the accompanist was improvising, however, the vocal line would not be played, and the keyboard part could easily be modified when ornaments were sung.

Filled-In Accompaniments

By far the large majority of Lied accompaniments in North Germany during this period use simple, unadorned chords only. These are easy for musical amateurs to play, and ensure that the accompaniment part remains secondary to the voice. However, there are some instances of filled-in accompaniments, and the influence of continuo practice can be seen in these keyboard parts as well. The most common way eighteenth-century

⁴⁴See for example Heck, *The Art of Playing Thoroughbass*, 92, Löhlein (Wilson's translation), 558; Manfredini, 63; and Quantz, 232.

composers fill in the chords is by arpeggiation, as the predominant vocal lines with their folk-like melodies do not lend themselves as easily to imitation or counter melodies.

For example, even with filled-in chords, J. F. Reichardt's "Der Edelknabe und die Müllerin" still features a simple and familiar texture with single bass notes in the left hand and the harmonic realization in the right. In this case the arpeggiation adds motion, and also helps set the scene near the turning mill wheel.⁴⁵

Example 26. Reichardt, "Der Edelknabe und die Müllerin," m. 1-6 from *Goethes Lieder, Oden, Balladen und Romanzen mit Musik*, Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 58 (Munich: G. Henle, 1964-70)

The musical score for "Der Edelknabe und die Müllerin" by J. F. Reichardt is presented in a two-staff format. The top staff is the vocal line for the Edelknabe, written in a treble clef with a key signature of one flat (B-flat) and a 2/4 time signature. The melody is simple and folk-like, with lyrics written below the notes: "Wo - hin, wo - hin? schö - ne Mül - le - rin, wie heißt du? Lie - se. Wo - l". The bottom staff is the piano accompaniment, written in a grand staff (treble and bass clefs). The right hand features arpeggiated chords, while the left hand plays single bass notes. A dynamic marking of *p* (piano) is placed at the beginning of the piano part.

Corona Schröter uses arpeggiation in both hands for her "Das unbefangne Mädchen" from her second Lied collection published in 1794.

⁴⁵Significantly, this song also shows that Schubert's "Die Schöne Müllerin" was not the first to use an arpeggiated right-hand accompaniment as an illustration of the turning mill wheel and running water.

Example 27. Corona Schröter, "Das unbefangne Mädchen," m. 1-4 from
Gesänge mit Begleitung (Weimar, 1794)

The image shows a page of handwritten musical notation. At the top, there are two staves: the upper one for the voice and the lower one for the keyboard. The music is in G major and 3/4 time. The vocal line consists of quarter and eighth notes. The keyboard accompaniment features arpeggiated chords. Below the vocal staff, the lyrics are written in cursive: "Ich bin ein Mädchen für und sing und bin gütlich noch der / Aufrecht von der aus um Chünmpen hat nigger die laf".

The lightness provided by the arpeggios fit the text, as the singer describes being a young, naïve maiden who loves to joke, sing, and dance. Schröter also follows the recommendations given by Heck that when arpeggiations are used in the left hand the bass note should feature the root of the chord.

Southern Germany

One of the most important Swabian composers from the second half of the eighteenth century is Johann Rudolph Zumsteeg. His vocal music was popular both with his contemporaries and with early nineteenth-century composers, particularly Schubert, who modeled several of his songs after those of Zumsteeg.⁴⁶ Although he is best known for his dramatic ballades with their expressive harmonies and descriptive keyboard

⁴⁶Cf. "Hagars Klage," "Lied der Liebe," "Nachtgesang," "Ritter Toggenburg," "Die Erwartung," and "Skolie".

figurations, Zumsteeg also composed hundreds of strophic Lieder with simple accompaniments that are clearly derived from continuo practice.⁴⁷

For example, the basic texture of the majority of his accompaniments is practically identical to that of the Berlin school with single bass notes in the left hand and two- to three-note harmonies in the right. This can be seen in Zumsteeg's setting of "An Mignon" (1800) below.

Example 28. Zumsteeg, "An Mignon," from *Kleine Balladen und Lieder*, vol. 2 (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1800-1805)

Etwas langsam.



Ue-ber Thal und Flufs ge - tra-gen, zie - het rein der Son-ne Wa-gen. Ach! sie regt in ih - rem Lauf, so wie
dei - ne, mei - ne Schmerzen, tief im Her-zen, im-mer morgens wie-der auf.

Most of Zumsteeg's Lieder are actually composed on three staves, rather than two, but even in these three-stave works, the basic texture remains the same.

⁴⁷In his article on Zumsteeg for the *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians* Gunter Maier also believes this, writing that "The piano accompaniment of many lieder is often simple and betrays its derivation from continuo practice."

Example 29. Zumsteeg, "Liebe," m. 1-4 from *Kleine Balladen und Lieder*, vol. 1
(Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1800-1805)

Etwas langsam.

Nichts rund-um er-forschen des End-li-chen Blü-cke, was hi-her als Lie-be, be-glück' und ent-sük-ke, was

In "Liebe" (1800), pictured above, Zumsteeg gives the voice part its own staff, while the keyboard part has two of its own. Even though the separate staves allow the parts to be more independent, the accompaniment remains very close to the vocal line throughout, often doubling it in the top note of the chords. Rather than doubling every note and rhythm of the voice part, however, Zumsteeg often has the accompanist play only on the strongest parts of the beat, leaving the moving notes to the vocalist. The distribution of the notes in the keyboard part is obviously derived from continuo practice, with single bass notes in the left hand and three-note chords in the right, which maintain the common tones from one harmony to the next.

Even more obvious is Zumsteeg's use of continuo-like keyboard figurations in his songs that are sacred in nature, such as "Hochgesang" (1803), reproduced below.

Example 30. Zumsteeg, "Hochgesang," m. 1-6 from *Kleine Balladen und Lieder*, vol. 5 (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1800-1805)

Feierlich langsam.

Preis ihm, der al - le Din - ge mit un - erforschtei Kraft er - hält! schweb' auf, mein Lied, und brin - ge das

The accompaniment often stays close to the vocal line, but is also frequently above or below it. However, it is always in the background providing harmonic support only. The majority of the texture features one note in the bass and three in the right, but occasionally octave doublings are used both in the bass and in the right hand chords to give the piece a fuller sound. This is appropriate for several reasons. First of all, the tempo is slow and the added notes give more sustaining power to the chords. In addition, the fullness of the texture adds to the solemn nature of the text. Finally, the poet is urging the whole universe to proclaim the Lord's praise with strength, and this text demands more than a delicate, light-textured accompaniment.

Zumsteeg's ballades also incorporate continuo practices through the use of recitative sections. In fact, "Die beiden Bonzen," published posthumously in 1805, uses actual figured basses in the score, and the accompanist is clearly meant to add chords to the bass notes and figures provided.

Example 31. Zumsteeg, "Die beiden Bonzen," m. 20-25 from *Kleine Balladen und Lieder*, vol. 7 (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1800-1805)

Recit.

Schritte und stürzten blass zur Er-de hin. Was soll's mit die-sen Kompl-men-ten, ihr Herren? rief die Mei-e-riu. Ach!

Other ballades, such as "Die Erwartung" (1800), include fully realized chords in the sections marked "Recit.," but it is clear that the idea behind these written-out chords comes from basso continuo principles.

Example 32. Zumsteeg, "Die Erwartung," m. 61-72 from *Kleine Balladen und Lieder*, vol. 2 (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1800-1805)

Recit.

blik-kend ihr Ver-tran-ter seyn. Rief es von fer-ne nicht lei-se, sü-sternden Stüm-men

Langsam.

gleich? Nein, der Schwan ist, der die Kreise zie-het durch den Sil-ber-reich.

Certainly the use of the idea of a recitative style and the basso continuo-like accompaniment of these sections come from the operatic styles that were so popular in Southern Germany at this time, and which Zumsteeg himself performed and composed. However, while opera was an influence, the works above were still published in Lied collections and meant to be performed by solo voice and piano, and are therefore relevant to this study.

The other major composer in late eighteenth-century Southern Germany was Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart. Although he was typically known for using more independent and technically advanced accompaniment parts, many of his Lieder do contain elements from the continuo tradition as well. His dramatic Lieder that use actual figures under the bass line for recitative sections have already been discussed above. In addition, many of his short, strophic songs also use textures and figurations that suggest the influence of that same tradition.

Example 33. Schubart, "An meine Liebe," m. 1-10 from *Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart Sämtliche Lieder*, Denkmäler der Musik Baden-Württemberg, no. 8 (Munich: Strube, 2000)

Schmeichlend

Mein En - gel den ich vom Him - mel er - bat, zu lei - ten mich

hier auf dor - nach - tem Pfad, zu füh - ren mich einst ins

A number of Schubart's songs, like many of those in Northern Germany, feature only a soprano line and a bass line, such as "An meine Liebe" above. The vocal line is much more ornamental than most of the songs of the period, perhaps representing the angel coming down from the sky that the text speaks of. It would be possible for the accompanist to play along with the singer note for note and include all the ornaments, but it makes more sense to improvise simple chords from the bass line and let the singer have the freedom to take her time with the ornaments.

Other strophic Lieder by Schubart include simple inner harmonies added to the right hand part, much in the same way as the songs by Berlin composers of the time, such as J. A. P. Schulz. The following example, "Der Frühlingsabend," features a single bass line in the left hand and two-note chords, almost entirely in thirds or sixths, the way Fricke describes an ideal continuo accompaniment from the late eighteenth century.

Example 34. Schubart, "Frühlingsabend," m. 1-4 from *Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart Sämtliche Lieder*, Denkmäler der Musik Baden-Württemberg, no. 8 (Munich: Strube, 2000)

Adagio

Küh - li - ger A - bend stei - ge vom Hü - gel lieb - lich ver - gol - det vom son - nig - ten Stral
Thau - e von dei - nem pur - purnen Flü - gel Trop - fen aufs dur - sti - ge Veil - chen im Thal

Switzerland

I have already noted that Lieder in Switzerland were heavily influenced by, and in fact often used, literal figured basses throughout the entirety of the eighteenth century. Even many of the songs that did not use figures still recall basso continuo practice, as well as showing their dependence on North German music of the period. The second Egli-Walder volume of *Singcompositionen mit Begleitung des Claviers* (1786) demonstrates the variety of song composing that was happening in Switzerland during this period. Several Lieder, such as the “Duett eines sich zärtlich liebenden Ehepaars” by Egli, uses figures above an unharmonized bass line, implying that the keyboardist should improvise an accompaniment. “Das Veilchen” by Walder closely resembles many of the North German Lieder of the period in its two staves with a single bass line for the left hand part. Also like the North German Lied, the right hand features a two-note harmony with one part doubling the vocal line and the other playing a third or sixth below, as seen in the following example.

Example 35. Walder, “Das Veilchen,” m. 1-6 from *Singcompositionen mit Begleitung des Claviers*, vol. 2 (Zürich: Orell, Gessner, Fueslin und Compagnie, 1786)

Einf.

Ein - sam blüß' ich hier im Thal; Duf - te still, und duf - te In dem Morgen - sonnenstrahl, ...

Finally, there are also songs that use three staves with independent, fully-realized accompaniments that are essentially written-out continuo accompaniments. "Hans an Veit," by Walder, which is illustrated below provides a good example of this.

Example 36. Walder, "Hans an Veit," m. 1-11 from *Singcompositionen mit Begleitung des Claviers*, vol. 2 (Zürich: Orell, Gessner, Fueslin und Compagnie, 1786)

The image shows a musical score for the song "Hans an Veit" by Walder. It consists of two systems of three staves each. The top system shows the vocal line on the top staff and the first two staves of the piano accompaniment. The bottom system shows the vocal line on the top staff and the next two staves of the piano accompaniment. The lyrics are: "Seit-dem mir's Gret-chen an - ge - tan, Kann ich dir nicht mehr la - - - chen; So fröh-lich war im Dorf kein Mann, Ich".

While the accompaniment part is independent from the vocal line, it still has a purely harmonic, supporting role. The division of the hands is a textbook continuo pattern with a single bass line outlining the chords and a three-note harmony in the right hand that generally stays below the vocal line. While the style of the accompaniment is clearly related to continuo practice, the composer does not, however, show regard for all of the rules. For example, when moving from one chord to another he sometimes keeps common

tones the same, as on the first three chords, but at other times jumps to other positions without warning, such as coming into the downbeat of measure three. Not only does he neglect to keep common tones the same, he jumps to a chord position that has the top note of the accompaniment part significantly above the vocal line, both of which are moves discouraged by continuo-treatise authors. It is clear that Walder was thinking of continuo accompaniment in general when he composed his accompaniment, but it is unclear why there are so many awkward moments such as those just mentioned. As I mentioned previously in the section on figured bass Lieder, the inaccuracies in many of the realized songs may be an indication that the Swiss continued to write Lieder as a matter of tradition more than practical use. Another possibility is that Walder, the original composer of the song wrote only the bass and vocal lines, while the other parts were quickly thrown together by a less experienced student or publisher.

Austria

In general, as discussed in Chapter Two, many of the Viennese composers use more complex keyboard accompaniments than their German and Swiss counterparts. Composers like Štěpán, Michael Haydn, Koželuch, Pohl, Salieri, Schuster, Teyber all used three staves in the majority of their Lieder which allowed for richer, more independent keyboard parts. Many of the German and Swiss Lied composers wrote the melody first and added simple bass lines that would support the melody but not detract from it, resulting in many continuo-like influences on the accompaniment. On the other hand, many of the Austrian Lied composers conceived of their songs instrumentally which led to

a more dominant role for the keyboard, with keyboard preludes, postludes, and soloistic interludes that are quite far removed from the simplicity of a continuo-style accompaniment.

However, basso continuo practice was still common in other areas of late eighteenth-century Viennese music, and there is evidence that all of the major Viennese composers were using it in some of their music, including a few of their Lieder. For example, there has been a significant amount of research on the fact that Mozart expected his keyboard players to play continuo during the orchestral *tutti* sections.⁴⁸ Howard Picton says there is also evidence for this practice in Štěpán's keyboard concertos.⁴⁹ Furthermore, Haydn frequently conducted his symphonies from the keyboard.⁵⁰

Joseph Haydn

Basso continuo practice was not limited to instrumental music. Keyboard continuo was still an important feature in Italian opera as well as in sacred music. In fact, nearly all of Joseph Haydn's vocal works, including part songs, folks songs, operas, and sacred choral works use basso continuo in one form or another, many with actual figures written into the score. It is not surprising that his sacred works and operas would continue in this tradition, but more unusual is the use of figure bass in his arrangements of Scottish folk

⁴⁸For a summary of many of these sources see Ferguson, "*Col Basso and Generalbass*"

⁴⁹Picton, *Life and Works*, 89.

⁵⁰Eva and Paul Badura-Skoda, *Interpreting Mozart on the Keyboard*, trans. Leo Black (New York: Saint Martin's Press, 1962), 199.

songs. The 150 *Schottische Lieder* published by Napier in several volumes between 1792 and 1795 are each arranged for voice, violin, and keyboard. The keyboard part is given as a single bass line with figures underneath, as seen in the following example.⁵¹

Example 37. Haydn, "I do confess thou art sae fair," m. 1-33 from *Schottische Lieder für William Napier*, Werke, series 32, vol. 2 (Munich: G. Henle, 1958-)

The image shows a musical score for a violin and keyboard. The violin part is written in G major, 3/4 time, and consists of a single melodic line. The keyboard part is written in G major, 3/4 time, and consists of a single bass line with figures underneath. The lyrics are: "I do confess thou art sae fair, I wad been o'er the".

Haydn's next collection of Scottish folk song arrangements were written for George Thompson in 1802-1805 for voice, violin, cello and keyboard. The figured basses have disappeared in this collection, and the keyboard accompaniment is fully written out. However the function of the instruments within the texture makes an obvious reference back to basso continuo practice. The cello line is really nothing more than a doubling of the bottom line of the keyboard part, as if the two together form the typical basso

⁵¹Joseph Haydn, *Werke*, ed. Peter Larsen Series 32, Vol. 2, *Schottische Lieder für William Napier 101-150*, ed. Andreas Friesenhagen (München: G. Henle, 1958). In the preface to this volume Andreas Friesenhagen admits that there are numerous problems with the figures in these works as many are incomplete or do not match the vocal line. It is unclear whether the problems are due to engraving errors, or whether someone other than Haydn put them in. However, Friesenhagen concludes that it is likely that at least some of them were put there by Haydn himself.

continuo ensemble. When the singer is not singing, the texture with the violin, keyboard, and cello is not that different from a Baroque sonata.⁵²

Haydn obviously knew how to compose and perform figured bass, and yet there is not much evidence of it in his songs for solo voice and keyboard. Why is this? For one thing, the songs were intended for amateurs in the home, whereas the larger vocal works were performed by professionals in the theaters and churches. However, the Scottish folk-song arrangements for Napier were also published specifically for musical amateurs, and they use figured bass, indicating that Haydn expected them to improvise.⁵³ Besides the issue of the audience, it is clear that Haydn viewed his Lieder quite differently from his other vocal works. As previously discussed in Chapter Three, Haydn conceived of his Lieder instrumentally. He intended that they could easily be used as simple keyboard pieces as well. Therefore the keyboard has a more heightened role, and his Lied accompaniments tend to be more active when compared to those of his large-scale works or to the Lied accompaniments of North Germany.

However, a connection to continuo practice can still be made most clearly in two of Haydn's songs: the tongue-in-cheek "Lob der Faulheit" and the original solo version of his hymn to the emperor, "Gott, erhalte den Kaiser!" Both songs are clearly hymns of

⁵²For more information on these collections see Karl Geringer, "Haydn and the Folksong of the British Isles," *Musical Quarterly* 35 (1949): 179-208; Cecil Hopkinson and C. B. Oldman, *Haydn's Settings of Scottish Songs in the Collections of Napier and White*, Edinburgh Bibliographical Society Transactions, no. 3 (Edinburgh: R. & R. Clark, 1945-55), 87-92.

⁵³Although the keyboardist could have also made a simple accompaniment by playing the vocal line or the violin part with the right hand.

praise, are meant to recall a church-like setting, and use more traditional accompaniment figurations that bring to mind the singing of chorales. “Gott, erhalte den Kaiser!” was indeed a serious hymn of praise to a person, but “Lob der Faulheit,” on the other hand, is a humorous text in praise of laziness.

Example 38. Haydn, “Lob der Faulheit,” m. 1-16 from *Werke*, series 24 (Munich: G. Henle, 1958-)

Andante

Paul - heit, end-lich muß ich dir

10
auch ein klei-nes Lob - lied brin-gen.- O! wie sau - er

Haydn’s clever musical setting moves homophonically throughout whenever the voice is singing, as if accompanying a lazy chorale. Two brief piano interludes interrupt the hymn to demonstrate the singer’s laziness with chromatic lines up and down. Aside from the two interludes in measures 13-14 and 18, the accompaniment is almost always chordal, doubling the melody in the top voice. Although the bass line and harmonies are intentionally more chromatic than would be found in many songs of this kind, the texture and divisions of the notes between the hands represent the two traditional positions that

continuo authors described. The majority of the piece divides the four notes equally between the hands, the typical texture for accompanying a chorale, while the last line keeps the harmony in the right hand and the bass line separate.

Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart

Of the approximately thirty extant songs by Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart, the best known are the dramatic miniatures, such as “Das Veilchen” (1785), “An Chloe” (1787), and “Als Luise die Briefe ihres ungetreuen Liebhabers verbrannte” (1787), with their frequently changing keyboard and vocal textures. However, at least six of Mozart’s other Lieder have ties to continuo practice. Ernst August Ballin, the editor of the volume on Lieder in the *Neue Ausgabe sämtlicher Werke* of Mozart, even calls three of Mozart’s early songs “Generalbasslieder.”⁵⁴ None of them use actual figures printed in the music, but the use of a continuo realization is implied by the way they look on the page. One of them, “Wie unglücklich bin ich nit” (1772) is “realized” by Mozart, while the other two, “An die Freude” (1768)⁵⁵ and a masonic song “Auf feierliche Johannisloge” (1772) feature only a vocal line and a bass line. The harmonies for “Wie unglücklich bin ich nit” are more complex than those of the other two, which is perhaps why Mozart chose to write that one

⁵⁴Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart, *Neue Ausgabe sämtlicher Werke*, ed. Ernst August Ballin, series 3, vol. 8 (Kassel : Bärenreiter, 1955-), xiv.

⁵⁵Alfred Einstein, *Mozart, His Character, His Work*, trans. Arthur Mendel and Nathan Broder (London: Oxford University Press, 1945), 376 dates this song from 1767, but in the *Kritische Berichte* accompanying the volume on Lieder for the *Neue Mozart-Ausgabe*, Ballin says Einstein’s date is impossible since at that time the poem by Johann Peter Uz, which the song is based on, had not been written. He dates the song from the following year, 1768, instead.

out. The other two use very simple harmonies, often in root position, and Mozart's realization would probably not have been as necessary for a contemporary performer.

Example 39. Mozart, "Wie unglücklich bin ich nit," m. 1-5 from *Neue Ausgabe sämtlicher Werke*, series 3, vol. 8 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1955-)

The image shows a musical score for the first five measures of the song "Wie unglücklich bin ich nit" by Mozart. The score is written in G major and 3/4 time. It consists of three staves: a vocal line in the upper staff and a keyboard accompaniment in the lower two staves. The lyrics are: "Wie un - glück - lich bin ich nit, wie schmach - tend sind mei - ne Tritt', wenn ich mich rach dir". The vocal line is a simple melody, and the keyboard accompaniment is a simple harmonic accompaniment, often in root position.

On the surface, Mozart's accompaniment to "Wie unglücklich" is practically a textbook example of what a continuo accompaniment should look like. The keyboardist plays only the bass note in the left hand while the right hand carries the harmony. The number of parts ranges from three to four, with four being the standard throughout. Furthermore, Mozart is careful to keep common tones the same from chord to chord so that the hand never has to move very far. The top line of the keyboard part generally doubles the vocal line, although it maintains a simpler rhythm. However, it is not a particularly artistic continuo accompaniment since it uses thick chords on every beat. For example, in the first measure of the song, Mozart asks the keyboardist to play the same chord, a full triad in root position, for three consecutive beats without any variation. The most likely reason for this ungainly accompaniment is the text Mozart was setting

How unhappy am I, how languishing my steps when I direct them towards you.
Only sighs comfort me, my torments redouble when you are in my thoughts.⁵⁶

The thick, repeated chords add to the impression of languishing steps as if someone is dragging his feet from the heavy burden of unhappiness. It is unclear for what occasion Mozart wrote this song, but some accounts suggest that the sixteen-year old Mozart wrote it jokingly for "the beautiful Theresel," the daughter of a George A. Horeischy, a doublebass player in Salzburg. Perhaps the "bad" accompaniment was part of the joke. However, Ballin concludes that there are no authentic sources to substantiate this claim and one cannot assume that Mozart did not take the song seriously.⁵⁷

Three of Mozart's later songs also utilize figured bass accompaniments, including the two *Kirchenlieder* written early in the year 1787. As I mentioned in Chapter Two, Mozart generally wrote songs for friends and for specific occasions. These two songs, "O Gotteslamm" and "Als aus Ägypten Israel" are no exception, and since this particular occasion was church-related, the use of figured bass would have been expected. The *Kirchenlieder* were written while Mozart was visiting Prague during 1786-7 for the performances of his opera *Le Nozze di Figaro* there. Joseph Strobach, the conductor of those *Figaro* performances, was also choir director at the St. Nikolaus Church in Prague,

⁵⁶"Wie unglücklichlich bin ich nit, Wie schmachtend sind meine Tritt', Wenn ich mich nach dir lenke. Nur die Seufzer trösten mich, Alle Schmerzen häufen sich, Wenn ich auf dich gedenke." Poet unknown. Translation by Thomas A. Quinn for W. A. Mozart *Lieder; Notturmi*. Elly Ameling and Dalton Baldwin. Philips: 422 524-2.

⁵⁷Ernst August Ballin, *Kritischen Bericht* for series 3, vol. 8: *Lieder of the Neue Mozart Ausgabe*, 63.

and helped compile a publication of devotional songs, in which Mozart's two *Kirchenlieder* were included.⁵⁸

Example 40. Mozart, Original version of "O Gotteslamm," m. 1-8 from *Neue Ausgabe sämtlicher Werke*, series 3, vol. 8 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1955-)

1. O Got - tes - lamm, dein Le - ben hast du als Lö - se - geld.

The original 1787 edition of this collection of *Lieder zur öffentlichen und häuslichen Andacht* did not actually include the figures in the printed music. However, the fifth edition published in 1805 did include them.⁵⁹

Example 41. Mozart, Figures for "O Gotteslamm," m. 1-7 from *Neue Ausgabe sämtlicher Werke*, series 3, vol. 8 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1955-)

6 7 6 6 6 6 5

⁵⁸Ibid., 116.

⁵⁹Both the original version and a version with figures can be found in the *Neue Mozart Ausgabe*. The realization of the chords in Example 40 is provided by the editor.

“Die Alte,” another of Mozart’s songs written in 1787, also uses an improvised accompaniment part. The bass line and the vocal part are clear from Mozart’s manuscript, but the right-hand part is only partially sketched, requiring the keyboard player to improvise the chords. The Lied is sung from an old woman’s perspective as she laments that the “good old days” of harmonious marriages and feminine supremacy in the household are long past. Mozart’s instruction that the performer sing “a bit nasally”⁶⁰ shows that the song is meant to be a humorous parody. Just as the singer’s text and tone of voice are meant to represent an older generation, Mozart’s accompaniment is also meant to bring to mind an earlier time period.⁶¹ In addition to the basso continuo-like accompaniment, dotted rhythms and trills at the vocal cadences, and in the two measure keyboard interlude between verses, add to the Baroque flavor of the song.

Maria Theresia Paradis

The Lieder of Maria Theresia Paradis (1759-1824) show some influence of continuo practice, especially in relation to the Berlin Lieder schools. A virtuoso pianist and singer, Paradis embarked on a grand European concert tour from 1783 to 1786 and visited many important musical centers including Salzburg, Paris, London, and Berlin.⁶² Blind

⁶⁰“Ein bischen aus der Nase,” or in some editions “Ein bischen *durch die* Nase.”

⁶¹In his thematic catalog of Mozart’s works, Ludwig Ritter von Köchel also acknowledges the continuo-like accompaniment writing that “Mozart hat archaisiert und ein Lied im Stil des Generalbass-Zeitalters geschrieben.” For a comparison of Mozart’s work to earlier settings of this same text, several of which do use figured bass, see Campbell, “Müthel,” 155.

⁶²Matsushita, “Maria Theresia von Paradis,” 24.

since childhood, Paradis was reputed to have exceptionally accurate hearing and a good memory,⁶³ and her exposure to such a variety of musical styles undoubtedly had an influence on her developing compositional technique. Evidence of these influences can be found in Paradis's extant Lieder, the majority of which were composed during her travels and published as *Zwölf Lieder auf ihrer Reise in Musik gesetzt* in 1786. Several of the songs in this collection, such as "Der Auferstehungsmorgen," show influence of her native Vienna with more active keyboard parts and virtuosic vocal lines that bring to mind the Italian operatic tradition. This is not surprising since one of her main composition teachers was the opera composer Antonio Salieri (1750-1825).

However, a number of her Lieder also show a strong connection to the Lieder of Berlin with their strophic settings, simple accompaniments, and diatonic vocal lines devoid of any Italian virtuosity. The melody is of primary importance, while the accompaniment is meant for harmonic support. A good example of a song bearing the mark of the Berlin composers is "Sophia an Siegwart," whose accompaniment follows the same directives as C. P. E. Bach's "Lied der Schnitterinnen," which was published only a few years later.

⁶³Ibid., 9.

Example 42. Paradis, "Sophia an Siegwart," m. 1-6 from *Zwölf Lieder auf ihrer Reise in Musik gesetzt* : (1784-86), ed. Hidemi Matsushita (Fayetteville, Arkansas : ClarNan Editions, c1987)

Paradis's accompaniment uses the left hand for the bass line alone, sometimes doubled by the octave, while the right hand doubles the vocal line and provides the harmony, usually a third or a sixth below. Paradis also keeps the number of parts to three or four throughout, with some variation from chord to chord.

Summary

The most concrete arguments for the influence of continuo practice on the composition of Lied accompaniments in the late eighteenth century are in the musical scores themselves. First of all, at least twenty composers continued to include actual figures underneath the bass lines into the beginning of the nineteenth century. Some of these songs with figures are in the style of a continuo-Lied with only a single bass line and soprano line, while others use a dramatic recitative style or a sacred part-song texture. Examples of Lieder with figures can be found in every region, but are most prevalent in Northern Germany, and especially Switzerland, where the majority of accompaniments used figured bass throughout the period of this study.

Even in the Lieder with unfigured basses, accompaniments written by North German composers generally follow the prescriptions given by continuo-treatise authors in matters of texture, distribution of the notes between the hands, octave doublings, parallel intervals, and in the relationship to the solo line. Swiss composers who used bass lines without figures follow the example of the Northern German composers, and many of their fully-realized keyboard parts are essentially written-out continuo accompaniments.

Evidence of basso continuo practice can also be found in the Lied accompaniments of Southern Germany and Austria. While Schubart and Zumsteeg in Southern Germany were known especially for their technically challenging and harmonically complex ballades, they also wrote many simple Lieder that contain many of the same continuo-like features listed above. Even in Austria, where Lieder were generally conceived more instrumentally or operatically, several strophic songs by Haydn, Mozart and Paradis clearly bear the influence of continuo accompaniment with their simple textures, single bass lines, right hand realizations, and occasionally chorale-like features.

CHAPTER V

CONTINUO PRACTICE AND THE COMPOSITION OF LIED ACCOMPANIMENTS IN THE EARLY NINETEENTH CENTURY

Although the nineteenth century was a time of experimentation regarding the Lied, the simple, strophic song did not go out of fashion. The early nineteenth-century Lied was still defined by many of the same parameters as it had been in the eighteenth century, such as singability, popularity, and simplicity. For example, even as late as 1827 a critic in the Munich *Allgemeine Musik-Zeitung* insisted that “the accompaniment...should remain altogether subsidiary in a true song.”¹ Furthermore, most of the published songs were still being written for amateurs and the Lied remained an important part of the *Hausmusik* tradition. Even composers like Schubert and Brahms, who are best known for their songs with more difficult vocal lines and accompaniment parts, wrote a substantial number of Lieder in older, simpler styles as well.

One of the ways these simple, nineteenth-century accompaniments are reminiscent of their eighteenth-century counterparts is in their use of common continuo figurations. Continuo treatises were still being written during the first decades of the nineteenth century and composers continued to study them. Several of the Lied composers discussed

¹Quoted in Brian Newbould, *Schubert, the Music and the Man* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997), 44. See also Koch’s definition quoted in Chapter Two, page 84.

in this chapter even compiled their own volumes on how to compose and realize a figured bass. This chapter analyzes the Lied accompaniments of eight composers, in order to show how the influence of basso continuo practice persisted in Lied composition well into the first half of the nineteenth century. These eight composers, Carl Friedrich Zelter, Ludwig van Beethoven, Louise Reichardt, Carl Loewe, Franz Schubert, Fanny Hensel, Felix Mendelssohn, and Johannes Brahms, are treated separately and are arranged in chronological order by date of birth.

Carl Friedrich Zelter (1758-1832)

Although Zelter is often included as part of the second Berlin school, along with J. F. Reichardt, Johann André, and J. A. P. Schulz, the majority of his Lieder were actually composed and published in the nineteenth century. Despite the later date of his musical publications, however, Zelter had a deep love and respect for music of the past, particularly that of J. S. Bach and his sons. His formal musical training also grounded him in earlier traditions, especially through his studies in thorough-bass and counterpoint with Carl Friedrich Christian Fasch (1736-1800), who was well qualified to teach on the subject having shared the role of accompanist to Frederick the Great with C. P. E. Bach. Furthermore, Zelter also received musical advice and criticism from Kirnberger and Marpurg, two of J. S. Bach's former students and proponents of eighteenth-century thorough-bass practice in Berlin.² It is not surprising, then, that evidence of continuo practice can be found in Zelter's Lied accompaniments. In fact, one of his early Lieder,

²Campbell, "Zelter," 26-28.

“Wir gingen beide Hand in Hand” was published in Schiller’s *Musenalmanach* of 1797 complete with figured basses.

Example 43. Zelter, “Wir gingen beide,” m. 5-9 from *Schillers Musen-Almanach für das Jahr 1797* (Tübingen: J. G. Cottaischen Buchhandlung, 1797)

kämpft auf ih-rem Wan-gen Ver-wir-rung und Ver-langen. Gott A-mor folgte
bück-te mich und drück-te die Hand, die Blu-men pflückte. Sie zog die Hand be-

In addition to the figured basses, a few notes in smaller type seem to suggest a possible realization.

Example 44. Zelter “Wir gingen beide,” m. 12-13 from *Schillers Musen-Almanach für das Jahr 1797* (Tübingen: J. G. Cottaischen Buchhandlung, 1797)

lauf-te mit und Nach-ti-gal-len

All the songs of Zelter's first published collection from 1796 are similar to "Wir gingen beide" and most late eighteenth-century collections in the fact that they are written in two staves with the vocal line sharing the space with the right hand of the keyboard part.³ They are also similar to these earlier collections in that they generally feature only one note in the left hand bass part, with the remainder of the harmonic realization consisting of two- to three- note chords in the right hand, in clear imitation of continuo practice. Only one song in the collection features an introduction, "Wer nie sein Brodt mit Thränen aß." The introduction is actually fairly elaborate with sweeping thirty-second note arpeggios, but as soon as the voice part enters the accompaniment is scaled back to harmonic support in the manner described above.

Example 45. Zelter, "Wer nie sein Brodt mit Thränen aß," m. 8-13 from *Lieder*, Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 5 (Munich: G. Henle, 1995)

Zelter was a close friend and the favored composer of the poet Goethe, and his strophic songs with simple accompaniments were well suited to Goethe's views and tastes.

³Although Zelter gradually moved away from Lieder written in two staves, they can be found in his collections through 1813. See, for example, "Der arme Thoms" (1813).

One of Zelter's simplest and most unassuming strophic songs, which he specifically planned to show to Goethe, is the unpublished "Sehnsucht," dated December 18, 1802.⁴ The melody is folk-like, outlining diatonic triads, while the accompaniment is sparse and written in a continuo style.⁵ While the singer is engaged the accompanist remains entirely in the background, and in the first bar and a half is completely absent. The left hand consists almost entirely of single bass notes that outline simple harmonic progressions, while the right hand plays three note chords above it. Although written on separate staves, the top note of the right hand doubles the important notes of the vocal line, playing one chord per beat, the most common arrangement for continuo accompaniments. Zelter is also careful to keep common notes the same from chord to chord, making the resemblance to continuo practice even clearer.

⁴In a letter to Goethe, dated 3 February 1803, Zelter writes that he intends to come soon to Weimar and show Goethe several new songs, including "Die Sehnsucht," which he is confident will win Goethe's favor. The original source for "Sehnsucht" is the Mus. ms. autog. Zelter 22 in the Staatsbibliothek in Berlin, but a transcription is available in Campbell, 374.

⁵Campbell, "Zelter," 373, 375. Stephanie Campbell also suggests that it might even have been written for children.

Example 46. Zelter, "Sehnsucht," m. 1-20 (Mus. Ms. Autog. Zelter 22, Berlin Staatsbibliothek)

Erwas ebernd und recht aber langsam

Was zieht nur das Herz so, was zieht mich hin- aus? Und von- der und
schreut mich aus Zer- zer und Haus? Wie dort sich die Wel- ker am Fel- sen ver- stehen? Da
reckt nur hin- te- ber, da reckt sich wohl hin!

The short postlude continues with a simple bass line in the left hand, but rather than the block chords found in earlier measures the right hand contains an arpeggiated eighth-note figure. This is in keeping with advice in the continuo treatises that while the

soloist is central the accompaniment should stay in the background, but when the soloist is resting the accompanist can add small flourishes. For variety and finality, the postlude following the final stanza is notated separately and is more complex. Although it uses the same harmonies, this time the left hand contains block chords and octaves, while the right-hand eighth-notes are replaced with sixteenth-note flourishes.

Example 47. Zelter, "Sehnsucht," Postlude (Mus. Ms. Autog. Zelter 22, Berlin Staatsbibliothek)



Other examples of this simple, strophic Lied style with continuo-like accompaniment can be found in every one of Zelter's published Lied collections up through his final series in 1827.⁶ One example, "Der König von Tule" from 1812 has many of the same features as "Sehnsucht," but provides an interesting twist. The figurations are still very much in line with continuo practice with the three-note right-hand chords moving closely together in contrary motion to the left-hand single bass notes. The twist, however, is that rather than the right hand doubling the melody line, the bass

⁶Ibid., 199 estimates that roughly a quarter of Zelter's Lieder are very simple with straightforward harmonies.

line doubles the voice part, which is written for a low male voice indicated by the use of bass clef.⁷

Example 48. Zelter, "Der König von Tule," m. 1-6, from *Lieder*, Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 5 (Munich: G. Henle, 1995)

Saft und frey.

Es war ein König in Tule, gar treu bis an das Grab, dem sterbend seine Buhle einen.

Even in his later collections from the 1820s Zelter continued to include Lieder with simple harmonic accompaniments right alongside the more independent Lied accompaniments he was also writing. "Der getreue Eckart" from 1821 is a setting of an eight-stanza poem by Goethe. The accompaniment to the opening phrase is very sparse with only one or two chords per measure.

⁷See "Geistesgruss" from the same collection for another example of the bass line doubling the vocal part.

Example 49. Zelter, "Der getreue Eckart," m. 1-4 from *Lieder*, Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 5 (Munich: G. Henle, 1995)

O wä-ren wir wei-ter, o wär ich zu Haus!

The harmony is very straightforward, using only the tonic and dominant. Since the keyboardist does not play every beat he cannot double the vocal line per se, but the chords do follow the main outline of the melody. In addition to the simple harmonies, the hand position of the chords is also very basic with single bass notes in the left hand and three-note block chords in the right.

Zelter changes the rhythm of the accompaniment for the second half of the poetic stanza, starting at measure 13 to a kind of "oom-pah" figure, alternating in eighth notes between the bass notes and the right-hand chords.

Example 50. Zelter, "Der getreue Eckart," m16-23 from *Lieder*, Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 5 (Munich: G. Henle, 1995)

hier, sie trin-ken das müß-sam ge-hof-te, das Bier, und las-sen uns leer und die Krü-

Although Zelter changes the rhythm, the distribution of the notes between the hands remains essentially the same, and if the two hand played together rather than one right after the other it would not look that different from the first half. The harmonies are also similar to the first half, alternating mainly between the tonic and dominant chords. Essentially this accompaniment is just a variation on that of the first half using rhythm to embellish the main chords.⁸

One of Zelter's most difficult songs, "Rastlose Liebe," is a stark contrast to his simplest songs with its challenging vocal melody, chromatic harmonies, and an independent, virtuosic keyboard accompaniment that is complete with introduction, interludes, and postlude. Furthermore, it is through-composed and longer than almost any other of his songs. However, the basic division of the notes between the hands throughout the majority of the song consists of single bass notes or octaves in the left hand and the harmonic realization in the right, which reinforces again that his compositional process was based on continuo practice. The basic texture throughout is based on several types of broken chords in the right hand, all of which are recommended chord diminutions found in continuo practice. Some sections of the piece feature simple arpeggiated right-hand chords in close position which maintain the common tones in the same position from harmony to harmony.

⁸See also "Härfner" from the same collection.

Example 51. Zelter, "Rastlose Liebe," m. 48-52 from *Lieder*, Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 5 (Munich: G. Henle, 1995)

The image shows a musical score for Example 51. It consists of three staves. The top staff is the vocal line, marked with a diamond-shaped fermata above the first measure and the instruction "rubato." above the second measure. The lyrics are: "ach wie to ei — gen schaffet das Schmer — zen, ach wie to ei — gen schaffet das Schmer". The middle and bottom staves are the keyboard accompaniment, marked with the instruction "nachlassend." below the first measure. The accompaniment features a steady eighth-note pattern in the right hand and a more active bass line in the left hand.

At the beginning of the last stanza of the poem Zelter stops the motion briefly as the protagonist pauses asks himself "Where shall I flee" and the accompaniment is more reminiscent of the simple continuo-like accompaniments seen in his other songs.

Example 52. Zelter, "Rastlose Liebe," m. 57-64 from *Lieder*, Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 5 (Munich: G. Henle, 1995)

The image shows a musical score for Example 52. It consists of three staves. The top staff is the vocal line, marked with diamond-shaped fermatas above the first, second, fourth, fifth, and seventh measures. The lyrics are: "Wie soll ich fliehen? Wülderwärts ziehen? wie soll ich; wie, wie soll ich flie — hen?". The middle and bottom staves are the keyboard accompaniment. The right hand plays a series of arpeggiated chords, while the left hand plays a chromatic line of parallel octaves.

Other sections, such as the prelude, are more reminiscent of a sweeping orchestral ritornello than a continuo accompaniment. While the texture is similar to the above with its arpeggiated right-hand chords, the parallel octaves between the hands moving chromatically in such a dramatic way are not typical for keyboard continuo.

Example 53. Zelter, “Rastlose Liebe,” m. 1-4 from *Lieder*, Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 5 (Munich: G. Henle, 1995)

Reich und kräftig.

Zelter is an important figure for this study since he consistently used continuo-style accompaniments well into the first few decades of the 1800s. He is also a key transitional Lied composer since he lived for several decades in both the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, and incorporated ideas from each. Furthermore, his teaching of thoroughbass and composition had a great deal of influence on several other Lied composers of the nineteenth century, especially on his students Felix and Fanny Mendelssohn.

Ludwig van Beethoven (1770-1827)

A dominant figure of the nineteenth century who was known for many musical innovations, Beethoven was also well grounded in the traditions of earlier generations, including figured bass. He was himself an experienced continuo player, having served in his early teens as the “Court Organist of the Prince” in Bonn, as well the “Cembalo Player in the orchestra, i.e one who provides the thoroughbass during symphonies.”⁹ According to his friend, secretary, and biographer Anton Schindler, thoroughbass was something

⁹*Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, 21 (1827): 346. Quoted in Tibor Szász, “Beethoven’s *basso continuo*: Notation and Performance” in *Performing Beethoven*, ed. Robin Stowell, 1-22 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994).

deeply ingrained in Beethoven's style and consciousness, like his Catholic faith. Schindler writes that

Beethoven observed the same silence with reference to thoroughbass, or rather to the whole field of music theory, as he did to religious topics. He regarded both religion and thoroughbass as closed issues, things not to be argued about.¹⁰

In fact, Beethoven even compiled his own *Materialen zum Generalbass* in 1809, which consists of an assortment of rules and examples for the notation and realization of keyboard harmony and accompaniment.¹¹ Furthermore, original editions of several of his larger works, including the five piano concertos, the Triple Concerto, as well as the Mass in C Major, Op. 86 and the *Missa solemnis*, include basso continuo parts, which Beethoven intended to be realized in performance.¹²

While none of Beethoven's Lieder actually include figures printed in the published music, many of his simple accompaniments clearly show the influence of his studies in that area. This is not surprising since one of his first composition and thoroughbass teachers in Bonn was Christian Gottlob Neefe, who, as discussed in Chapter Four, was closely

¹⁰Anton Schindler, *Beethoven as I Knew Him*, ed. Donald W. MacArdle, trans. Constance S. Jolly (New York: W. W. Norton, 1966), 366.

¹¹The work was then published in Vienna in 1832 under the title *Ludwig van Beethoven's Studien im Generalbasse, Contrapuncte und in der Compositions-Lehre* by Ignaz von Seyfried and is available today in a facsimile edition published by Georg Olms in 1967.

¹²The most recent study is Leon Plantinga, *Beethoven's Concertos: History, Style, Performance* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1999). See also Tibor Szász, "Figured Bass in Beethoven's 'Emperor' Concerto: Basso Continuo or Orchestral Cues?" *Early Keyboard Journal* 6-7 (1988-9): 5-71 and Ferguson, "Col Basso and Generalbass," for evidence of Beethoven's figured basses as authentic keyboard continuo. Tibor Szász, "Beethoven's basso continuo" also offers suggestions on how to realize the keyboard parts.

associated with the North German ideals of song settings. In particular, many of his earliest songs from the 1790s fit in well with their eighteenth-century counterparts, using strophic form, and simple accompaniments, such as “Maigesang” (ca. 1796) Beethoven adds his own touches, like short keyboard preludes and interludes with more active accompaniments, but as soon as the voice comes in the keyboard is relegated to harmonic support, with the top note of the right hand doubling the important notes of the vocal line.

Example 54. Beethoven, “Maigesang,” m.10-18 from *Beethoven Werke*, series 12, no. 1, ed. Helga Lühning (Munich: G. Henle, 1990)

The image shows a musical score for Example 54, Beethoven's "Maigesang" (m. 10-18). The score is in G major and 3/4 time. It features a vocal line and a piano accompaniment. The vocal line begins with the lyrics "Wie herr-lich leuch-tet in-ir die Na-tur! Wie" and is accompanied by a piano accompaniment that includes a dynamic marking of "p" (piano). The piano accompaniment consists of a right hand with a melody that often doubles the vocal line and a left hand with a steady eighth-note accompaniment.

A few secondary dominants are added to the harmony, making it a bit more complex than most of the typical Lied writing for amateurs, but it is still relatively simple and almost completely diatonic. The number of notes in each chord generally stays between three and four, keeping the texture light for this cheerful May song. Beethoven alternates between keeping the chordal realization in the right hand and dividing the notes equally between the hands, providing a nice sense of variety throughout.

While some of Beethoven's later songs demonstrate his experimental nature and incorporate a wide variety of styles, many still fall into an eighteenth-century idiom, rather

than a nineteenth-century one. "Der Bardengeist" written in November of 1813 is a good example of this.

Example 55. Beethoven, "Der Bardengeist," m. 5-8 from *Beethoven Werke*, series 12, no. 1, ed. Helga Lühning (Munich: G. Henle, 1990)

The image shows a musical score for measures 5-8 of "Der Bardengeist" by Beethoven. The score is written in bass clef with a key signature of one sharp (F#). It consists of a vocal line and a piano accompaniment. The lyrics are: "Bar - den-geist; es tönt wie A - ols - har - fen-klang im ban - gen schwe - ren". The piano accompaniment features a simple melody in the right hand and a bass line in the left hand, often playing in octaves.

First of all, the Lied is strophic with a total of 14 verses to a text by Franz Rudolph Herrmann. Beethoven sets the text for bass voice, and the accompaniment continually doubles the vocal line an octave higher. The simple melody and the lilting six-eight meter give the Lied a folk song-like quality, not unlike those of the Second Berlin school. Except for one chord in measure 11, the left hand plays only the bass line throughout, sometimes in single notes and other times in octaves. In addition to containing the vocal melody, the right hand part is filled out with two- and three-note chords, which provide simple harmonic support throughout. The short prelude, interlude, and postlude give the piano a more dominant role than is found in most earlier Lieder, but they contain the same rhythmic and melodic patterns as the rest of the song, and do not add anything substantial to the poetic meaning of the song.

Beethoven's sacred songs also deserve special mention. The six songs from Op. 48 to texts by Christian Gellert were completed between 1801 and 1802, and are often considered an homage to C. P. E. Bach, whose works Beethoven knew well. Amanda Glauert describes the texture as "an exaggeratedly simple hymn style"¹³ and the songs certainly do present many obvious elements of sacred counterpoint and continuo. For example, in the third song of the collection "Vom Tode," Beethoven relies on chord distributions that immediately bring to mind a continuo realization.

Example 56. Beethoven, "Vom Tode," m. 26-33 from *Beethoven Werke*, series 12, no. 1, ed. Helga Lühning (Munich: G. Henle, 1990)

The image shows a musical score for the third song of the collection "Vom Tode" by Beethoven, measures 26-33. The score is in G major (one sharp) and 4/4 time. It consists of a vocal line and a piano accompaniment. The vocal line is in the treble clef and has the lyrics: "säu - me nicht, denn eins ist not, säu - me nicht, denn eins". The piano accompaniment is in the bass clef and features a steady eighth-note bass line with chords in the right hand. Dynamics include *cresc.*, *f*, *sf*, and *p*.

The harmonies are decidedly romantic, with all their chromatic movement, but the distribution of the notes between the hands is exactly as Beethoven and others advise in their writings on how to realize thoroughbass. The consistent use of octaves in the bass is particularly appropriate for the weighty text, which urges one to contemplate one's own

¹³Glauert, "Songs of C. P. E. Bach," 80.

death. In addition to contributing to the drama, they also help to sustain the long chords in a slow and heavy tempo.¹⁴

Louise Reichardt (1779-1826)

As the daughter of Johann Friedrich Reichardt, one of the central figures of the Second Berlin school, and Juliane Benda (1752-1783),¹⁵ a singer and song composer herself, Louise was no stranger to the Lied. Although she did not receive much formal musical training, the musical and literary environment that she grew up in provided an enviable education in its own right. She experienced not only the musical excellence of Frederick the Great's court, but also was able to participate in her family's frequent entertaining of the greatest poets of the day including Goethe, Tieck, Novalis, the Schlegels, Eichendorff, Arnim, and Brentano.¹⁶ In 1809, however, Louise left her family for the city of Hamburg, where she supported herself as a singing teacher, composer, and choral conductor.¹⁷ While her independent spirit is typical of the Romantic period, her compositions betray the influence of eighteenth-century composers, such as her father.

¹⁴In addition to the Gellert Lieder see also "Opferlied" which uses a similar texture and also has religious tones in that it is a prayer to Zeus.

¹⁵Juliane Benda was the daughter of Franz Benda, the well-known violinist and composer associated with Frederick the Great's court in Berlin. Franz Benda also contributed several Lieder to the *Oden mit Melodien* of 1752, one of the First Berlin School collections.

¹⁶Nancy B. Reich, Introduction to Louise Reichardt, *Songs* (New York: Da Capo Press, 1981), viii.

¹⁷Diane Jezic and Elizabeth Wood, *Women Composers: The Lost Tradition Found* (New York: Feminist Press at the City University of New York, 1994), 66.

Although all of her Lieder were published after 1800, many features of her songs are representative of earlier Lieder. The majority of her songs are strophic and only one page long. The vocal line is nearly always printed on a separate stave from the accompaniment, but the keyboard parts remain in the background, serving as support and never overshadowing the text. Furthermore, many of the simple keyboard figurations continue to draw on the principles of continuo realization.

For example, “Aus Genoveva” (1806) to a poem by Tieck, looks very similar to many of the late eighteenth-century Lieder discussed in Chapter Four.

Example 57. L. Reichardt, “Aus Genoveva,” m.1-4 from *Songs*, ed. Nancy B. Reich (New York: Da Capo Press, 1981)

Sehr langsam.

Dicht von Felsen eingeschlossen wo die stillen Bächlein gehn, wo die

Even though the accompaniment and vocal line have individual staves, the top part of the accompaniment keeps very close to the vocal line, essentially doubling the main notes, while leaving out some of the passing tones. The left hand plays mostly single bass notes, while the rest of the harmony is almost entirely in the right hand in two or three parts. The exceptions to this note arrangement are at the beginning of the first and second phrases (measures one and five), with full f-minor chords, consisting of a total of eight notes

divided between the hands. This accompaniment is appropriate for several reasons, all of which are consistent with continuo practice. First of all, the chord is notated to be held for almost two measures at a slow tempo. The full texture, then, will help add sustaining power to the chord, particularly when arpeggiated as indicated. The long, arpeggiated chord is particularly appropriate for the sad text as well. The stanza opens with a description of the quiet, lonely valley and the long chord gives an impression of a recitative while the scene is being described. Furthermore, the slow harmonic rhythm and the expansive chord also emphasize the quietness and loneliness professed by the poet.

While many of Louise Reichardt's song accompaniments use simple, block chords, such as the one described above, several others use more active keyboard parts that feature arpeggiations, one of the recommended methods from the continuo treatises for filling in chords. Reichardt's setting of another Tieck poem, "Ruhe Süßliebchen," provides a good example of this technique. Rather than just plain chords, Reichardt chooses to fill them out with a lilting eighth-note pattern in the right hand, which provides a rocking motion that better fits the text of the tender lullaby. It is also a good way to sustain the harmony at a slow tempo, which is one of the reasons treatise authors recommended it. While the accompaniment is slightly more independent than the previous example, "Aus Genoveva," it always remains in the background, providing solid harmonic support for the voice, but never taking over. Although the chord is broken, the chords retain the typical continuo division with the harmony in the right hand and the left hand playing the bass line, here in octaves. Furthermore, the top note of the right hand accompaniment part remains below the vocal line, the hands stay close together toward

the middle of the keyboard, and the common tones remain in the same position from chord to chord.

Example 58. L. Reichardt, "Ruhe Süßliebchen," m. 1-3 from *Songs*, ed. Nancy B. Reich (New York: Da Capo Press, 1981)

Sehr sanft .

Ru - - he Süßliebchen im Schat-ten der grü - - nen dämmernden
Schweigt ihr versteckten Gefän - ge und stört nicht die süs - - se-Ste

Halfway through the strophe Reichardt changes the right-hand accompaniment to a sixteenth-note pattern. First of all, Reichardt uses this change in texture to provide variety, just as the treatise authors recommend using different figurations for the sake of expression and interest. Also, the sixteenth-note arpeggiations can be seen as a response to the text, which describes a gently rustling grove. Finally, the more active accompaniment is responding to greater activity in the vocal line, which also includes faster moving notes and more ornamentation.

Example 59. L. Reichardt, "Ruhe Süßliebchen," m. 8-16 from *Songs*, ed. Nancy B. Reich (New York: Da Capo Press, 1981)

Louise Reichardt, mostly in her later years, also wrote a number of sacred Lieder, whose accompaniments also bear a strong resemblance to continuo practice. In particular, she composed many of these songs for her students and Hamburg choral groups, including the *Sechs geistliche Lieder* (1823) and the *Christliche liebliche Lieder* (1827).¹⁸ One such song is "Stille der Andacht" with a text by Ludwig Tieck describing the quiet joy and tender devotion one feels while meditating on the love and comfort God brings. For her setting Louise chose a chorale-like setting with four-part chords, divided evenly between the two hands for the majority of the song, with the right hand doubling the vocal line, as shown in the following example.

¹⁸Reich, xvii.

Example 60. L. Reichardt, "Stille der Andacht," m.1-5 from *Songs*, ed. Nancy B. Reich (New York: Da Capo Press, 1981)

Zart.

Nur die Einsam . keit un . schat . tet, weisst mit Kühlung mei . nen Geist, Wenn er durstend

Her setting of Novalis' "Wenn ich ihn nur habe" is also sacred, but uses a divided accompaniment very typical of continuo accompaniments. The left hand plays the bass notes alone, occasionally in octaves, while the right hand fills out the harmonies in two and three note chords, as illustrated below.

Example 61. L. Reichardt, "Wenn ich ihn nur habe," m.1-4 from *Songs*, ed. Nancy B. Reich (New York: Da Capo Press, 1981)

1) Wenn ich ihn nur ha - be, wenn er mein nur ist,
2) Wenn ich ihn nur ha - be, laß ich al - les gern,

The song also exists in an SATB version and was included in many hymnals with all four parts. It is relevant here because it was originally intended for solo voice and piano when

first published in *Zwölf Gesänge mit Begleitung des Forte-Piano* (1806) and again in *Sechs Lieder von Novalis mit Begleitung des Piano-Forte in Musik gesetzt* (1819).¹⁹

Johann Carl Gottfried Loewe (1796-1869)

Often referred to in his lifetime as the “North German Schubert,” Carl Loewe’s dramatic ballades did indeed resemble and influence those of Schubert.²⁰ While he composed songs and ballades throughout his lifetime, and into the second half of the nineteenth century, much about Loewe’s philosophy, education, career choices, and musical composition, including his Lieder, are more reminiscent of the eighteenth century. Loewe’s early musical training was very traditional and came from his father, an organist and teacher for the Catholic parish in the small town of Löbejün.²¹ From 1811-1813 Loewe took daily lessons in theory, composition, and figured bass from Johann Gottlieb Türk, known for his conservative approach, and author of one of the most significant later treatises on basso continuo practice. With Türk, Loewe also studied the works of eighteenth-century theorists Kirnberger and Marpurg.²²

¹⁹Reich, xvii. See also “An den Erlöser” (1826) for similar figurations in a sacred song.

²⁰James Deaville, “The Lied at Mid-century,” in *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied*, ed. James Parsons (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), 147. Robert and Clara Schumann were also influenced by Loewe’s work.

²¹Althouse, “Carl Loewe,” 11.

²²*Ibid.*, 19.

Loewe's career also reflected his conservative values. While most major nineteenth-century musical figures sought a livelihood outside of church patronage, Loewe was content with a position as organist and teacher supported by the church in Stettin, not unlike that of J. S. Bach in Leipzig.²³ Loewe was steeped in church music his entire life, and therefore many of his musical values also reflect the more conservative traditions of the church, specifically the use of basso continuo. As an organist, Loewe was well trained in improvising from figured basses and even wrote a textbook on the subject for his seminary students at Stettin around 1851.²⁴

In fact, throughout his compositional career Loewe often chose religious texts for his songs and set them for solo voice and piano. Not surprisingly, these spiritual songs use accompaniments that are reminiscent of the continuo practices Loewe would have been teaching his students. In fact, "Christi Huld gegen Petrus," which Loewe wrote in 1832 for the Crown Prince of Prussia, Friedrich Wilhelm, was later included as an example in his *Klavier und Generalbass-Schule*. The text about Christ and Peter utilizes a divided style of accompaniment typical of church chorales. This is seen clearly in the first few measures of the song, as illustrated below.

²³Ibid., 34.

²⁴Carl Loewe, *Practisch- theoretische Klavier- und Generalbass- Schule für Lehrer und Lernende, nach ältern und neuern Lehrbüchern, u. systemen methodisch geordnet zugleich für Anfänger und Kinder leicht fasslich dargestellt* (Stettin, 1851).

Example 62. Loewe, "Christi Huld gegen Petrus" m. 1-5 from *Gesamtausgabe der Balladen, Legenden, Lieder und Gesänge, für eine Singstimme*, ed. Max Runze (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel; reprint ed. Westmead, England: Gregg International Publishers, 1970)

Larghetto. (♩ = 76)

1. Mit - ten un - ter dei - nen Schmer - zen blick - test
 2. Ihn vom Fal - le zu er - he - ben, blickst du
 3. O, was fühlt dein Freund für Lei - den bei dem
 4. Thrä - nen bit - ter Reu - e flie - ssen nun von
 5. Dei - nem Freun.de bin ich ähn - lich, ach, er -

dolce

trö - stend du her - ab auf den Freund, der dei - nem
 ihn voll Mit - leid an, sagst im Blick: „Es ist ver -
 lie - be - vol - len Blick! sonst gab solch ein Blick ihm
 sei - nem An - ge - sicht, und es schämt, sie zu ver -
 barm' auch mei - ner dich! Sieh', ich fle - he bang und

The top voice of the accompaniment doubles the vocal melody throughout while the other voices move in harmonic support. This texture remains the same throughout the song except for brief moments between phrases in which the piano gets a brief interlude of its own, as illustrated in measure four above.²⁵

While Loewe's ballades had an influence on new styles, many of his song collections, especially the early ones, belong firmly to the eighteenth-century tradition, with sparse chordal accompaniments doubling the vocal line and strophic forms. He was

²⁵See also Loewe's *Geistliche Gesänge* (Op. 22), as well as "Das Gebet des Herrn und die Einsetzugsworte" (Op. 2), "Weihnachts-Cantate," "Lobgesang," and many others.

personally acquainted with both Johann Friedrich Reichardt and Carl Friedrich Zelter, and these men had more influence on his Lied writing than others of Loewe's nineteenth-century contemporaries.²⁶ Furthermore, Loewe generally composed his ballades for himself to perform, and as an accomplished singer and pianist the greater complexity was of no difficulty for him. His Lieder, on the other hand, were intended for the amateur public, and therefore were simpler out of necessity.²⁷

However, even the ballades use some continuo-style figurations in simpler sections, and especially in recitative-style sections meant to imitate speaking. For example, "Die Gruft der Liebenden" (Op. 21) is a typical nineteenth-century tale of castles, knights, kings, princesses, love, and death. Most of Loewe's accompaniment is full of octaves and tremolos befitting the dramatic story line. In order to distinguish between the narrator and the various characters, Loewe uses a recitative style with simple chords underneath a dramatic vocal line. This is seen clearly in the following excerpt, an order made by the king, Don Garcias. As Don Garcias speaks the accompaniment changes to only one chord per measure, indicating a moment of recitative. The octaves in the bass befit the powerful presence of the king. The dotted eighth-sixteenth note figuration in between vocal phrases also summon the idea of royalty. For the final forceful phrase Loewe fills in the chords with more notes and speeds up rhythm of the accompaniment so that it moves right along with the voice part in order to emphasize the finality of the king's command.

²⁶Ibid., 77.

²⁷Ibid., 79.

Example 63. Loewe, "Die Gruft der Liebenden" m.47-65 from
*Gesamtausgabe der Balladen, Legenden, Lieder und Gesänge,
 für eine Singstimme*, ed. Max Runze (Leipzig: Breitkopf &
 Härtel; reprint ed. Westmead, England: Gregg International
 Publishers, 1970)

The musical score consists of four systems of music. Each system has a vocal line on a treble clef staff and a piano accompaniment on a grand staff (treble and bass clefs). The key signature is two sharps (F# and C#), and the time signature is 3/4. The tempo markings are 'Recit.' and 'Allegro.' The lyrics are in German and describe a scene where a king's chamberlain brings a betrothal ring to a woman.

Lyrics:

Grab der Lie-be lüf-te. Don Gar-ci-as, der Kö-nig, ruft
 seinen Kämmer-ling: „Geh, bringe meiner Tochter von meinem künftigen Ei-dam, Don
 Pe-dro, den Ver-jo-bungsring Sie hal-te sich zum drit-ten Tag be-reit, zum
 Herrscher von Ca-sti-li-en zu ziehn. Du führst als Marschall ihr Ge-leit.“ Der

Franz Peter Schubert (1797-1828)

Many Lied histories from earlier decades make bold statements that Schubert was
 the “pioneer of the Lied” and “Schubert’s songs alone know no ancestry but sprang

miraculously at the bidding of his uncanny genius.”²⁸ There is no doubt that Schubert was a very talented composer or that many of his Lieder with their beautiful melodies, unconventional harmonies, and descriptive keyboard figurations did provide some new directions for the nineteenth-century Lied. However, Schubert wrote over 600 songs, not all of which were as “ground-breaking” as the virtuosic and dramatic “Gretchen am Spinnrade” or “Erlkönig.” In fact, a substantial number of his songs are more representative of the simple, strophic, amateur Lied. Furthermore, Schubert was not composing in a vacuum; he was well aware of many earlier Lied composers and styles and did not deny that they had an influence on his music. For example, in Schubert’s obituary notice, his friend Josef von Spaun wrote that

Schubert was extremely well versed in the classical works of the great masters. For Handel, Gluck, Mozart, Haydn and Beethoven he felt an enthusiastic reverence. Zumsteeg’s songs, with which he became acquainted already as a boy and which specially appealed to him, may have had some influence on his predilection for German song, which began to develop so early.²⁹

Schubert also expressed a desire to “modernize the Lied,” which shows that while he had some new ideas, Schubert recognized he was only one link in a longer musical chain.³⁰

²⁸A. Craig Bell, *The Songs of Schubert* (London: Alston Books, 1964), 6.

²⁹Otto Erich Deutsch, ed. *Schubert: Memoirs by his Friends*, trans. R. Levy and J. Nowell (New York: Macmillan, 1958), 26-7.

³⁰Lorraine Byrne, *Schubert’s Goethe Settings* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2003), 38. For more on Schubert’s compositional models see Marjorie Wing Hirsch, *Schubert’s Dramatic Lieder* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 24-5 and Kristina Muxfeldt, “Schubert’s Songs: the Transformation of a Genre,” in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Christopher H. Gibbs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), 122-3.

One of the ways that Schubert incorporates earlier traditions is through his accompaniments. While Schubert is best known for more complex keyboard figurations that paint the text in a vivid way, many of his other accompaniments are much simpler and stay in the background to provide harmonic support for the singer. Furthermore, many of these simple accompaniments draw on familiar figurations that have already been noted in other composers' Lieder and can be traced to continuo practice. Two early ballades, "Der Graf von Habsburg" (D990) to a text by Schiller and "Kaiser Maximilian auf der Martinswand in Tirol (D990A) to a text by Heinrich von Collin stand out, not only for their striking resemblance to the eighteenth-century Lied, but also because they are quite possibly the simplest of any of Schubert's strophic Lieder. "Der Graf" has only two stanzas while "Kaiser Maximilian" has three, but in both songs the keyboard part doubles the vocal line throughout and uses very simple chordal harmonic accompaniments as seen in the following excerpt from "Kaiser Maximilian."

Example 64. Schubert, "Kaiser Maximilian" m. 1-6 from *Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke*, series 4, vol. 14 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)

„Hin - auf! hin - auf! in Sprung und Lauf! wo die Luft so leicht, wo die
Gähnt auch die Kluft schwarz wie die Gruft, nur hin - ü - ber, hin - ü - ber im
Der Stein nicht hält; der Kai - ser fällt in die Tie - fen hin - ab, zwei -
Er starrt hin - ab ins Wol - ken - grab. Er starrt hin - auf ins
So ist es ge - schehn, es muß - te so gehn. Wo die Luft so leicht, wo die
Im Ta - les - grund ein Hir - te stund und... sieht auf der Plat - te sich's

The right-hand block chords, which move with the voice part, and the left-hand bass line, which outlines the simple harmony, are not unlike the figurations seen in many eighteenth-century Lieder, although they are not typical for Schubert. Most likely these pieces were written at the request of Franz Schubert's brother Ferdinand for use at the orphanage school where he worked, which probably explains their unique qualities.³¹

Although they are not representative of all of Schubert's Lieder, they are relevant because they show that there were people who still desired this kind of style in 1814, and also that Schubert was capable of writing in it.

Although such stark simplicity is rare in Schubert's Lieder, he did write many other Lieder throughout his career that also use straightforward harmonies and continuo-like figurations. One example of this is his setting of Goethe's "Der Goldschmiedsgesell," about a goldsmith's apprentice who dreams about the day he can make a ring for the neighbor girl he loves.

Example 65. Schubert, "Der Goldschmiedsgesell" m. 1-5 from *Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke*, series 4, vol. 11 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)

Es ist doch mei-ne Nach-ba-rin ein al-ler-lieb-stes Mäd-chen! Wie früh ich in — der
Ich fei-le, wohl zer-feil ich dann auch man-ches gold-ne Dräht-chen. Der Mei-ster brummt, der
Und flugs wie nur der Han-del still, gleich greift sie nach dem Räd-chen. Ich weiß wohl, was — sie

³¹Walther Dürr, Introduction to the *Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke*, series 4 (Lieder), xxv-xxvi.

In Schubert's version the singer has a very active solo line with almost constant sixteenth notes and an ornamental turn. The keyboard part, on the other hand, is truly an accompaniment, providing harmonic support on the main beats and their pickups, but staying out of the way of the vocal line. Furthermore, once again, the hand position and distribution of the notes are similar to a continuo realization.

Some of Schubert's well-known songs also use continuo-like figurations. For example, in "Der Tod und das Mädchen" (1817), the character of death is accompanied by a continuo-like distribution of the notes between the hands. The chords are written low in the keyboard, but the texture is unmistakable.

Example 66. Schubert, "Der Tod und das Mädchen" m. 22-26 from *Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke*, series 4, vol. 1 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)

Das erste Zeitmaß
Der Tod

Gib dei - ne Hand, du schön und zart Ge - bild, bin Freund und

The poet expresses death not as a frightening thing, but as a kind invitation to eternal, peaceful rest. Although the chords are certainly meant to be a bit eerie, the use of these slow continuo figurations in the accompaniment also contribute a reverent or stately feel that adds to the emotional meaning of the text.

In addition to the simple, strophic Lieder that Schubert composed throughout his lifetime, many of his most complicated accompaniments also build on continuo figurations, including the famed “Gretchen am Spinnrade” and “Erlkönig.” It is true that there are many ways in which these songs are in a completely different category than the simple, strophic Lied of the eighteenth-century. The vocal lines are far from the easily singable ideal advocated by Berlin composers, and neither the vocal parts nor the keyboard parts could be played by amateur musicians. The harmonies are complicated and frequently changing. The keyboard parts are aggressive and play active roles in telling the story, even portraying specific “sound effects” like the spinning wheel in “Gretchen” and the horse’s hooves in “Erlkönig.” However, while the function and difficulty level of the keyboard part is more advanced, the basic keyboard figurations are hardly as revolutionary as they are usually depicted.

For example, the right-hand accompaniment of “Gretchen,” while relatively new and exciting in this context, is really nothing more than arpeggiated three-note chords in the right hand with occasional passing tones between the main notes of the chord. The left hand usually features octaves or perfect fifths, only incorporating other notes of the harmony in loud sections of the song, often as part of a crescendo building to a *fortissimo* climax. Not only do Schubert’s accompaniment patterns and division of the notes between the hands resemble typical continuo recommendations, but he also keeps the right-hand chords in close position throughout the piece, always moving to the closest possible inversion of the next chord.

Example 67. Schubert, "Gretchen am Spinnrade," m. 48-59 from *Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke*, series 4, vol. 1 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)

The musical score for Example 67 consists of three systems of music. Each system includes a vocal line (treble clef) and a piano accompaniment (grand staff). The piano accompaniment features a continuous triplet accompaniment in the right hand and a bass line in the left hand. The lyrics are: "geh ich aus dem Haus. Sein ho - - her Gang, sein ed - - le Ge - stalt, sei - nes Mun - - des Lächeln, sei - ner Au - - gen Ge - walt, und sei - - ner scen - - do - - poco - - a - - poco".

Even "Erlkönig" with its relentless triplet accompaniment relies on the standard continuo-like division of the hands. Again, Schubert's conception here of the accompanist as an equal partner and character in the drama is nothing like the normal eighteenth-century Lied. Neither would the pounding, repetitive rhythms have been typical, or even technically possible on instruments several decades earlier. However, the basic overall texture is familiar. Aside from occasional scalar passages, the left hand plays only the bass line, usually in octaves, while the right hand plays the rest of the harmony in three or four note chords, as seen in the following example.

Example 68. Schubert, "Erlkönig," m. 19-23 from *Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke*, series 4, vol. 1 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)

Wind? Es ist der Va - ter mit sei - - nem

The arpeggiated figures used to accompany the Erlking's invitation to join his dancing and singing daughters maintain the same division of the notes between the hands, but feature broken chords in the right hand, which I have already shown is a common method of filling out chords when playing continuo.

Example 69. Schubert, "Erlkönig," m. 93-96 from *Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke*, series 4, vol. 1 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)

wie - gen und tan - zen und sin - gen dich ein, sie wie - gen und tan - zen und sin - gen dich ein.

The concluding statement of the song is emphasized with both the voice part and accompaniment chords performed in a clear recitative style, also reminiscent of a continuo style.

Example 70. Schubert, "Erlkönig," m.145-end from *Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke*, series 4, vol 1 (Kassel:Bärenreiter, 1964)

The image shows a musical score for Schubert's "Erlkönig" (m. 145-end). The score is in G major and 3/4 time. It features a vocal line and a piano accompaniment. The vocal line begins with the word "Not;" and continues with "in sei-nen Ar-men das Kind war tot." The piano accompaniment consists of block chords in the right hand and a more active bass line in the left hand. The tempo marking "Andante" is present at the end of the excerpt.

Schubert is known for constantly reworking his songs and even returning to the same poems later to compose completely new settings.³² Comparisons of these different settings provide insight into Schubert's experiments with different accompaniment styles. One set of poems that Schubert set most frequently are the Mignon songs from Goethe's *Wilhelm Meister*, and his original settings of these poems are significantly simpler than the later versions. Both versions of Schubert's "Heiß mich nicht reden" use mostly simple block chords in the keyboard part, but the first version from 1821 (D726) is truly accompanimental with its thin chords moving in a continuo-like fashion. Occasionally the vocal line is doubled by the top note of the right hand, although the keyboard generally plays the note an octave lower than the voice is singing, such as in measure 9 and 10. However, most of the time the accompaniment part remains well below the vocal line, as the opening measures of the text show.

³²For a more detailed study of Schubert's song revisions and multiple settings see Kramer, *Distant Cycles* and John Lambert, "Schubert's Multiple Settings of Poetry" (Ph.D. diss., Yale University, 2000).

Example 71. Schubert, "Mignon I" (1821) m.1-10 from *Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke*, series 4, vol. 3 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)

Langsam

Heiß mich nicht

re - den, heiß mich schwei - gen, denn mein Ge - heim - nis ist mir

Schubert's chordal accompaniment is very simple. There are only a few moments where the left hand plays more than just the bass line, while the rest of the harmony is relegated to the right hand part in two- or three-note chords. The harmonies themselves in this first version are also much simpler than in the later one.³³

Continuo-like hand positions are also incorporated in Schubert's dramatic Lieder, particularly through the use of a recitative style.³⁴ As a student of Antonio Salieri, Schubert studied operatic styles and even composed a number of theatrical works himself.

³³See also the other *Wilhelm Meister* Lieder and the different versions of "Geistes-Gruss."

³⁴For a thorough discussion of other aspects of Schubert's dramatic Lieder see Marjorie Wing Hirsch, *Schubert's Dramatic Lieder* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993).

It is likely, then, that Schubert drew on these operatic influences as he composed these songs. However, as demonstrated in Chapter Four, many eighteenth-century composers also used this technique in their Lieder and ballades, and Schubert likely also drew inspiration from them.³⁵ Of particular interest to this study is Schubert's imitation of *secco* recitative since these are the places where the continuo figurations appear.

Different songs seem to call for different uses of the recitative-style. In "Verklärung" (D. 59), a poem depicting a human soul ascending to heaven at the moment of death, Schubert alternates between two distinctly different styles depending on the meaning of the text. Recitative is used for emphatic statements or to portray action, while a contrasting slow arioso style is used to express the more reflective, lyrical ideas. The song begins with bold statements, complete with exclamation marks, about ending the fight with nature and separating from pain. At this dramatic moment, Schubert actually notates "Recit." in the score, but even without the words it is clear from the texture what the composer intends. The brief accompaniment chords on the downbeat quickly get out of the way to allow for the voice part to declaim the text in a speech-like way. Furthermore, the accompaniment figurations are also clearly drawn from a continuo-accompanied recitative with octaves in the bass and three- to four-note chords in the right hand.

³⁵See Marie-Agnes Dittrich, "The Lieder of Schubert," in *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied*, ed. James Parsons (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), 92.

Example 72. Schubert, "Verklärung" m.10-12 from *Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke*, series 4, vol. 6 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)

After the dramatic opening statement, the text changes to describe the gentle upward floating of the soul. The music also changes to a more measured, *arioso* style with a gentle pulsing rhythm.

Example 73. Schubert, "Verklärung" m.13-15 from *Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke*, series 4, vol. 6 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)

The song continues to alternate between the two styles, using recitative at the moment in the middle of the piece that describes the actual transition from life to death, and *arioso* for lines about floating, until finally coming to a dramatic close with a Biblical quotation "O

Grab, wo ist dein Sieg? Wo ist dein Pfeil, O Tod?" (O grave, where is your victory?

Where is your arrow, O death?) Schubert sets this text with one final recitative section and punctuates the vocal line with full chords marked *fortissimo*.

Example 74. Schubert, "Verklärung" m. 38-41 from *Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke*, series 4, vol.6 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)

In other instances Schubert uses recitative to represent a character speaking in a scene. "Antigone und Oedip" (D542) is one of those songs with a series of two different monologues by the characters Antigone and her father Oedipus. An accompaniment in *secco* recitative style is used towards the end of Antigone's monologue as she comments on her father, who is beginning to wake up after she has just pleaded for the gods to have pity on him.³⁶

³⁶For more examples of recitative in Schubert's dramatic Lieder see "Auf der Risenkoppe" (D611), "Sonett" (D628), "Die Nacht" (D534), "Uraniens Flucht" (D554), "Der Kampf" (D594).

Example 75. Schubert, "Antigone und Oedip," m. 27-33 from *Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke*, series 4, vol. 1 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)

The image shows two systems of musical notation. The first system, starting at measure 26, is labeled 'Recit.' and contains the vocal line with the lyrics 'Was seufzt und stöhnt der bleiche Vater?'. The piano accompaniment consists of a series of chords. The second system, starting at measure 31, contains the vocal line with the lyrics 'ich ahn's, ein furcht-ba-res Ge - sicht verschleucht von ihm den leich - ten Schlummer,'. The piano accompaniment features block chords held across measures, with dynamic markings 'fp' and 'p'.

Occasionally Schubert also uses a recitative texture in the middle of a more lyrical song to portray the idea that someone is speaking. He uses this technique in "Am Feierabend," the fifth song from the "Die schöne Müllerin" cycle. The song opens with piano figurations that depict the mill wheel whirring as the protagonist describes how hard he works at the mill, hoping that the miller's daughter would notice. The accompaniment patterns slow from the rolling sixteenth notes of the mill wheel to eighth notes as the day is coming to a close. In the last stanza of the poem he reflects on how the master says to the workers "Euer Werk hat mir gefallen" (I am pleased with your work) followed by a "good night" from the maiden he loves, and Schubert sets these statements in a quasi-recitative style as all of the keyboard motion comes to a complete stop. Block chords are played only on the downbeat and are held through the measure while the singer declaims the text in an imitation of speech.

Example 76. Schubert, "Am Feierabend" m.46-59 from *Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke*, series 4, vol. 2 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)

Mei-ster sagt zu al-len: eu-er Werk hat mir ge-fal-len, eu-er Werk hat mir ge-

51 fal-len; und das lie-be Mäd-chen sagt — al-len ei-ne gu-te

56 Nacht, al-len ei-ne gu-te Nacht. Etwas geschwinder

Fanny Hensel (1805-1847)

Although not as much published as her younger brother, Fanny Mendelssohn received the same extensive musical education as Felix. Their earliest studies were with their mother, who eventually sent them to Ludwig Berger for piano lessons.³⁷ Fanny also received theory and composition lessons from Carl Friedrich Zelter, just as her brother

³⁷Berger also composed a number of simple of strophic Lieder and would be worthy of further study.

did.³⁸ In part because of societal expectations for wealthy women, Fanny wrote the majority of her songs for home entertainment, often to be sung by her sister Rebecca, much in the eighteenth-century tradition discussed in the previous chapters.³⁹ Not surprisingly, due to the performance environment, and her studies with Zelter, many of Fanny's songs are strophic with simple accompaniments that do not stand in the way of the vocal part. For this reason, the poet Goethe was particularly enthusiastic about her songs and actually wrote a poem specifically for her to set.⁴⁰

In particular, her earliest songs, especially those from the 1820s, are clearly oriented to the Berlin Lied school aesthetic with accompaniments that use simple figurations related to continuo practice. "Was will die einsame Träne" (1827) is an excellent example of this. The text by Heinrich Heine, a popular poet for many nineteenth-century Lied composers, is given a musical realization nearly identical to the songs of the late eighteenth century in form and style. The song is very brief, only twelve measures in length, and is set strophically. The top note of the accompaniment doubles almost every note of the vocal line with the right-hand harmony generally a third below. The left hand features single bass notes outlining the simple harmony, which are then doubled at the octave for the last six bars of the song.

³⁸Nancy B. Reich, "The Power of Class: Fanny Hensel," in *Mendelssohn and His World*, ed. R. Larry Todd (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1991), 87.

³⁹Gorrell, 202.

⁴⁰*Ibid.*, 192. Fanny did not actually set this particular poem to music, but overall she did set more of Goethe's poems than of any other poet.

Example 77. Hensel, "Was Will die einsame Träne" m. 5-8 from *Lieder ohne Namen* (1820-1844), vol. 1, ed. Cornelia Bartsch (Kassel: Furore Verlag, 2003)

trübt mir ja den Blick. Sie blieb aus al - ten Zei - ten. sie
all' zer - flos - sen sind. mit mei - nen Qua - len und Freu - den. mit
blau - en Ster - ne - lein. die mir je - ne Freu - den und Qua - len. die
floß wie ei - tel Hauch! Du al - te. ein - sa - me Trä - ne, du

These same patterns continue throughout most of the song until the last three bars of the piece where another continuo figuration occurs. Rather than playing chords on every note, Hensel has the pianist play only on the strong beats of the measure. Furthermore, instead of thirds in the right hand part, Hensel features three-note chords in the recommended note distribution common to continuo practice.

Example 78. Hensel, "Was Will die einsame Träne" m. 9-12 from *Lieder ohne Namen* (1820-1844), vol. 1, ed. Cornelia Bartsch (Kassel: Furore Verlag, 2003)

blieb aus al - ten Zei - ten in mei - nem Aug' zu - rück.
mei - nen Qua - len und Freu - den zer - flos - sen in Nacht und Wind.
mir je - ne Freu - den und Qua - len ge - lä - chelt ins Herz hin - ein.
al - te ein - sa - me Trä - ne zer - flie - ße jetz - un - der auch!

Fanny's setting of the popular "Harfner's Lied" (1825) by Goethe is also particularly relevant for the accompaniment patterns. She gives the singer a special instruction at the beginning of the piece, "rezitativisch vorgetragen." The entire piece is set in a declamatory style and the accompaniment provides both harmonic and rhythmic support. The song opens with slow, repeated chords in the accompaniment, as illustrated below.

Example 79. Hensel, "Harfner's Lied" m.1-5 from *Ausgewählte Lieder*, vol. 2, ed Annette Maurer (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1993)

Largo, rezitativisch vorgetragen

Wer sich der Ein-sam-keit er-gibt. ach! der ist bald al-lein: ein je-der

In some continuo accompaniments that many repeated chords in a measure would be redundant, but at such a slow tempo a chord on every beat would have been more common and not inappropriate.

The accompaniment moves through several types of figurations throughout the song as the singer declaims various statements, but there is a very clear moment of recitative style at the end of the piece as the accompanist comes to a stop on a chord, pausing so that the singer has the flexibility to deliver the text however she chooses.

Example 80. Hensel, "Harfner's Lied" m.25-26 from *Ausgewählte Lieder*, vol. 2, ed. Annette Maurer (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1993)

Ach könn ich nur ein - mal ein - sam im Gra - be

The image shows a musical score for two measures. The top staff is a vocal line in treble clef, 3/4 time, with a key signature of one sharp (F#). The melody consists of eighth and quarter notes. The bottom two staves are piano accompaniment, with the right hand in treble clef and the left hand in bass clef. The accompaniment features sustained chords in the right hand and simple bass notes in the left hand, with a fermata over the first measure.

Fanny wrote over 250 Lieder and while a large portion of them are strophic and utilize simple accompaniments, she also wrote many that are more complex. Some, such as her setting of Goethe's "Über allen Gipfeln ist Ruh" have clear basslines with right-hand parts that are essentially simple chords decorated and sustained by broken figures.

Example 81. Hensel, "Über allen Gipfeln ist Ruh," m. 1-5 from *Ausgewählte Lieder*, vol. 2, ed. Annette Maurer (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1993)

U - - - ber al - - - len Gip - - feln ist Ruh, in al - len

The image shows a musical score for five measures. The top staff is a vocal line in treble clef, 3/4 time, with a key signature of three sharps (F#, C#, G#). The melody features triplet markings over groups of three notes. The bottom two staves are piano accompaniment, with the right hand in treble clef and the left hand in bass clef. The accompaniment features a steady bass line in the left hand and chords in the right hand, with triplet markings over groups of three notes.

Others such as “Frühling,” incorporate some of the same techniques, but move away from continuo practice with their sweeping use of arpeggios across the entirety of the keyboard and complex figurations in both hands.

Example 82. Hensel, “Frühling,” m. 1-7 from *Ausgewählte Lieder*, vol. 1, ed. Annette Maurer (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1993)

Allegro molto

U-bern Gar - - - ten durch die

pp *leggero*

Luf - - - te hör ich Wan - der - vö - gel ziehn. das be -

f

Felix Mendelssohn (1809-1847)

Like his elder sister Fanny, Felix had the privilege of the best musical education possible, including extensive studies in figured bass with Carl Friedrich Zelter.⁴¹ While basso continuo practice was not used as extensively in other areas by the beginning of the

⁴¹Facsimiles of many of these exercises can be found in Todd, *Mendelssohn's Musical Education*.

nineteenth century, Berlin remained a bastion of conservatism with thoroughbass instruction persisting and flourishing there until at least 1830.⁴² Mendelssohn himself often used figured basses as shorthand devices in his sketches and included continuo parts in several of his sacred works. For example, the first version of his *Ave Maria* Op. 23, no. 2 from 1830 includes only an unrealized figured bass line for the keyboardist to improvise from.⁴³ Furthermore, figured bass lines are featured in his piano concertos in the *col basso* tradition of Mozart and Beethoven before him, in which the keyboard soloist would play an improvised continuo part during the orchestral *tutti* sections.⁴⁴

In addition, Mendelssohn himself was an accomplished keyboard continuo performer. Adolph Bernhard Marx wrote that Mendelssohn conducted his string symphonies of the early 1820s from the keyboard, “which Felix played in discreet accompaniment, and mostly or entirely as thoroughbass.”⁴⁵ Of course, Mendelssohn is also credited with the J. S. Bach and Handel revivals of the nineteenth century, in which he

⁴²Ibid., 20.

⁴³As figured bass was becoming more obsolete he published a second, more practical version with a choice between several fully realized parts.

⁴⁴R. Larry Todd, *Mendelssohn: A Life in Music* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003), 113.

⁴⁵A. B. Marx, *Errinerungen aus meinen Leben* (Berlin, 1865), vol. 1, trans. Susan Gillespie in “From the Memoirs of Adolf Bernhahrd Marx,” in *Mendelssohn and His World*, ed. R. Larry Todd (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1991), 207.

often restored the original continuo parts, occasionally playing them himself for rehearsals and performances.⁴⁶

Since Mendelssohn spent his formative years in Berlin it is not surprising that he would be more influenced by song composers in that city's song tradition, such as Johann Friedrich Reichardt and his own teacher Zelter, than he was by his other contemporaries. Mendelssohn knew only a few Schubert songs, and seemed to remain uninfluenced by them. In fact, he was not alone in his preferences, as many in Berlin did not care for the new Lied style embodied by Schubert. For example, a reviewer for the *Allgemeine musikalischer Zeitung* wrote that Schubert's *Erlkönig*

although filled with modulations and bizarre turns, did not attain the level of Reichardt's or Zelter's settings.⁴⁷

Indeed, in many ways Mendelssohn's Lieder hark back an earlier aesthetic, embodying the principles of simplicity and popularity that were so common only a few decades earlier. Most of his songs were written as gifts to friends and show a preference for strophic forms, tuneful melodies, and modest accompaniments. The keyboard part always remains subordinate to the vocal line, and the short preludes or postludes, when present, serve no real poetic purpose.

One of his earlier songs "Minnelied" (Op. 8, no.1), published in 1826 bears a strong resemblance to the simple songs of his mentor, Carl Friedrich Zelter. There is no

⁴⁶Todd, *Mendelssohn: A Life in Music*, 157, 304, 476.

⁴⁷*Allgemeine musikalischer Zeitung* 30 (1828): 42. Quoted in R. Larry Todd, "The Unfinished Mendelssohn," in *Mendelssohn and His World*, ed. R. Larry Todd (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1991), 176.

printed introduction and only a very brief postlude of a measure and a half. Rather, the accompaniment moves along right with the voice part throughout. The cheerful text, the simple and repetitive tune, and the lilting rhythms are reminiscent of folk-like tunes of earlier decades.

Example 83. Mendelssohn, "Minnelied" from *Werke*, vol. 19, ed. Julius Rietz (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1874-77; reprint ed. Farnborough, England: Gregg International Publishers, 1968)

Andante.

Singsstimme.

1. Hol - der klingt der Vo - gel - sang, wenn die En - gel - rei - ne,
2. Oh - ne sie ist al - les todt, welk sind Blüth und Kräu - ter,

PIANOFORTE.

die mein ju - ges Herz be - zwang, wan - delt durch die Hai - ne. Rö - ther bli - het
und kein Fröh - lings - a - bend - roth dünkt mir schön und hei - ter. Frau - te, heiss - ge -

Thal und Au, grü - her wird der Ra - sen, wo die Fin - ger
lieb - te Frau, wol - lest mir mer flie - hen; das mein Herz, gleich

mei - ner Frau Mai - en blu - men la - sen.
die - ser Au, mög in Won - ne bli - hen!

The image shows a musical score for Mendelssohn's 'Minnelied'. It consists of four systems of music. Each system has a vocal line (Singsstimme) and a piano accompaniment (PIANOFORTE). The tempo is marked 'Andante'. The key signature has one flat (B-flat). The first system includes two vocal parts with lyrics. The second system continues the vocal line and piano accompaniment. The third system continues the vocal line and piano accompaniment. The fourth system concludes the piece with a final vocal line and piano accompaniment. The piano part features a simple, repetitive melody in the right hand and a more active bass line in the left hand.

The accompaniment is also reminiscent of eighteenth-century styles with the predominance of thirds and sixths in the right hand, mostly doubling the voice line throughout. In the four measures where the keyboard does not directly double the vocal part it always remains below it, as a good continuo accompaniment should, staying towards the middle of the keyboard while the vocal line leaps above the staff.

By the end of measure two Mendelssohn gradually increases the number of accompanimental voices from three to five, and divides the accompaniment between the two hands to accommodate all the parts. As the vocal line rises in pitch the bass line descends, covering a larger range on the keyboard, creating a kind of crescendo effect throughout the phrase. In fact, the second time this idea occurs in measures 14 and 15 Mendelssohn actually notates a crescendo sign in the music. In many ways this is reminiscent of the technique continuo players used on the harpsichord or other early keyboard instruments to create dynamic contrast. Some features of the harmony and the surprisingly uneven phrasing in the last line remind the performer and listener that this is a nineteenth-century song, but the basic texture and style of the accompaniment are connected with earlier Lied traditions and draw on basic principles of continuo practice.

Mendelssohn's accompaniment style remains much the same throughout his Lied publications, as evidenced by one of his latest songs, "Wenn sich zwei Herzen scheiden" (Op. 99, no. 5), composed in 1845 and published in 1852.

Example 84. Mendelssohn, "Wenn sich zwei Herzen scheiden" m.1-4 from *Werke*, vol. 19, ed. Julius Rietz (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1874-77; reprint ed. Farnborough, England: Gregg International Publishers, 1968)

The image shows a musical score for a song. The top staff is labeled 'Singstimme.' and 'Sostenuto.' It contains two lines of lyrics: '1. Wenn sich zwei Her-zen schei-den, die sich der.einst ge . liebt, das' and '2. Da ich zu .erst em . pfan . den, dass Lie . be bre . chen mag, mir'. The bottom staff is labeled 'PIANOFORTE.' and 'p'. It shows a piano accompaniment with a right hand playing chords and a left hand playing a bass line.

The poem by Geibel is sadder and more pensive than "Minnelied" above, but the basic accompaniment principles remain the same. Again, there is no written introduction and only a short instrumental refrain between stanzas. The accompaniment doubles the vocal line, this time on every note. The texture is fairly sparse. The left hand moves more slowly, usually with the bass line alone, but occasionally in octaves, and it outlines the basic harmonies while the right hand moves along with the vocal part filling in with two- to four-note chords.

Not all of Mendelssohn's songs use such sparse accompaniments and he frequently employs arpeggios rather than block chords in the right hand. However, even in these more active accompaniments, the keyboard remains in a purely supportive role, providing only the harmony and rarely taking part in expressing the poetry in a clear way. Furthermore, even in the more complex accompaniments the bass line is always prominent, with the left hand generally playing only single notes or octaves. The clarity of the bass line and melody in most of Mendelssohn's songs suggest that his compositional process resembled that of his teacher Zelter. He began with a clear bass line and melody

and then filled in the outer parts with basic harmonies, according to the figured bass principles he had studied. Sometimes he used simple block chords resembling continuo figurations, and at other times expansions of these chords into flowing arpeggios.

Johannes Brahms (1833-1897)

While Johannes Brahms is by no means an early nineteenth-century composer, his Lieder still deserve special mention in this chapter because of the central role figured bass played in his compositional process. Brahms had a vast personal library of musical scores and treatises, including two copies of David Kellner's *Treulicher Unterricht im Generalbass*, two copies of Marpurg's *Handbuch bey dem Generalbass*, one copy of Johann Mattheson's *Kleine Generalbassschule*, and a handwritten copy of portions from Heinichen's *Der Generalbass in der Composition*.⁴⁸ The many annotations, markings, and underlines found in his copies of these writings show that Brahms actively and thoroughly studied these materials. In fact, his contemporaries considered him an expert on figured basses, and often relied on his help for realizing the figured basses in editions of Baroque music.⁴⁹ Sketches and manuscripts also show that Brahms was active in applying this theoretical knowledge to practical composition.⁵⁰

⁴⁸Georg A. Predota, "Johannes Brahms and the Foundations of Composition: The Basis of his Compositional Process in his Study of Figured Bass and Counterpoint" (Ph.D. diss., University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, 2000), 11.

⁴⁹*Ibid.*, 52.

⁵⁰For detailed analyses of Brahms's sketches and their implications see Predota, as well as George Severs Bozarth, Jr. "The Lieder of Johannes Brahms—1868-1871: Studies in Chronology and Compositional Process" (Ph.D. diss., Princeton University, 1978).

In particular Brahms's study of eighteenth-century contrapuntal and thoroughbass theorists led to a place of prominence for the bass line in his music, both in composition and performance.⁵¹ Georg Henschel wrote that when he showed some of his songs to Brahms in 1876, Brahms's advice to him was that

...in writing songs you must endeavor to invent, simultaneously with the melody, a healthy, powerful bass. You stick too much to the middle parts...⁵²

Max Graf reports a similar experience in showing Brahms his songs.

At once he plunged two fingers between the first and third staves of the score. I was somewhat surprised to see him cover up my middle voices of which I was inordinately proud...Seeing my astonishment he growled, "When I look over a new song I always cover the middle voices. I only want to see the melody and the bass. If these two are right, everything is right."⁵³

Brahms's sketches show that he followed his own advice, always composing the outer voices of his Lieder first. Once he established a perfect two-voice contrapuntal framework, he added figured bass signatures, both to indicate the harmonies, and to establish proper voice-leading for the inner voices.⁵⁴

Brahms also has strong ties to the eighteenth century in his love for German folk music. Like many of the eighteenth-century German Lied composers before him, Brahms

⁵¹According to contemporaries Brahms always brought out the bass line when he was accompanying singers, even in sweet songs like the *Wiegenlied*. Heather Platt, "The Lieder of Brahms," in *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied*, ed. James Parsons (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), 203.

⁵²Georg Henschel, *Personal Recollections of Johannes Brahms* (Boston: R. G. Badger, 1907), 44.

⁵³Max Graf, "Recollections of Johannes Brahms," in *Legend of a Musical City* (New York: Philosophical Library, 1945), 107f.

⁵⁴Predota, 36-7.

was devoted to folk songs and even considered the folk song to be superior to other types of Lieder.⁵⁵ But even in his study and composition of the simplest of folk songs Brahms relied on contrapuntal and figured bass techniques when composing his accompaniments, as clearly seen in the collection of folk settings Brahms sent to Clara Schumann in 1854.⁵⁶ Brahms copied these melodies from a variety of preexisting folk song collections, added his own bass lines and then indicated his desired harmonization by adding figures above the bass, and occasionally sketching in a few of the middle voices. In many cases the figures were necessary because the harmonies were not as immediately obvious as the tonic and dominant chords of the Second Berlin school.

Example 85. Brahms, *Volksweisen für Clara Schumann*, p.10 from the facsimile, ed. Gerd Nauhaus (Hildesheim: Georg Olms Verlag, 1997)



Brahms used the same technique in composing his own songs in a folk style, and although the figures were always eliminated before publication, the clear bass lines and simple chordal figurations make evident the influences Brahms was drawing from.

“Heidenröslein” from Brahms’s collection of children’s folk songs dedicated to Robert and

⁵⁵Gorrell, 258.

⁵⁶A 16-page collection of German, Hungarian, and Scandinavian folksongs which has been published in facsimile. Johannes Brahms, *Volksweisen für Clara Schumann*. Facs. repr., ed. Gerd Nauhaus (Hildesheim: Georg Olms Verlag, 1997).

Clara Schumann's children, is a good example of this. This well-loved poem by Goethe about a young boy picking a little red rose is set very simply.⁵⁷ The voice part moves brightly along in eighth notes while the piano plays two quarter-note chords per bar except for the brief two-measure interlude between verses.

Example 86. Brahms, "Heidenröslein" m.1-4 from *Complete Songs for Solo Voice and Piano*, vol. 4, ed. Eusebius Mandyczewski (New York: Dover, 1980)

Andante con moto

1. Sah ein Knab ein Rös . lein stehn, Rös . lein auf der Hei . den;
 2. Kna . be sprach: Ich bre . che dich, Rös . lein auf der Hei . den!
 3. Und der wil . de Kna . be brach 's Rös . lein auf der Hei . den;

p legato

Brahms uses a divided accompaniment style, sharing the notes of the four-part chords evenly between the hands. For the most part both hands stay close to the middle of the keyboard, a frequent recommendation in accompaniment treatises. As a result, when the vocal part lies lower in the range it is generally doubled by the top note of the keyboard part, but when it jumps up to higher notes the keyboard part remains below.

A more serious song that also uses a continuo-like texture is "Schnitter Tod" from the 28 Folk songs for Solo Voice and Piano (1858).

⁵⁷Schubert also wrote a well-known setting of this poem.

Example 87. Brahms, "Schnitter Tod" m.1-8 from *Complete Songs for Solo Voice and Piano*, vol. 4, ed. Eusebius Mandyczewski (New York: Dover, 1980)

Poco allegro

1. Es ist ein Schnitter, heißt der Tod, hat Gewalt vom höchsten Gott: heut
2. Was heut noch grün und frisch da steht, wird morgen schon weg-ge-mäht: die

The left hand plays only the bass line that Brahms has carefully crafted, while the right hand fills in the very basic harmonies and doubles the vocal line. Brahms writes the song in a minor key, which fits the topic of death and the grim reaper. However, the tempo is marked "poco allegro," which keeps the song from plodding and expresses the idea portrayed in the poem that death is not necessarily an ominous event to be afraid of, but rather a welcome event for which we are all waiting.

Brahms also uses this same undivided accompaniment texture in another Lied that is not specifically labeled as a folk song, but that deals with the topic of grief and death. The keyboard figurations in the strophic "Vergangen ist mir Glück und Heil" (1868) are such consistent divided keyboard patterns that there is no doubt Brahms wants to bring to mind an eighteenth-century continuo-style accompaniment.⁵⁸

⁵⁸See also "Ich schell mein Horn ins Jammertal" (1868)

Example 88. Brahms, "Vergangen ist mir Glück und Heil" m.1-10 from *Complete Songs for Solo Voice and Piano*, vol. 2, ed. Eusebius Mandyczewski (New York: Dover, 1980)

Andante

Singstimme

Pianoforte

The image shows a musical score for a voice and piano piece. It consists of two systems of staves. The first system has a vocal line (Singstimme) and a piano accompaniment (Pianoforte). The vocal line is in G major, 4/4 time, and begins with the lyrics '1. Ver-gan-gen ist mir Glück und Heil und al-le Freud auf Er-'. The piano accompaniment features a complex texture with many notes per chord, often with a common tone between chords. The second system continues the vocal line with the lyrics 'den; e-lend bin ich ver-lo-ren gar, mir mag nit bes-ser wer-den. Bis' and the piano accompaniment. The tempo is marked 'Andante'.

1. Ver . gan . gen ist mir Glück und Heil und al . le Freud auf Er .

den; e . lend bin ich ver . lo . ren gar, mir mag nit bes . ser wer . den. Bis

Not only does Brahms use the standard number of notes per chord and the common division of the notes between the hands, he also is careful to keep common tones the same from chord to chord as much as possible, and he consistently moves the hands in contrary motion to each other in order to avoid parallel fifths and octaves.

While not all of Brahms's Lieder are so obviously continuo-like, even his most complex Lieder betray a similar compositional process with their prominent soprano and bass outline filled in with chords. For example, "Meine Liebe ist grün" (1874) looks and sounds complex because of its full texture and rapid movement. However if all the notes are stacked one on top of the other it can be seen that it is essentially just a highly decorated version of the kind of accompaniments described above.

Example 89. Brahms, "Meine Liebe ist grün," m. 1-6 from *Complete Songs for Solo Voice and Piano*, vol. 2, ed. Eusebius Mandyczewski (New York: Dover, 1980)

Lebhaft

Singstimme
Pianoforto

Mei - ne Lie - - - be ist grün - - -
wie der Flie - - - der - busch, und mein
Lieb ist schön - wie die Son - - - ne, mein

The top voice of the right hand chord follows closely along with the vocal line and often doubles it. The left hand plays the bass line only, sometimes in single notes or octaves, and sometimes arpeggiating the outlines of the main chords. The chordal realization is entirely in the right hand, but in order to express the youthful exuberance of the lover described in the poem Brahms wants more movement than plain chords could provide. Therefore, Brahms utilizes one of the simplest broken chord techniques described

by the continuo treatise authors. Rather than arpeggiating each note of the chord, Brahms instead separates the three or four notes into two groups and offsets them by an sixteenth note so they sound one right after another rather than simultaneously, thus providing a constant motion throughout the Lied. In other sections Brahms uses arpeggios in the right hand just offset from the bass, another basic kind of diminution recommended for continuo practice, as I have already demonstrated.

Example 90. Brahms, "Meine Liebe ist grün," m. 35-38 from *Complete Songs for Solo Voice and Piano*, vol. 2, ed. Eusebius Mandyczewski (New York: Dover, 1980)

The image displays a musical score for Example 90, Brahms' "Meine Liebe ist grün," measures 35-38. The score is presented in three systems. The first system shows the vocal line and the piano accompaniment. The vocal line is in G major (one sharp) and 3/4 time, with the lyrics "Lie" and "der." under the notes. The piano accompaniment features a right hand with a constant motion of sixteenth-note arpeggios and a left hand with a steady eighth-note bass line. The second system continues the piano accompaniment, showing the right hand's arpeggiated chords and the left hand's bass line. The third system shows the vocal line and piano accompaniment for the final measures, with the vocal line ending on a whole note and the piano accompaniment concluding with a final chord.

Summary

While many nineteenth-century composers were writing songs with more complex harmonies and difficult accompaniment parts, the fact remains that there were also simple songs still being composed, many of which employ a continuo-like part for the keyboard. Specifically, these accompaniments play a secondary role to the voice part and serve primarily as harmonic support. Generally the left hand plays only the bass line, which is sometimes doubled at the octave. The right hand fills in the harmony, playing the remaining notes of the chord. The keyboard part either doubles the voice line throughout or stays below the vocal line. In addition, the two hands typically move in contrary motion to one another and stay toward the center of the keyboard. Continuo styles are also used frequently in songs of a sacred nature or to convey a recitative style in dramatic songs.

Furthermore, many of the more complex Lied accompaniments also incorporate continuo techniques for the division of the notes between the hands and for filling in the chordal harmonies while retaining strong soprano and bass outlines. The most commonly used techniques were breaking the chords either with some kind of arpeggiation or by separating and offsetting groups of notes within the chord. While many of these more complex accompaniments have a different function from traditional continuo accompaniments in that they elevate the level of the keyboard player to a more equal partner with the vocalist, the figurations and textures they use are frequently similar to those that can be found in earlier continuo improvisations.

Eight Lied composers in particular stand out for their use of continuo-style accompaniments: Carl Friedrich Zelter, Ludwig van Beethoven, Louise Reichardt, Carl Loewe, Franz Schubert, Fanny Hensel, Felix Mendelssohn, and Johannes Brahms. Zelter had a deep love for music of the past and was particularly steeped in the figured bass tradition. At least one of his Lieder was even published with actual figures in the music. His frequent adherence to eighteenth-century Lied styles also made him the favored composer of the poet Goethe. Beethoven was also well grounded in earlier traditions and even wrote a *Materialen zum Generalbass*. He was an experienced continuo player himself, and many of his simple Lieder show the influence of that keyboard practice. As the daughter of Johann Friedrich Reichardt, Louise Reichardt was also well aware of the eighteenth-century Lied tradition, and all of her songs are written in a similar style as those of her father. Carl Loewe is known especially for his ballades, but he also composed a large number of simple, strophic Lieder. Furthermore, Loewe was immersed in church music his entire life, frequently performing and teaching thoroughbass, so it is no surprise that these continuo elements also appear in his Lieder.

Franz Schubert, although best known for his inventive and illustrative accompaniments in Lieder like "Erlkönig," also wrote keyboard parts in many other styles, some of which incorporate elements of continuo practice. For example, his simple, strophic Lieder use continuo-like accompaniments to give priority to the vocal line. Schubert also uses a continuo style in sections of his dramatic Lieder to give the impression of recitative. Furthermore, even some of Schubert's most complex Lieder like "Gretchen am Spinnrade" and "Erlkönig" rely on continuo-like divisions of notes between

the hands and styles of arpeggiations for filling in the chords. Fanny Hensel and Felix Mendelssohn studied in Berlin with Zelter and their Lieder reflect the musical traditions of that conservative city, as well as their conservative teacher. Finally, although he is a later composer, Brahms fits into this study because eighteenth-century figured bass theory was so central to his compositional process. Sketches of even the simplest of folk songs show that Brahms generally began by composing a melody and bass line, which he then filled in using principles of figured and unfigured bass. Furthermore the accompaniments that Brahms eventually harmonized and notated bear a strong resemblance to continuo style.

The fact that continuo practice, a tradition in which improvisation plays a key role, continued to have such an influence on Lied accompaniments in the late eighteenth century and early nineteenth centuries suggests that additions and embellishments might be made to the written versions of these Lieder as well. It is these possibilities that I will now explore in Chapter Six.

CHAPTER VI
THE PERFORMANCE OF LIED ACCOMPANIMENTS
IN THE LATE EIGHTEENTH AND EARLY NINETEENTH CENTURIES

Earlier chapters in this dissertation have provided evidence for the continuing presence of basso continuo practice in the Lieder of the late eighteenth century and the early nineteenth century. Basso continuo practice is an improvised art, and since there is so much evidence of continuo practice in the written music, the question arises whether or not more complex accompaniments could have been improvised from the simple outlines written on the page. Secondary sources, statements by musicians of the period, as well as clues in the music itself show that the original written scores were not necessarily definitive. This chapter begins with an overview of the general attitude towards the musical score in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries in order to show that improvisation was still an important and expected practice during that time. The focus will then turn more specifically to improvisation in the Lied. The argument will be made that performers could have indeed added to the written score based on documented performances of the period, the set-up of the musical score, issues of audience and marketing, available instruments, multiple editions of the same pieces, and various aspects of musical notation. Some examples of possible applications will also be given.

Flexibility of the Musical Score

In order to argue convincingly that notes may be added to the original Lied scores, it is first necessary to provide a context for improvisation in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. There is no question that many famous performers such as Mozart, Beethoven, Mendelssohn, and Liszt were known for their ability to extemporize free fantasies, preludes, and theme and variations for solo keyboard. The ability to improvise a cadenza in a solo concerto was also an important skill for late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century performers. While these skills add to the general understanding of the importance of improvisation during the period, this chapter is more concerned with additions to an already written-out score rather than completely new improvisations. While composers of this period were providing many more details and performance directives in the score than in previous years, comments in period sources as well as recent studies in musicology and performance practice have shown that original scores were far from binding, and that improvisation was permitted and even expected.

In his 1999 book on the subject of Classical and Romantic performance practice, Clive Brown writes that

Throughout the period 1750-1900 musical notation in European art music was generally viewed as something much more flexible with respect to pitch, rhythm, and embellishment than it has been for much of the twentieth century...In fact, during the first half of the period the embellishment and elaboration of all kinds of music by performers was endemic and, in many respects, fundamental to the aesthetic experience of composer, performer, and listener alike. The alteration of attitudes during the course of the nineteenth century was slower than might be imagined. Change was most gradual in vocal music, especially opera, and most rapid in German chamber music, yet by the end of the century it seems probable that in all these areas performers' practices, and their perceptions of what the notation implied, were still considerably closer to those of the late eighteenth

century than late twentieth-century performer's practices and perceptions are to theirs.¹

Eighteenth-Century Attitudes

Statements by eighteenth-century musicians also make it clear that the common attitude was that it was the composer's job to provide an outline, while much of the responsibility for a tasteful and successful realization lay with the performer, especially in vocal music. For example, Anselm Bayly wrote in his 1771 *Practical Treatise on Singing and Playing* that

Many composers insert appoggiaturas and graces, which indeed may assist the learner, but not a performer well educated and of a good taste, who may omit them as he shall judge proper, vary them, or introduce others from his own fancy and imagination....The business of a composer is to give the air and expression in plain notes, who goes out of his province when he writes graces, which serve for the most part only to stop and confine the invention and imagination of a singer. The only excuse a composer can plead for this practice, is the want of qualifications in the generality of singers.²

¹Clive Brown, *Classical and Romantic*, 415-6. The importance of improvisation is documented by many other modern historians. One of the earlier sources is E. T. Ferand's *Improvisation in Nine Centuries of Western Music* (Cologne: Arno Volk Verlag, 1961), in which he points out on page 20 that that improvisation and ornamentation continued to be systematically taught throughout the late eighteenth century and beyond without interruption. Richard Taruskin's views on historical performance are well known. He emphasizes the importance of the performer to the process, writing that "ultimate authority rests not in the texts but in the interpreters (for texts do not speak for themselves)..." "Tradition and Authority," in *Text and Act* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1995), 185.

²Anselm Bayly, *Practical Treatise on Singing and Playing with Just Expression and Real Elegance* (London, 1771), 47-8.

Certainly not all performers were “well educated” or possessed the “good taste” that Bayly described, and there are frequent complaints by composers of the time about unqualified musicians who butchered their music by excessive or ungainly ornaments. For example, Türk in his *Klavierschule* (1789) protests against “irksome” improvisations and ornamentations by players who lack good taste and genuine feeling.³ Domenico Corri complained in 1810 about the recent “abuse of ornament.”⁴ Regardless of the criticisms, statements such as these show that performers did not view the composer’s score as sacred, and frequently embellished it whether they knew how to do it appropriately or not. Furthermore, the fact that some composers criticized over-embellishing does not mean that they were opposed to tasteful and more subtle embellishments, as evidenced in an earlier quote by Corri in the 1780s, in which he states that

either an air, or recitative, sung exactly as it is commonly noted, would be a very inexpressive, nay, a very uncouth performance; for not only the respective duration of the notes is scarcely hinted at, but one note is frequently marked instead of another.⁵

Clive Brown reiterates Corri’s point, stating that while substantial changes to the original musical text generally occurred only in more dramatic operatic or instrumental display pieces, the use of more subtle modifications were regarded as “an essential aspect of

³Daniel Gottlob Türk, *School of Clavier Playing*, trans. Raymond H. Haggh (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1982), 310.

⁴Domenico Corri, *The Singer’s Preceptor* (London, 1810), 3.

⁵Domenico Corri, *A Select Collection*, vol. 1 (Edinburgh, 1782), 2.

musicianly performance in all circumstances, without which the music would be lacking in communicative power.”⁶

Nineteenth-Century Approaches

Even by the first few decades of the nineteenth century the printed score was still generally seen as a flexible entity. Philip Friedheim explains that in the nineteenth century one went to the concert not to hear the composition, but to hear how the performer would treat it.⁷ In his dissertation on Liszt’s Schubert transcriptions, Charles Madsen points out that published music criticism during the first half of the nineteenth century focuses on interpretation rather than on the compositions themselves.⁸ Alan Walker confirms the era’s expectation of musical additions, writing that

What in the profession is nowadays called fidelity to the text was hardly fostered until the second half of the nineteenth century, when it became associated with the “restrained” performances of such artists as Clara Schumann and Joachim.⁹

Numerous accounts of early nineteenth-century composers show that most had a more flexible approach to their own scores than our modern *Urtext* editions would lead one to believe. For example, in his 1832 *Violin School*, Louis Spohr distinguishes between

⁶Clive Brown, 416.

⁷Philip Friedheim, “First Version, Second Version, Alternative Version: Some Remarks on the Music of Liszt,” *Music Review* 44, no. 3 (1983): 201.

⁸*Ibid.*, 53.

⁹Alan Walker, *Franz Liszt: the Virtuoso Years, 1811-1847* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1983), 317.

a “correct” style, or a literal rendering of the composer’s musical text, or the preferred “fine” style, which incorporated small modifications for the sake of expression.¹⁰ Walter Schenkman’s study of chapters in Johann Nepomuk Hummel’s piano method of 1828 indicates that Hummel, like Spohr, distinguished between “correct,” “beautiful,” and “expressive” performances. In order to achieve an expressive performance Hummel suggests that the most expressive interpretations go beyond what is merely written into the score, or as Schenkman puts it for modern musicians, beyond “the limits of *Urtext* authority.” He concludes that if such a conservative figure as Hummel indulged in this kind of freedom, we might certainly expect the same from a “bolder, less conventional person like Beethoven” or from Schubert, whose performances Hummel greatly admired.¹¹

Indeed, even Beethoven, who generally opposed others’ additions to his music, lauded the violinist George Bridgetower’s ornamented rendition of the “Kreutzer” sonata.¹² Mendelssohn, who also had strict views about certain performance matters, such

¹⁰Louis Spohr, *Violinschule* (Vienna, 1832), trans. John Bishop (London, 1843), 181.

¹¹Walter Schenkman, “Beyond the Limits of *Urtext* Authority: A Contemporary Record of Early Nineteenth-Century Performance Practice,” *College Music Symposium* 23, no. 2 (1983): 145-63. For more examples of flexibility in the nineteenth-century score see Marc Pincherle, “On the Rights of the Interpreter in the Performance of 17th- and 18th-Century Music,” trans. Isabelle Cazeau, *Musical Quarterly* 44 (1958): 145-166. Although the main focus of the article is on seventeenth and eighteenth-century music, Pincherle also shows that improvisation did not disappear in the early nineteenth century, and gives a number of examples of performers and composers from those decades that show that the score was still not considered sacred and inviolable.

¹²F. G. Edwards, “George P. Bridgetower and the “Kreutzer” Sonata,” *Musical Times* 49 (1908), 302. Part of the reason for the embellishment on this particular occasion was that Beethoven had finished composing the work in such haste that there was not time to copy the violin part before the concert and Bridgetower had to perform the work from

as avoiding unwritten *rallentando* and *accelerando*, reportedly enjoyed the occasional embellishment by talented performers. His good friend Henry Chorley wrote about him saying that Mendelssohn

wrote so as to allow no space or exercise of fancy for the vocal embroider; and thus, to alter or add to his music, would be to injure it, by showing an arrogant disloyalty to the master's wishes and meanings. Nevertheless, I well recollect the quiet smile of pleasure with which even Mendelssohn used to receive a shake exquisitely placed in the second verse of his delicious "Frühlingslied" (Op.47); and it must not be forgotten, by all who desire to see the question fairly argued out, and illustrated by facts, not dogmas, that the first singer of *Elijah* in Mendelssohn's *Oratorio*—Herr Staudigl—was sanctioned, in one of the finest pieces of dramatic *recitative* which the work contains, to heighten the effect, by substituting one note for another...¹³

Several notable pianist-scholars, including Robert Levin and Malcolm Bilson, contend that Franz Schubert should be counted among the early nineteenth-century composers who left many decisions up to the performer. Levin, in particular, argues that in Schubert's time there was no composer/performer dichotomy as there is today. Because composers were "demonstrably performers," and "distinguished performers were composers" improvisation invariably remained an important part of music making in early nineteenth-century Vienna. He writes that

To contend that [Schubert's] music was meant to be performed exactly as written presupposes a stylistic change that is belied by the melodic shapes and phraseology of his music, which, despite his astounding harmonic vision and vastness of scope remain an unmistakable part of his style.¹⁴

Beethoven's original manuscript.

¹³Henry Chorley, *Modern German Music*, vol. 2 (London, 1854), 377.

¹⁴Levin, "Performance Prerogatives," 723-24. Cf. Bilson, "Schubert Interpretation," 715-722.

Figured Bass

Particularly relevant to this study is the practice of improvised figured bass that unquestionably existed throughout the period in the symphony, concerto, opera, and sacred music. For example, the original editions of almost all of Haydn's large scale vocal works, including operas, oratorios, and part songs incorporate figured bass symbols as part of the accompaniment. Linda Ferguson finds the use of "Generalbass notation" in keyboard concertos of both the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, including works by Mozart, Hummel and Mendelssohn.¹⁵ Mendelssohn, in fact, incorporated figured basses into many sacred works as well. Furthermore, he encouraged a renewed interest in improvised continuo playing when he revived numerous works of J. S. Bach and Handel in the nineteenth century.¹⁶ Figured bass was especially long lasting in opera because of its usefulness in the accompaniment of recitative. Even as late as 1836, Meyerbeer, who studied thoroughbass with Zelter, included figures in some of the recitatives of *Les Huguenots*. All of these examples with figures would have required additions to the original score by improvising from the given bass line.

¹⁵Ferguson, "Col Basso and Generalbass." See especially Chapter Ten on "Keyboard Concerto Prints from ca. 1810-1830."

¹⁶Federhofer, "Generalbasspraxis," 1-10.

Improvisation in the German Lied

The Controversy

It is clear from the discussion above that the musical score still possessed a significant amount of flexibility in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. In regard to the Lied, however, there are differing opinions. Many singers and accompanists today have a reverent approach to the Lied, probably because of the intimacy of the genre and the special connection between poetry and music that is unique to art song. These performers would never think about adding to what is written in the score. Several Lied historians also express the opinion that adding anything to what is already written on the page would detract from the composer's original intention. In his thorough study of C. P. E. Bach's Lieder, William Youngren states in the preface that since Bach rarely used actual figured bass notation in his songs, the keyboard player should not take the liberty of adding to the written notes. He concedes that "it appears that some added notes are required" in many of Bach's songs, but prefers to add to the score only when "it seems absolutely necessary."¹⁷ Regarding J. A. P. Schulz, a composer later in the eighteenth century, Kyunghee Lee writes that filling out the inner voices of his accompaniments would damage Schulz's goal of deliberate simplicity.¹⁸ David Montgomery is especially

¹⁷Youngren, *C. P. E. Bach*, ix.

¹⁸Lee, 207. Lee is echoing an earlier sentiment by Eugen Schmitz who maintained that during Schulz's time his Lieder were sung and played exactly as they had been written. Eugen Schmitz, *Unverwelkter Volksliedstil: J. A. P. Schulz (1749-1800) und seine "Lieder im Volkston"* (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1956), 42.

critical of any attempt to embellish nineteenth-century Lieder, and writes that as styles changed and became more sophisticated, taking on “the mantle of art” rather than mere entertainment, the “major control of and responsibility for a song’s emotional content and melodic shapes (including ornaments) shifted to the composer” rather than being left up to the performer.¹⁹

Other historians, however, are convinced that elaboration of the Lied was necessary and even expected. Furthermore, the social history of the Lied, some of which has already been discussed in previous chapters, points to the flexibility of the score and differences in individual performances. Most importantly, there is much evidence in the music itself that shows that a literal rendering of the score was not always possible or desirable. It is this evidence that I will explore in the remainder of this chapter.

Vocal Ornamentation in Schubert Lieder

The majority of the existing research surrounding the embellishment of German Lieder is centered around the vocal lines in Franz Schubert’s songs. While this study is concerned with the role of the keyboard accompaniment, the research on ornamentation of the vocal line does show the general attitude towards flexibility of the written Lied score. In various writings, Walther Dürr, Timothy Mussard, and Eric Van Tassel all convincingly argue that the vocal ornamentation of Schubert’s Lieder is a practice that is both

¹⁹Montgomery, *Franz Schubert’s Music*, 194.

historically documented and approved by Schubert himself.²⁰ One of the main reasons they give is that Schubert's favorite singer, and the singer he urged others to emulate, was Johann Michael Vogl, a former opera singer who was known for taking many liberties with the Lieder while performing with Schubert himself. Vogl's practice of adding ornaments is also confirmed and preserved in his personal hand copied songbooks of Lieder by Schubert and Johann Friedrich Reichardt. Furthermore, several published editions of Schubert's Lieder included added ornamentation, including an ornamented version of the song cycle *Die Schöne Müllerin* printed by Anton Diabelli in 1829.²¹

Alterations of Schubert's Accompaniments

It is not just the vocal line of Schubert's Lieder that is subject to alteration, but also the keyboard part. Schubert himself was no virtuoso pianist and often had to adapt his own difficult accompaniments when he performed them.²² He even wrote a simplified version of "Erkönig," possibly his most difficult accompaniment, in 1816 because he was uncomfortable playing the original version in performance. Benedikt Randhartinger, a

²⁰Dürr, "Schubert and Johann Michael Vogl;" Mussard, "Embellishing Schubert's Songs;" and Eric VanTassel, "Something Utterly New"

²¹According to Dürr, "Schubert and Johann Michael Vogl," 138 Vogl was primarily responsible for the printed ornaments, although Diabelli may have altered a few himself. This is clear from a statement by a contemporary singer of Vogl's, Joseph Gainsbacher, who wrote about Diabelli's edition stating that it was a printed version of the variants frequently sung by Vogl.

²²Gorrell, 115. Walther Dürr also writes that in personal adaptations Schubert himself "altered the voice part (as well as the piano) part of numerous songs in order to meet a singer's or a player's personal abilities halfway." Dürr, "Schubert and Vogl," 140.

singer who performed the song with Schubert at the Stadtkonvikt in Vienna, describes how the audience was so inspired by the performance that they demanded an encore. Randhartinger says that during this second performance of the song Schubert left out the rapid triplets of the accompaniment entirely and replaced them with eight notes, saying “they are too difficult for me; a virtuoso may play them.”²³

Although friends and fellow musicians frequently describe his performances with Vogl and others as sensitive, spontaneous, and heartfelt, they also acknowledge his lack of technique. This shows not only that Schubert himself took liberties with his own accompaniments, but also that an effective performance is possible even with alterations to the original score. For example, a young Hiller describes the evening he heard Schubert perform for the first time saying that:

A little while after we had left the dinner table Schubert sat down at the piano with Vogl at his side—the rest of us settled down comfortably in the large drawing-room, wherever we felt inclined, and then began a unique concert. One song was followed by another—untiring the contributors, untiring the listeners. Schubert had but little technique, Vogl had but little voice, but they both had so much life and feeling, and were so completely absorbed in their performances, that the wonderful compositions could not have been interpreted with greater clarity and, at the same time, with greater vision.²⁴

Schubert’s Lieder were well known by composers and the public during his lifetime and after he died.²⁵ While his songs were well respected, that respect did not always entail

²³Deutsch, *Schubert: Memoirs*, 203.

²⁴*Ibid.*, 283-4. For more descriptions of Schubert’s piano playing see Newbould, 90.

²⁵For more information on the reception of Schubert’s songs see Christopher H. Gibbs, “German Reception: Schubert’s ‘Journey to Immortality’” in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. By Christopher H. Gibbs, 241-253 (Cambridge: Cambridge

following the score exactly. For example, Charles Madsen points out that Franz Liszt added ornamentation to Schubert's accompaniments when he performed his Lieder with a singer. This is confirmed in printed reviews of Liszt's performances, including the following excerpt from *The Times* following an 1840 recital in London. The reviewer writes that Schubert's "Serenade," in particular, was encored and "...repeated with deliciously fanciful amplifications..." While Liszt could in many ways be considered a special case because of his personality and performance goals, Madsen feels that these kind of embellishments were not particular to this virtuoso performer, but were common both in the early part of the century when Schubert composed the songs as well as in the middle part of the century when Liszt performed them.²⁶ Furthermore, the acceptance of Liszt's alterations by audience and critics alike show that Schubert's Lieder were not seen as a sacrosanct entity, the way they are generally approached today in concert performance.

Improvised Introductions

Walther Dürr also writes about the performance of Schubert's Lied accompaniments, suggesting that keyboard introductions should be improvised in the songs that lack them. In fact, the Lied volumes of the *Neue Schubert-Ausgabe* include these short introductions in footnotes. Dürr describes the importance of these

University Press, 1997). The book also contains chapters on Schubert's reception in England and France.

²⁶Madsen, 82.

introductions in the foreword to the edition, writing that

Schubert did not compose piano introductions to a large number of his songs. Nonetheless, this scarcely means that these songs were performed without an introduction; rather the accompanist would have improvised a short introduction. It is to be inferred that numerous introductions in the posthumous publications of his songs, where Schubert's authorship cannot be proven, can be traced back to his improvisations; these introductions are thus not forgeries, but rather necessary additions for an edition destined primarily for dilettantes.²⁷

A number of possibilities exist for the form these introductions can take. It could be something as simple as a few repeated chords to set up the key and basic rhythmic pattern of the song. For example, Dürr provides the following for Schubert's "Genügsamkeit" from the first printing shortly after Schubert's death.

Example 91. Schubert, "Genügsamkeit" m.1-2 from *Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke*, series 4, vol. 7 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)

1815

Etwas geschwind

1. Dort ra - get ein Berg aus den Wol - ken her, ihn er -
treibt ihn vom schwe - ben - den Ro - sen - licht aus dem
nun wird es rings - um öd - und flach, und doch

²⁷Dürr, *Neue Schubert-Ausgabe*, series 4, preface, xiv. Dürr includes these printed introductions in the footnotes of his edition. Translated by Levin, 725.

Example 92. Possible Introduction to Schubert, "Genügsamkeit"

Etwas geschwind

1. Dort ra-ger ein
treibt ihn vom
nun wird es

Another easy solution is to simply use a written interlude or postlude as the introduction as well. This works well in Schubert's "Der Goldschmiedsgesell" (See Chapter Five, Example 65). Schubert uses the concluding two-bar phrase as a brief ritornello between stanzas and it functions just as nicely as a brief introduction to set up the key of the piece.

Example 93. Possible Introduction to Schubert, "Der Goldschmiedsgesell"
m. 9-10

Läd - chen.
Läd - chen.
Mäd - chen.

Of course, it is also possible to improvise a completely new introduction, which is what Dürr provides for the edition of “Der Goldschmiedsgesell” in the *Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke* of Schubert.

Example 94. Another Possible Introduction to Schubert, “Der Goldschmiedsgesell”



One reason all three of these introductions types are legitimate is that the same kinds can also be found in Schubert’s own written-out introductions.

Some modern performers agree with Dürr’s assessment and have begun to improvise their own introductions to Schubert’s Lieder that do not have a printed version. For example, the 1996 recording of Goethe Lieder with Andreas Staier on a fortepiano from the time of Schubert, features new introductions to six of the songs, most of which are not included in the *Neue Schubert-Ausgabe*.²⁸

The practice of improvised introductions also makes sense in the context of nineteenth-century performance tradition. There is a great deal of evidence on the subject

²⁸Franz Schubert, *Lieder nach Gedichten von Johann Wolfgang von Goethe*. Andreas Staier and Christoph Prégardien. BMG Int’l B000001TYX. Staier also introduces a number of special effects including harp and bell stops on several of the songs.

of improvised solo keyboard prelude during the period.²⁹ Although this was a practice in instrumental music, its purposes, which included trying out the instrument, arousing the attention of the listeners, introducing the key of the work, and sometimes introducing the thematic material from the work, would also be appropriate for a vocal performance.³⁰ Furthermore, the practice of improvising an introduction to a song is certainly not unheard of in performances today, although it is rarely done with Schubert's Lieder. Playing a short phrase of the song or a few chords to give the singer a feel for the correct harmony and starting note is much more graceful than striking a note out of context. The practice is also, of course, very common in hymn accompanying for church services in order to bring the congregation of singers in together. If, indeed, it is appropriate to add introductions to Schubert's Lieder, it is possible that this practice could also be applied to other Lieder of the period which have no written-out keyboard introductions.

Figured and Unfigured Basses

Chapter Four has already explored the many figured basses written in the music of the Lieder themselves up through the first decades of the nineteenth century. The texture of a single melody line and a single bass line with figures underneath is very reminiscent of that of the Baroque continuo Lied and shows that the composer expected the accompanist

²⁹See Jane Lohr, "Preluding on the Harpsichord and Fortepiano, circa 1770 to circa 1850" (Ph.D. diss., University of Iowa, 1993).

³⁰See Czerny's description of prelude in the first chapter of his *A Systematic Introduction to Improvisation on the Pianoforte* (1836), trans. and ed. Alice L. Mitchell (New York: Longman, 1983).

to fill out the harmonies according to the rules of basso continuo practice. Many other Lieder from the period use the same two-part texture but without the figures. It seems likely, then, that these *continuo Lied-like textures, even without figures, call for a harmonic realization by the keyboard player, as they would be very sparse indeed without any additions.*

One reason for this assumption is that unfigured basses were very popular during the second half of the eighteenth century. As described in Chapter Three, many treatise authors did not approve of the practice, but still taught the necessary skills for realizing unfigured basses since they were so common at the time. Hermann Keller describes how eighteenth-century keyboard players needed to have some knowledge of playing from unfigured bass since there were many genres that required this skill, especially operas and cantatas, but also some two-part keyboard dances and pieces in the galant style.³¹ If unfigured bass was so common elsewhere, and especially if these simple keyboard pieces with a melody and bass line were expected to be elaborated on, it makes sense that simple two-part Lieder could also be harmonized.

Even David Montgomery, who has written extensively on his staunch opposition to extemporaneous improvisation in early nineteenth-century music, concedes that late eighteenth-century music included embellishment of some kind. He writes on the subject that

³¹Keller, *Thoroughbass Method*, 78-83.

On the basis of general style, we believe that much solo song of the eighteenth century and before, with its relatively simple outlines, not only permitted spontaneous ornamentation, but required it.³²

Other Lied historians agree with this general assessment of the flexible accompaniment.

James Parsons relates a song by C. H. Graun from the second half of the eighteenth century to one with a similar texture from the first half. Regarding the need to fill in the accompaniments he writes

As to the bass, many Lieder from the century's first half include figured bass symbols, as does Görner's *An die Freude*. Since Graun's does not, the keyboardist presumably is to flesh out some harmonic realization, one in keeping with the aesthetics of naturalness.³³

Robert Gordon Campbell, writing about the Lieder of Johann Gottfried Mützel, which he compares stylistically to those of the Berlin school, says of the single bass line present in nearly all of the Lieder that it "served as a basso continuo although after around 1750 it was rarely figured."³⁴

Sandra Mangsen, in her article on unfigured bass and continuo playing states that "the presence or absence of figures cannot offer conclusive evidence as to the role of the keyboard in a given passage."³⁵ Therefore, just as previous chapters in this study discussed how the two-stave format of the printed music allows for flexibility in whether or not to double the vocal line, there is this same kind of flexibility about realizing further

³²Montgomery, *Franz Schubert's Music*, 194.

³³Parsons, "The Eighteenth-Century Lied," 48.

³⁴Campbell, "Mützel," 125.

³⁵Sandra Mangsen, "The Unfigured Bass and the Continuo Player: More Evidence from France," *Early Keyboard Journal* 3 (1984-5), 9.

harmonies. The keyboard player could have played along with what was on the page, but it would have been easy to improvise a simple harmonic realization over the bass line, even without figures.

For example, the majority of Zelter's "Musen und Grazien in der Mark" from Schiller's 1797 *Musenalmanach* consists only of only a soprano and bass outline. The harmony is simple, diatonic, and the implied chords are obvious.

Example 95. Zelter, "Musen und Grazien in der Mark" m. 1-4 from *Schillers Musen Almanach für das Jahr 1797* (Tübingen: J. G. Cottaischen Buchhandlung, 1797)

The image shows a musical score for the first four measures of a piece. It consists of two staves: a vocal line on top and a bass line on the bottom. The key signature has one sharp (F#) and the time signature is 2/4. The lyrics are: "O wie ist die Stadt so wenig, laßt die Maurer künfrig ruhn, un - se". The vocal line is written in a soprano clef and the bass line in a bass clef. The music is simple and diatonic.

One possibility for filling in the chords is to parallel the melody line with sixths and thirds, a style that is common during the period. In addition to its simplicity, this kind of harmonization enables the keyboard player to continue to double the vocal line with the right hand.

Example 96. Author's Realization of Zelter, "Musen und Grazien," m. 1-4

The image shows a musical score for the first four measures of a piece, labeled as the author's realization. It consists of two staves: a vocal line on top and a keyboard realization on the bottom. The key signature has two sharps (F# and C#) and the time signature is 2/4. The lyrics are: "O wie ist die Stadt so wenig, laßt die Maurer künfrig ruhn, un - se". The vocal line is written in a soprano clef and the keyboard realization in a bass clef. The keyboard realization uses a style of parallel motion with sixths and thirds to harmonize the vocal line.

If there is no need for the keyboardist to double the vocal line, one could leave out the singer's part and instead improvise simple chords underneath the melody line that fill in the basic harmonies but stay out of the singer's way.

Example 97. Author's Alternate Realization of Zelter, "Musen und Grazien," m. 1-4

The image shows a musical score for three staves. The top staff is a vocal line in treble clef, 2/4 time, D major. The lyrics are: "O wie ist die Stadt so we- itig, lasst die Müt- ter kü- nig ruhn. tut- sie". The middle staff is a right-hand accompaniment in treble clef, showing simple chords. The bottom staff is a left-hand accompaniment in bass clef, showing a simple bass line.

Although C. P. E. Bach wrote out his desired harmonies in most of his Lieder, a few consist only of two lines and suggest the need for additions to the accompaniment part. His "Lied" from Voss's 1782 *Musenalmanach* is one of those. While Bach's harmonies and counterpoint are more sophisticated than those of many contemporary Lied composers, the harmonies are still easily discerned from Bach's soprano and bass outline, and a simple, chordal accompaniment would not be difficult to improvise.

Example 98. C. P. E. Bach, "Ich ging unter Erlen" from Max Friedlaender, *Das deutsche Lied im 18. Jahrhundert*, vol. 2 (Hildesheim, NY: G. Olms, 1970)

Etwas langsam.



Ich ging un-ter Er-len am küh-li-gen

Bach, und dach-te wohl manchem und man-chem wohl

nach: es war mir im Her-zen so leicht und so

wohl: doch wurden von Thränen die Au-gen mir voll.

The following example shows one possible realization that fills in the harmony, but also maintains the period's recommended simplicity and naturalness, uses the recommended three-part texture for accompanying solo voices, and would still have been easy for amateurs to play.

Example 99. Author's Realization of C. P. E. Bach, "Ich ging unter Erlen"

The musical score is presented in four systems, each with a treble and bass clef staff. The key signature is one sharp (F#) and the time signature is 3/8. The lyrics are written below the treble staff of each system.

System 1: *Ich ging un- ter Er- len am küh- li- gen*

System 2: *Bach, und doch ic wohl man- chem und man- chem wohl*

System 3: *nach es wa me im Her- zen so lieb und so*

System 4: *wohl, doch wur- den von Thrä- nen die Au- gen mir voll.*

Intended Audience

These songs were meant for home entertainment, and were meant to appeal to a very broad audience, so the skeletal accompaniment structures offer much needed flexibility. By providing only a basic outline of an accompaniment, the keyboardist could adapt it to the skill level of the performers involved as well as to the particular instruments available. A very beginning keyboardist could stay close to what was written on the page and still have a complete piece with a correct soprano and bass line. An amateur with even the slightest knowledge of how to accompany unfigured basses could have easily added simple harmonies to the texture since the implied harmony is very clear from the soprano/bass outline. A more advanced accompanist could have taken it even further and incorporated tasteful nuances in order to bring out the text. The complexity of the accompaniment could also be varied depending on the comfort level of the singer, who was often one and the same person as the keyboard player.

Lieder were not performed in concert halls until the end of the nineteenth century.³⁶ Rather, the main performance venue was in the privacy of one's own home, either for personal enjoyment or for a small group of friends. Therefore, along with personal ability, personal taste must have played a large role in how these songs were performed. While there were certainly treatises available to offer performance suggestions, there were no music critics present at most of these home-made performances to ensure

³⁶For a brief history of the journey of the Lied to the public concert hall see Edward Kravitt, "The Lied in Nineteenth-Century Concert Life," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 18, no. 2 (1965): 207-218 and Vena Alesio, "Performance of the Song Cycle: An Historical Perspective," *The Nats Journal* 49, no. 2 (1992): 10-11.

that things were played or sung a certain way. Given the evidence presented above about the flexible nature of the score, there is no reason to think that individual performers might not have added whatever they liked and felt comfortable with to the score, adjusting to their instruments and performance skill.

Furthermore, popular sheet music today is published and performed in very much the same way. The printed music generally consists of only basic outlines of the melody and bass line, with a few filled-in chords here and there. While one could certainly play only what is written in the music, most people see the score as only a basic outline. Depending on the singer, performance venue, and skill level of the keyboard player any number of notes might be added or altered from the original score. There are often chord symbols in the music that suggest how chords can be filled out, but even without them there is enough information from the musical outline that is there to fill in basic harmonies.

Available Instruments

Another issue is which kind of keyboard instrument was available. Harpsichords, clavichords, and fortepianos were all used in the second half of the eighteenth century and not every player would have owned the same kind of keyboard instrument. Furthermore, throughout the period there was tremendous variation between instruments within the same family. *Robert Winter emphasizes this fact about the nineteenth century as well, writing that “The most important fact about the Romantic piano is that it was many*

pianos.”³⁷ By keeping the written accompaniments simple, if they so desired the performers could easily adapt the keyboard part to the instrument they had at home. For example, the sparse texture of the original version of the Lied might be enough for an instrument with a strong after-resonance, whereas other keyboards with drier, clearer tones would require more filling out of the harmony. More or fewer notes could be used to provide varying dynamics to bring out different words or to provide some variety between stanzas. Octave doublings of either part could be used to help support a louder singer, while the original texture would be more appropriate for a quieter one.

Consumer Culture

These simple Lieder were considered part of the popular music of the day, and much about the composition and printing of them was market driven. Lied composer Johann Friedrich Reichardt emphasizes the commercial nature of music in the late eighteenth century in a 1782 article containing his advice to young, aspiring musicians. He writes

I think the most important thing is that beautiful natural necessity [that is, the spontaneous creation of *Volkslieder*] has become art, and art nothing more than a trade. From the prince’s Oberkapellmeister down to the beer-fiddler who brings operetta into the farmer’s tavern, virtually everyone is now an imitative manual laborer for the going market rate. Most unfortunately, there are so many of them

³⁷Robert Winter, “Keyboards,” in *Performance Practice: Music After 1600*, eds. Howard Mayer Brown and Stanley Sadie (New York: W. W. Norton, 1990), 346. For more information on keyboards of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries see Rosenblum, *Performance Practices* and Robert Winter, “Orthodoxies, Paradoxes, and Contradictions: Performance Practices in Nineteenth-Century Piano Music,” in *Nineteenth-Century Piano Music*, ed. R. Larry Todd, 16-54 (New York: Schirmer Books, 1990).

that there can never be competition among the buyers, but always among the sellers. Therefore, then, even the highest goal of today's so-called artist is this: to satisfy the greatest quantity of his payer's follies at once.³⁸

As the patronage system declined, composers no longer knew their consumers personally and had to cater to musical amateurs and general, fashionable tastes.

Most eighteenth-century strophic Lieder were printed on only one page. Each stanza was only about sixteen to twenty measures long and only the words of the first stanza are printed underneath the assigned pitches. Any remaining stanzas were printed with text only at the bottom of the page underneath the complete notation of the song. As previously mentioned, the notation consists of only two staves with the right hand keyboard part sharing the same staff as the vocal line. This mode of publication was ingenious, as it was able to meet a wide variety of needs in a very small space.

C. P. E. Bach hints at this flexibility in the preface to his Gellert Lieder when he says that he added ornaments to his melodies not only to help out bumbling figured bass players, but also so the songs could also be used as *Handstücke*.³⁹ William Youngren comments on Bach's intentions writing that

At first glance, this is merely a clear declaration of what seems to have been Bach's usual intention in regard to the performance of his songs: he has included all the necessary harmony and ornaments, and he wants little or no filling out or other

³⁸Johann Friedrich Reichardt, "An junge Künstler," *Musikalisches Kunstmagazin* 1 (1782): 5. Quoted and Translated by David Gramit, "Selling the Serious: The Commodification of Music and Resistance to It in Germany, circa 1800," in *The Musician as Entrepreneur, 1700-1914*, ed. William Weber (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2004), 89. For a more expansive treatment of some of these issues see David Gramit, *Cultivating Music: The Aspirations, Interests, and Limits of German Musical Culture, 1770-1848* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002).

³⁹See the full quote in Chapter Two, page 48.

improvisation added by the keyboard accompanist. But fully notated, these pieces may also be used as “Handstücke”! The *New Grove* tells us that *Handstück* was “a term used by D. G. Türk for a didactic keyboard piece suitable for the development of a student’s technical proficiency,” a term superceded in the 19th century by *étude*...Bach is trying to have it all ways at once.⁴⁰

Bach is not the only one, however, who wanted “to have it all ways at once.” Since much of Lied publication was economically driven, the two-stave format was convenient because it was cheaper to print, cheaper to buy, and could supply what was needed for any number of musicians. As already mentioned, the songs could be used as written for solo vocalist with keyboard accompaniment or solo keyboard pieces. As songs, the accompaniments could be played as written or elaborated on depending on skill level. Furthermore, many Lieder with frequent thirds and sixths in the right hand part could easily be adapted to be a duet for two singers. In addition, it is possible that other instruments might have been used. Certainly a cello or other bass instrument could have played along, and other melody instruments could be substituted for the voice. Finally, since part of the attraction of these songs was the poetry, the texts could have been used for poetry readings even without the instruments.

Revisions and Expansions in Later Editions

The use of two staves was a good way to save space, and therefore money, but it appears that many composers would have done things differently if they had the option of

⁴⁰Youngren, 223. C. P. E. Bach was particularly known for being obsessed with financial matters and his letters show that he often made decisions about publication based on whether or not it would give him a good return on his investment. For more information see the preface to *The Letters of C. P. E. Bach*, trans. and ed. Stephen L. Clark (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997).

spreading things out over more stanzas or pages.⁴¹ In describing the situation in late eighteenth-century Weimar, Annie Randall states that the reasons for the simplicity and brevity of the popular Lieder were more than just an aesthetic choice. Practically speaking, the songs had to conform to this format because, due to printing costs, this was all editor Christoph Martin Wieland could fit on the page.⁴²

Furthermore, later printed editions of Lieder often expand on the original versions of the songs. Editions of Schubert songs with embellished vocal lines have already been mentioned above.⁴³ Although these editions only applied ornaments to the vocal line and the embellishments were added by people other than the composer, there are also examples of accompaniment revisions by the original composer. The best examples are found in many of the songs by Carl Friedrich Zelter. Before 1800 most of Zelter's solo Lieder were published in magazines or anthologies featuring multiple composers. After 1803, however, Zelter began to "improve" some of his earlier songs. These were not new compositions or new settings, but rather a transfer of the composition from two staves to

⁴¹Even earlier in the seventeenth century, it seems that cost considerations sometimes kept composers from writing other kinds of forms and accompaniments. According to R. Hinton Thomas, Heinrich Albert describes the fifth part of his famous *Arien* as containing some songs of "rather special quality." He goes on to say that had he not had to think about the cost, he would have given every line its own settings. In other words, he would have preferred a through-composed setting of the text, but it was much cheaper to print it strophically.

⁴²Randall, 60.

⁴³According to Will Crutchfield, English publishers also frequently added vocal ornaments to simple songs in the latter part of the Classical period. For example, Corri published ornamented versions of many of Haydn's songs in 1810. Will Crutchfield, "Voices," in *Performance Practice: Music After 1600*, 317-18.

three. In the process Zelter gave the vocal line a separate staff and added a more elaborate, independent accompaniment part.⁴⁴

The following example shows an early version of “An Mignon” (1801) in a two-stave format with simple quarter and half-note chords underneath the melody line and simple harmonies indicated by smaller notes.⁴⁵

Example 100. Zelter, “An Mignon” (1801), m. 6-11 from *Lieder*, Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 5 (Munich: G. Henle, 1995)

The image shows a musical score for two staves. The top staff is the vocal line, and the bottom staff is the piano accompaniment. The lyrics are: "Seuf, so wie bei dir, und so schmerzhaft, das ich dich jetzt in mir hab, denn wie bei dir." The score is in G major and 3/4 time. The vocal line consists of quarter and half notes, while the piano accompaniment consists of simple chords and smaller notes.

The later version (1806) contains three staves with a much more elaborate accompaniment.⁴⁶ The accompaniment uses the same harmonies, but is filled in with sixteenth-note figurations. There is no doubling of the vocal line in the accompaniment, and the two parts are completely independent of each other.

⁴⁴Reinhold Kubik, Introduction to *Zelter: Lieder*, Vol. 106 of *Das Erbe deutscher Musik*. Kubik carefully sets out the differences between improvements [*Verbesserung*], new versions, and new settings.

⁴⁵Zelter originally set the poem, at Goethe's request for Schiller's *Musenalmanach* (1797) and then published it in his own collection of *Zwölf Lieder am Clavier zu singen* (1801).

⁴⁶Zelter's "improved" version is located in an autograph, dated 16 August 1806 and is also featured in Ludwig Landshoff's edition of *Fünzig Lieder by Zelter*. (Mainz: Schott, 1932).

Example 101. Zelter, “An Mignon” (1806) m. 8-11 from *Carl Friedrich Zelter: Fünfzig Lieder*, ed. Ludwig Landshoff (Mainz: B. Schott’s Söhne, 1932)

Schmerzen, tief im Her - zen,
Schmerzen, fill im Her - zen,

im - mer mor - gens wie - der auf. 2. Kaum will
heim - lich bil - den - de - Gewalt.

decresc.

p

Zelter’s revisions may be responding to the changing styles at the turn of the nineteenth century. However, the expanded accompaniments also give credence to the possibility that Zelter may never have intended for the accompanist to slavishly follow the melody or play only what is written on the page. Since he does not change the basic structure or harmonies of the song, his later three-stave version may in fact be more what he had in mind all along.⁴⁷

⁴⁷Other of Zelter’s songs with multiple versions to compare are “Kennst du das Land,” and “An Mignon.”

Chords that are Difficult to Play

There is a further reason that Zelter probably never intended that the accompanist always duplicate the melody line in this song, despite the two stave set-up. In the above example from "An Mignon" there are several chords which would be practically impossible for a pianist to play. For example, if the accompanist were to play all of the notes on the second beat of measure 10 in the middle of the word "Morgens" it would require a reach of a tenth in the right hand part. It seems unlikely that Zelter would really have wanted someone to play all the parts since this reach of more than an octave would have been difficult for most, and does not fit with the promise of ease and pleasure usually associated with the genre. The fact that Zelter includes some of the notes in a smaller type implies that the vocal part and the keyboard part were independent. If the accompanist was not bound to the vocal line, there are possibilities for a more flexible and independent keyboard part in other songs as well.

Notes in Smaller Print

As in the first Zelter example above, Johann Friedrich Reichardt also provides smaller, optional notes in his *Lieder*. In this case, however, he is explicit about his flexible approach to the score, providing the optional notes for those at different skill levels and with different hand spans. He shows a particular concern for the young ladies, who were frequently the target audience of Lied composition, in the introductory material to his *Gesänge fürs schöne Geschlecht* (1775), in which he writes

With due consideration for the sensitive eyes and small hands of the fair sex, I have written the middle voice that is worked into the texture, in small notes, so that you [the fair sex] may more easily distinguish the notes that are to be sung from those that are only for the clavier, and also so that you will be able to determine more readily which notes you can leave out, if the pretty little hand won't stretch, and you would rather only play the vocal line [with the right hand]. This also applies to the small notes in the bass, so that you can find the real bass line more easily, because I was truly worried about envious, red, and squinting eyes.⁴⁸

The following example, from "Elegie auf ein Landmädchen," illustrates the small notes Reichardt was describing.

Example 102. Reichardt, "Elegie auf ein Landmädchen", m. 19-22 from *Goethes Lieder, Oden, Balladen und Romanzen mit Musik*, Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 58 (Munich: G. Henle, 1964-70)

Measures 19-22, in particular, show a clear distinction between the bass notes, vocal line and accompaniment. Reichardt gives his performers the option of playing only the outer parts if that is all their hands can reach, but he also provides a fully realized right hand part. Furthermore, Reichardt's filled-in accompaniment could easily be played without.

⁴⁸Johann Friedrich Reichardt, *Gesänge fürs schöne Geschlecht* (Berlin: Friedrich Wilhelm Birnstein, 1775), afterward to the preface. Translated by Head, "Music for the Fair Sex," 221.

always doubling the vocal line. For example, in measure 21 on the word “Mutter,” it makes more sense for the accompanist to continue in the repeated sixteenth-note chord pattern playing only the small notes rather than jumping up to the high E in the vocal part and playing a four-notes chord with a large reach.

Other Lied composers of the period also use these notes in smaller type to distinguish between melody and accompaniment in the two-stave format. For example, the accompaniment for Zelter’s “Feenreigen,” illustrated below, features several measures in which the accompaniment continues the established figuration while the melody deviates from the top line of the keyboard part. Zelter indicates the vocal melody with larger notes and the keyboard part with smaller ones.

Example 103. Zelter, “Feenreigen,” m. 11-12 from *Schillers Musen-Almanach für das Jahr 1798* (Tübingen: J. G. Cottaischen Buchhandlung, 1798)

The image shows a musical score for two staves, treble and bass clef, in 3/4 time. The treble staff contains the vocal melody with larger notes, and the bass staff contains the keyboard accompaniment with smaller notes. The lyrics are: Pur- pur- ne Flöck- chen und.

Zelter uses this concept of smaller notes most frequently in his Lieder from Schiller’s *Musenalmanach* of 1797-1800. Most of the songs have a basic two-part texture with a clear soprano and bass line. The smaller notes that occasionally appear between these lines are presumably meant as a suggested realization of the keyboard part.

These examples of the separation of melody and accompaniment show that the top-line melody is essentially the voice part and the accompanist does not always have to double it. This same approach might also be applied to other *Lieder* of the period that do not necessarily use the different sizes of type settings. Furthermore, the examples indicate a more flexible approach to the musical score. As Reichardt openly states, the music could easily be adapted to the individual performers, depending on their level of comfort, by including more or fewer notes in the accompaniment. The smaller notes are only a suggested realization, with the option of providing one's own based on the soprano and bass lines.

Strophic Songs

One final consideration that points to the possibility of elaborating on the original score is the expectation of the period that the performer would add some kind of ornamentation on repeated sections. This is important to understand since the most common song form was strophic, with each stanza repeating the same music. There is no question that vocal lines had to be adjusted in order to accommodate the slight variations of accents, poetic rhythms, and textual expression from strophe to strophe.⁴⁹ Vocal ornamentation was also a frequent way to bring out words in different stanzas, as evidenced in Vogl's editions of Schubert's songs, mentioned above.

⁴⁹See for example, Johann Adam Hiller's "Vorbericht" to his *Lieder mit Melodien* (1772) in which he advises the singer to introduce small variations of the notes from verse to verse. J. A. P. Schulz, in his article on "Veränderungen; Variationen" for Johann Georg Sulzer's *Allgemeine Theorie der schönen Künste* (1774), also acknowledges the necessity of these slight alterations of rhythm, accent, and even melody for the different stanzas.

What about the accompanist? The directions given to keyboard players in other sources of the time provide some clues. In the forward to his first collection of *Sonaten für Clavier mit veränderten Reprisen* (1760), which were composed for amateur musicians, C. P. E. Bach writes that “Today varied reprises are indispensable, being expected of every performer.” He describes how performers love to “vary every detail” and listeners applaud it. However, he cautions that the variations ought to honor the original piece and be used in moderation. He concludes, however that “regardless of these difficulties and abuses, good variation always retains its value.”⁵⁰ Later in the eighteenth century, Türk writes that extempore embellishments are best used when the composition is repeated and “which would otherwise not be interesting enough and consequently become tedious.”⁵¹

As quoted above, Robert Levin believes that there is much evidence for improvisation in Schubert’s instrumental music. He goes on to write that “In particular, Schubert continues the tradition of embellishing themes when they recur, but leaves up to the performer the evolution of such embellishment when repeat signs are used.” This guideline could easily be applied to Schubert’s strophic Lieder as well. Although Schubert does compose more complex accompaniments with embellishments written in, he also has many strophic songs that have music for only one strophe followed by a repeat sign for the others.

⁵⁰Translated by Mitchell in Bach, *Essay*, 166f.

⁵¹Türk, *School of Clavier Playing*, 311.

For example, subtle modifications to the five stanzas in Schubert's "Jägers Liebeslied" (1827) help bring out various points in the text and prevent monotony. The poem by Schober describes a hunter who sings that even though he is tough on the exterior from his hunting and shooting all day, he has experienced the tenderness of love. Aside from very slight modifications on the last stanza, Schubert sets each verse to an identical four-part accompaniment with a consistent texture throughout the song. The jaunty folk-like nature of the melody suggests that the accompaniment remain fairly simple, but several easy adjustments can be made without turning the keyboard part into a concerto.

Example 104. Schubert, "Jägers Liebeslied" m.1-10 from
Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke, series 4,
 vol. 5 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)

1. Ich
 2. Hab
 3. Der
 4. O
 5. Wenn

1. schieß den Hirsch im grün-ten Forst, im still-ten Thal das Reh, --
 2. oft... han-delt in ran-her Zeit, in Sturm und Win-ter - nach, --
 3. wil - de Falk war mein Ge-sell, der Wolf mein Kampfge - spann; --
 4. Schü-fer auf dem wei-chen Moos, der du mit Blu - men spielt, --
 5. sie... dann auf mich nie - der-sieht, wenn mich ihr Blick durch - glüht, --

In the second verse the hunter describes how strong he must be in order to survive his calling, since he often has to walk through rough storms with snow and ice, and make his bed on rocks and thorns. In order to portray musically the strength the hunter is describing, one possible variation would be to take the top three notes of the chord with the right hand and add octaves in the bass.

Example 105. Author's Modifications to Schubert, "Jägers Liebeslied," m. 6-9

The musical score for Example 105 consists of three staves. The top staff is the vocal line, written in G major (one sharp) and 6/8 time. The lyrics are: "oft han-tiert in rau-ber Zeit in Sturm und Win-ter nacht". The middle and bottom staves are the piano accompaniment. The right hand plays a series of chords, primarily triads, while the left hand plays a rhythmic pattern of eighth notes, often an octave below the right hand. The key signature and time signature are consistent with the original piece.

After the long list of the hardships he has faced he provides a contrasting statement: "And yet my tough heart has experienced the tender dream of love." (*Doch hat der Liebe zarten Traum die rauhe Brust gespürt*). At this point it makes sense to go back to the original lighter texture and division of notes between the hands. The two different textures, one heavy and one light, musically portray the different images and emotions the hunter is describing.

Example 106. Schubert, "Jägers Liebeslied" m. 23-27 from *Neue Ausgabe sämtliche Werke*, series 4, vol. 5 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964)

1. und den-noch hab ich har-ter Mann die Lie-be auch ge - fñhlt, — und
 2. doch hat der Lie - be zar-ten Traum die ran-he Brust ge - spñrft, — doch
 3. und den-noch schlug die Lie-be mir ins wil-de Jä - ger - blut, — und
 4. schwebt kö-nigs - hehr die Licht-ge-stalt, wie ste kein Mei-ster malt, schwebt
 5. als wenn der al - ler - be - ste Freund mich in die Ar-me schließt, als

The musical score consists of a vocal line and a piano accompaniment. The piano part features a prominent ornament in the right hand during the fourth stanza, marked with a forte (f) dynamic. The lyrics are printed below the vocal line, with some words in German and some in English in parentheses.

In the fourth stanza the hunter speaks to a nearby shepherd saying "O shepherd on the soft moss, playing with flowers, Who knows whether you feel love as warmly or as much as I." (*O Schäfer auf dem weichen Moos, der du mit Blumen spielst, Wer weiss, ob du so heiss, so gross, wie ich, die Liebe fñhlt*). This text for this stanza is the lightest and most playful of all five in the poem and therefore small embellishments are most appropriate here. Musically the word "Blumen" is emphasized the most since it is the highest note of the phrase. This also seems an appropriate word to highlight with an ornament in the accompaniment to illustrate the idea that the shepherd is "playing" with the flowers. The following alteration is in keeping with the ornament that Schubert uses in the introduction.

Example 107. Author's modification of "Jägers Liebeslied" m.9-10

The image shows a musical score for a vocal line and a piano accompaniment. The vocal line is in G major (one sharp) and 6/8 time. The lyrics are "du_ mit Blu- men spielst_". The piano accompaniment is in the same key and time signature, featuring a simple harmonic accompaniment with a trill ornament above the first measure.

Other early nineteenth-century evidence for improvising embellishments in the repeated sections of keyboard music come from Gustav Schilling, a contemporary of Schubert, whose writings on the subject show that literal repeats are not preferable. He writes that

...a fitting place for free ornamentation would be in the repeats of a particularly long theme or movement...and similarly, we find other forms and places where we can apply this kind of ornamentation, namely in what are called 'rondo-like' compositions. In such work, where the composer himself has not supplied ornamentation, the player can and must apply it himself rather than merely repeat [the material]⁵²

The possibility of modifying strophic accompaniments is also provided by some written-out accompaniments from the end of the eighteenth century. In the following example, "Bergschloß," J. F. Reichardt wrote out two different accompaniments, one for the first six stanzas and another for the last seven.

⁵²Gustav Schilling, *Musikalische Dynamik* (Kassel, 1843), 255. Translated by David Montgomery, 205. Schilling is frequently used by Levin, Mussard, and Dürr to support improvisation in Schubert's music.

Example 108. Reichardt, Opening of "Bergschloß" (Stanza 1-6) from *Goethes Lieder, Oden, Balladen und Romanzen mit Musik*, Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 58 (Munich: G. Henle, 1964-70)

Nicht zu geschwind

1. Da dro - ben auf je - nem Ber - ge, da steht ein al - tes Schloß,

p *pf* *p* *cresc.* *f*

p (coll' sba)

Example 109. Reichardt, "Bergschloß" (Stanza 7-13) from *Goethes Lieder, Oden, Balladen und Romanzen mit Musik*, Das Erbe deutscher Musik, no. 58 (Munich: G. Henle, 1964-70)

Zu den Strophen 7 bis 13

7. Doch als mit Zit - her und Fla - - sche nach die - sen fel - si - gen

p *pf* *p* *cresc.* *f*

The vocal part remains basically the same with both accompaniments, with the last phrase sung a third higher and a brief coda on the last stanza. The bass notes of the accompaniment and the basic harmonies also stay the same except for the chords in the antepenultimate bar. Reichardt, however, changes the figurations in the right hand. The first six stanzas use three note chords with a continuo-like texture moving in the same

rhythm as the left hand. In the last seven stanzas the right hand chords are broken into a steady sixteenth-note pattern.⁵³

Reichardt's accompaniment shows that keyboard players were free to modify the strophes both to bring out the text and to provide variety. While not every composer was at liberty to write out every stanza because of the publication costs, as discussed above, this does not mean that they never intended the singer and accompanist to vary the music slightly from strophe to strophe. This idea is present in the continuo treatises as well. Edward Miller, in his *Elements of Thoroughbass and Composition* (1787) encourages variation in continuo accompaniment and typically provided several possible realizations for each of his vocal examples, usually one with chords and one with arpeggiated figures. C. P. E. Bach also recommends that arpeggiated or broken chords can be used in the right hand to vary the texture.⁵⁴

These kinds of variations might be applied to other strophic songs as well, such as Reichardt's setting of Herder's "O weh, o weh" from 1781. Reichardt's original setting uses two staves, one for the left hand playing single bass notes, and the other for the vocal line and the right hand three-note chords, as seen in the following example.

⁵³For other good examples of these kinds of strophic accompaniment modifications see Haydn's "Beim Schmerz der dieses Herz durchwühlet" (written between 1765 and 1775) and "Pleasing Pain" (1794)

⁵⁴Bach, *Essay*, 396.

Example 110. Reichardt, "O weh, o weh" m. 1-2 from Max Friedlaender, *Das deutsche Lied im 18. Jahrhundert*, vol. 2 (Hildesheim, NY: G. Olms, 1970)

The image shows a musical score for two staves. The top staff is in treble clef, and the bottom staff is in bass clef. The key signature has three flats (B-flat, E-flat, A-flat), and the time signature is 6/4. The melody in the right hand consists of quarter notes and half notes. The lyrics "O weh, o weh, hin-ab ins Thal, und" are written below the right-hand staff. The left hand provides a simple harmonic accompaniment with sustained notes.

The written-out version uses this same texture throughout, but playing this exactly the same way for all five strophes would get monotonous. A simple remedy is to modify the right-hand rhythm. This provides variety, but still keeps the accompaniment part in the background as a simple harmonic support. It is also possible to vary the bass part by adding octaves or modifying the rhythm on long, sustained notes. The following examples demonstrate two possibilities. The first uses a triplet rhythm in the right hand and a slightly altered rhythm in the left.

Example 111. Author's modified accompaniment for Reichardt, "O weh, o weh," m. 1-2

The image shows a musical score for two staves. The top staff is in treble clef, and the bottom staff is in bass clef. The key signature has three flats (B-flat, E-flat, A-flat), and the time signature is 6/4. The right hand features a triplet rhythm of eighth notes. The left hand has a modified accompaniment with sustained notes and a slightly altered rhythm compared to the original.

The second possible accompaniment uses an eighth-note pattern in the right hand with octaves in the bass.

Example 112. Second modified accompaniment for Reichardt, "O weh, o weh," m.1-2

The musical score for Example 112 consists of two staves. The upper staff is in treble clef with a key signature of two flats (B-flat and E-flat) and a 3/4 time signature. It contains an eighth-note arpeggiated pattern. The lower staff is in bass clef with the same key signature and time signature, featuring a simple octave accompaniment.

For a strophic song that already features an arpeggiated accompaniment, such as Ruprecht's "Das verliebte Mädchen," variety could be achieved by combining the notes into block chords.

Example 113. Ruprecht, "Das verliebte Mädchen" m. 1-8 from Max Friedlaender, *Das deutsche Lied im 18. Jahrhundert*, vol. 2 (Hildesheim, NY: G. Olms, 1970)

The musical score for Example 113 is presented in two systems. The first system includes a vocal line in treble clef with the lyrics "Nichts kann mir Freu - de mehr ge - wöh-ren," and a piano accompaniment in bass clef. The piano part features an arpeggiated pattern in the right hand and a simple accompaniment in the left hand, marked with a piano (*p*) dynamic. The second system continues the vocal line with the lyrics "bei al - lem sitz ich kalt und stumm!" and the piano accompaniment, which is marked with a crescendo (*crese.*) dynamic.

Example 114. Author's modified accompaniment for Ruprecht, "Das verliebte Mädchen,"
m.1-4



Any of these modifications could easily be performed by an amateur.

In the early nineteenth century, even though many through-composed Lieder were being written, strophic songs remained popular, partially because so many of the poems composers chose to set were strophic. Composers such as Beethoven, Schubert, and Mendelssohn often chose to write in a modified strophic form, using the same basic melody and harmony throughout with slight variations in the melody or accompanying figures in each verse. By using a modified strophic form composers could still treat the poet's original text with integrity, but bring out the text further *with slight changes*. Perhaps the popularity of these modified strophic forms in the early nineteenth century is representative of a written-out version of a practice that was already taking place in the music of Reichardt and others at the end of the eighteenth century.

Conclusion

Just as continuo practice remained an influence in other musical genres of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, the practice is clearly present in the Lied as well. The most obvious evidence is that a number of composers, including many who are well

known, continued to include figured basses in the published music until at least 1804. Some of these songs, such as “Philint Stand” by Georg Benda, illustrated in Chapter Four, resemble a Baroque continuo Lied with only a melody and a figured bass line that needed to be realized. Furthermore, unfigured basses were becoming increasingly popular throughout the eighteenth century and many composers published similar songs with only a melody and an unfigured bass, which the consumer could have filled in with chords. In addition to the look of the music on the page, the overarching priorities of late eighteenth-century and early nineteenth-century Lied composers were not that different from their seventeenth-century counterparts who were writing actual continuo Lieder. These priorities included simple, strophic songs with lighthearted texts and with music that could easily be sung and played by amateur musicians in social settings.

In addition, eighteenth-century Lied composers also used figured basses in dramatic songs, to imitate an operatic recitative style and provide the singer more flexibility to declaim the text in an expressive and speech-like way. Figures were also used frequently in sacred Lieder, particularly the Psalm settings of the Swiss composers. This is not surprising considering that figured basses were especially long lasting in both opera and church music of the time. As described in Chapter Three, performers who wanted to understand how to realize the figured basses in these songs had ample resources in the over 60 published treatises on the subject, many of which were targeted at middle-class amateurs.

Even as composers started composing fuller keyboard parts, my analyses in Chapters Four and Five show that a large portion of these written-out accompaniments

still use figurations that are unmistakably reminiscent of earlier continuo practices. One of the most obvious similarities is in the number of notes and how they are distributed between the hands. For accompanying a solo part the treatises generally recommend a fairly sparse texture with three or four notes, with the left hand playing only the bass line and the right hand playing the rest of the harmony, and this is exactly what appears in many of the Lieder. In sacred songs, a chorale-like accompaniment style with the notes divided evenly between the hands is also present. In addition to the obvious note distributions Lied composers also follow general continuo guidelines when it comes to octave doublings, avoidance of parallel intervals, and the relationship of the accompaniment to the solo line. Furthermore, some of the more complex Lied accompaniments from the nineteenth century draw on common continuo techniques for filling in the chords with various arpeggiations.

The evidence for the influence of continuo practice on the composition of Lied accompaniments is significant not only because it adds to the growing body of research that shows continuo practice remained a factor in composition and performance much longer than is commonly assumed, but also because of the ramifications for performance practice. Since continuo accompaniments were originally improvised, and since there is so much evidence of continuo practice in the written accompaniments, there are many reasons to assume that improvisation still happened in the late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century accompaniments as well.

Musicians during the period had a very flexible approach to the score, including that of the Lied, and did not see it as definitive. The social climate of the time also

encouraged performance flexibility in the Lieder. The intended audience was amateur musicians who would have been more concerned with their own personal tastes, as well as “fashionable taste,” than with what the musical elite considered “artistic.” The flexible two-stave structure of the printed Lieder allowed performers to adapt songs to their skill levels, tastes, and whatever instrument they had at home. Furthermore, composers and publishers liked the one-page setup of the musical score since it was a cheap way to *provide a number of musical options with only one printing.*

Other evidence in the printed music, such as chords that would be difficult to play as written and notes in smaller type, show that the accompanist had more flexibility and was *not locked into doubling the vocal line.* Furthermore, recent research on Schubert’s Lieder allows for ornamenting the vocal lines, altering the accompaniments, and improvising introductions to songs that did not originally include them. Also, new and “improved” versions of Schubert’s and Zelter’s songs by the composers themselves are basically elaborations on the original scores and indicate that they would have preferred a more complex accompaniment had it not been for publication costs. The prevailing attitude about altering repeated sections suggests that strophic accompaniments should also be varied from verse to verse.

There are three main arguments against additions to the printed musical score, but all are unsatisfactory given the evidence presented in this study. First of all, some argue that since composers were writing out more explicit directions in the score they must have included everything they meant to and any additions would be inappropriate. However, the evidence presented above in Chapter Six shows that this idea of the inviolability of the

score is just not true. A through-composed Lied, such as Schubert's "Gretchen am Spinnrade," in which the accompaniment has an integrated role in the drama as the representation of the spinning wheel, are already quite complex and probably do not need any amplifications or changes. On the other hand, even Schubert modified his own "Erlkönig," a song whose accompaniment functions similarly to "Gretchen," for ease of performance. Furthermore, certainly not every song is as well developed as "Gretchen" or "Erlkönig." There are many songs well into the nineteenth century whose accompaniments are very simple and serve only as harmonic support to the voice, and these would be the best candidates for improvisation.

A second argument against improvisation in the Lied is that adding to the original score would ruin the simple, natural effect Krause describes as ideal in his *Von der musikalischen Poesie*. Krause insisted that accompaniments should remain in the background and serve only as a vehicle for delivering the text. It is true that adding extensive embellishments could take away from the simplicity of an eighteenth-century Lied, but the modifications need not be complex. Simply filling in the harmonies implied by the outlines provides more support for the singer without taking away from the text. The continuo treatises provide suggestions on where embellishments would be most appropriate, including when the soloist is holding a long note or not singing, especially at slower tempos. Following this advice will keep the accompaniment from getting in the way. Additions may not always be appropriate, and they certainly do not need to be applied every time, but that does not mean they never were. In fact, in simple strophic

Lieder some variation in the accompaniment could actually help the singer bring out the text more effectively, as I demonstrated with Schubert's "Jägers Liebeslied."

Finally, some argue that amateurs were not capable of a more complex style of accompaniment. Certainly some were not and it would be possible for them to have played only what was written on the page. However, many continuo treatises were written specifically for the amateur, and with some rudimentary study most would be capable of filling in the few basic harmonies required for the simple Lieder of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. The average late eighteenth-century musician might not be able to supply chords for the complex figured basses of someone from an earlier generation like J. S. Bach, but this is not the kind of music most were playing. As musical styles changed and harmonic rhythm slowed down it would have been the ideal time for amateurs to learn the basics of continuo playing. These basic principles of continuo playing could have easily been applied to the simple Lieder of the period, most of which use only a few diatonic chords and would not necessitate extensive training.

There is a need for a reevaluation of both eighteenth- and nineteenth-century Lieder. The eighteenth-century Lied continues to be largely neglected by scholars, dismissed as unimportant and unrelated to what followed in the nineteenth century. However, these simple Lieder should not be so easily ignored, as they represent one of the most important and popular genres among amateurs with literally thousands being composed and published during the period. Modern performers need to study the important continuo treatises of the period, such as those by C. P. E. Bach and Türk, to better understand how to approach this repertoire. We need to move beyond what is on

the page in order to understand that in their original context these songs represented unique personal expressions offered to friends in intimate settings, and would have been very meaningful to those involved. The performance possibilities afforded by a more flexible approach to the score, and the recapturing of the original performance ethos would discourage people from describing the songs as “anemic.”

Furthermore, the traditional definition of the nineteenth-century Lied which is represented by only a few “forward-looking” songs from the period is inadequate and needs reexamination. Many more simple songs were being written in the first half of the nineteenth century than has been commonly acknowledged. The eighteenth-century prescriptions of simplicity and naturalism were still priorities for many nineteenth-century composers, including the most well-known, and *Lieder for Hausmusik* were still popular with amateurs throughout the century.

In addition, the traditional view of the nineteenth-century Lied score as a sacred entity needs to be questioned. There is much evidence to show that improvisation in the Lied was an accepted practice by performers, audiences, and composers alike. In particular the simple, strophic *Lieder* of the early nineteenth century lend themselves most readily to accompaniment modifications. Most keyboardists already feel free to vary certain musical elements, such as articulation and dynamics, even when they are not written in the score. Accompanists should explore the possibility of varying embellishments and keyboard figurations as well. One place to start would be with Schubert’s song cycle *Die schöne Müllerin*. There is already evidence that the vocal line was frequently modified with ornamentation. Furthermore, most of the songs in the cycle

have much in common with earlier Lieder as they are short, simple, strophic, and use folk-like melodies. Finally, the majority of the songs, like those in many of Schubert's other Lieder discussed in this study, use the traditional divided accompaniment as well as common continuo techniques for filling in the accompaniment with various kinds of broken chords.

Lied composers were not composing in a vacuum, and their Lieder need to be understood and evaluated in the context of what was going on around them, as well as what had come before. In particular, this dissertation shows that one of the ways late eighteenth-century and early nineteenth-century Lieder can be understood in their historical context is through the continuing influence of continuo practice on song accompaniments.

Appendix A: General Information Regarding Continuo Treatises, 1750-1808

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Reinhard: Kurzer und deutlicher Unterricht von dem General-Bass (1750)		beginners; the first half is dedicated to instruction in clefs, notes, meters, rests, etc	to provide clear rules and easy examples so beginners can learn the useful science of thorough bass quickly and easily	all practical	none specifically	wants a good balance between detailed, clear rules and copious examples; most chapters illustrated with tables and musical examples	clearer rules, brief but more informative	very basic, avoids issues of expression to focus on the forming of chords for the beginners	60
Nauss: Gründlicher Unterricht den General-Bass (1751)		beginners	a thorough instruction in Figured Bass which some good friends asked him to write; focuses especially on how to figure bass lines (13-32)	practical	acknowledges his reliance on other famous authors, but does not want to name-drop as is the recent fashion of the day	demonstrates how to figure bass lines of any number of ascending and descending notes (e.g. if there are four notes ascending use these chords, if five use these....)		uses Latin names and phrases throughout	32
Quantz: Versuch (1752)	Frederick the Great	says it is for beginning musicians of all kinds, but the accompanying section with its focus on subtlety and taste is probably too detailed and advanced for amateurs	main purpose is to teach the rudiments of flute playing, but includes a chapter on accompanying well (Ch. 7); also sections on good taste and style, the qualities necessary to become a musician, and how to judge music and musicians	practical	refers to J. S. Bach as one of the greatest of all keyboard players (232)	only very brief illustrations	useful for all musicians; focus on training skilled and intelligent musicians in good taste, rather than just the mechanics	also a Lied composer; G. M. Telemann said every budding accompanist should learn Quantz's chapter on the subject by heart (<i>Telemann: Unterricht</i> , 11)	334 (100 pages on acc.)

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Corrette: <i>Le Maître de clavecin</i> (1753)		amateur beginners	a short and easy method to explain the "supposed difficulties which the enemies of good harmony take care to spread about."	calls it a "theoretical and practical method"	preface gives a short history of music accompanied by <i>continuo</i> in France and highlights important composers around Europe, especially Corelli; also mentions Handel (England), Rameau (France), Telemann (Germany), D. Scarlatti (Spain); mentions earlier treatises by Bovin, St. Lambert, Keller, etc.	range from short, repetitive exercises to short pieces and sonatas; refers to numerous other compositions not printed in his treatise with specific pages and relevant measure numbers	those who follow his method will make more progress in six months than in ten years with other methods	includes a short glossary of the most common Italian musical terms; also chapters on tuning and stringing the harpsichord	94
La Porte: <i>Traité Théorique et pratique de l'accompagnement</i> (1753)	Mlle. Le Duc	amateurs	to demonstrate principles of harmony and theory quickly and easily with the use of examples from keyboard accompaniment	theoretical and practical; says one cannot come to like harmony without first wanting to understand the keyboard and accompaniment; focuses mostly on practical formation of chords, but does give an explanation of how to find the intervals and fundamental chords in nature		roughly 1/2 of the work is examples; shows short chord progressions in every key with different numbers of parts; examples get longer and longer as the treatise progresses		Title page indicates that La Porte was an organist in Paris; the work shows the influence of Rameau's theories	58

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Dubugrarre: Méthode plus courte et plus facile (1754)	"aux dames"	simple enough that "even women" can understand	to provide a method that will not bore people so much that they abandon the study of accompaniment; sole objective is to explain the difficulties of accompaniment in a way that is clear and simple	practical	Pellegrini, Corelli, Pergolesi, Scarlatti, Handel, le Clerc, Rameau, Mondonville, Corrette, Fouquet, Dubouset	16 pages printed at the end (referred to throughout); very systematic introduction to clefs, scales, and the formation of chords in every key; several (unrealized) airs and a minuet to practice on	shorter and clearer; method will be useful in accompanying all kinds of music ranging from airs, symphonies, songs, etc.; for accompanying one's self or others	the only author who consistently advocates at least five parts in the texture at all times; the title page indicates that Dubugrarre was "organiste de Saint-Sauveur et Maître de Clavecin"	20 (plus 16 pages of music)
Daube: General-Bass in drey Accorden (1756)	Prince Carl, Duke of Württemberg and Teck	beginners; "It is not necessary for one who already knows and practices thorough bass to read this treatise anyway. It was not written for him."	to teach thorough bass and composition (preluding and setting a bass line to a melody) to beginners with only three primary chords	mostly practical; recommends letting "the ear advise" rather than the rules; often includes theoretical explanations of the chords--says that without sufficient theory one can not every really learn thorough bass completely, but with a theoretical knowledge even those with modest ability can play extremely well	Heinichen, Fux, Mattheson, J.S. Bach, C. P. E. Bach; Handel, title says that it is "based upon the rules of old and new"; gives a brief history of music from the creation of the world through Guido d'Arezzo noting the side-by-side growth of music and religion	charts of all the modulations in various keys, but no lengthy musical examples for practice	easier to learn--only three simple rules instead of having to learn chords for each bass note	all harmonies come from one of three fundamental chords (I, IV, V7); mostly talking about the current state of music: frequently mentions "today's taste," "today's music," and chords that "are in vogue nowadays"	215 (plus 16 page intro)

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Geminiani: The Art of Accompaniment (1756)		industrious people who want to learn the art on their own or with the assistance of a master teacher; the Learner should already be acquainted with the basics of music (clefs, notes, measures, keys, concords, discords)	a "new and well digested" method to "learn to perform the Thorough Bass on the Harpsichord with propriety and elegance"; Vol II: treats position and motion of harmony and the preparation and resolution of discords	completely practical; criticized by some of his contemporaries for his lack of theoretical explanations		majority of the treatise is figured bass exercises for practice with brief explanations of the examples at the beginning of each part; often gives several possible realizations for each example	bears "little resemblance" to other books on the subject because "it is impossible to arrive at the just performance of thorough bass by the help of any, or all of the books hitherto published."	Published three versions around the same time: one in English, one in French, and one in Italian; F. T. Arnold writes that Geminiani's treatise is unique in that he speaks not as an accompanist, but "as a soloist telling us how he likes to be accompanied!" (Arnold, 468)	I: 33; 2: 36
Adlung: Anleitung zu der Musikalischen Gelahrtheit (1758)	Elias Friedrich Heitmann, Christian Reichard, Christoph Reichard	scholars and amateurs alike; lovers of musical science, composition, keyboard instruments	a compendium of all his musical knowledge including: the history of music, music and mathematics, problems of tuning, history, registration, construction costs of the organ, descriptions of other musical instruments, the art of singing, figured bass (Ch. 14), chorales, improvisation, composition, and Italian tablature	covers a variety of practical and theoretical subjects	gives a history of figured bass practice beginning with Viadana and followed by a lengthy overview of treatises by authors such as Agazzario, Campion, Crüger, Daube, Gasparini, Heinichen, Justinus a Despons, Keller, Kellner, Kresse, Lambert, Marpurg, Mattheson, Mitzler, Nauss, Niedts, Quantz, Rameau, Reinhard, Sorge, Schröter, Telemann, Werkmeister, C. P. E. Bach, and many others (627-640)	only a few short examples to illustrate some of his points		forward by Johann Ernst Bach; focused especially on the organ	814 (30 pages on fig. bass)

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Clément : Essai sur l'accompagnement du clavecin (1758)		does not specify, but begins with very basic information such as intervals and scales	to learn to accompany with or without figures easily and in a short amount of time, by the most clear and simple principles of composition	intended for practical use, but also talks about the science of music, mathematical justifications, and fundamental bass	Rameau; says he relied strongly on Brossard's dictionary and a review of it from 1761; Zarlino	tables describing all chords, the rule of the octave, and fundamental bass; lesson for practicing the "Règle de l'octave" ascending and descending, as well as progressions according to fundamental bass		a revised and enlarged version of this and his essay on fundamental bass appeared in 1775 and continued to be reprinted until 1792	22
Heck: Short and Fundamental Instructions for Learning Thorough Bass (1760)		anyone interested in more than just "Learning to play after the notes"; sometimes gives several different explanations with one geared toward young beginners	chief intent is to make thorough bass intelligible "to the meanest Capacity" without turning people off by jumbles of figures and rules	title page states that the treatise will lead to a complete understanding both of the Theory and Practice of Thoroughbass; much of the treatise is devoted to how each chord relates to the basic triad (trias harmonica)		no examples for practice, only illustrations of his main points	presenting the "shortest and most certain way"	Wrote a longer work on thorough bass in 1777 (see below)	22

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Marpurg: Handbuch bey dem Generalbasse und der Composition (1755, 1757, 1758, 1760)	Johann Mattheson (I); Carl Heinrich Graun (II)	Vol I begins with a short instruction in Generalbass for the beginner in harmony, but most of the work is too advanced for an amateur	practical introduction to composition and a harmonic handbook	both--explains theoretical principles and then applies them to composition	Mattheson; C. H. Graun; C. P. E. Bach; Quantz; Rameau; Riepel; Riedt; Benda; Fux; Kuhnau; Pepusch; Telemann; Sorge; Scheibe	many illustrative examples located at the end of each chapter and referred to by number in the next; very few actually use figured bass symbols		also a Lied composer	341 (plus 25 pages of music)
Rameau: Code de Musique Pratique (1760)		contains some basic information (learning to read music, hand position at the keyboard, etc.), but quickly moves beyond beginners	comprehensive treatise on many musical subjects; Chapters 5 and 15 are on accompaniment with and without figures	title states that it is practical, but there is also a heavy theoretical emphasis, including numerous theoretical descriptions throughout of the fundamental bass	none in the accompaniment sections	most lessons illustrated by exercises, but all are printed at the end of the book; Rameau repeatedly insists that students practice each exercise until it can be played automatically before moving on to the next lesson	teaches how to play all sorts of chord progressions and only then explains how to recognize which progression belongs over a given basso continuo (the opposite of most authors)	shows a concern for the blind who want to learn music and sought to develop a system of notation for them; emphasizes the need for all players to rely on trained ears (since the ear always prefers what is found in nature) and fingers rather than sight	185 (plus 33 pages of music)

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
C. P. E. Bach: Versuch (1753, 1762)		students and amateurs who have been misled by poor teachers; the accompanist who desires "good taste" in addition to technique; beginners are mentioned, but it is expected that the student has already played a considerable amount of music	to make practical, easy, and agreeable many aspects of keyboard playing--solo and accompanying	practical, based on wisdom and personal experience	Couperin, Telemann, Graun, J.S. Bach, Quantz, Leclair	short illustrative examples throughout the text; Part One includes eighteen short movements (combining to create six sonatas) in progressive order of difficulty (published separately); Part Two contains no complete musical work	focus on artistic accompaniment; says that present taste requires new and unusual harmonies and the previous rules are no longer sufficient	also a Lied composer; treatise had widespread influence: Rust, J. F. Reichardt, Haydn, Neefe, Mozart, Beethoven, Clementi, Czerny, among others used it for their teaching and personal study	I: 135, II: 341 (plus 16 pages of music)
Clément: Essai sur la basse fondamentale (1762)	Monsieur de la Borde, receveur général des finances	those who know little about melody, harmony, and fundamental bass, which are essential to composition	supplement to his original essay on accompaniment and an introduction to practical composition	explains harmonic principles found in nature with their practical applications to composition	Zarlino, Rameau, D'Alembert	tables of progressions according to fundamental bass and the ranges of voices and instruments; three longer examples of composition		a revised and enlarged version of this and his essay on accompaniment appeared in 1775 and continued to be reprinted until 1792	35

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Pasquali: Thorough Bass Made Easy (1763)		for all, but gives special attention to beginners; assumes very little previous theoretical knowledge; lessons ordered by level of difficulty	considers this an introduction to accompaniment--does not want students to stop here, "but should likewise procure the assistance of an experienced master" (48)	subtitled "practical rules for finding and applying its various chords with little trouble;" Pasquali intends to deal with the theoretical in another work (although he never does)	psalm tunes by R. Bremner, solos by Corelli	includes multiple examples at the end of each lesson so students can quickly put things into practice; examples include "concertos, solos, songs, and recitatives"; advocates frequent practice and warns <i>against moving ahead too quickly</i>		extremely popular in Britain--went through at least three English editions and was also translated into French and Dutch; uses a humble tone throughout	48 (plus 24 plates of music)
Serre: Observations sur les principes de l'harmonie (1763)		those who are already quite knowledgeable; expects that those whose works he is examining (such as D'Alembert) will read it as well	essays critiquing several well-known works on harmony: the article on fundamental bass in d'Alembert's encyclopedia, Tartini's "Traité de Théorie musicale," and Geminiani's "Guide Harmonique"	theoretical	Rameau, Tartini, Euler, D'Alembert, Blainville, Nichelmann, Geminiani	describes chords with words and solfège syllables rather than with musical notation			206

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Roussier: Traité des accords (1764)	Abbé Arnaud	too advanced and detailed for beginners	Divided into three parts: 1) chord derivations, 2) chord progressions, and 3) "new" chords.	almost entirely theoretical-- the few practical hints are given mainly in footnotes	based largely on the theories of Rameau	almost entirely lacking, in 1775 he published L'harmonie pratique which contained the musical examples for the Traité des accords			192
Garnier: Nouvelle Méthode (1767)	Mon- seigneur Poncet de la Rivier (former bishop of Troyes, commendator y abbot of the Abbey of Saint Benigne of Dijon and Charlieu)	says it is simple enough for those with only a basic understanding of music; good for keyboardists or harpists	wants readers to know four things: 1) how chords are formed, 2) how chords work in practice, 3) how chords should be connected together, and 4) how to play both figured and unfigured bass	all practical	None by name, only vague remarks about "many people think such and such"	No songs or actual pieces used for examples, only short tables	"new method" to render accompaniment principles simple, intelligent and within the grasp of those with only a basic understanding of music	Title page indicates that Garnier was once an accompanist for the former King of Poland who was also the Duke of Lorraine and Bar	27
Boutmy: Traité Abrégé (1769/70)		amateurs; beginning students of the keyboard	to provide an accompanying method that is short, clear, easy and intelligible for beginners (3-4)	practical	mentions in a general way previous "masters" who wrote inadequate continuo treatises; Louis Viana; recommends Pasquali's treatise for further study	short musical examples to illustrate the points in the text; Boutmy feels that short, accurate examples will be more useful to beginning students than flowery rhetoric	"the shortest and most assured method for reaching perfection in accompaniment"	written during his employment at the Hague as organist and harpsichordist for the Portugese ambassador; written in French and Dutch	28

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Bemetzrieder: Leçons de Clavecin (1771)	Diderot's daughter	originally intended for Diderot's daughter, but meant to be used by other beginners as well; Bemetzrieder claims his method is so easy that it can be quickly learned even without practice!	supposedly word for word transcription of Diderot's daughter's lessons in keyboard playing, accompanying, and composition printed for the advantage of others	practical, but a lot of historical, theoretical, and philosophical background information and discussion	Greek theory--the monochord; Honavre, Eckart, Schobert, Wagenseil, Rameau, Alberti, Cramer, Hasse, Pergolesi, Philodor, Grétry, Abel, Alberti, C. P. E. Bach, J.C. Bach, Müthel	lots of short examples demonstrating various aspects of keyboard playing; includes one example by Diderot's daughter--her homework	real people involved--lessons printed "word for word"	Spanish ed. 1775, English ed. 1778-9; humorous and informal tone	361
Falkener: Instructions for Playing the Harpsichord (1772)		"for the benefit of every rational human being;" designed for players of the harpsichord, organ, spinet or forte piano, but Falkener says that the basic musical instruction could be useful for any instrument	to teach the basics of keyboard playing, including thorough bass, in a plain a manner as possible; will help parents discover whether their children are properly instructed by their teachers	practical	Haydn, Handel, Corelli; mentions that even "the music masters" sometimes break the rules	avoids all superfluous examples; real musical tunes used right away to keep things interesting, many full pieces for practice as well as short demonstrations of his key points	can be understood in less than 12 months; quite different than anything "hitherto published;" despises the "thirst after novelty" in his time and wants to renew interest in better, older music (like Handel and Corelli)	includes a dictionary of the most common Greek, Latin, Italian and French musical terms; a German (Rudolph) who moved to London	44

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Schröter: Deutliche Anweisung (1772)		beginning organists	felt most previous treatises were inadequate; wants to relate everything back to the triad	generally practical, but with a strong theoretical foundation (focusing on the triad-- the source of all harmony and found in nature)	detailed narrative of the "most lofty" of the earlier figured bass treatises (most of which he finds inadequate) including Rameau, Sorge, Heinichen, Mattheson, Keller, Mizler, Quantz, C. P. E. Bach; in relation to the triad: the Greeks, Neidhardt, Teichmeyer, Scheibe; provides a theological foundation for triadic harmony and mentions many Biblical characters; Viadana; Werkmeister	tables and examples of varying lengths to illustrate most every point (unless he felt his prose were clear enough without them); extremely abbreviated table of signatures as a possible practical joke (164-5)	bases everything on the triad inherently found in nature	finished writing by 1754; sarcastic tone; wrote a second volume on full-voiced accompaniment and unfigured bass and a work on harmony but both are lost	202
G. M. Telemann: Unterricht im Generalbass-Spielen (1773)		for beginners who are intending to make music their profession and amateurs who want a complete knowledge of thorough bass (14)	to give clear and simple instructions with only the necessary rules and abundant examples; teaches only "das simple Accompagnement" and avoids anything beyond the basics	practical	Quantz, C. P. E. Bach, Marpurg, Sorge, calls his grandfathers treatise "a better work" and refers readers to it for practical musical examples; Viadana; Mattheson; Tosi; Agricola; Sorge	"abundant examples from accepted authors"	easier for beginners to learn than the older treatises which contain out of date rules and confusing terminology	specifically for the organ but says the rules can be applied to any other keyed instrument	112

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Martini: Esemplare (1774-76)	Cardinal Vincenzo Malvezzi (I); Mon- seigneur Gennaro Adelmo Pignatelli (II)	advanced students	to adapt the principles of counterpoint from earlier composers (such as Palestrina, Monteverdi and others) to the musical idiom of his own day; Vol I deals with counterpoint on a cantus firmus while II deals with fugal counterpoint	practical, but dealing with how to compose vocal polyphony more than with the accompaniment itself	Zarlino, Palestrina, Morales, Victoria, Porta, Giovanni Navarro di Siviglia Spagnolo, Bonifazio Pasquale Bolognese, Willaert, Giacomo Antonio Perti, Cristoforo Caresana, Marcello, Gian-Carlo Maria Clari, Marenzio, Monteverdi and many others	hundreds of annotated examples make up the majority of the treatise--his philosophy seems to be to learn by example more than rules			I: 260; II: 328
Corrette: Prototype (1775)		amateur beginners	supplement to Le Maître-summa-rizes the main points (in Q&A form) and provides a guide to the earlier work; new elements include: sections on transposition; six sonatas; and comments on accompanying vocal music in an Italian manner	practical; not interested in discussing "harmonic proportions or the sonorous bodies of physical experiments" because they are only proper for a treatise on composition and are absolutely useless in a treatise on accompani- ment	refers students back to pages in his earlier work; Composers include: Vivaldi "Four Seasons", Corelli, Geminiani, Tartini, Handel, Pergolesi, de Gardini, and Rameau	six sonatas for continuo and violin (or flute or pardessus de viole), Italian ariettes by Pergolesi, Galuppi, di Capua			60
Fenaroli: Regole Musicali (1775)		beginning keyboard players	to teach the basics of counterpoint and figured bass playing	practical		no musical examples, the lessons are only described with text			55

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Manfredini: Regole Armoniche (1775)	Paul Petrovicz, Grand Duke of Russia	beginning students	wants to illuminate the rules and history of figured bass <i>playing in a clear way</i> with "fewer numbers, fewer words, and with much truth" so that students might learn basso continuo in a short time	practical, but gives some history and rationale behind <i>many of the rules</i>	quotes D'Alembert in the preface; mentions the Greek system of modes, Benedetto Marcello, Pergolesi, Gluck, Raff, Tauberin, Mingotti, Bernacchi, Farinelli, Amorevoli, Carlani, Rameau, Tartini, Rousseau; quotes frequently from Rousseau's encyclopedia, Leo, Clari, Durante, Pergolesi, Martini	short examples throughout and several full length examples of <i>preludes and scales</i> at the end	his system of accompaniment is "new" because it includes the reasoning behind the rules in the footnotes	expanded and substantially revised for a 1797 version with completely new sections on counterpoint and singing	79 (plus 16 pages of music)
Hesse: Kurze, doch hinlängliche Anweisung zum General-Basse (1776)		beginners	"short and sufficient" instruction in thorough bass	practical		has examples to demonstrate everything in order to be absolutely clear, often in multiple keys; four full-length Lieder at the end that look exactly like other Lieder of the period with predominant 3rds and 6ths	so easy and straightforward it can be learned even without a tutor	four short Lieder at the end but no explanation about what they are for; possibly examples to practice unfigured bass, examples of compositions using these principles, or a bonus for his amateur readers?	48

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Heck: The Art of Playing Thorough Bass (1777)		young composers and performers that desire good grounding; quickly goes beyond simple realization to more advanced accompanying topics	to explain thoroughly the principles of thorough bass using a "great variety of examples"; to provide resources for further study of the subject for those who desire to continue	practical, but also talks about thorough bass as a science based on the fundamental principles of harmony and composition	full-length examples by Corelli, Graun, Quantz; a short history of thorough bass mentions Viadana specifically and makes general comments about French and Germans who wrote on the subject; especially recommends Corelli's works for beginners to practice	many short examples throughout with thorough explanations of his rules; several full length "lessons" at the end for practice	subject treated more "largely" than any previous publication; discussions of refinement of accompaniment was "entirely new and different" than the common practice of the day	born in Germany and had a strong knowledge of German music and theory; also wrote a treatise on harmony (1768) and harpsichord playing (1770)	99
Löhlein: Klavierschule (1779-1781)	Prince Franz Friedrich Anton (I); Imperial Countess von Werthern (II)	Vol I: VERY beginners-- starts with how to sit at the keyboard and note names; Vol II: Students who have already have a good grasp of figured bass accompaniment	Vol I: To make accompanying easy and pleasant; to provide brief rules and a guide for teachers and students; Vol II: To fill in gaps from Vol. I regarding unfigured bass and unusual harmonies	both-- everything from how to take care of your piano to the vibrations of a string	C.P.E. Bach, Marpurg, and Quantz are admired; Sorge (Vol. 1) and Rameau (Vol. 2) are noted for the derivation of harmony; 2nd edition contains an explanatory response to critical comments by Schröter; refers to Heinichen and Kellner for information on unfigured bass; Fux is mentioned as valuable for older compositions, but not the present; Hasse; Piccinni; Mattheson; Filz; Abel; Scheibe	Vol I: Many musical examples, written by the author which progress in order of difficulty; Vol II: Musical examples center around six violin sonatas by the author with unfigured basses in progressing order of difficulty; also presents a recitative and aria by Hasse for practice.	"brevity"; "many practical examples"; can be used by any student no matter how much of a beginner	well received by contemporaries and appeared in new editions for nearly a century: J. G. Witthauer (1791) and A. E. Müller (1804, 1819) both published editions under the title <i>Forte piano-Schule</i> . Carl Czerny's <i>Grosse Forte piano-Schule</i> was actually the 8th edition of Löhlein's work	372 (1804)

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
J. M. Bach: Kurze und systematische Anleitung zum General-Bass (1780)		the common public	to be helpful and obliging for his fellow citizens to learn the practice	practical	C. P. E. Bach; Marpurg	copious illustrations and tables to clearly illustrate his point; no full-length musical examples for practice	does not dare to claim this is a great, indispensable work like C. P. E. Bach's or Marpurg's, only wants to oblige his friends and patrons		47
Kirnberger: Grundsätze des Generalbasses (1781)		repeatedly talks about children, however he says that it is intended for those who want to make a thorough study of music; amateurs who only want to advance quickly will find the work dry	thorough bass as the rudiments of composition; discusses both the theoretical aspects of the laws of harmony and how to play from a figured bass	both--based on his theories about chord classification, but the intent is to teach the pupil to actually play from a figured bass	C. P. E. Bach; J.S. Bach; Benda; Heinichen	45 pages of figures and examples for demonstration and practice that are included separately from the text; the longest example is part of a trio by J. S. Bach		also a Lied composer; emphasizes the importance of letting the ear judge whether a theory holds true or not	88 (plus 45 pages of music)
Paisiello: Regole per bene accompagnare (1782)	the Grand Duchess of Russia (Maria Feodorovna-Catherine II's daughter-in-law)	written for his pupil, the Grand Duchess	focus on making solo pieces from figured bass exercises rather than accompanying a solo instrument	practical, mostly exercises		over half the work consists of numerous full-length examples for practice		partimento rather than accompaniment	60

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Petri: Anleitung zur praktischen Musik (1767, 1782)	Friedrich August, Duke of Saxony	beginning musicians; especially concerned with poorer musicians who could only afford one volume	one brief volume containing everything a beginner would need in the rudiments of music, matters of style and technique on every instrument; Ch. 10 is on figured bass)	entirely practical-- refers readers to other authors for a study of the science of harmony	Heinichen, Mattheson, Sorge, Kellner, Marburg; repeatedly refers students to Kirnberger and C. P. E. Bach for more detailed study	brief charts and musical examples within the text to illustrate the main points	a basic introduction to every possible aspect of music	self-taught musician; sold well in his lifetime and also at least 80 copies remain today	484
Jackson: A Treatise on Practical Thorough Bass (1785)	Earl of Rochford	written for the "improvement and exercise of any Scholars"; though he says the plan is easy, the "Instruction of a Master" is still important	to render the principles of musical science and complete harmony "perspicuous and practicable"	title says practical, but dedication talks about the necessity of understanding scientific principles for true and complete understanding of music	Greek theory--uses the word "gamut" for scale and talks about three types of music "diatonic, chromatic, and enharmonic"; dedication emphasizes how powerful music is to move the affections and edify	goes through every individual major, minor, and chromatic scale; shows every interval with the intervening notes and the different inversions for each signature; gives examples of how to compose figures according to the progression of the octave transposed into every key; no real music for practice, explains how to play individual chords, but rarely puts them in context			40

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Rodolphe: <i>Théorie d'accompagnement</i> (1785)	Monseigneur Le Baron de Breteuil Ministre et Secrétaire d'État de la Maison du Roy	students at "L'Ecole Royale de Musique"	basic textbook on the theory of harmony	theoretical, shows each chord in detail <i>but does not really talk about how to apply</i>	follows Rameau's principles of fundamental bass	lots of musical examples, goes through every chord in every key	tries to simplify "extremely abstract principles" as much as possible		111
Fricke: <i>Treatise on Thorough Bass</i> (1786)	"Her most Gracious Majesty the Queen of Great Britain"	dilettanti and beginners	to provide a "plain and accurate method for accompanying" and "to propose a clear System for figuring"	practical work; intended for performers		short musical examples to illustrate the text; no full length examples for practice	a focus on a clearer and simpler method of figuring in addition to the rules of thorough bass	a German who moved to London; his ideal accompaniment (left hand with single bass line, right hand doubling vocal line and playing a third below) is like the Lieder of the day	111
Miller: <i>Elements of Thoroughbass and Composition</i> (1787)	Right Honourable Lord Vicount Gallivay, Knight of the Bath	performers who are unacquainted with the principles of harmony; so simple that "even young ladies" can use it; he expects his readers to know the first rudiments of music and be able to play a few tunes on the harpsichord	An "amusing" and "pleasant" introduction to the art of thorough bass; mostly talks about accompaniment, but also some mention of composition	A few basic ideas about fundamental bass, but Miller mostly focuses on practical application of these ideas.	Includes examples by composers such as Purcell, Handel, Arne, Rameau, Rousseau, Jomelli, Pergolesi, Rousseau, and Corelli; indicates frustration with other works on thorough bass by Lampe, Pasquali and Heck <i>because they are not straightforward enough for beginners</i>	Uses actual pieces for practice in order to keep things more interesting for the pupil; Eight Italian, Eight French, and Twelve English Songs; all vocal examples except <i>for a Corelli violin sonata</i> ; Miller says the songs can also be played as solo keyboard pieces	principles of accompanying rendered amusing and simple for the musical amateur		88

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Türk: Von den wichtigsten Pflichten eines Organisten (1787)		specifically for the beginning organist or the organist with limited formal training (usually an elementary school teacher who had little specialized musical training), but also wished to show clergymen how the musical portions of the service could encourage devotion	to improve the German Lutheran musical liturgy	practical; theorizes on the basis of technical knowledge, not abstract concepts	recommends C. P. E. Bach and Kimberger for learning the rules of thorough bass, Kuhnau for accompanying chorales; refers to Petri, Reichardt, and "many recent articles"; Heinichen; Sulzer; Adlung; Graun; Scheibe; Quantz	numerous hymns and chorales		the first work to treat the subject of the organ in worship extensively	211
Mattei: Pratica D'Accompagnamento (1788)			to teach the practice of figured bass accompaniment and counterpoint	practical, mostly devoted to practice examples		2/3 of the volume is music to practice, but there are no examples by other composers; exercises on various scales and bass patterns in every key	committed to older styles of accompaniment and counterpoint despite opposition from contemporaries	also translated into French and very popular in France	120

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Anonymous: Armonici Erudimenti (1790)		musical amateurs and music lovers	rules for many aspects of keyboard practice including basso continuo accompanying, proper hand position, fingering for fluid movement on the keys and different kinds of scales	practical		short musical examples to illustrate basso continuo accompaniment but most of the lengthy examples are scales and various figurations with fingering to practice fluid movement on the keyboard	contains only the "necessary rules"		24
Kessel: Unterricht im Generalbasse (1791)	Carl Wilhelm Müller	beginners	new work is necessary because others are too outdated, lengthy, expensive or too complicated for an amateur	practical	Mattheson; Sorge; Heinichen; Schröter; C. P. E. Bach; Haydn; Mozart; Clementi; Koželuch; Rosetti; Martini; Hoffmeister; Pleyel; Sulzer; Bach; Kimberger; Marburg; Löhlein; Quantz; Bossler; Türk; J. S. Bach; Doles; Kuhnau	says he uses more and better examples than other treatises; illustrates every point with short examples	just the right length and amount of information for amateurs; better examples	in addition to accompanying he also discusses counterpoint and improvising fantasies	110
Albrechtsberger: Kurzgefasste Methode den Generalbass (1792)		beginners	basic thorough bass tutor	practical	mentions Telemann's symbol for the diminished fifth (^) (18)	includes short illustrations for each point as well as several lengthy examples for practice	none, does not even have an introduction, jumps right into the material	original from 1791; expanded in 1792; translated into English 1815	36

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Tomeoni: Regole Pratiche (1795)	Maddalena Dotillieu (his grand-daughter)	dedication says it was written for his grand-daughter at the request of her parents, but the title page also indicates that it is for "young beginners"	to help young beginners acquire the principles of accompanying (and a little bit of counterpoint) as easily as possible—he uses a question and answer format since he thinks this is the easiest way to learn	practical; deals briefly with the scientific and theoretical aspects of harmony at the very end		there are examples at the end of each dialogue that present each principle in several keys; no full length examples			44
Türk: Anweisung zum Generalbassspielen (1800)		beginners who are prepared to take their studies seriously and are willing to take the time to do it	to provide a comprehensive book at a relatively inexpensive price so beginners of any means could learn; to provide sound teaching on, and perhaps revive the declining practice of thorough bass	very practical, but also contains some theoretical explanations	C. P. E. Bach, Quantz, Heinichen, Löhlein	copious brief examples throughout to illustrate the text			390

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
King: A General Treatise on Music (1801)	The Right Honourable William Lord Viscount Dudley and Ward	does not specify, but the work contains several chapters of rudimentary material such as clefs and note names so it may have been for beginners	to apply the principles of harmony and thorough bass to composition	discusses the science of music and the existence of the scale in nature, harmony and vibrations (1-3); although he wants to apply the concepts to composition, he focuses mostly on the science and theory of harmony	uses the introduction to defend himself against Kollmann's attacks [in A Practical Guide]; appeals to the ancient Greeks for scientific aspects; mentions Rameau and Marpurg in regard to chords of supposition--where the thirds are placed in relation to the seventh; relies heavily on Rameau's fundamental bass	many musical tables; gives a brief example from Handel's Messiah to explain modulation; God Save the King; Corelli: Sonata no. 11 Op. 2; Handel: Minuet in the Overture to Ariadne; Haydn: "Passion"			81
Choron: Principes de composition (1804)		Students at the Cathedral School	to remedy the lack of French writings on the practice of harmony; consists of six volumes--Vol. 1 is on harmony and accompani- ment	Chapters 1-7 deal especially with theoretical elements of harmony, and the other chapters deal with how to employ those elements of harmony in an accompani- ment	focus on Italian composers and theorists, as indicated by the title	Examples by Fenaroli, Leo Durante, Sala, and Cotumacci		very popular at time of publication-- owned by Haydn, Paisiello, Spontini, Beethoven, Cimarosa, Clementi, and Hummel	I: 104 (plus 142 pages of music)

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
Corfe: Thorough Bass Simplified (1805)		students and amateurs who are "totally uninformed in this science"; provides more advanced instruction in discords and enharmonic passages to encourage "industrious and persevering" students in their study	to simplify the theory and practice of thorough bass so that amateurs can learn the principles in a short time	practical, but often refers to figured bass as a "useful science" and traces every chord to its original fundamental bass	Mentions Ludovico Viadana, Dr. Pepusch, Rameau, and Charles Burney in a history of the basso continuo; examples by Handel, Corelli, Geminiani, Tartini, Sacchini, and Haydn; mentions Rousseau in regard to modulation; mentions D'Alembert and his Treatise on the Elements of Music	Many musical tables and short examples by "the best authors"; the longest examples are selections from Corelli's concertos and instrumental pieces from Handel operas; uses examples from Haydn and Mozart to illustrate the ways composers are using new chords and modulations to enhance text	a simpler method for amateurs		56
Kollmann: Practical Guide to Thoroughbass (1807)		Meant for the "public" and says that even ladies and amateurs can learn with it; he expects people to already have some basic knowledge of music	To provide a knowledge of chords for the practical application of Figured Bass	A few theoretical chapters, but mostly he refers readers to his earlier book for that; main purpose is practical applications of Figured Bass	Rameau and Kirnberger are mentioned as not being sufficient for the more complex harmonies of this later period—their biggest fault is that they look at chords individually and not in context	Musical Examples at the End: C. P. E. Bach (from his <i>Essay</i>); Handel (six concertos for the harpsichord or organ); Corelli (from 12 concertos); Geminiani (from op. 10 and 11); Rameau (from the <i>Traité</i>); Tartini (from his six Solos for a Violin, op. 2)	presenting a "new" method that looks at chords in context rather than individually; to present a simpler system than previously published	Also wrote an earlier "Practical Guide to Thorough bass" (1801); published in English and German as Kollmann was linked to both countries	60

	Dedication	Audience	Purpose	Practical or Theoretical?	Other Authors/ Composers Mentioned	Examples	Self-proclaimed Distinctions from Other Treatises	Other	No. of Pages
J. Jousse: Lectures on Thoroughbass (1808)		young students	to bring the principles of thorough bass to the level of young students by avoiding difficult or obscure explanations	leaves the theoretical to his other works and focuses on practical application of chords	Recommends pieces by Corelli, Tartini and Geminiani as good places for the student to start practicing since those composers were known for their regularity in figuring basses; mentions Mr. Delaire in regard to the Rule of the Octave	short exercises throughout and longer examples for practice at the end; all examples are printed in C Major or A minor for clarity and ease with the intention that the student transpose them into all keys for practice	brief yet thorough		64

Appendix B: Number of Notes and Their Distribution According to Continuo Treatises, 1750-1808

	Number of parts	Division Between the Hands	Range and Relationship Between the Hands	Variety in Texture	Which Notes to Duplicate in Full Textures
Reinhard: Kurzer und deutlicher Unterricht von dem General-Bass (1750)	examples show four notes total for consonant chords and five for dissonant ones	examples show a single note in the left hand and the remainder of the harmony in the right	contrary motion is best to avoid parallel fifths and octaves (26)		
Nauss: Gründlicher Unterricht den General-Bass (1751)	does not say explicitly, but gives instructions for three or four voices (12-13)	does not specify and the examples show only bass lines and figures--no chords	contrary motion is best to avoid parallel fifths and octaves (11)		
Quantz: Versuch (1752)	general rule is to play in four parts, but to accompany well one should not be too bound to this rule--there must be variation throughout (223)	relies on the good judgment of the accompanist (229)	hands should never get too far apart (233)	the most interesting and tasteful accompaniments vary throughout (223); pay attention to what the other instruments are doing and vary the texture according to dynamics or kinds of passage work, etc. (224); more notes can be added in order to create louder sounds on the harpsichord (231)	
Corrette: Le Maître de clavecin (1753)	generally three, and sometimes four parts in the right hand (1, 12)	three or four notes in right hand, one in the bass (1, 12)		tasto solo means to play the bass without chords, a chromatic style particularly expressive for prayers (80)	sixth or third depending on the position of the hand (15-16)
La Porte: Traité Théorique et pratique de l'accompagnement (1753)	two to four parts in the right hand (6)	two to four notes in the right hand with the left hand playing the bass note; realization entirely in right hand (6)	contains the widest written interval found in French treatises (two octaves plus a minor seventh between bass and soprano) (36)		

	Number of parts	Division Between the Hands	Range and Relationship Between the Hands	Variety in Texture	Which Notes to Duplicate in Full Textures
Dubugrarre: Méthode plus courte et plus facile (1754)	as often as possible four or five parts in the accompaniment is best (2); objects strongly to a three part texture in the right hand which he considers part of "l'ancienne règle"	does not object to using the left hand for part of the realization in order to include as many notes as possible (2)			as much as possible double all the parts (2)
Daube: General-Bass in drey Accorden (1756)	advisable to learn thorough-bass in four voices from the beginning (201)	examples show one in the left hand and three in the right hand	right hand should stay within an octave unless hands come too close together (196); contrary motion is preferred to avoid parallel fifths and octaves (196)	strong, full-voiced sound rarely appears except for a special musical effect, but complete triads are preferred over empty or defective ones (197-8); Texture should be thinned when dynamic levels are soft (198-9)	fifth and octave should be played in right hand especially in full-voiced pieces (196); "fifth is doubled most often, in the absence of a fifth, the sixth is doubled the most, the minor third can also be doubled, after this, the octave" (200); usually depends on the previous interval; the major third should not be doubled frequently—too intense; inelegant to double dissonant intervals except in a very strong full-voiced chord (200-1); in solos never leave out a note that is not in the upper voice but is in the harmony (200)
Geminiani: The Art of Accompaniment (1756)	varies from example to example, but anywhere from two to eight	varies greatly from example to example--sometimes one note in bass, other times a full triad	does not say specifically, but the right hand realizations in his examples range from A just below middle C to the A just above the staff	great variety, many examples feature one bass line with several possible realizations using different kinds of figures	

	Number of parts	Division Between the Hands	Range and Relationship Between the Hands	Variety in Texture	Which Notes to Duplicate in Full Textures
Adlung: Anleitung zu der Musikalischen Gelahrtheit (1758)	examples show four parts	examples show three in right hand and one in the left (Table VI); also mentions divided accompaniment in which the left hand shares some of the middle voices (657)			
Clément : Essai sur l'accompagnement du clavecin (1758)		does not specify and his examples are unrealized			
Heck: Short and Fundamental Instructions for Learning Thorough Bass (1760)	does not actually say, but the examples consist mostly of four part chords.	examples show one note in the bass and three in the right hand	does not say specifically, but the right hand realizations in his examples range from B just below middle C to the G just above the staff; contrary motion prohibits parallel fifths and octaves (14)		
Marpurg: Handbuch bey dem Generalbasse und der Composition (1755, 1757, 1758, 1760)	in composition it varies from two to nine voices, but for accompanying three to five is common; "galant style accompaniment" features frequent changes in texture and number of voices	gemein or common accompaniment=bass note in left hand and realization in the right hand; getheilt=notes divided equally between the two hands (6)	there should never be too great a "vacuum" between voice parts; better to have a gap between the tenor and bass with the upper voices in close position than to have a gap between alto and soprano--based on natural acoustical principles (255); avoid thirds in the low register; if the right hand gets too high or low only change position after a consonance (11); contrary motion is best to avoid parallel fifths and octaves (51)	"galant style accompaniment" features frequent changes in texture and number of voices; "tasto solo" or "unisono" means play the bass alone (11)	in triads: bass, fifth, third; diminished triad: third; augmented triad: bass if upper note is resolving, upper part if bass is resolving, third; seventh: bass, fifth, third; dissonances generally not doubled except for diminished fifth, augmented fourth, diminished third, and perfect fourth (161-190)
Rameau: Code de Musique Pratique (1760)	three (consonant) or four (dissonant) parts in the right hand chord (25)	bass note in the left hand, harmony in the right (25)			

	Number of parts	Division Between the Hands	Range and Relationship Between the Hands	Variety in Texture	Which Notes to Duplicate in Full Textures
C. P. E. Bach: Versuch (1753, 1762)	1, 2, 3, 4, or more; uniform 4-voice for heavily scored music in the learned style, three or fewer for more delicate works; best to begin with 4 parts; elegant accompaniments are not restricted to a uniform number of parts (II: 281)	Most frequent is one note in left hand with three in right (undivided), but sometimes dividing equally (divided) between the two hands provides variety and refinement; alternate between the two on repeated passages (II: 45, 284)	right hand should not play above the two-lined f unless the bass is written very high or replaced by a different clef, or if a special effect is intended (eg. a change of register for a repetition) (II: 36); should not play below the "upper half of the unlined octave, unless conditions the reverse of those mentioned in the previous paragraph are present"; for practice it is fine to become familiar with all the registers (II: 36); when the hands come too close to each other, the chord may be shifted to a higher register by repeating it over a single bass note; upper voice should always sing and maintain a pure relationship with the bass; contrary motion is best and safest, especially with triads (II: 34)	play in octaves without harmony when: 1) all other parts are in unison or octaves or 2) when the lowest part has brilliant passage work (II: 174); <i>tasto solo</i> means left hand plays bass alone (II: 176); observe the loudness of the soloist's various registers and adjust the chords as needed (II: 247); lower registers should use fewer notes; vary for dynamics (II: 244-5); one of the most outstanding refinements is when the right hand accompanies in parallel thirds with the bass (II: 271)	double consonant intervals; do not double dissonances--it is disagreeable and results in parallel octaves; in 3 parts omit the note that doubles the bass; in 2 parts only the third is played (II: 34)
Clément: Essai sur la basse fondamentale (1762)					
Pasquali: Thorough Bass Made Easy (1763)	usually four to five altogether (3)	usually one in bass, three or four in right hand (3)		<i>tasto solo</i> " means means play without chords until " <i>tutti</i> " (45); for songs and solo instruments chords should be thinner with few octaves (45); texture should match the meaning of the words--lighter for tender moments, fuller and more frequent chords for more passionate moments (46); if there is no "fiddle or flute to play the symphonies, play these notes with the right hand" (46)	

	Number of parts	Division Between the Hands	Range and Relationship Between the Hands	Variety in Texture	Which Notes to Duplicate in Full Textures
Serre: Observations sur les principes de l'harmonie (1763)					
Roussier: Traité des accords (1764)					
Garnier: Nouvelle Méthode (1767)	four notes total for consonant chords, five notes for dissonant				
Boutmy: Traité Abrégé (1769/70)	examples show three parts in the right hand or four for seventh chords; when moving in parallel sixths the right hand should alternate between two and three notes (28)	play the bass note with the left hand and the chords with the right (5)	contrary motion is best because parallel fifths and octaves are avoided; parallel motion is fine with successive thirds and sixths (27)		
Bemetzrieder: Leçons de Clavecin (1771)		implied in the dialogue and the examples throughout that there should be one bass note with the harmony in the right hand			
Falkener: Instructions for Playing the Harpsichord (1772)	examples show four parts for consonant chords and five for dissonant	examples show one bass note in the left hand and the remaining harmony in the right	use contrary motion to avoid parallel fifths and octaves (36, 41)		
Schröter: Deutliche Anweisung (1772)	four or five total (40)	bass note in the left hand, remaining harmony in the right (40)	describes parallel, oblique and contrary motion--says contrary is best to avoid parallel fifths and octaves (45-6)		

	Number of parts	Division Between the Hands	Range and Relationship Between the Hands	Variety in Texture	Which Notes to Duplicate in Full Textures
G. M. Telemann: Unterricht im GeneralbassSpielen (1773)	most common is four notes total (19)	left hand plays bass note and the right hand takes the rest (15); occasionally dividing the notes between the hands is necessary (17-18)	three octave range G to G; hands should never be too far apart--if the left hand plays low in the keyboard, the right hand should follow and vice versa (98-9)	it is not always necessary to maintain three notes in the right hand as it sometimes interferes with the movement of the chords and two will be better (17), sometimes even five notes (19)	
Martini: Esemplare (1774-76)					
Corrette: Prototype (1775)	three or four parts against the bass (1); strong preference for three notes unless an extra note is necessary for a dissonance (it is more beautiful, clear, and brilliant execution) (47)	three or four notes in right hand, one in the bass (1)		a good accompanist varies the number of parts according to circumstances; a solo requires fewer so as not to suffocate the soloist (15); a good accompanist completes harmony and omits notes according to the occasion (16)	dissonances are never doubled; thumb is never used in the right hand unless it is doubling the top note in a consonant chord (14); in recitative consonant chords can be doubled in the left hand (15)
Fenaroli: Regole Musicali (1775)	examples in later versions show three to four notes in right hand chord	later versions with musical examples show one note in the bass with the harmony in the right			

	Number of parts	Division Between the Hands	Range and Relationship Between the Hands	Variety in Texture	Which Notes to Duplicate in Full Textures
Manfredini: Regole Armoniche (1775)	examples show four parts total for consonances and five for dissonances	left hand plays bass, the right hand realizes the chord (30)	contrary motion is best in order to avoid parallel fifths and octaves (58)		
Hesse: Kurze, doch hinlängliche Anweisung zum General-Basse (1776)		realization entirely in right hand (10)	contrary motion is best in order to avoid parallel fifths and octaves (10)		
Heck: The Art of Playing Thorough Bass (1777)	four parts is the most common and the most proper for a beginner to practice before he proceeds to any other (2); full accompaniment requires more (91)	most examples show one note in the bass with the harmony in the right; examples demonstrating "full accompaniment" show the parts divided between the hands in order to play as many notes as possible (26); "in full accompaniment [sic] full Chords may be play'd with both hands (91)	"the right hand must not exceed the Compass from E, betwixt the 3.d Space of the Bass and G, next above the 5.th Line in the Treble" (90); describes four types of motion: 1) similar, 2) contrary, 3) oblique, and 4) parallel (10); chords in general are to be taken as near to each other as possible (23); not too much space should be left between the hands (23); contrary motion is proper, especially when the bass rises or falls by one step (26); the nearer the hands are in full accompaniment the more pleasing it is (26)	full accompaniment (more than four notes) is more proper for the harpsichord than the organ; if the tempo and meter permit, in full accompaniment the space between the highest and lowest part may be filled in by as many notes as desired (example shows up to four in each hand); in full accompaniment it will be impossible to maintain regularity in the middle parts (26); dynamics can be achieved on a harpsichord by playing more or fewer notes, changing key sets or changing stops (91); compositions for only a few parts (trio or solo) should use a sparser texture--start by leaving out the eighth (92)	in a seventh chord neither the third or the seventh should be doubled (42); different instructions for each type of figure, but all concords (unison, octave, fifth, third and sixth) shall occasionally be doubled (11); in 3-part accompaniment leave out the 8th (26)

	Number of parts	Division Between the Hands	Range and Relationship Between the Hands	Variety in Texture	Which Notes to Duplicate in Full Textures
Löhlein: Klavierschule (1779-81) [*Page numbers correspond with the English translation by Dora Wilson]	Most common is four voices, but there are no rules without exception (216, 493)*	three notes in right hand, bass note in left hand (216)	"The limits of the right hand are determined by the bass. If there are low bass notes, then the right hand is supposed to accompany in a lower range than when the bass notes are high. Thus the position of the right hand must be set so that there is neither too much, nor is there too little room between both hands. One determines the intervals with both hands, approximately two and one-half octaves in the outermost voices: however if the bass is close to the one-line octave, then limit yourself to one and one-half octaves"; hands should not be too far apart—if bass is low, right hand should play lower, never more than 2 1/2 octaves between outer voices (218)	only three voices for a simple melody or solo so the melody is not obscured, but with dense texture one may play as many voices as he pleases, thinner textures may be necessary to avoid incorrect consecutive chords (216-217); a full-voiced accompaniment should not be used in the low register (458); The more delicate the music, voice or instrument...the more discreet and economical the accompaniment should be (463); in symphonies or full-voiced passages a simple accompaniment would be too empty (494); cases of imitation and melodic passages in the bass are often best accompanied by left hand alone or the right hand at the octave or third (329); <i>tasto solo</i> means the bass is played without accompaniment, <i>unisono</i> means the right hand accompanies the left with octaves (422)	6 and 3 are readily doubled as acceptable intervals—especially in <i>minor keys</i> (436); do not be conceited and try to be more prominent by doubling harmonies with the left hand and right hand at the same time—it is presumptuous, absurd, and leads to incorrect harmonies (459)
J. M. Bach: Kurze und systematische Anleitung zum General-Bass (1780)	examples show four parts	examples show a single note in the left hand and harmony in the right		when all the other voices go into octaves or unisons the accompaniment should follow suit (26)	
Kirnberger: Grundsätze des Generalbasses (1781)	the standard is four parts, but the appendix to the last chapter describes accompaniments with up to eight parts (83-86)	generally one note in left hand three notes in right hand, but in the case of more than four parts it is necessary to share the harmony with the left hand (83-86)			essential discords (such as the 7th in a 7th chord) may not be doubled (85); the major third may be doubled; in four parts the octave can be doubled, or the third or fifth—the third must always be present in a triad (16)

	Number of parts	Division Between the Hands	Range and Relationship Between the Hands	Variety in Texture	Which Notes to Duplicate in Full Textures
Paisiello: Regole per bene accompagnare (1782)					
Petri: Anleitung zur praktischen Musik (1767, 1782)			contrary motion helps avoid parallel fifths and octaves (226)	tasto solo" means play the bass note alone without accompaniment (249)	
Jackson: A Treatise on Practical Thorough Bass (1785)	examples generally use four	examples mostly use one note in bass with three in the right			"in quick passages the eighth may be omitted in the chords of the 6th and 5th. Also the fifth in the chord of the 7th when followed by a 6th" (20)
Rodolphe: Théorie d'accompagnement (1785)		examples show a single note in the left hand with harmony in the right			
Fricke: Treatise on Thorough Bass (1786)	most regular consists of three or four parts (1)--treats each separately		contrary motion is best	three parts used for one or two singers, an instrumental solo, piano dynamic, or a quick movement because a fourth part would get in the way (93)	
Miller: Elements of Thoroughbass and Composition (1787)	generally three in the right hand (melody plus two notes underneath)	does not say explicitly, but examples show one note in the bass and two to three in the right hand	In the right hand: "Never play a note higher than G (above top line in treble clef) or lower than G (below treble staff)" (4); contrary motion is best (6)	Sometimes gives several examples of an accompaniment in a variety of ways: a full harmony, a thinned harmony, and arpeggiated chords; "Tasto solo" means play only the bass notes	"In accompanying Songs or Solos, it is often proper to accompany the Chords of the Seventh or Sixth; only with a Third; but this should not be attempted till you are perfectly Master of the Chords in their full State."

	Number of parts	Division Between the Hands	Range and Relationship Between the Hands	Variety in Texture	Which Notes to Duplicate in Full Textures
Türk: Von den wichtigsten Pflichten eines Organisten (1787)	chorales: four parts should remain constant throughout; for solos: two, three, or more depending on the size of the ensemble (152)	for chorales dividing the notes between the hands is best to keep the harmony from sounding empty and weak (50)	hands should not be too far apart, but the notes in one hand should not be too close together (50-2)	harmony changes depending on the hymn text (48); strength of the accompaniment depends on the number and types of voices/instruments (150)	he does not say which, but does say that it is important for a good thorough bass player to know and recommends students see C. P. E. Bach and Kirnberger for more information (33)
Mattei: Pratica D'Accompagnamento (1788)					
Anonymous: Armonici Erudimenti (1790)	examples show four parts	examples show a single note in the left hand and harmony in the right			
Kessel: Unterricht im Generalbasse (1791)	most examples in four parts	left note plays only the bass tone with the remaining harmony in the right (59)	using contrary motion helps avoid parallel fifths and octaves (21)	anywhere from one to five notes can be played depending on how large an ensemble one is accompanying (60)	
Albrechtsberger: Kurzgefasste Methode den Generalbass (1792)	all examples in three or four parts	all examples feature a single bass note in the left hand and a two or three note chord in the right	use oblique and contrary motion to avoid parallel fifths and octaves; keep chords close together (10)		consonant intervals may be doubled but not dissonant ones: in consonant chords double the 3, 6, or 5 (12); in dissonant chords double the 2 of the 5/2 and the perfect fourth of the 6/4 (13); sometimes the fifth can be doubled as well (14)
Tomeoni: Regole Pratiche (1795)			Three kinds of motion: parallel, contrary and oblique; contrary motion is best because parallel fifths and octaves are avoided (40)		

	Number of parts	Division Between the Hands	Range and Relationship Between the Hands	Variety in Texture	Which Notes to Duplicate in Full Textures
Türk: Anweisung zum Generalbassspielen (1800)	four parts are the most complete and easiest (108)	generally the bass note in the left hand and the chord in the right, although the notes can be divided between the hands for chorales and as a way to keep the hands from getting too far apart (331)	upper voice does not usually go above e or f; tenor voice should not usually go below g or f, unless the bass part is very low or the solo part goes very low (113); accompanying voices should not lie too far from the bass, if the voices get too close, jump the right hand up at the beginning of the measure (114)	fewer voices to create a softer dynamic, more voices can be used for large symphonies or choruses (109); fewer voices used for sections with a sad or sweet character or for piano or pianissimo (328); for a crescendo gradually add notes, for a decrescendo gradually take them away (328)--he recommends this technique even for instruments such as the fortepiano that can make these dynamics in other ways (329)	only consonances should be doubled (328)
King: A General Treatise on Music (1801)	one to four are possible, but for harmony to be fully expressed four parts are necessary, more than that is redundant (64)	musical examples show one note in the bass with harmony in the right	contrary motion is best	harmony more or less complex/complete depending on the particular instrument	forbidden doublings: sharp seventh (leading tone), flat seventh, third of the key ascending to the fourth and vice versa, any progression ascending or descending half a tone (20); doubling may be necessary for avoiding parallel fifths and octaves
Choron: Principes de composition (1804)	One to four parts	"If the bass is figured there is nothing to do but play the bass line with the left hand, double it at the octave with the little finger and fill in the harmony with the right hand--either in three or four parts according to the intention of the composer and according to the prescribed rules." (18)		One part: only one note in the left hand is used when "Tasto Solo" is called for or when there is an indication of "all'unisono"/"unissoni"; Two parts: only when a "3" is indicated, meaning to play in thirds, only the most essential notes are played; Three Parts: include all the consonant notes; Four Parts: double one of the consonants or add the dissonant note in a seventh chord. For any other dissonance it will require a fifth note to be complete (18-19)	Do not double dissonances, too hard on the ear (19); best notes to double in a major chord: fundamental, then fifth, then thirds (seems to be relying on the harmonic series--goes all the way up to nine notes) (20); in a minor chord: fundamental or third, then fifth (21)

	Number of parts	Division Between the Hands	Range and Relationship Between the Hands	Variety in Texture	Which Notes to Duplicate in Full Textures
Corfe: Thorough Bass Simplified (1805)		Does not specify, but the examples show a single bass line with the harmony in the right hand.		"it is not always necessary to fill the whole Harmony of a Chord, particularly in accompanying the Voice, but very often a third alone is allowed, and even preferred, without any other part of the Chord." (Intro)	recommends that young students not "crowd" the chords since mature taste and judgement is needed in knowing what to omit and double (Intro)
Kollmann: Practical Guide to Thoroughbass (1807)	In general it should consist of four regular parts (40)	Generally one note in left hand, three in the right hand "or whatever is left over"	"In general it must be observed...that the highest part of the chord should not without necessity come higher than the A immediately above the five treble lines, nor lower than the C between the treble and bass lines (41)	more than four parts can be used to create a greater forte (40); When the tenor or counter tenor clef is used, it shows that the real bass part is omitted and the harmony shall then be two or three parts only; "All'Unisone" or "All'Ottava" means that the right hand shall lay only in octaves with the bass, and no chords, until figures are introduced again (40)	Consonances may be doubled, but dissonances may not (5); if a note of the triad is to be left out when doubled it is best to omit the fifth since the third tells you whether the chord is major or minor.
J. Jousse: Lectures on Thoroughbass (1808)	most common is four parts; consonant chord must have at least three notes; dissonant chord must have at least four (33); gives rules for chords in three or four parts (44)	generally one note in left hand three notes in right hand (48)	General rule for right hand is from G below treble clef to G just above: "Therefore the accompanist should read a little forward to see the course of the progression, and accordingly bring the hands lower or higher" (48); the right hand should never be too far from the bass line (48)	"All-Unisone" or "All-Octava" means all parts proceed in octaves with no harmony; Tasto Solo means only bass line with no harmony (48); increase the number of notes for a crescendo, decrease for softer passages (48, 54) It is best to try and keep the number of notes consistent--do not vary at random-- a note or two may be added either for the sake of a more natural progression in the melody or to avoid consecutive fifths and octaves (48)	only consonant intervals are to be doubled (49); the following notes must not be doubled: the sharp seventh or leading tone, the minor seventh of any bass note, the third of the key ascending to the 4th degree, any note ascending or descending a semitone (34)

Appendix C: Intervals and Chords According to Continuo Treatises, 1750-1808

	Prohibited Intervals and Chords	Moving from one chord to another	Dissonances
Reinhard: Kurzer und deutlicher Unterricht von dem General-Bass (1750)	parallel fifths and octaves forbidden, use contrary motion between the hands to avoid (26)	jumping in the right hand is forbidden, always keep the common tones the same from chord to chord (26)	
Nauss: Gründlicher Unterricht den General-Bass (1751)	parallel fifths or octaves not permitted ascending nor descending (11)		
Quantz: Versuch (1752)	depending on the tuning of the instrument certain intervals may need to be avoided or hidden so the ratios do not offend the ear (233)		should be struck more strongly than consonances (227); each belongs to one of three classes that determines the force they should be struck with (mezzo forte, forte, fortissimo) (228-229); if multiple dissonances follow each other the expression should gradually swell and diminish (230)
Corrette: Le Maître de clavecin (1753)	"at the present time people are not scrupulous about avoiding parallel fifths and octaves and few practice it" (16)	musical examples demonstrate keeping common tones the same	include 2nd, tritone, 7th and 9th (15); distinguishes between major and minor dissonances (43)
La Porte: Traité Théorique et pratique de l'accompagnement (1753)	avoid parallel fifths and octaves between bass and upper note of right hand chord (33)	the easiest execution and most beautiful harmony refrains from moving the right hand from chord to chord (33-4)	to prepare: make sure the dissonant note is heard in the previous chord; to resolve: ascend or descend one note to a consonance (33, 49-50)
Dubugrarre: Méthode plus courte et plus facile (1754)		do not move the right hand unless absolutely necessary, play the notes next to the previous chord (2)	always look one or two measures ahead so that you can prepare the dissonances properly and resolve the one that you are holding (3)
Daube: General-Bass in drey Accorden (1756)	parallel fifths and octaves are undesirable, especially in outer voices (196)	always try to have one or two common tones between chords (196); most incorrect passages occur because of the frequent moving of the right hand (23)	three whole chapters on how to resolve dissonances in common and uncommon ways (Ch. 6-8); one can sometimes add ties that have not been written in or implied by the figured bass (203-4)
Geminiani: The Art of Accompaniment (1756)			gives several pages of examples but refers readers to his "Guida Armonica" for examples of all resolutions (II, 4)
Adlung: Anleitung zu der Musikalischen Gelahrtheit (1758)			result from anticipation and delay of the main note; easiest to deal with on slow notes (643)
Clément : Essai sur l'accompagnement du clavecin (1758)			

	Prohibited Intervals and Chords	Moving from one chord to another	Dissonances
Heck: Short and Fundamental Instructions for Learning Thorough Bass (1760)	parallel fifths and octaves should be avoided "for the most part" because the chords have no relation to one another; a false fifth can follow a perfect fifth; avoid "false" or "inharmonic" relations (14)		
Marpurg: Handbuch bey dem Generalbasse und der Composition (1755, 1757, 1758, 1760)	parallel fifths and octaves prohibited because they offend the ear, though he hesitates to say that there would never be an exception to the rule and gives many examples of possible exceptions; criticizes current taste and "slovenly amateurs" who have relaxed these rules in composition; many things (like parallel octaves and fifths) are mistakes in composition but not in accompanying where there is more latitude (51-70); can be avoided by doubling a consonant interval in either chord or by distributing the chord between the hands (6-7)	stay as close as possible with little jumping in the right hand (11)	longest segment, most innovative and controversial; gives instruction for how to resolve each type of dissonant interval (78-160)
Rameau: Code de Musique Pratique (1760)		keep common notes the same (28)	must be prepared and resolved properly (33)
C. P. E. Bach: Versuch (1753, 1762)	parallel fifths and octaves should be strictly avoided by leap or by step (II: 24-5); "It is obvious that the parallel octaves rule does not apply to those places where good reason prompts a composer to lead two voices in unison. It does apply to chord progressions"; hidden fifths may be allowed in the inner voices but never between the upper voice and the bass (II: 34); generally avoid the augmented 2nd (II: 60)	leaps are occasionally allowed in the right hand for variety (II: 281)	called "dissonances" because they sound bad, should be used only under certain conditions and their harshness mollified by preparation and resolution (although he lists several exceptions) (II: 25)
Clément: Essai sur la basse fondamentale (1762)			
Pasquali: Thorough Bass Made Easy (1763)	avoid parallel fifths and octaves between top note and bass note (always provides a solution: "instead of this...play this..."), but says the beginner may avoid this rule until he is a master of the thorough bass (9-11)	avoid skipping too much from one chord to another (it helps to keep at least three bass notes in view at all times) (9); the chord moved to should not be too "distant" from the previous one, which is defined as "the highest note of the one is four notes higher or lower than the highest note of the other" (14)	

	Prohibited Intervals and Chords	Moving from one chord to another	Dissonances
Serre: Observations sur les principes de l'harmonie (1763)			
Roussier: Traité des accords (1764)			
Garnier: Nouvelle Méthode (1767)			
Boutmy: Traité Abrégé (1769/70)	parallel fifths and octaves forbidden at all times--avoid by moving the hands in contrary motion (27)		
Bemetzrieder: Leçons de Clavecin (1771)			
Falkener: Instructions for Playing the Harpsichord (1772)	parallel fifths and octaves are not allowed between the treble and the bass, although if there are many parts in a composition they may be allowed (36); two common chords (triads) should not follow each other (such as D to E) (25)--however even great masters occasionally break the rules		nature provided two: the flat 7th and the sharp 7th, they must be properly introduced and not overused (37)
Schröter: Deutliche Anweisung (1772)	considered parallel fifths and octaves "most disgusting" and said they should be avoided in all forms, even when hidden in middle parts (45)		
G. M. Telemann: Unterricht im GeneralbassSpielen (1773)	avoid parallel fifths and octaves (99)	do not jump from chord to chord in the right hand since it often results in parallel fifths and octaves; keep common tones the same; it is possible to jump to another inversion if the right hand is getting too close or too far away from the left hand (99)	many exceptions to conventional rules; he says "as long as you can prepare, prepare; and again: as long as you can resolve, resolve! And if anyone observes these two rules, he has done his part; and for all else he can leave figurist and composer to answer" (53); some theoretical discussion about what constitutes a dissonance and the distinction between essential and accidental dissonances (footnote 34-5)
Martini: Esemplare (1774-76)			
Corrette: Prototype (1775)	doubling the bass in the upper voice displeases the ear (10)		discusses formation of dissonant chords, but refers readers to his earlier work for more details (5-6)
Fenaroli: Regole Musicali (1775)	parallel fifths and octaves prohibited because they are the fundamental basses and do not permit harmonic variation (4)		

	Prohibited Intervals and Chords	Moving from one chord to another	Dissonances
Manfredini: Regole Armoniche (1775)	an essential rule is to avoid parallel fifths and octaves in the outer parts because they are difficult to listen to; they are tolerated in inner voices, but not preferred (58); his examples actually frequently show parallel octaves in the inner voices (see ex. 59)		
Hesse: Kurze, doch hinlängliche Anweisung zum General-Basse (1776)	parallel fifths and octaves not permitted, although they are sometimes difficult to avoid in full textures (9-10)		shows how to prepare and resolve properly with special notes for beginners (30-37)
Heck: The Art of Playing Thorough Bass (1777)	octaves and fifths not allowed to follow each other in similar or parallel motion (11); avoid inharmonic relations as they are unmelodious (22)	shows three positions for the right hand triad and says the top voice should be the most melodious (a third is more melodious than a fifth and a fifth more than an eighth) (23)	all discords must be prepared and resolved properly (12-15)
Löhlein: Klavierschule (1779-81) [*Page numbers correspond with the English translation by Dora Wilson]	parallel fifths and octaves should be avoided by beginners even if they are common in fashionable compositions of the day (241)*; the accompanist must have a trained ear in order to discern what is most appropriate; incorrect progressions result if one proceeds from a perfect interval to an imperfect one in parallel motion (242); avoid ascending leaps of augmented fourths and fifths (244)	leaping forbidden--always take closest chord, contrary motion is the most reliable and least likely to contain mistakes (240)	should always be resolved in the same voice where they are found (273); rules not as strict in recitatives; extensive discussion on how to treat seventh and ninth chords with copious examples (269-328)
J. M. Bach: Kurze und systematische Anleitung zum General-Bass (1780)	parallel fifths and octaves forbidden (9-10)		
Kirnberger: Grundsätze des Generalbasses (1781)	parallel fifths and octaves forbidden (15, 17-18)		
Paisiello: Regole per bene accompagnare (1782)	avoid parallel fifths and octaves--they produce a "cattivissimo effetto" (8)	which chord should follow what chords seems to be the focus of the treatise (if it descends by a third it should be followed by an ascending fourth, etc...)	
Petri: Anleitung zur praktischen Musik (1767, 1782)	parallel fifths and octaves are considered the largest error in music because of their unpleasant sound--avoid them (225)		

	Prohibited Intervals and Chords	Moving from one chord to another	Dissonances
Jackson: A Treatise on Practical Thorough Bass (1795)	parallel fifths and octaves ought to be carefully avoided (1); best way to avoid is move the hands in contrary motion (gives two full pages of examples of good and bad realization in this manner) (21-22)	should be played, as much as possible, by rising and falling only one note (2); contrary motion is preferred (21)	2nd, 4th, 7th, 9th; discords must be properly prepared and resolved: "The discord is first heard as a concord to the bass note immediately preceding that to which it is a discord and resolved by falling a note or half note to a concord" (3, 23)
Rodolphe: Théorie d'accompagnement (1785)			
Fricke: Treatise on Thorough Bass (1786)	successive fifths and octaves are the greatest faults (40), hidden fifths not allowed in extreme parts, but permitted in the internal parts (4f)	keep common tones the same and avoid every unnecessary skip (41)	
Miller: Elements of Thoroughbass and Composition (1787)	Avoid common chords in parallel motion (6)	keep common notes in the same place and avoid skipping as much as possible (4); contrary motion is always preferred (6)	"All discords are prepared upon the unaccented part of a Bar; struck upon the following accented, and resolved by descending one degree upon the next unaccented part of the Bar" (55)
Türk: Von den wichtigsten Pflichten eines Organisten (1787)	avoid parallel octaves and fifths (33)--but notes that this alone is not enough to make a great thorough bass player	keep the voices of the chords as much as possible in the same spacing (50)	a good thorough bass player must be fluent in how to properly prepare and resolve dissonances (33)
Mattei: Pratica D'Accompagnamento (1788)	parallel fifths and octaves prohibited (7)		
Anonymous: Armonici Erudimenti (1790)	parallel fifths and octaves prohibited (3)		
Kessel: Unterricht im Generalbasse (1791)	parallel fifths (especially) and octaves should be avoided in the outer voices because they sound empty, indefinite, and insult the ear (20)		explains how to resolve dissonances properly moving downward (10-13); dissonances can be used for expression (63-6)
Albrechtsberger: Kurzgefasste Methode den Generalbass (1792)	parallel fifths and octaves forbidden (10)		
Tomeoni: Regole Pratiche (1795)	parallel fifths and octaves prohibited--they produce a "sour and harsh" sound that is insupportable (39)		
Türk: Anweisung zum Generalbassspielen (1800)	parallel fifths and octaves are objectionable, especially the fifths, because they produce a feeling of uncertainty; parallel intervals vary in unpleasantness based on the nearness or remoteness of the key relationships (75)	best to maintain common voices, jumping may lead to many errors (107)	the preparation and resolution of dissonances is not as exact in recitatives (342)

	Prohibited Intervals and Chords	Moving from one chord to another	Dissonances
King: A General Treatise on Music (1801)	avoid successive fifths or eighths, also hidden fifths and eighths should be avoided (18); in three or four parts two fifths "may follow in succession; provided that the perfect precedes the imperfect fifth; and in which case they may appear in the external or internal parts...Two imperfect fifths may also exist at the same moment" (19)		
Choron: Principes de composition (1804)	Parallel octaves produce "aucun effet," parallel fifths produce "un très mauvais" effect--avoid them (6)		
Corfe: Thorough Bass Simplified (1805)	parallel fifths and octaves absolutely forbidden (6)	"The old rule given to Thorough-Bass Players is, that the right hand should be kept, as much as possible, in one position; but if an agreeable, and elegant melody can be gained, by sometimes moving the right hand, not more than a fourth, I see no reason why such a liberty should not be taken..." (11)	
Kollmann: Practical Guide to Thoroughbass (1807)	parallel fifths and octaves should be avoided; To prevent them it is a general rule that in four parts one chord of the sixth should not succeed another in the same form; but that the Octave, and the doubled Sixth or Third should be introduced alternately. (11)		"a dissonance is an interval that ought not to be doubled, and requires a certain progression called its resolution" (5); "...in Discords, the dissonant intervals should as much as possible go in unison with that principal part in which they occur, as otherwise the dissonances not only sound as being doubled, contrary to the general rule, but their resolutions also have the effect of disallowed octaves" (41)
J. Jousse: Lectures on Thoroughbass (1808)	parallel fifths and octaves are expressly forbidden--this is the strictest rule in music--In order to avoid them notes may need to be omitted from chords (49); a perfect fifth may be followed by an imperfect one, but only if it resolves properly (10); parallel octaves not as offensive as parallel fifths, but they are monotonous and create a vacancy between parts so they should still be avoided; (Notes that the Germans NEVER break this rule, although several Italian, French and English authors have) (49)	Irregular motions of the parts in the harmony are to be avoided: every sharp interval should ascend and every flat interval should descend (unless it makes parallel octaves or fifths) (10); unnecessary skips are forbidden--"when a note of a chord is to be part of the following, it must be kept down" (10)	

Appendix D: Bass Line Specifics According to Continuo Treatises, 1750-1808

	Octave Doublings	Number of Chords to a Bar	Unfigured Bass
Reinhard: Kurzer und deutlicher Unterricht von dem General-Bass (1750)		when the notes move very fast, such as in sixteenth-note patterns, play only one chord per beat (26)	
Nauss: Gründlicher Unterricht den General-Bass (1751)			
Quantz: Versuch (1752)	long notes may be struck with the lower octave (226); bass notes can be doubled to produce louder sounds (259)		
Corrette: Le Maître de clavecin (1753)			explains both the Rule of the Octave ("the compass of the accompanist") (19, 22) and the fundamental bass method (67-9)
La Porte: Traité Théorique et pratique de l'accompagnement (1753)			a chapter on the rule of the octave in order to know how to figure each note of the scale (6-7); says it is very difficult to accompany exactly a bass without figures--especially the suspensions, accidentals, and modulations (51)
Dubugrarre: Méthode plus courte et plus facile (1754)			
Daube: General-Bass in drey Accorden (1756)	can be used to strengthen the bass, but only occasionally and never with leaps or running passages (197)		recommends using his three-chord method rather than learning a chord for each bass note (212-213)
Geminiani: The Art of Accompaniment (1756)			rejects the rule of the octave--considers it defective (I, 3)
Adlung: Anleitung zu der Musikalischen Gelahrtheit (1758)			only possible to play from if one has the full score or the melody line; refers people to Heinichen's treatise for more information (657)
Clément : Essai sur l'accompagnement du clavecin (1758)			
Heck: Short and Fundamental Instructions for Learning Thorough Bass (1760)		most of his examples use a chord for every bass note, but he is concerned more with how to realize the figures rather than performance issues	does not talk specifically about this, but he does talk about specific chords and figures associated with each individual scale degree (10-11)

	Octave Doublings	Number of Chords to a Bar	Unfigured Bass
Marpurg: Handbuch bey dem Generalbasse und der Composition (1755, 1757, 1758, 1760)	can double the bass without fear of transgression (11)		
Rameau: Code de Musique Pratique (1760)			Chapter 15: do not attempt until you can already accompany perfectly with figures, know the rules of composition, and your ear is trained well in harmony (171)
C. P. E. Bach: Versuch (1753, 1762)	vary this when there are lots of repeated notes so it does not get boring and the hand does not get stiff; good for fortes, and the entrance of bold fugal subjects (II: 245); add the lower octave when many repeated, slurred notes appear in a slow tempo (II: 251); left hand should not be doubled at the octave in tasto solo unless needed for balance with loud instruments (II: 181)	two to a bar: half notes in alla breve, fast 3/2; quarter notes: slow 3/2, simple meters in faster tempos, 3/4 and 6/4 in fast tempos; eighth notes: 4/4 in slow tempos, slow 3/8, 6/8, 9/8, 12/8, 3/4 and 6/4 (II: 303); rapid notes do not each need a separate chord (II: 28)	basses should be fully figured since the rules for unfigured bass are often wrong; unjust to expect the accompanist to learn thorough bass both with and without figures--too much needless effort and too much possibility for error (298-9)
Clément: Essai sur la basse fondamentale (1762)			
Pasquali: Thorough Bass Made Easy (1763)	should not be used until single note basses have been mastered; use sparingly and very rarely with any note shorter than a crotchet; use in full pieces to give additional force but omit in soft places; adding and omitting octaves can give the impression that the harpsichord has the faculty of increasing and decreasing in sound (43-44)	only four chords to a bar in common time unless it is figured otherwise (31); in alla breve view the minims as crotchets and play as common time (37); in triple time play the downbeat and sometimes beat three depending on the tempo and harmony (39-41)	
Serre: Observations sur les principes de l'harmonie (1763)			
Roussier: Traité des accords (1764)			
Garnier: Nouvelle Méthode (1767)			

	Octave Doublings	Number of Chords to a Bar	Unfigured Bass
Boutmy: Traité Abrégé (1769/70)		One chord per whole note, half note or quarter note; for 8th, 16th or 32nd notes play a chord on the first beat of each grouping. (5)	shows how to harmonize an unfigured bass by giving a single bass note and showing which chord goes with each melody note up a chromatic scale; gives the example in one key and tells students to practice transposing it into all the different keys (26-27); strongly opposes the use of unfigured bass despite its prevalence (28)
Bemetzrieder: Leçons de Clavecin (1771)			
Falkener: Instructions for Playing the Harpsichord (1772)		in slower pieces play one chord for every beat, fewer for presto tempos; in quick movements two chords per bar is probably sufficient (24-5)	
Schröter: Deutliche Anweisung (1772)		generally accompany only the consonant notes (170); in faster tempos play chords on the main beats unless the harmonies move faster, at slower tempos play on every eighth notes; gives examples from every meter and tempo (166-185)	
G. M. Telemann: Unterricht im Generalbassspielen (1773)	doubled at slow tempos; if the bass line is already too low double with the octave above; not necessary except when a loud accompaniment is wanted (18)		his chapter "on Bass notes without figures" does not deal with unfigured basses, but rather with passing tones whose harmonies must be inferred from the context
Martini: Esemplare (1774-76)			
Corrette: Prototype (1775)		one chord played on each beat except when resolving dissonances (then play two); in slow movements chords can be played on each eighth note when they repeat the same scale degree; more than one chord may be played per beat if the harmony requires it (16)	recommends Rameau's fundamental bass method and the rule of the octave; refers students to his earlier work (47)
Fenaroli: Regole Musicali (1775)			
Manfredini: Regole Armoniche (1775)	appropriate only when accompanying in a large orchestra or a church work with multiple choirs, in solo accompaniment it would be inappropriate (63)	play a chord on the first beat of the bar, in the middle of the bar, and if the tempo is right on every quarter (59)	describes three kinds of accompaniment: partimento, figured bass accompaniment, and unfigured bass; he considers unfigured bass to be the most difficult (30)

	Octave Doublings	Number of Chords to a Bar	Unfigured Bass
Hesse: Kurze, doch hinlängliche Anweisung zum General-Basse (1776)		no more than one chord in the right hand per beat; when the bass line has moving notes play only on the first of each set; gives examples of various left hand patterns and where to place the chords (41)	
Heck: The Art of Playing Thorough Bass (1777)		The general rule is to play "as many Chords in a Bar as there are different Parts of measure" (common time=four, alla breve time=two, etc.) (67); in quick tempos with sixteenth notes in the bass line the keyboard accompanist need only play one chord per quarter note and let the string player play the rest (72)	shows which chords correspond to each note of the scale, but does not call it the rule of the octave or refer to that system explicitly (Ch. 28)
Löhlein: Klavierschule (1779-81) [*Page numbers correspond with the English translation by Dora Wilson]	double the bass at the octave for long notes (216)*	very seldom does every note have accompaniment--depends on the nature of the notes and their movement (245); passing notes are generally not accompanied; in slow tempos usually every note receives harmony, in fast only the accented beats--there are many exceptions which can only be learned through diligent practice and training the ears (424)	the focus of the second volume; gives the natural progression of chords for each note of major and minor scales (373-4); an attentive ear is the most important thing for accuracy (378); before attempting unfigured bass the student should already know: 1) how to perform a figured bass; 2) the accompaniment of the scales (natural accompaniment); 3) how to modulate (407)
J. M. Bach: Kurze und systematische Anleitung zum General-Bass (1780)			
Kirnberger: Grundsätze des Generalbasses (1781)			
Paisiello: Regole per bene accompagnare (1782)			
Petri: Anleitung zur praktischen Musik (1767, 1782)	in unison sections both hands can be doubled at the octave (249)		
Jackson: A Treatise on Practical Thorough Bass (1785)			goes through the "diatonic progression of the octave with its harmony in the major/minor keys"; he does not specifically associate this with unfigured bass but he uses it as an example of how to compose a figured bass according to these particular rules (5, 27)

	Octave Doublings	Number of Chords to a Bar	Unfigured Bass
Rodolphe: Théorie d'accompagnement (1785)			
Fricke: Treatise on Thorough Bass (1786)		If a "strong accompaniment" is required (such as for a full chorus) and the tempo is slow, play as "many chords, as there are minims, Crotchets or Quavers in a Bar"; if the tempo is quick or a piano dynamic is required the right hand should "move sparingly" (67)	use the rule of the octave (74); if the composer does not want to insert figures the bass line should be included with the score so the accompanist can take notice of the other parts in order to modulate correctly, etc. (85); composers do not always figure accurately, if they figure at all, so it is important to understand figures and figuring in order to play accurately whether the figures are there or not (preface)
Miller: Elements of Thoroughbass and Composition (1787)		"The general rule is, to play as many chords in a Bar as there are different parts of measure; thus if there be four crotchets in a Bar, we accompany only every crotchet however they may be divided into quicker Notes, unless the marking of some figures direct us to the contrary"; In quick passages doubled by a string instrument only play the main notes (56)	Observe: 1) What key the piece is in; and whether major or minor, 2) Where the modulations are and what chords are necessary for them, 3) Which chord goes with which note of the scale and keep it the same while in the same key (53)
Türk: Von den wichtigsten Pflichten eines Organisten (1787)	double the bass note with the pedal for fortes (152); in rapid passages it may be necessary to leave out the pedal for clarity (156)		a good thorough bass player needs to know how to figure the bass himself and devise the correct harmony (34)
Mattei: Pratica D'Accompagnamento (1788)			
Anonymous: Armonici Erudimenti (1790)			
Kessel: Unterricht im Generalbasse (1791)		generally play only on the main notes of the left hand in faster tempos and on every note in slower ones (56-7)	First step is to play many figured basses in order to understand proper harmony; start by noticing the key and type of composition; if one is unsure of the appropriate harmonies play fewer notes (107); shows chords for each note of the octave (108); to play well one must possess a good ear, good understanding of the art, and good thinking and feeling (110)

	Octave Doublings	Number of Chords to a Bar	Unfigured Bass
Albrechtsberger: Kurzgefasste Methode den Generalbass (1792)		play a chord on every principal division of the bar (in common time use 4 chords, in alla breve 2, in triple meter 3, etc)--this rule remains unchanged even when the bass is further divided into smaller note values	
Tomeoni: Regole Pratiche (1795)			
Türk: Anweisung zum Generalbassspielen (1800)	the lower octave may be added to bass notes to strengthen the setting, especially when the right hand is syncopated (334)	each division of the measure gets its own chord (119); in faster tempos in duple meter play only two chords per measure unless the harmony is indicated to change more often (122); in faster triple meter tempos play only on the first and/or fourth beats (123); if in doubt fewer chords are always better than too many (333)	features a whole chapter on unfigured bass; essentially says that the best thing to do is to first play many figured basses in order to get used to the common order of chords, therefore he expands on his earlier rules about figuring basses and which chord follows which (358-372)
King: A General Treatise on Music (1801)			
Choron: Principes de composition (1804)			
Corfe: Thorough Bass Simplified (1805)			
Kollmann: Practical Guide to Thoroughbass (1807)		Left to performer's own tastes: "The number of chords to be struck in every bar, depends upon the nature of the piece, as well as upon every particular passage, as the succeeding practices will shew [sic.]. And though it is generally considered as a rule, that the accompaniment should divide one bar in the same manner as another, the nature of the passage often requires more chords in one, and fewer in another bar, as a judicious performer will easily perceive, and in which he ought to attend." (41)	Need to know the rule of the octave--which can also help with improvising preludes and other short pieces; refers readers to Türk and C.P.E. Bach for more instruction.
J. Jousse: Lectures on Thoroughbass (1808)	"The use of octaves in the bass being intended to give additional force to some notes, they should be introduced only when a passage requires it, or in full pieces, when all the instruments play loud. Octaves are seldom played to any note shorter than a Crotchet. Octaves must not be used in the Bass in accompanying a single Voice or Instrument, or in the Piano passages of a piece for a full band." (48)	The general rule is to play a Chord to each part of the Bar (quarter notes in quick, eighth notes in slow)	Need to first know the "accompaniment of the scale" and have a perfect knowledge of figured bass (35); general rules without exceptions cannot be given but a few guidelines: 1) Decide the key and mode of the piece; 2) Use the rule of the octave to determine the chords in the given key; 3) when the music modulates into another key it can usually be determined by a change in sharps or flats; 4) only the essential notes, usually those on the accented beats should be accompanied; 5) Cadences should always end with a common chord preceded by the V7 (53)

Appendix E: Performance Instructions Given in Continuo Treatises, 1750-1808

	Relationship to Solo Line	Independent or Non-chordal Accompaniment	Ornamentation and Embellishment	Recitative	Other performance instructions
Reinhard: Kurzer und deutlicher Unterricht von dem General-Bass (1750)					
Nauss: Gründlicher Unterricht den General-Bass (1751)					
Quantz: Versuch (1752)	right hand should not be too active or play melodically along with soloist (225); it is best to play below the solo part rather than with or above it (234); moderate the accompaniment (rhythm, dynamics, melody, range, touch, etc) based on what the soloist is doing (235); even if the soloist takes the wrong tempo at the beginning the accompanist should not alter it (236)	"imitations that consist of running or melodic passages have a better effect if they are doubled with the right hand at the upper octave than if they are accompanied with full chords" (236)	when the soloist is playing an appoggiatura leave out the conflicting note in the chord until the appoggiatura is resolved (232)	anticipate the singer's note in the chord with a quick arpeggiation if the recitative is sung from memory (238); in Italian recitative the tempo is flexible and the accompanist must follow the singer by ear rather than by the beat (272); in order to keep momentum going do not wait until the singer has finished holding a note to begin the next chord (272)	the fewer the number of instruments, the more discretion is required (225); some chords must be struck with more emphasis than others (226); gives advice on how to curve the fingers (231-2); pay attention to the register of the instrument and adapt accordingly (234); make sure all instruments are properly tuned (239); exact expression of piano and forte dynamics are one of the most essential matters in performance (249); exact tempos, rhythms, and rests are very important (255)

	Relationship to Solo Line	Independent or Non-chordal Accompaniment	Ornamentation and Embellishment	Recitative	Other performance instructions
Corrette: Le Maître de clavecin (1753)					accompanist will have to adjust to the different systems of figuring used by French and foreign composers (79-80)
La Porte: Traité Théorique et pratique de l'accompagnement (1753)					
Dubugrarre: Méthode plus courte et plus facile (1754)					strike all chords without arpeggiating them unless it is a recitative or a slow, graceful piece--in a vivacious piece arpeggiating would be confusing and spoil the harmony (3)
Daube: General-Bass in drey Accorden (1756)	if the soloist has a trill or running passage above the held note, then the accompanist will play the chord in quick arpeggiation (197-8); help the soloist enhance dynamics; in very soft dynamics the upper voice can be left out; discretely double the vocal line in difficult passages (202)	Possibilities for improving the accompaniment (keeping in mind the person being accompanied and using extreme caution): 1) a few melodic figures when the upper voice pauses; 2) proceeding in thirds or sixths with the upper voice; 3) imitating the theme or playing counter melody in the right hand; and 4) improve a badly written bass part by imitative the upper voice or changing note values, etc. (203-4)	accompaniment is especially beautiful when played very clearly without ornamentation or arpeggiation (197) running passages may be added when the soloist holds a long note	requires accompanying according to the character of the piece, as full of voicing as possible, precise tempo, great care, and keen discernment; arpeggiation of chords should bring out the melody for the singer, especially in difficult passages (202-3)	chords should be released quickly (197)

	Relationship to Solo Line	Independent or Non-chordal Accompaniment	Ornamentation and Embellishment	Recitative	Other performance instructions
Geminiani: The Art of Accompaniment (1756)	"If an Accompanyer thinks of nothing else but satisfying his own whim and caprice, he may perhaps be said to play well, but will certainly be said to accompany ill" (II, 1); accompaniment should seek to delight and inspire the player or singer (II, 1)	"... a good accompanyer ought to possess the faculty of playing all sorts of basses, in different manners; so as to be able, on proper occasions, to enliven the composition, and delight the singer or player. But he is to exercise this faculty with judgment, taste, and discretion, agreeable to the style of compositions, and the manner and intention of the performer; when the upper part stops and the bass continues the accompanist should improvise a melodious variation on the same harmony to give pleasure to the hearer and inspire the performer (II, 1)	free use is made throughout of passing (accented and unaccented) notes and appoggiaturas, but not trills or similar ornaments		performances will change based on various performers' tastes; uses special notation to eliminate the need for printing rests and to help distinguish essential and non-essential notes at a glance (e.g. "round black notes without tails, over or under minims, are to be played... as though preceded by a crotchet rest") (II, 1)
Adlung: Anleitung zu der Musikalischen Gelahrtheit (1758)	the best accompanists are also trained in singing because they know what to expect with the melody and have the best ears (624-5)	the best kind of ornament is using melodies in the right hand including syncopation and imitation (653-4)	right hand ornaments include accents, mordents, trills (653)		
Clément : Essai sur l'accompagne- ment du clavecin (1758)					

	Relationship to Solo Line	Independent or Non-chordal Accompaniment	Ornamentation and Embellishment	Recitative	Other performance instructions
Heck: Short and Fundamental Instructions for Learning Thorough Bass (1760)					
Marpurg: Handbuch bey dem Generalbasse und der Composition (1755, 1757, 1758, 1760)					strict rules must be learned first to train the ear, but then the ear should be used to determine good taste
Rameau: Code de Musique Pratique (1760)	Take care not to take attention away from a solo voice or instrument (73)		recommends occasionally adding a coulé to a perfect triad (inserting the leading tone before the tonic) with a rapid arpeggio releasing the dissonance quickly (similar to an Italian acciaccatura but not as noisy) (73)		learn to rely on the fingers and ear rather than the eyes (28)

	Relationship to Solo Line	Independent or Non-chordal Accompaniment	Ornamentation and Embellishment	Recitative	Other performance instructions
C. P. E. Bach: Versuch (1753, 1762)	"When the principal part moves in tenths with a middle part, the accompanist plays thirds in the lower register rather than tenths" (II: 255); poor to constantly duplicate the melody of the principal part, but permissible and necessary at the beginning of rapid pieces in order to adjust to the same tempo (II: 257); make sure harmonic and melodic nuances in the accompaniment never hamper the solo part (II: 288); when accompanying soloists with a low range be careful not to play too high above the principal part (II: 256)	during the soloist's pauses the accompanist may use more elaborate passage work and additional melodies; discuss ahead of time how many liberties the soloist wants taken in the accompaniment (II: 244-5); care must always be taken to construct a good melody part in the right hand; imitation is often used in passages which are varied on their repetition--pattern it as closely as possible after the leading part and be careful that both are not "noisy" at the same time (290-1); broken chords can be used in one or both hands for dynamics and variety of texture; filling out slow notes is one of the best refinements (II: 286), but they must be in accord with the affect and content of a piece (II: 325)	appoggiaturas are an integral part of refined accompaniment and require a delicate accompaniment; when the solo part has many appoggiaturas the accompanist should not obscure the melody and may need to leave out some ornaments or introduce rests; unless notated otherwise the appoggiatura should be accompanied by the chord which belongs to the release; bow to the soloist's modifications and modify harmony accordingly (II: 185-219); discordant passing notes can be added if the harmony is not obscured (II: 288)	harmonies are simpler than in earlier periods and recitative is not as difficult as it once was; requires constant listening to the soloist to be always ready; arpeggiation best for slow recitatives and sustained chords (place the singer's note in the upper part); the theater usually requires louder playing (II: 313-319)	solo or aria requires greatest nuances and care; an accompanist with "discretion" can fashion his setting to the nature of the piece, number of parts, other performers, audience, instruments, etc. (I: 269); must be the "guardian of the beat"; must study solo performance first; "unadorned steadiness and noble simplicity in a flowing accompaniment" is the goal, not gratuitous bustling that detracts from the soloist (II: 243); if a bass instrument is also playing it is possible to omit some bass notes in fast passages; notes held for varying lengths depending on the tempo (II: 304); if bass line is poorly written it may be modified when not duplicated by other instruments; if the bass note is held for a long time restrike it (II: 249); depress the keys with force--avoid constantly playing on the surface of the keys (II: 259)
Clément: Essai sur la basse fondamentale (1762)					

	Relationship to Solo Line	Independent or Non-chordal Accompaniment	Ornamentation and Embellishment	Recitative	Other performance instructions
Pasquali: Thorough Bass Made Easy (1763)	chords should never be taken much above nor much below the notes of the voice; in songs whenever possible the top note of the chord should be that which the voice is singing--for this reason "the chords may be taken in any of their different ways, and in any part of the instrument. And, provided the voice may be closely pursued, a skip now and then is permitted." (46); in instrumental solos it is not necessary to play the melody notes; if the soloist is playing low than the chords must also be transposed low (47)			the most difficult to accompany for beginners, but eventually the easiest; use "harpeggios" (slow or quick depending on the words) rather than striking too abruptly; harmony should be filled up as much as possible (47-8)	very specific instructions on songs, instrumental solos, and recitative (45-8); practitioner should not be left to his own taste until he has mastered by ear what chords are required to accompany many common passages (44); if one finds a passage he does not know how to accompany play only the bass notes until an easy section (30)
Serre: Observations sur les principes de l'harmonie (1763)					
Roussier: Traité des accords (1764)					
Garnier: Nouvelle Méthode (1767)					
Boutny: Traité Abrégé (1769/70)					

	Relationship to Solo Line	Independent or Non-chordal Accompaniment	Ornamentation and Embellishment	Recitative	Other performance instructions
Bemetzrieder: Leçons de Clavecin (1771)					
Falkener: Instructions for Playing the Harpsichord (1772)					
Schröter: Deutliche Anweisung (1772)				arpeggiating chords in both hands has a great effect (185-6); do not beat time with the accompaniment, feel the internal text rhythm; if the singer has a difficult interval gently play their part or thirds or sixths below (186); gives no musical examples because he says his text is clear enough	
G. M. Telemann: Unterricht im GeneralbassSpielen (1773)			refers readers to C. P. E. Bach, Quantz, Tosi and Agricola for more information on the subject (21)	use organ for church recitative and harpsichord for opera; accompanist must help singer navigate through modulations (20)	
Martini: Esemplare (1774-76)					

	Relationship to Solo Line	Independent or Non-chordal Accompaniment	Ornamentation and Embellishment	Recitative	Other performance instructions
Corrette: Prototype (1775)	in Italian ariettes the melody part may be played from time to time with the <i>right hand on long notes</i> (15, 16, 46)	in Italian ariettes one may arpeggiate chords on long notes; alternate between plain chords and arpeggios so it does not become too "tiring," "dull," "confused" or stifle the delicacy of the voice--this manner of accompanying requires fine musicianship (16)	trills and mordents may occasionally be performed by the left hand: 4th note and leading tone of an ascending scale, mordents on long notes, trills on the 6th scale degree in minor or descending scales (11)	appropriate to double consonant chords with the left hand on a harpsichord (produces a bad effect on the organ) (46)	To accompany in the Italian style: 1) women accompany themselves in concert, 2) do not smother the voice with an abundance of chords--only <i>play in moving passages</i> or majestic passages that require extra strength, 3) strike chords in strict time in instrumental sections, 4) In lines with pretty melodies they most often play the same vocal line on the harpsichord with the right hand, 5) If singing <i>mezza voce</i> they play the chords on the upper keyboard, and almost always with only three fingers in the right hand (no duplicating the octave) (46); when accompanying on the organ do not lift fingers too much (15)
Fenaroli: Regole Musicali (1775)					
Manfredini: Regole Armoniche (1775)			the harmony should be kept simple and unadorned (63); it is best to <i>accompany simply and leave out the ornaments</i> so as not to clash with the soloist (63)	acciaccaturas are most appropriate for recitatives when they can be arpeggiated (62); arpeggiating some of the chords in a recitative creates a beautiful effect (63)	movement of the hand over the keys should be comfortable and beautiful without moving other body parts (28)
Hesse: Kurze, doch hinlängliche Anweisung zum General-Basse (1776)					

	Relationship to Solo Line	Independent or Non-chordal Accompaniment	Ornamentation and Embellishment	Recitative	Other performance instructions
Heck: The Art of Playing Thorough Bass (1777)	"the highest Notes of the Chords must not be the same as those of the principal Part except in the beginning of a Piece, which may be done only for the sake of more regularity of Time between the Parties, much less are they to exceed, the compass of the Principal, except where it cannot easily be avoided." (91)	demonstrates two-handed arpeggiation; says the lowest note in Alberti bass patterns can be held (89)	Generally introducing ornamentation in accompaniments is not a good idea since "more Skill and Judgement is required than what falls to the share of the generality of Thorough Bass Players" (93); the harmony must be regulated when there are appoggiaturas in the solo melody—be careful as these ornaments are seldom indicated in the figures—these kinds of passages are best accompanied more sparingly with only two parts in the right hand (92)		notes should be repeated more often on a harpsichord than an organ since the sound does not sustain (91); more refinement, taste and variety is needed in the modern practices of the day (93); the Rules from the older styles (such as Corelli) may not be sufficient for the works in modern Practice (93)
Löhlein: Klavierschule (1779-81) [*Page numbers correspond with the English translation by Dora Wilson]	Going beyond the upper voice should only be done reluctantly, especially in simple phrases (493)*; the accompaniment must remain subordinate to the melody (427)	passages of imitation are best accompanied with one voice at the octave or the third (329)	"artistic or tasteful" accompaniment with ornaments are possible when one has already mastered the simple type as it requires great care; suggests looking at C. P. E. Bach or Quantz for more info (217); in quick tempos appoggiaturas should not be played in the accompaniment because they spoil the melody (427); Generally it is "a slippery thing for the accompanist to do the appoggiatura in a solo or trio; and often, if in doubt, it is best to tasto solo until one can accompany again without disturbing the melody. In symphonies and other full-voiced compositions, appoggiaturas do not occur so frequently and if they do occur then it is not so noticeable if they are passed over, as in delicate music." (558)	fewer strict rules; follow the singer; more dissonances allowed; use arpeggios of different types; give the singer his pitch in the chord; most chords should be played briefly; best accompanied from the score (344-5, 562-3); if the recitative is quick do not break or spread the chords; do not overuse the arpeggio (183-4)	clavichords are better than a harpsichord or pianoforte for the beginner (97); if a harpsichord with two keyboards is used, play gently on the upper keyboard (415); the chord need not always be played as prescribed by the figures as long as the performer follows a regular progression (a minor triad might be substituted for its parallel major); a soloist who has no good sense must not be imitated: the "accompanist must also be a captain as well as a musician, and if he is awkward and incompetent, he causes more harm than if he were not there at all." (464)

	Relationship to Solo Line	Independent or Non-chordal Accompaniment	Ornamentation and Embellishment	Recitative	Other performance instructions
J. M. Bach: Kurze und systematische Anleitung zum General-Bass (1780)					
Kirnberger: Grundsätze des Generalbasses (1781)					
Paisiello: Regole per bene accompagnare (1782)					
Petri: Anleitung zur praktischen Musik (1767, 1782)	do not play along with the solo line (169, 171)		no trills in the right hand since the accompanist should not play the melody (169, 171)	now and then make use of arpeggios or broken chords to good effect (169, 171); follow the singer's tempo; can help with the melody if the singer is inexperienced or makes a mistake (171)	play chords briefly and remove fingers immediately after striking the chords (169)
Jackson: A Treatise on Practical Thorough Bass (1785)					which inversion of the chord to use is left up to the performers own tastes—Jackson shows all of the options (14-19)
Rodolphe: Théorie d'accompagnement (1785)					
Fricke: Treatise on Thorough Bass (1786)	pay attention to the solo part so that if the soloist makes a mistake the accompanist can quickly assist by playing the solo part (85); examples show the top voice of the accompaniment doubling the voice line and then adding a third below. He says this is better than inverting the third to a sixth because then the melody would be doubled at the octave and "would sound very poorly," especially in "empty passages, where a Singer is accompanied only by the Organ or Harpsichord" (93)				on the organ never strike the same chord or figure twice—hold it until another is required (69)

	<i>Relationship to Solo Line</i>	<i>Independent or Non-chordal Accompaniment</i>	<i>Ornamentation and Embellishment</i>	<i>Recitative</i>	<i>Other performance instructions</i>
Miller: Elements of Thoroughbass and Composition (1787)	Use the solo line melody as the "little finger note" (top note) of the chord (7, 29); "When there are quavers or quick notes in the treble, it is frequently most proper to touch them alone"; once you are master of what chords are proper sometimes a third or octave below will have a better effect <i>than doubling--let observation and taste guide</i> (29)				"It is proper frequently to touch the Treble Notes singly, especially if they are quick ones" (18); Accents: 2 Notes in a Bar: 1st accented, 2nd unaccented; 4 Notes in a Bar: the 1st and 3rd accented; 3 Notes in a Bar: only 1st accented (55); in duets keyboard should play both treble parts in right hand (80)
Türk: Von den wichtigsten Pflichten eines Organisten (1787)	important to double the melody of chorales so that the congregation sings in tune; (1-7) when accompanying solo works do not play in a higher register than the solo voice (exceptions will have to be made for bass or tenor singers)	chords should not always be played in the same way--use a combination of playing together and broken chords with arpeggios at different tempos (165)	not acceptable--the organist is the accompanist and "must absolutely refrain from all additions that are completely contrary to the content, bother the singer, cause errors, etc."; the organist should play simply--always follow the soloist (164)	do not hold out bass notes or chords even if they're written as long notes--release quickly; vary the striking of chords; arpeggios should not be used too frequently; strike chords on the early side (by an eighth note) to help the singer (162-7)	in order to express particular sentiments in a hymn text, one "must combine taste and judgment with his knowledge and application of the rules, have proper sensibilities, know the effects of chords individually and in combination with others, etc" (34-5); must be confident in keeping time (142)
Mattei: Pratica D'Accompagnamento (1788)	the right hand should take care to have a good melody of its own but <i>should not contain the solo part</i> (7)				
Anonymous: Armonici Erudimenti (1790)					

	Relationship to Solo Line	Independent or Non-chordal Accompaniment	Ornamentation and Embellishment	Recitative	Other performance instructions
Kessel: Unterricht im Generalbasse (1791)	take care not to play above the soloist because this is unpleasant and mars the melody (60)			in recitative with the singer and keyboard alone the tempo is not steady so be careful to follow the singer; break the chords; if the singer falters in their pitches play a few notes to help them (61-2)	good taste and being able to adapt to various circumstances make the music more expressive and attractive (60); use simple organ accompaniments for chorales (62)
Albrechtsberger: Kurzgefasste Methode den Generalbass (1792)					
Tomeoni: Regole Pratiche (1795)					
Türk: Anweisung zum Generalbass-spielen (1800)	says that generally the accompaniment should stay below the solo part, but in many cases the accompaniment part can be a whole octave higher than the bass voice, cello, or bassoon (331)		the simplest, most unadorned accompaniment is often the best, especially for the beginner—ornaments should only be added by masters and they are not the focus of the study (refers people to Quantz, C. P. E. Bach, Heinichen and Riepel for more information on the refinements of accompaniment) (337); at a fermata pause on the chord while the singer embellishes the note, after the last note come in again clearly and firmly so that the performer knows where to come back in (336)	tempo is not steady, follow the singer carefully (338); put the singer's note in the chord for their ease, if it is an especially difficult interval the chord can be played a tiny bit early (338) or use an arpeggio that ends on the singer's next note (339); in lively moments the arpeggiation should be quick, in quieter moments the arpeggiation should be slower, in sentiments about courage the chords should not be broken, arpeggios should not happen incessantly (340); lift the chord right after it is played unless it is notated with a tenuto; arpeggio help sustain the sound on strung keyboard instruments (341); accompanied recitative follows the same basic principles (345)	a good accompanist should look a few beats ahead in order to avoid errors, be able to prepare dissonances, etc. (112); much care should be taken when accompanying chorales because errors are the most obvious in this situation (He provides a whole chapter on the subject—Ch. 11); following the rules is not enough—playing with discretion and good taste is what makes a good accompanist (327)

	Relationship to Solo Line	Independent or Non-chordal Accompaniment	Ornamentation and Embellishment	Recitative	Other performance instructions
King: A General Treatise on Music (1801)					
Choron: Principes de composition (1804)		allowed during ritornellos or when the soloist is resting (102)	During the ritornellos or silences in the solo part one can embellish a little (102)		harpsichord or fortepiano (sometimes with cello) for chamber or theater; organ for church (102)
Corfe: Thorough Bass Simplified (1805)	"he who accompanies, should by no means play the part of the Person who sings or plays, unless with an intention either to instruct or affront him" (11)				accompanists should touch the keys delicately (11)
Kollmann: Practical Guide to Thoroughbass (1807)	the chords also should not come above the highest obligato part, except in cases where that part only skips under the accompaniment, and then resumes its highest rank again" (41); "The thoroughbass accompaniment of an air, or of any solo treble...can be rendered most correct in those places, where the highest part of the chords goes in unison with the principal notes of that part or melody. But in tuttis and full pieces it is sufficient when the accompaniment is correct in itself, and adapted to the character of the piece" (41)	use arpeggiated chords if the harmony has to be continued against a long note (29)		Bass notes should be played short; chords need not be sustained (27, 30); yield to the singer's rhythm; play the singer's note inconspicuously in the upper part of the right hand; use "harpeggios" for added flourish; experience and good judgement are the best teachers (42)	

	Relationship to Solo Line	Independent or Non-chordal Accompaniment	Ornamentation and Embellishment	Recitative	Other performance instructions
J. Jousse: Lectures on Thoroughbass (1808)	Play toward the middle of the keyboard not disturbing the solo line or the bass; the right hand should never be too far from the bass line (48); in vocal music: "The chords must not be taken much above or below the notes of the voice, and when it can be easily effected, the highest note of the chord should be the note which the voice sings" (50); it is bad taste to take away from the soloist by adding misplaced flourishes and noisy accompaniments (54)	arpeggios played quicker or slower depending on the movement of the piece and the taste of the performer (52)	no rules can be given for how to introduce flourishes to the accompaniment--this must be learned by observing a master, beginning players should keep the accompaniment quite plain (54)	requires great discretion--must prepare the singer for difficult intervals, support his voice, keep it in tune, and direct modulations; flourishes are entirely misplaced; follow the Singer and their tempo and rhythm; hold each chord for about a quarter note unless a tenuto is indicated; chords can be arpeggiated when the words and time allow for it; if the singer has a difficult note place it in the top of the arpeggio (51)	a good accompanist must be able to vary his style according to the piece he has to accompany-- gives lengthy instructions on the differences between instrumental, vocal, and recitative accompanying (50)

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Continuo Treatises

- Adlung, Jakob. *Anleitung zu der musikalischen Gelahrtheit*. Erfurt: J. D. Jungnicol, 1758. Facsimile Edition, Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1953.
- Albrechtsberger, Johann Georg. *Kurzgefasste Methode den Generalbass zu erlernen*. Wien-Mainz: Artaria, 1791. Enlarged, Wien: Cappi, 1792.
- Anonymous. *Armonici erudimenti nei quali si contengono le regole e suoi esempi per imparare accompagnare sul cimbalò il basso continuo*. Florence: A. G. Pagani, 1790.
- Bach, Carl Phillip Emanuel. *Versuch über die wahre Art das Clavier zu spielen, Erster Theil*. Berlin: Christian Friedrich Henning, 1753.
- _____. *Versuch über die wahre Art das Clavier zu spielen, Zweyter Theil*. Berlin: Georg Ludwig Winter, 1762.
- Bach, Johann Michael. *Kurze und systematische Anleitung zum General-Bass*. Kassel: Waisenhaus-Buchdruckerei, 1780.
- Bemetzrieder, Anton. *Leçons de clavecin, et principes d'harmonie*. Paris: Bluet, 1771.
- Boutmy, Jean-Baptiste-Joseph. *Traité abrégé sur la basse continue*. Den Haag: B. Hummel; Amsterdam: J. J. Hummel, 1760.
- Braun, Johann Christoph. *Leichter und ganz kurz gefasster General-Bass für die Anfänger im Clavier*. Augsburg: Johann Jakob Lotter, 1774.
- Choron, Alexandre-Etienne, and Vincenzo Focchi. *Principes d'accompagnement des écoles d'Italie: extrait des meilleurs auteurs*. Paris: Chez Imbault, [1804].
- Clément, Charles-François. *Essai sur l'accompagnement du clavecin, pour parvenir facilement & en peu de tems à accompagner avec des chiffres ou sans chiffres par les principes les plus clairs & les plus simples de la composition*. Paris: C. Ballard, 1758. Facsimile Edition, Geneva: Minkoff, 1997.

- _____. *Essai sur la basse fondamentale pour servir de supplément à l'essai sur l'accompagnement du clavecin, & d'introduction à la composition pratique*. Paris: C. Ballard, 1762. Facsimile Edition, Geneva: Minkoff, 1997.
- Corfe, Joseph. *Thoroughbass Simplified*. London: Preston, 1805.
- Corrette, Michel. *Le maître de clavecin pour l'accompagnement, méthode théorique et pratique*. Paris: L'Auteur, Bayard, Le Clere, Castagnere, 1753. Facsimile Edition, Geneva: Minkoff, 1976.
- _____. *Prototype pour servir d'addition au Maître de clavecin méthode, pour l'accompagnement contenant des leçons d'accompagnement*. Paris: aus addresses ordinaires, 1775.
- Culant, René-Alexandre marquis de. *Nouvelle règle de l'octave*. Paris, 1786.
- Daube, Johann Friedrich. *General-Bass in drey Accorden*. Leipzig, Frankfurt am Main: Johann Benjamin Andrä (J. G. I. Breitkopf), 1756. Reprint, Michaelstein: Kultur und Forschungsstätte Michaelstein, 1984.
- Dubugrarre. *Méthode plus courte et plus facile que l'ancienne pour l'accompagnement du clavecin*. Paris: l'auteur, Le Clere, Mangean, Bayard, Castagnery, 1754. Facsimile Edition, Geneva: Minkoff, 1972.
- Falkener, Robert. *Instructions for Playing the Harpsichord Wherein is Fully Explained the Mystery of Thoroughbass*. London, 1772.
- Fenaroli, Fedele. *Regole musicali per li principianti di cembalo*. Napoli: V. Mazzola-Vocola, 1775. Reprint, Bologna: A. Forni, 1975.
- Fricke, Joseph. *A Treatise on Thoroughbass*. London: The Author, 1786.
- Garnier, Honoré. *Nouvelle méthode pour l'accompagnement du clavecin et bon pour les personnes qui pincent de la harpe*. Paris: l'auteur, 1767.
- Geminiani, Francesco. *The Art of Accompaniment*. 2 vols. London: John Johnson for the author, 1755. Facsimile Edition, Firenze: Studio per Edizioni Scelte, 1990.
- Gournay, B. C. *Lettre à M. L'abbé Roussier, sur une nouvelle règle de l'octave que propose M. le marquis de Culant*. Paris: Royez et Bailleux, 1785.
- Heck, John Caspar. *Short and Fundamental Instructions for Learning Thoroughbass*. London, 1760.

- _____. *The Art of Playing Thoroughbass*. London: J. Welcker, 1777.
- Hesse, Johann Heinrich. *Kurze, doch hinlängliche Anweisung zum General-Basse*. Hamburg: Michael Christian Bock, 1776.
- Jackson, George. *A Treatise on Practical Thoroughbass*. London: Longman and Brodery, 1795.
- Jousse, J. *Lectures on Thoroughbass*. London: Goulding, D'Almaine, Potter, 1808.
- Kessel, Johann Christian Bertram. *Unterricht im Generalbasse zum Gebrauche für Lehrer und Lernende*. Leipzig: Christian Gottlieb Hertel, 1791.
- King, Matthew Peter. *A General Treatise on Music, Particularly on Harmony or Thoroughbass*. London: printed for and sold by the author, 1809.
- _____. *Thoroughbass Made Clear to Every Capacity*. London: C. Mitchell, 1810.
- Kirnberger, Johann Phillip. *Grundsätze des Generalbasses als erste Linien zur Composition*. Berlin: J. J. Hummel, c. 1781.
- Kollmann, August Friedrich Christoph. *A Practical Guide to Thoroughbass*. London: the author, 1801.
- _____. *A Second Practical Guide to Thoroughbass*. London: the author, 1807.
- La Porte, Claude de. *Traité théorique et pratique de l'accompagnement du clavecin*. Paris: L'auteur, Boivin, Le Clerc, 1753. Facsimile Edition, Geneva: Minkoff, 1972.
- Löhlein, Georg Simon. *Clavier-Schule; oder, kurze und gründliche Anweisung zur Melodie und Harmonie*. 2 Vols. Leipzig: Auf Kosten der Waisenhaus- und Frommannischen Buchhandlung, 1779-1781.
- Manfredini, Vincenzo. *Regole armoniche*. Venice: Guglielmo Zerletti, 1775. Facsimile Edition, New York: Broude, 1966.
- Marpurg, Friedrich Wilhelm. *Handbuch bey dem Generalbasse und der Composition*. 3 vols. Berlin: J. J. Schützens Witwe, 1755-1760. Reprint, Hildesheim and New York: Olms, 1974.)
- Martini, Giambattista. *Esemplare, o sia Saggio fondamentale pratico di contrappunto sopra il canto fermo*. 2 vols. Bologna: Lelio dalla Volpe, 1774-1776. Facsimile Edition, Ridgewood: Gregg Press, 1965.

- Mattei, Stanislao. *Pratica d'accompagnamento sopra bassi numerati*. Bologna: Editore, 1788.
- Miller, Edward. *Elements of Thoroughbass and Composition*. London: Longman & Broderip, 1787.
- Nauss, Johann Xaver. *Gründlicher Unterricht, den General-Bass recht zu erlernen*. Augsburg: Johann Jacob Lotter Erben, 1751.
- Paisiello, Giovanni. *Regole per bene accompagnare il partimento*. St. Petersburg: tip. Morskago Šljahetnago, 1782.
- Petri, Johann Samuel. *Anleitung zur practischen Musik*. Lauban: Johann Christoph Wirthgen, 1767.
- _____. *Anleitung zur practischen Musik*. Leipzig: Breitkopf, 1782. Facsimile Edition, Prien am Chiemsee: Katzblicher, 1969.
- Quantz, Johann Joachim. *Versuch einer Anweisung, die Flöte traversiere zu spielen*. Berlin: Voss, 1752. Facsimile edition, Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1983.
- Rameau, Jean-Philippe. *Code de musique pratique*. Paris: l'Imprimerie royale, 1760. Facsimile Edition with commentary by Erwin R. Jacobi, *Jean Philippe Rameau: Complete Theoretical Writings*. Vol. 4. Rome: American Institute of Musicology, 1967-73.
- Reinhard, Leonhard. *Kurzer und deutlicher Unterricht von dem General-Bass*. Augsburg: Johann Jacob Lotters Erben, 1750.
- Riepel, Joseph. *Baßschlüssel, das ist Anleitung für Anfänger und Liebhaber der Setzkunst*. Regensburg: Johann Leopold Montags Erben, 1786.
- Rodolphe, Jean-Joseph. *Théorie d'accompagnement et de composition*. Paris: F. P. Le Roy, 1785.
- Roussier, Pierre-Joseph. *L'harmonie pratique ou exemples pour le traité des accords*. Paris: l'éditeur, Lyon, Castaud, 1775.
- Sacchi, Giovenale. *Delle quinte successive nel contrappunto e delle regole degli accompagnamenti*. Milano: Malatesta per Cesare Orena, 1780.
- Schröter, Christoph Gottlieb. *Deutliche Anweisung zum General-Bass*. Halberstadt: Johann Heinrich Gross, 1772.

- Tapray, Jean. *Abrégé de l'accompagnement du clavecin, renfermé dans un seul prelude*. Paris: Boyard, Dole, l'auteur, 1755.
- Telemann, Georg Michael. *Unterricht im Generalbass-Spielen, auf der Orgel oder sonst einem Clavier-Instrumente*. Hamburg: Michael Christian Bock, 1773.
- Tomeoni, Florido. *Méthode qui apprend la connoissance de l'harmonie et la pratique de l'accompagnement selon les principes de l'école de Naples*. Paris: l'auteur, 1798.
- _____. *Traité d'harmonie et d'accompangnement selon les préceptes de Durante et Leo*. Paris: l'auteur, 1800.
- Tomeoni, Pellegrino. *Regole pratiche per accompagnare il basso continuo*. Firenze: Anton-Giuseppe Pagani e compagni, 1795. Facsimile Edition, Bologna: Forni Editore, 1971.
- Türk, Daniel Gottlob. *Von den wichtigsten Pflichten eines Organisten*. Halle: Selbstverlag, 1787. Facsimile Edition, Hilversum: Frits A. M. Knuf, 1966.
- _____. *Kurze Anweisung zum Generalbaßspielen*. Halle-Leipzig: Selbstverlag, 1791.

Secondary Sources

- Abraham, Gerald. *The Music of Schubert*. Port Washington, NY: Kennikat Press, Inc., 1947.
- _____. "18th-Century Music and the Problems of its History," *Current Musicology* 9 (1969): 49-51.
- Ahrens, Christian. "Über vier und zwanzig Veränderungen: Funktion und Bedeutung der Züge an frühen Fortepianos." In *Festschrift Klaus Hotschansky zum 60. Geburtstag*. Tutzing: H. Schneider, 1995.
- Alberti-Radanowicz, Editha. "Das Wiener Lied von 1789-1815." *Denkmäler der Tonkunst in Österreich* (1923): 37-36.
- Alesio, Vena. "Performance and the Song Cycle: An Historical Perspective." *NATS Journal* 49, no. 2 (1992): 10-11.

- Althouse, Paul Leinbach, Jr. "Carl Loewe (1796-1869): His Lieder, Ballads, and Their Performance." Ph.D. diss., Yale University, 1971.
- Andrus, John Clarke. "Schubert and His Public: the Songs from 1817 to 1828." Ph.D. diss., University of Southern California, Santa Barbara, 1974.
- Arnold, Byron. "The Life and Works of Johann Caspar Bachofen." Ph.D. diss., University of Southern California, 1956.
- Arnold, F. T. *The Art of Accompanying from a Thoroughbass*. 2 Vols. New York: Dover, 1965.
- Badura-Skoda, Eva and Peter Branscombe, eds. *Schubert Studies: Problems of Style and Chronology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982.
- Baker, Nancy Kovaleff, and Thomas Christensen, eds. *Aesthetics and the Art of Musical Composition in the German Enlightenment: Selected Writings of Johann Georg Sulzer and Heinrich Christoph Koch*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995.
- Ballam, Michael Lynn. "The Life of Johann Michael Haydn and an Examination of His Lieder Collections *Auserlesene Sammlung von Liedern mit Melodien* and *Aoide*." D.M.A. diss., Indiana University, 1976.
- Baratz, Lewis Reece. "The Basso Continuo According to Jean-Joseph Boutmy." *Early Keyboard Journal* 8 (1995): 39-80.
- Baron, John. "Foreign Influences on the German Secular Solo Continuo Lied of the Mid-Seventeenth Century." Ph.D. diss., Brandeis University, 1967.
- _____. "Dutch Influences on the German Secular Solo Continuo Lied in the Mid-Seventeenth Century." *Acta musicologica* 43 (1971): 43-55.
- Barr, Raymond Arthur. "Carl Friedrich Zelter: A Study of the Lied in Berlin During the Late Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth Centuries." Ph.D. diss., University of Wisconsin, Madison, 1968.
- Bauer, Moritz. Introduction to *Karl Friedrich Zelter: Fünfzehn Ausgewählte Lieder*. Berlin: Martin Breslauer, 1924.
- Beach, David. "The Harmonic Theories of Johann Philipp Kirnberger; their Origins and Influences." Ph.D. diss., Yale University, 1974.

- Beutler, Ernst. "Corona Schröter," In *Essays um Goethe*, ed. Christian Beutler, 459-501. Zürich and Muich: Artemis Verlag, 1980.
- Bei, Oskar. *A History of the Pianoforte and Pianoforte Players*. Translated by E.E. Kellett and E.W. Naylor. New York: Da Capo Press, 1966.
- Bilson, Malcolm. "Schubert's Piano Music and the Pianos of His Time." *Studia Musicologica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae* 22 (1980): 263-271.
- _____. "Triplet Assimilation in the Music of Schubert: A Reply." *Historical Performance* 7, no.1 (1994): 27-30.
- _____. "The Future of Schubert Interpretation: What is Really Needed?" *Early Music* 25, no. 4 (1997): 715-722.
- Blume, Friedrich. *Classic and Romantic Music*. New York: W. W. Norton, 1970.
- Bostrom, Marvin. "Keyboard Instruction Books of the Eighteenth Century." Ph.D. diss., University of Michigan, 1960.
- Bozarth, George Severs, Jr. "The Lieder of Johannes Brahms—1868-1871: Studies in Chronology and Compositional Process." Ph.D. diss., Princeton University, 1978.
- Brody, Elaine and Robert Fowkes. *The German Lied and its Poetry*. New York: New York University, 1971.
- Brown, Clive. *Classical and Romantic Performing Practice: 1750-1900*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- _____. *A Portrait of Mendelssohn*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2003.
- Brown, Howard Mayer, and Stanley Sadie, eds. *Performance Practice: Music After 1600*. New York and London: W. W. Norton, 1989.
- Brown, Jane K. "In the Beginning Was Poetry," In *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied*, ed. James Parsons, 12-34. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- Buelow, George John. "The Full-Voiced Style of Thoroughbass Realization." *Acta Musicologica* 35 (1963): 159-171.
- Burdette, Glenn. "A Thorough Harping on Alberti." *Music Research Forum* 4 (1989): 1-10.

- Burney, Charles. *The Present State of Music in Germany, The Netherlands, and United Provinces*. 2 Vols. London: T. Becket, J. Robson, and G. Robinson, 1775.
- Busch, Gudrun and Anthony Harper, eds. *Studien zum deutschen weltlichen Kunstlied der 17. Und 18. Jahrhunderts*. Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1992.
- Bynum, Leroy Evans, Jr. "The First Berlin Lieder School: The Early Development of German Art Song." D.M.A. diss., University of Georgia, 1992.
- Campbell, Robert. "Johann Gottfried Mützel, 1728-1788." Ph.D. diss., Indiana University, 1966.
- Campbell, Stephanie. "Carl Friedrich Zelter and Text Setting: A Comparison of Goethe Settings by Zelter, Beethoven, and Schubert." Ph.D. diss., Washington University, St. Louis, 1997.
- Capell, Richard. *Schubert's Songs*. New York: Macmillan, 1957.
- Chapple, Gerald, Frederick Albert Hall, and Hans H. Schulte, eds. *The Romantic Tradition: German Literature and Music in the Nineteenth Century*. Lanham: University Press of America, 1992.
- Chenette, Louis. "Music Theory in the British Isles During the Enlightenment." Ph.D. diss., Ohio State University, 1967.
- Christensen, Jesper Bøje. *18th Century Continuo Playing: A Historical Guide to the Basics*. Translated by J. Bradford Robinson. Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2002.
- Christensen, Thomas. "The Règle de l'Octave in Thoroughbass Theory and Practice." *Acta musicologica* 64 (1992): 91-117.
- _____, ed. *The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- Citron, Marcia. "Corona Schröter: Singer, Composer, Actress." *Music and Letters* 61, no. 1 (1980): 15-27.
- _____. "Women and the Lied." In *Women Making Music*, ed. Jane Bowers and Judith Tick, 224-48. Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1986.
- Clark, Stephen, ed. *The Letters of C. P. E. Bach*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997.

- Coeyman, Barbara. "Continuo in the Historical Continuum." *Historical Performance* 4 (1991): 131-132.
- Cole, Michael. *The Pianoforte in the Classical Era*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998.
- Cooper, John Michael, and Julie D. Prandi, eds. *The Mendelssohns: Their Music in History*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- Czerny, Carl. *A Systematic Introduction to Improvisation on the Pianoforte*. Translated and edited by Alice L. Mitchell. New York: Longman, 1983.
- Dahlhaus, Carl. *Nineteenth Century Music*. Translated by J. Bradford Robinson. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1989.
- Darbellay, Etienne. "C. P. E. Bach's Aesthetic as Reflected in His Notation." In *C.P.E. Bach Studies*, ed. Stephen Clark, 43-64. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1988.
- Deaville, James. "A Multitude of Voices: the Lied at Mid Century." In *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied*, ed. James Parsons, 142-167. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- Deutsch, Otto Erich, ed. *Schubert: Memoirs By His Friends*. Translated by Rosamund Ley and John Nowell. Edinburgh: R. & R. Clark Ltd., 1958.
- Devrient, Eduard. *My Recollections of Felix Mendelssohn-Bartholdy, and His Letters to Me*. Translated by N. MacFarren. London: R. Bentley, 1869.
- Dittrich, Marie-Agnes. "The Lieder of Schubert." In *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied*, ed. James Parsons, 85-100. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- Donnington, Robert. *The Interpretation of Early Music*, 2d ed. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1974.
- Dorian, Frederick. *The History of Music in Performance: The Art of Musical Interpretation From the Renaissance to Our Day*. New York: W. W. Norton, 1966.
- Dunsby, Jonathan. *Making Words Sing: Nineteenth- and Twentieth-Century Song*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- Dürr, Walther. "Schubert and Johann Michael Vogl: a Reappraisal." *19th-century Music* 3, no. 2 (1979): 126-40.

- Earl, Don. "The Solo Song Cycle in Germany: 1800-1850." Ph.D. diss., Indiana University, 1952.
- Edwards, John Richard. "Christian Gottfried Krause: Mentor of the First Berlin Song School." Ph.D. diss., University of Iowa, 1973.
- Einstein, Alfred. *Music in the Romantic Era*, 2d ed. New York: W. W. Norton, 1975.
- Federhofer, Hellmut. "Zur Generalbasspraxis im 19. Jahrhundert." *Musik und Kirche* 60, no. 1 (1990): 1-10.
- Ferand, Ernest. *Improvisation in Nine Centuries of Western Music*. Cologne: Arno Volk Verlag, 1961.
- Ferguson, Howard. *Keyboard Interpretation from the 14th to the 19th Century*, 2d ed. New York: Oxford University Press, 1987.
- Ferguson, Linda. "Col Basso and Generalbass in Mozart's Keyboard Concertos: Notation, Performance Theory, and Practice." Ph.D. diss., Princeton University, 1983.
- Finson, Jon W. and R. Larry Todd, eds. *Mendelssohn and Schumann: Essays on Their Music and Its Context*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1984.
- Fischer-Dieskau, Dietrich. *Carl Friedrich Zelter und das Berliner Musikleben seiner Zeit: eine Biographie*. Berlin: Nicolai, 1997.
- Fleischhauer, Günter. "Johann Friedrich Reichardt als Komponist und Musikschriftsteller." *Wissenschaftliche Beiträge der Martin-Luther-Universität Halle, Germany* 20, no. 13 (1986): 65-71.
- Friedlaender, Max. *Das deutsche Lied im 18. Jahrhundert*. 2 Vols. Hildesheim, NY: G. Olms, 1970.
- Frotscher, Gotthold. *Performance Practices of Early Music*. New York: Heinrichshofen Edition, 1981.
- Frisch, Walter, ed. *Schubert: Critical and Analytical Studies*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1986.
- Geiringer, Karl. "Haydn and the Folksong of the British Isles." *Musical Quarterly* 35, no.2 (1949): 179-208.

- Gellrich, Marin, and Bertil Sundin. "Instrumental Practice in the 18th and 19th Centuries." *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education* 119 (1993): 137-145.
- Genova, Gina. "Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's *Neue Lieder-Melodien nebst einer Kantate zum singen beym Klavier* (1789) and the development of the German Lied." M.M. thesis, University of Arizona, 1995.
- Geoffrey-Dechaume, Antoine. "L'accompagnement sur basse dans le continuo: Un véritable art d'improviser." *Analyse musicale* 14, no. 1 (1989): 19-29.
- Gerling, Cristina. "Franz Schubert and Franz Liszt: A Posthumous Partnership." In *Nineteenth-Century Piano Music: Essays in Performance and Analysis*, ed. David Witten, 205-232. New York: Garland Publishing, Inc, 1997.
- Glauert, Amanda. "Beethoven's Songs and Vocal Style." In *The Cambridge Companion to Beethoven*, ed. Glenn Stanley, 186-199. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- _____. "The Lieder of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach, Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven." In *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied*, ed. James Parsons, 63-84. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- Goldsworthy, James E. "Franz Paul Rigler's *Anleitung zum Klavier für musikalische Lehrstunden*: Translation and Commentary." D.M.A. diss., Stanford University, 1991.
- Gorrell, Lorraine. *The Nineteenth-Century German Lied*. Portland, OR: Amadeus Press, 1993.
- Grace, Richard Milton. "Carl Friedrich Zelter's Musical Settings of Johann Wolfgang Goethe's Poems." Ph.D. diss., University of Iowa, 1967.
- Gramit, David. "The Intellectual and Aesthetic Tenets of Franz Schubert's Circle." Ph.D. diss., Duke University, 1987.
- _____. "Constructing a Victorian Schubert." *19th-Century Music* 17, no. 1 (1993): 65-78.
- _____. *Cultivating Music: The Aspirations, Interests and Limits of Musical Culture, 1770-1848*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002.

- _____. "The Circulation of the Lied: the Double Life of an Artwork and a Commodity," In *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied*, ed. James Parsons, 301-314. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- Hall, H. James. *The Art Song*. Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press, 1953.
- Hallmark, Rufus, ed. *German Lieder in the Nineteenth Century*. New York: Schirmer Books, 1996.
- Hausmann, Matthias. "Sag an, wer lehrt dich Lieder...? Probleme der Aufführungspraxis in Schuberts Liedern aus Sangersicht." *Schubert durch die Brille* 21 (1998): 9-18.
- Head, Matthew. "'Fürs schöne Geschlecht—Johann Friedrich Reichardt und der weibliche Amateur.'" In *Professionalismus in der Musik: Arbeitstagung in Verbindung mit dem Heinrich-Schütz-Haus Bad Kostritz vom 22 bis 25 August 1996*, ed. Christian Kaden and Volker Kalisch, 285-292. Musik-Kultur 5. Essen: Blaue Eule, 1999.
- _____. "'If the Pretty Little Hand Won't Stretch': Music for the Fair Sex in Eighteenth-Century Germany." *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 52 (1999): 203-54.
- Helm, Eugene. *Music at the Court of Frederick the Great*. Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press, 1960.
- Henrickson, Donald Gene. "The Harpsichord and Development of the Piano Prior to the Lieder of Schubert." D.M.A. diss., University of Missouri, Kansas City, 1970.
- Herbert, J. B. *How to Write an Accompaniment*. Cincinnati: The Fillmore Brothers Co., 1903.
- Hill, Bruce Kirkpatrick. "Beethoven's Reworking of Lieder." M.A. thesis, University of Victoria, British Columbia, 1990.
- Hiller, Johann Adam. *Treatise on Vocal Performance and Ornamentation*. Translated by Suzanne Beicken. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001.
- Hirsch, Marjorie Wing. *Schubert's Dramatic Lieder*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.
- Hizer, Lynn Jaye. "Performance Practice According to Johann Samuel Petri's 'Anleitung zur Praktischen Musik': An Annotated Translation." Ph.D. diss, Washington University, 1991.

- Hogwood, Christopher. "A Supplement to C.P.E. Bach's *Versuch*: E.W. Wolf's *Anleitung* of 1785." In *C.P.E. Bach Studies*, ed. Stephen Clark, 133-158. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1988.
- Ivey, Donald. *Song: Anatomy, Imagery, and Styles*. New York: The Free Press, 1970.
- Jackson, Barbara. "Musical Women of the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries." In *Women and Music, a History*, 2d ed., ed. Karin Pendle, 54-95. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2001.
- Jackson, Roland. *Performance Practice, Medieval to Contemporary: A Bibliographic Guide*. New York: Garland, 1988.
- Jacobi, E. R. "Harmonic Theory in England After the Time of Rameau." *Journal of Music Theory* 1 (1957): 126-46.
- Jezić, Diane and Elizabeth Wood. *Women Composers: The Lost Tradition Found*, 2d ed. New York: Feminist Press at the City University of New York, 1994.
- Johnson, H. E. "George K. Jackson, Doctor of Music (1745-1822)." *Musical Quarterly* 22 (1943): 113-21.
- Johnson, Susan. "Johann Friedrich Reichardt's Strophic Settings of Poems by Goethe." M.M. thesis, Florida State University, 1972.
- Jolizza, W. K. *Das Lied und seine Geschichte*. Vienna: A. Hartleben's Verlag, 1910.
- Kassler, Jamie Croy. *The Science of Music in Britain, 1714-1830: A Catalogue of Writings, Lectures and Inventions*. 2 Vols. New York: Garland Publishing, 1979.
- Keller, Hans. "Goethe and the Lied." In *Goethe Revisited: A Collection of Essays*, ed. by Elizabeth M. Wilkerson, 72-84. London: Calder, 1984.
- Keller, Hermann. *Thoroughbass Method*. Translated and edited by Carl Parrish. New York: Columbia University Press, 1965.
- Kitson, C. H. *Six Lectures on Accompanied Vocal Writing*. London: Oxford University Press, 1930.
- Kolneder, Walter. *Schule des Generalbaßspiels. Vol. 2: Die Vokalmusik*. Wilhelmshaven: Heinrichshofen, 1984.

- Komlos, Katalin. *Fortepianos and Their Music: Germany, Austria, and England, 1760-1800*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1995.
- Kotluski, Debra Ann. "Proscription, Polemics, and Propriety: The Life and Lieder of Johanna Kinkel." D.M.A. diss., University of North Carolina at Greensboro, 2003.
- Koury, Daniel. "The Orchestra in the Nineteenth Century: Physical Aspects of its Performance Practice." Ph.D. diss., 1963.
- Kroll, Mark. *Playing the Harpischord Expressively: A Practical and Historical Guide*. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press, 2004.
- Krones, Hartmut. "Lied-Interpretation." *Österreichische Musikzeitschrift* 52, no. 12 (1997): 6-16.
- Kubik, Reinhold, and Andreas Meier. Introduction and Critical Notes to "Carl Friedrich Zelter: Lieder." *Das Erbe Deutscher Musik* 106. Munich: G. Henle, 1995.
- Lambert, John. "Schubert's Multiple Settings of Poetry." Ph.D. diss., Yale University, 2000.
- Landau, Anneliese. *The Lied: the Unfolding of Its Style*. Lanham, MD: University Press of America, c.1980.
- Landshoff, Ludwig. Introduction to "Carl Friedrich Zelter: Fünfzig Lieder." Mainz: Schott, 1932.
- Lang, Paul. "Ornamentation and Improvisation." In *Musicology and Performance*, ed. Alfred Mann and George J. Buelow, 210-231. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1997.
- LeBar, Ann. "The Domestication of Vocal Music in Enlightenment Hamburg." *Journal of Musicological Research* 19 (2000): 97-134.
- Lee, Kyunghee. "Songs in the *Musenalmanache* and *Taschenbuecher* in German Speaking Areas (1770-1814)." Ph.D. diss., Universität Innsbruck, 1996.
- Lehmann, Lotte. *Eighteen Song Cycles: Studies in Their Interpretation*. London: Cassell, 1971.
- LeHuray, Peter and James Day, eds. *Music and Aesthetics in the Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth Centuries*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981.

- Leppert, Richard. "Music Teachers of Upper-Class Amateur Musicians in Eighteenth-Century England." In *Music in the Classic Period: Essays in Honor of Barry S. Brook*, ed. Allan Atlas, 133-58. New York: Pendragon Press, 1985.
- _____. *Music and Image: Domesticity, Ideology, and Socio-Cultural Formation in Eighteenth-Century England*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Lester, Joel. *Compositional Theory in the Eighteenth Century*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1992.
- Levin, Robert. "Performance Prerogatives in Schubert." *Early Music* 25, no. 4 (1997): 723-727.
- Lin, Chia-Yin. "The Liszt Transcriptions for Piano of Songs by Beethoven, Chopin, and Mendelssohn: Inspiration, Process and Intention." D.M.A. diss., University of Washington, 2003.
- Lin, Ling-Mei. "Collections of Piano Preludes in the Classic and Early Romantic Eras (Circa 1770 to Circa 1839): A Historical and Stylistic Study." D.M.A. diss., University of North Carolina, Greensboro, 1997.
- Lin, Shen-An. "The Lieder of Beethoven: A Stylistic Analysis." M.A. thesis, University of North Texas, 1987.
- Lockwood, E. M. "Edward Miller." *Music and Letters* 9 (1928): 67-76.
- Lodes, Birgit. "Probing the Sacred Genres: Beethoven's Religious Songs, Oratorio, and Masses." In *The Cambridge Companion to Beethoven*, ed. Glenn Stanley, 218-236. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- Loesser, Arthur. *Men, Women, and Pianos*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1954.
- Lohr, N. Jane. "Preluding on the Harpsichord and Pianoforte, ca. 1770 to ca. 1850." Ph.D. diss., University of Iowa, 1993.
- Lunde, Nanette. *The Continuo Companion*. Columbus: Skyline Publications, 1988.
- Luper, Ray Fernando. "The German Lieder of Nikolaus Freiherr von Krufft, 1779-1818." Ph.D. diss., Tulane University, 1976.
- MacClintock, Carol, ed. *Readings in the History of Music in Performance*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1994.

- Mallard, James Harry. "A Translation of Christian Gottfried Krause's *Von der musikalischen Poesie*, with a Critical Essay on his Sources and the Aesthetic Views of his Time." Ph.D. diss., University of Texas at Austin, 1978.
- Mangsen, Sandra. "The Unfigured Bass and the Continuo Player: More Evidence From France." *Early Keyboard Journal* 3 (1984-5): 5-12.
- Marco, Guy. "The Alberti Bass Before Alberti." *Music Review* 20 (1959): 93-103.
- Marx, Hans Joachim, ed. *Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach und die europäische Musikkultur des mittleren 18. Jahrhunderts*. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht, 1990.
- Matsushita, Hidemi. "The Musical Career and Compositions of Maria Theresia von Paradis (1759-1824)." Ph.D. diss., Brigham Young University, 1989.
- McGlathery, James, ed. *Music and German Literature: Their Relationship Since the Middle Ages*. Columbia, SC: Camden House, 1992.
- McKay, Elizabeth Norman. *Franz Schubert's Music for the Theatre*. Tutzing: H. Schneider, 1991.
- McKendrick, Neil, John Brewer and J. H. Plumb. *The Birth of a Consumer Society: The Commercialization of Eighteenth-Century England*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1982.
- Meister, Barbara. *An Introduction to the Art Song*. New York: Taplinger Press, 1980.
- _____. *Art Song: The Marriage of Music and Poetry*. Durango, CO: Hollowbrook Publishing, 1992.
- Monelle, Raymond. "Word Setting in the Strophic Lied." *Music and Letters* 65 (1984): 229-236.
- Montgomery, David. "Triplet Assimilation in the Music of Schubert: Challenging the Ideal." *Historical Performance* 6, no.2 (1993): 79-97.
- _____. "Franz Schubert's Music in Performance: a Brief History of People, Events, and Issues." In *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Christopher H. Gibbs, 270-283. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- _____. *Franz Schubert's Music in Performance: Compositional Ideals, Notational Intent, Historical Realities, Pedagogical Foundations*. Monographs in Musicology 11. Hillsdale, NY: Pendragon Press, 2003.

- Moore, Robin. "The Decline of Improvisation in Western Art Music: An Interpretation of Change." *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 23, no. 1 (1992): 61-84.
- Morrow, Mary Sue. *German Music Criticism in the Late Eighteenth Century*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- Moser, H. J. *Das deutsche Lied seit Mozart*. 2 Vols. Tutzing: Schneider, 1968.
- Mussard, Timothy. "Embellishing Schubert's Songs: A Performance Practice." D.M.A. diss., University of Washington, 1987.
- Nathan, Hans. "The Sense of History in Musical Interpretation." *Music Review* 13 (1952): 85-100.
- Nef, Albert. *Das Lied in der deutschen Schweiz: Ende des 18. Und Anfang des 10. Jahrhunderts*. Zürich: Gebrüder Hug & Co, 1909.
- Nettl, Bruno. "Thoughts on Improvisation: A Comparative Approach." *Musical Quarterly* 60 (1974): 1-19.
- Neuls-Bates, Carol, ed. *Women in Music: An Anthology of Source Readings From the Middle Ages to the Present*, Rev. ed. New York: Harper and Row, 1996.
- Neumann, Frederick. *Ornamentation in Baroque and Post-Baroque Music*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1978.
- _____. *Essays in Performance Practice*. Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1982.
- _____. *Ornamentation and Improvisation in Mozart*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1989.
- _____. *Performance Practices of the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries*. New York: Schirmer Books, 1993.
- Newbould, Brian, ed. *Schubert Studies*. Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 1998.
- Ng, Kah-Ming. "Figured Bass Accompaniment at the Harpsichord in its Social and Artistic Context." Ph.D. diss., Oxford University, 2002.
- Norman-McKay, Elizabeth. *The Impact of the New Pianoforte on Classical Keyboard Style: Mozart, Beethoven, Schubert*. West Hagley, West Midlands: Lynwood Music, 1987.

- Osborne, Richard. "The Theoretical Writings of Abbé Pierre-Joseph Roussier." Ph.D. diss., Ohio State University, 1966.
- Ottenberg, Hans-Günter. "C. P. E. Bach and Carl Friedrich Zelter." In *C. P. E. Bach Studies*, ed. Stephen Clark, 185-216. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1988.
- _____. "Die 1. berliner Liederschule im Urteil der Zeitgenössischen Presse." In *Studien zum deutschen weltlichen Kunstlied des 17. und 18. Jahrhunderts*, ed. Gudrun Busch und Anthony J. Harper, 247-268. Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1992.
- Parsons, James. "Toward an Understanding of the 18th-Century Lied," In *Musikkonzepte*, Vol. 2, ed. Kathrin Ebert and Wolfgang Ruf, 380-385. Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2000.
- _____, ed. *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- _____. "The Eighteenth-Century Lied." In *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied*, ed. James Parsons, 35-62. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- Peake, Luise. "The Song Cycle: a Preliminary Inquiry Into the Beginnings of the Romantic Song Cycle and the Nature of an Art Form." Ph.D. diss., Columbia University, 1968.
- _____. "The Antecedents of Beethoven's *Liederkreis*." *Music and Letters* 63, no. 3-4 (1982): 242-60.
- Pfau, Thomas. *Romantic Moods: Paranoia, Trauma, and Melancholy, 1790-1840*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2005.
- Picton, Howard J. *The Life and Works of Joseph Anton Steffan (1726-1797)*. 2 Vols. New York: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1989.
- Piersel, David. "Ornamentation as Presented in Piano Method Books, c.1790-1850." Ph.D. diss., University of Iowa, 1970.
- Pincherle, Marc. "On the Rights of the Interpreter in the Performance of 17th- and 18th-Century Music." Translated by Isabelle Cazeau. *Musical Quarterly* 44 (1958): 145-66.
- Plantinga, Leon. *Romantic Music*. New York: W. W. Norton, 1984.
- _____. "The Piano and the Nineteenth Century." In *Nineteenth-Century Piano Music*, ed. R. Larry Todd, 1-15. New York: Schirmer Books, 1990.

- _____. *Beethoven's Concertos: History, Style, Performance*. New York: W. W. Norton, 1999.
- Platt, Heather. "The Lieder of Brahms." In *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied*, ed. James Parsons, 185-203. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- Plumb, John Harold. "The Commercialization of Leisure." In *The Birth of a Consumer Society: The Commercialization of Eighteenth-Century England*, ed. by Neil McKendrick, John Brewer and J. H. Plumb, 265-285. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1982.
- Pool, Jeannie G. *Women in Music History: A Research Guide*. New York: Jeannie Pool, 1977.
- Porter, E. G. "Zumsteeg's Songs." *Monthly Musical Record* 88 (1958): 135-40.
- _____. *Schubert's Song Technique*. London: D. Dobson, 1961.
- Predota, Georg. "Johannes Brahms and the Foundations of Composition: The Basis of His Compositional Process in His Study of Figured Bass and Counterpoint." Ph.D. diss., University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, 2000.
- Ragogini, Ernest. "Johann Rudolf Zumsteeg and the *Kleine Balladen und Lieder*." Ph.D. diss., Peabody Institute of the Johns Hopkins University, 1975.
- Rainbox, B. "The Miseries of Musick Masters." *Musical Times* 127 (1986): 201-3.
- Randall, Annie Janeiro. "Music and Drama in Weimar, 1776-1782: A Socio-Historical Perspective." Ph.D. diss., University of Cincinnati, 1995.
- Randall, Mayumi. "The History of Piano Improvisation in Western Concert Music." D.M.A. diss., University of Cincinnati, 1993.
- Ratner, Leonard G. *Classic Music: Expression, Form, and Style*. New York: Schirmer Books, 1980.
- _____. *Romantic Music: Sound and Syntax*. New York: Schirmer Books, 1992.
- Rebmann, Martina. "*Das Lied, das du mir jüngst gesungen...*": Studien zum Sololied in der ersten Hälfte des 19. Jahrhunderts im Württemberg. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang, 2002.

- Reed, John. *The Schubert Song Companion*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1985.
- Reich, Nancy. "A Commentary and Translation of Selected Portions of *Vertraute Briefe geschrieben auf einer Reise nach Wien und den Oesterreichischen Staaten zu Ende des Jahres 1808 und zu Anfang 1809* by Johann Friedrich Reichardt, 1752-1814." Ph.D. diss., New York University, 1972.
- _____. "European Composers and Musicians, ca. 1800-1890." In *Women and Music: A History*, 2d ed., ed. Karin Pendle, 97-122. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2001.
- Reichard, Kathryn Louise. "Five Settings of Goethe's *Rastlose Liebe*, 1794-1815." M.A. Thesis, Harvard University, 1970.
- _____. "Aspects of Weimar's Musical Life, 1775-1807." Ph.D. diss., Harvard University, 1980.
- Reichardt, Johann. "Die Berlinische Singakademie." *Berlinische Musikalische Zeitung* 1, no. 8 (1805): 29-31.
- Reichardt, Johann Friedrich. *Johann Friedrich Reichardt: Autobiographische Schriften*. Edited by Günter Hartung. Halle: Mittel deutscher Verlag, 2002.
- Rice, John A. *Empress Marie Therese and Music at the Viennese Court, 1782-1807*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003.
- Riethmüller, A. "Joseph Haydn und das Deutschlandlied." *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft* 44 (1987): 241-67.
- Riley, Matthew. "Straying From Nature: The Labyrinthine Harmonic Theory of Diderot and Bemetzrieder's *Leçons de clavecin* (1771)." *Journal of Musicology* 19, no.1 (2002): 3-38.
- _____. *Musical Listening in the German Enlightenment*. Aldershot, England: Ashgate Publishing, Ltd., 2004.
- Ringer, Alexander. *The Early Romantic Era*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1991.
- Rink, John, ed. *Musical Performance: A Guide to Understanding*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.

- Rosen, Charles. *The Romantic Generation*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1995.
- Rosenblum, Sandra. *Performance Practices in Classic Piano Music: Their Principles and Applications*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1988.
- _____. "Concerning Articulation on Keyboard Instruments: Aspects from the Renaissance to the Present." *Performance Practice Review* 10, no.1 (1997): 31-40.
- Rosenwald, Lawrence. "Theory, Textsetting and Performance." *Journal of Musicology* 11, no. 1 (1993): 52-65.
- Rowland, David. *Early Keyboard Instruments: A Practical Guide*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001.
- Rowley, Gordon Samuel. "'Le maître de clavecin pour l'accompagnement,' Michel Corrette's Method for Learning to Accompany from a Thoroughbass: A Translation." Ph.D. diss., University of Iowa, 1979.
- Ruetz, Robert. "A Comparative Analysis of Goethe's *Der Erbkönig*, *Der Fischer*, *Nachtgesang* and *Trost in Tränen* in Musical Settings by Reichardt, Zelter, Schubert, and Loewe." D.M.A. diss., Indiana University, 1964.
- Sadie, Stanley, and Edward Ripin, eds. *Early Keyboard Instruments*. London: MacMillan, 1989.
- Salmen, Walter. *The Social Status of the Professional Musician From the Middle Ages to the Nineteenth Century*. Annotated and Translated by Herbert Kaufman and Barbara Reisner. New York: Pendragon Press, 1983.
- Schenkman, Walter. "Beyond the Limits of Urtext Authority: a Contemporary Record of Early Nineteenth-Century Performance Practice." *College Music Symposium* 23, no. 2 (1983): 145-63.
- Schletterer, Hans Michel. *Johann Friedrich Reichardt: sein Leben und seine Werke; sein Leben und seine musikalische Thätigkeit*. Augsburg: J. A. Schlosser, 1865.
- Schroeder, David. "Schubert the Singer." *The Music Review* 49 (1988): 254-66.
- Schulte, Wilhelm. "J.A.P. Schulz, a Protagonist of the Musical Enlightenment: *Lieder im Volkston*." *Music Research Forum* 3, no.1 (1988): 23-34.

- Schumann, Elizabeth. *German Song*. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1948. Reprint, 1979.
- Schwab, Heinrich. "Strophic Form as a Norm in Lieder of the Time of Joseph Martin Kraus." In *Joseph Martin Kraus in seiner Zeit*, ed. Friedrich W. Riedel, 83-100. Munich: E. Katzbichler, 1982.
- Schwaneflugel, Susan. "Modes of Performance: Women's Musico-Literary Masquerade in Early Nineteenth-Century Germany." Ph.D. diss., University of Pennsylvania, 1997.
- Seaton, Douglas. "A Composition Course with Karl Friedrich Zelter." *College Music Symposium* 21, no. 2 (1981): 126-38.
- Serwer, Howard J. "Friedrich Wilhelm Marpurg (1718-1795): Music Critic in a Galant Age." Ph.D. diss., Yale University, 1969.
- Shawe-Taylor, Desmond. "Schubert as Written and Performed: A Symposium." *Musical Times* 104 (1963): 626-628.
- Sheldon, David. *Marpurg's Thoroughbass and Composition Handbook: A Narrative Translation and Critical Study*. Stuyvesant, NY: Pendragon Press, 1989.
- Shore, Richard Alan. "Goethe, Zelter, and their Innovations in the German Art Song." D.M.A. diss., Boston University, 1998.
- Siegmund-Schultze, Walther. "Zu Johann Friedrich Reichardts musikasthetischen Anschauungen." In *Johann Friedrich Reichardt (1752-1814): Komponist und Schriftsteller der Revolutionszeit*, ed. Konstanze Musketa, Gert Richter, and Götz Traxdorf, 21-25. Halle: Händel-Haus, 1992.
- Simms, Bryan Randolph. "Alexandre Choron (1771-1834) as a Historian and Theorist of Music." Ph.D. diss., Yale University, 1974.
- Sirota, Victoria Ressmeyer. "The Life and Works of Fanny Mendelssohn Hensel." Mus.A.D. thesis, Boston University School for the Arts, 1981.
- Smeed, J.W. *German Song and its Poetry, 1740-1900*. London: Croom Helm, 1987.
- Snyder, Lawrence. *German Poetry in Song: An Index of Lieder*. Berkeley, CA: Fallen Leaf Press, 1995.

- Spaethling, Robert. *Music and Mozart in the Life of Goethe*. Columbia, SC: Camden House, 1987.
- _____. "Music in Goethe's Thought." In *The Romantic Tradition: German Literature and Music in the Nineteenth Century*, ed. by Gerald Chapple, Frederick Hall, and Hans Schulte, 113-32. Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 1992.
- Sperber, Roswitha, ed. *Women Composers in Germany*. Bonn: Inter Nationes, 1996.
- Steblin, Rita. *A History of Key Characteristics in the Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth Centuries*, 2d ed. Studies in Musicology 67. Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 2002.
- Stein, Jack. "Was Goethe Wrong About the Nineteenth-Century Lied?" *Publications of the Modern Language Association of America* 77 (1962): 232-9.
- _____. *Poem and Music in the German Lied from Gluck to Wolf*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1971.
- Stevens, Denis, ed. *A History of Song*, 2d ed. New York: Hutchinson and Co., 1970.
- Stoljar, Margaret Mahony. *Poetry and Song in Late Eighteenth-Century Germany: A Study in the Musical Sturm und Drang*. London: Croom Helm, 1985.
- Stowell, Robin, ed. *Performing Beethoven*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994.
- Szász, Tibor. "Beethoven's Basso Continuo: Notation and Performance." In *Performing Beethoven*, ed. Robin Stowell, 1-22. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994.
- Teal-Greenshields, Jean-Anne. "'The Prince of Song': Franz Schubert, His Early Lieder." D.M.A. Diss., University of Maryland, College Park, 1996.
- Thomas, Hinton. *Poetry and Song in the German Baroque: A Study of the Continuo Lied*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1963.
- Tillar, Françoise. *Fanny Mendelssohn*. Translated by Camille Naish. Portland, OR: Amadeus Press, 1996.
- Todd, R. Larry, ed. *Mendelssohn's Musical Education: a Study and Edition of His Exercises in Composition, Oxford, Bodleian MS Deneke Mendelssohn C. 43*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983.

- _____. *Mendelssohn and His World*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1991.
- _____. *Mendelssohn: A Life in Music*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003.
- Todd, R. Larry, and Peter Williams, ed. *Perspectives on Mozart Performance*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991.
- Troeger, Richard. *Technique and Interpretation on the Harpsichord and Clavichord*. Bloomington, Indiana University Press, 1987.
- Türk, Daniel Gottlob. *School of Clavier Playing*. Translated by Raymond H. Hagg. Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press, 1982.
- Quin, Carol Lynelle. "Fanny Mendelssohn Hensel: Her Contributions to Nineteenth-Century Musical Life." Ph.D. diss., University of Kentucky, 1981.
- Van Tassel, Eric. "'Something Utterly New': Listening to Schubert Lieder. I: Vogl and the Declamatory Style." *Early Music* 25, no. 4 (1997): 702-714.
- Walker, Nancy. "A Stylistic Analysis of Selected Lieder of Fanny Mendelssohn Hensel and Clara Wieck Schumann." D.M.A. diss., Indiana University, 1988.
- Wallace, Barbara. "J. F. Daube's *General-Bass in drey Accorden* (1756): A Translation and Commentary." Ph.D. diss., North Texas State University, 1983.
- Weber, William. "Mass Culture and the Reshaping of European Musical Taste, 1770-1870." *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 8 (1977): 5-21.
- _____. "Did People Listen in the 18th Century?" *Early Music* 25, no. 4 (1997): 678-691.
- _____. *Music and the Middle Class*, 2d ed. New York: Holmes and Meier Publishers, 2002.
- _____, ed. *The Musician as Entrepreneur, 1700-1914: Managers, Charlatans, and Idealists*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2004.
- West, Ewan. "The Musenalmanach and Viennese Song 1770-1830." *Music and Letters* 67 (1986): 37-49.

- Whalen, Meg Freeman. "A Little Republic Filled With Grace: The Nineteenth-Century Music Salon." *Women of Note Quarterly* 3, no. 4 (1995): 16-26.
- Whitton, Kenneth. *Lieder: An Introduction to German Song*. New York: Frankli Watts Inc., 1984.
- _____. *Goethe and Schubert: The Unseen Bond*. Portland, OR: Amadeus Press, 1999.
- Wier, Albert Ernest. *The Piano, Its History, Makers, Players, and Music*. New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1940.
- Williams, Peter. *Figured Bass Accompaniment*. 2 Vols. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1970, 1977.
- Wilson, Dora. "Georg Simon Löhlein's Klavierschule: Translation and Commentary." Ph.D. diss., University of Southern California, 1979.
- _____. "Löhlein's *Klavierschule*: Toward an Understanding of the Galant Style." *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 12, no. 2 (1981): 103-15.
- Wing, Marjore Joan. *Schubert's Dramatic Lieder*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.
- Winn, James Anderson. *Unsuspected Eloquence: A History of the Relations Between Poetry and Music*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1981.
- Winter, Robert. "The Emperor's New Clothes: Nineteenth-Century Instruments Revisited." *19th-Century Music* 7, no. 3 (1984): 251-55.
- _____. "Orthodoxies, Paradoxes, and Contradictions: Performance Practices in Nineteenth-Century Piano Music." In *Nineteenth-Century Piano Music*, ed. R. Larry Todd, 16-54. New York: Schirmer Books, 1990.
- _____. "Performing Nineteenth-Century Music on Nineteenth-Century Instruments." *19th-Century Music* 1, no. 2 (1997): 163-75.
- Wraxall, N. William. *Memoirs of the Courts of Berlin, Dresden, Warsaw, and Vienna in the Years 1777, 1778, and 1779*, 3d ed. 2 Vols. London: F. Cadell and W. Davies, 1806.
- Youens, Susan. *Schubert's Poets and the Making of Lieder*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.

_____. "Behind the Scenes: *Die Schöne Müllerin* Before Schubert," *19th-Century Music* 15 (1991-2): 3-22.

Youngren, William. *C. P. E. Bach and the Rebirth of the Strophic Song*. Lanheim, MD: Scarecrow Press, 2003.

Zappulla, Robert. *Figured Bass Accompaniment in France*. Turnhout, Belgium: Brepols, 2000.